ECOTOURISM AS A FORM OF SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT
IN SOUTH AFRICA

by

Alexandra Leigh Ayotte

A thesis submitted to the Department of Environmental Studies
In conformity with the requirements for
the degree of Masters of Environmental Studies

Queen’s University
Kingston, Ontario, Canada
(September, 2009)

Copyright ©Alexandra Leigh Ayotte, 2009
Abstract

This study examines ecotourism as a form of sustainable development in the Eastern Cape of South Africa. Tourism is one of the world’s largest industries, with ecotourism being one of the fastest growing sectors. Ecotourism can provide a superior and sustainable alternative to traditional, resource dependent industries that are prevalent in developing countries. This research offers a multi-disciplinary perspective incorporating economic, environmental and social issues surrounding the implementation of an ecotourism industry. A framework for sustainable ecotourism development is created using indicators developed by the World Tourism Organization. This framework is applied to three case studies within the Eastern Cape. The case studies demonstrate both common and unique opportunities and challenges for ecotourism development throughout the Eastern Cape. The end result of this project is to create a better understanding of the tourism-environment relationship, and to explore how ecotourism, and more specifically backpacking, can contribute to sustainable development. This study contributes to the literature on the use of indicators in ecotourism. A framework of indicators for sustainable ecotourism represents the final product of this research. This framework can be used by local governments and organizations to aid in the planning and management of ecotourism both in South Africa and other developing nations, and lead to improvements in both the physical and social environments.
Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to thank the School of Environmental Studies for the opportunity to pursue this research in a supportive and encouraging environment. My experience at Queen’s would not have been such a success without the numerous people that make the department what it is. Many thanks go to my supervisor Dr. Allison Goebel, for her continued support, feedback and encouragement. This research would not have been possible without her. I would also like to sincerely thank my committee members Dr. Mick Smith and Dr. Graham Whitelaw for their valued input and participation throughout the research process.

To all of my fellow MES students, many thanks for making my Kingston experience a special one. Their continued support and encouragement was invaluable, and they more than once provided the necessary distraction from my research problems. My family and friends have always, and continue to be a grounding force in my life, and their encouragement during my time here at Queen’s has been priceless. During the past two years I have not only learned a great deal but I have grown significantly as a person and to everyone who played a part, thank you.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................................ iii  
List of Acronyms ............................................................................................................................... xi  
Chapter 1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 1  
  1.1 Overview of Research: ........................................................................................................... 1  
  1.2 Supporting Theoretical Perspective ...................................................................................... 3  
  1.3 Research Purpose, Objectives and Contribution .................................................................... 4  
Chapter 2 Literature Review ............................................................................................................ 6  
  2.1 Tourism .................................................................................................................................. 6  
    2.1.1 The Meaning of Tourism: ................................................................................................ 6  
    2.1.2 The Current Tourism Industry: ........................................................................................ 7  
    2.1.3 The Impacts of Tourism .................................................................................................. 9  
    2.1.4 Tourism and Environment Relationship ........................................................................ 10  
  2.2 Ecotourism ........................................................................................................................... 11  
    2.2.1 The Rise of Ecotourism: Definitions ............................................................................. 11  
    2.2.2 Characteristics and Principles of Ecotourism: ............................................................... 14  
    2.2.2.1 Nature Based: ......................................................................................................... 14  
    2.2.2.2 Ecologically Sustainable: ....................................................................................... 15  
    2.2.2.3 Environmentally and Culturally Educative: ........................................................... 15  
    2.2.2.4 Locally Beneficial: ................................................................................................. 16  
    2.2.2.5 Tourist Satisfaction: ............................................................................................... 16  
    2.2.3 Ecotourism and its Relationship to Other Tourism Types ............................................ 16  
    2.2.4 Impacts of Ecotourism: ................................................................................................. 20  
    2.2.4.1 Environmental ........................................................................................................ 20  
    2.2.4.2 Social ...................................................................................................................... 21  
    2.2.4.3 Economic ................................................................................................................ 23  
  2.3 Ecotourism in the Developing World: A tool for development ........................................... 25  
    2.3.1 Current Extent of Ecotourism in the Developing World ............................................... 25  
    2.3.2 Issues and Effects of Tourism in the Developing World: ............................................ 27
2.3.2.1 Foreign Domination and Dependency: .................................................................28
2.3.2.2 Socio-economic and Spatial Polarization ..............................................................29
2.3.2.3 Environmental Destruction and Cultural Alienation ..............................................30
2.3.3 Ecotourism Policy, Government Intervention and Planning .......................................31
   2.3.3.1 Policy and Government Intervention .................................................................31
   2.3.3.2 Ecotourism Planning .........................................................................................33
2.3.4 Collaboration and Community Involvement ............................................................36
2.4 Ecotourism and Sustainable Development ....................................................................37
   2.4.1 Sustainable Development Defined .........................................................................37
   2.4.2 Weaknesses of Sustainable Development ............................................................40
2.4.3 The Principles of Sustainability in Tourism ..............................................................41
   2.4.3.1 Ecological Sustainability ...................................................................................42
   2.4.3.2 Social Sustainability .........................................................................................42
   2.4.3.3 Cultural Sustainability .......................................................................................42
   2.4.3.4 Economic Sustainability ....................................................................................43
2.4.4 Agenda 21 and Sustainable Tourism Development ...................................................43
2.4.5 The Tools of Sustainability in Tourism .....................................................................45
   2.4.5.1 Area Protection ..................................................................................................45
   2.4.5.2 Industry Regulation .........................................................................................45
   2.4.5.3 Visitor Management Techniques .......................................................................46
   2.4.5.4 Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) ..........................................................46
   2.4.5.5 Consultation/Participation Techniques ...............................................................47
   2.4.5.6 Codes of Conduct .............................................................................................47
   2.4.5.7 Sustainability Indicators ....................................................................................47
2.5 Specific Ecotourism Focus: Backpacking ......................................................................48
   2.5.1 What is Backpacking? .........................................................................................48
   2.5.2 Backpacker Characteristics ..................................................................................50
   2.5.3 Backpacker Tourism and Third World Development .............................................51
   2.5.4 Regional Focus .....................................................................................................54
2.6 Community Based Ecotourism: A Conceptual Framework .........................................54
Chapter 3 Methodologies ..................................................................................................57
   3.1 The Case Study Approach: .......................................................................................57
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.3 Social Analysis:</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.2.4 Infrastructure Analysis:</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.3 Identification of Tourism Assets and Risks</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.4 Long Term Vision for Buffalo City Tourism Development</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.5 Priority Issues for Buffalo City Municipality Tourism Development</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.6 Indicator Analysis:</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.3.7 The Challenges and Opportunities for Tourism in Buffalo City</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4 Case Study #3: Mbizana Municipality, Oliver Tambo District</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.1 Definition of Destination:</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2 Current Reality in Mbizana:</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2.1 Economic Analysis:</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2.2 Environmental Analysis:</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2.3 Social Analysis:</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.2.4 Infrastructure Analysis:</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.3 Identification and Tourism Assets and Risks</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.4 Long Term Vision for Mbizana Municipalities Tourism Development</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.5 Priority Projects and Issues for Mbizana Tourism Development</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.6 Indicator Analysis:</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.4.7 The Challenges and Opportunities for Tourism in Mbizana Municipality</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 7</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Challenges and Opportunities:</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1 Overarching Issues within all three Cases:</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1.1 Opportunities:</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.1.2 Challenges:</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2 Site Specific Issues within Each Case Study</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.1 Baviaans</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.2 Buffalo City</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1.2.3 Mbizana</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 Recommendations:</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.1 The Potential of a backpacking Industry in the Eastern Cape</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.2 Potential Shortcoming of Backpacking Ecotourism Development</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2.3 The Role of Social Justice Theory in Backpacking Tourism</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

Figure 2-1: PIC planning principles: Steps in the Planning Process .............................................35
Figure 2-2: Community Based Ecotourism Conceptual Framework ...........................................55
Figure 6-1: Eastern Cape Provincial Map ..................................................................................87
Figure 6-2: Baviaans Municipal Map .......................................................................................89
Figure 6-3: Buffalo City Municipality Location .......................................................................100
Figure 6-4: Mbizana Municipality Location ..........................................................................115
Figure 8-1: Ecotourism Conceptual Framework ....................................................................149
List of Tables

Table 2-1: Commonly cited economic benefits and costs of tourism development ...................... 25
Table 2-2: Growth in tourism to selected destinations .................................................................. 27
Table 2-3: Leakage in Third World Tourism Destination .............................................................. 29
Table 5-1: Indicator Identification ................................................................................................. 77
Table 6-1: Baviaans Municipality SWOT Analysis ...................................................................... 92
Table 6-2: Baviaans Municipality Priority Issues .......................................................................... 94
Table 6-3: Buffalo City Municipality SWOT Analysis ................................................................. 107
Table 6-4: Buffalo City Municipality Priority Issues ................................................................... 110
Table 6-5: Mbizana Municipality SWOT Analysis ..................................................................... 119
Table 6-6: Mbizana Municipality Priority Issues ......................................................................... 121
List of Acronyms

TIES: The International Ecotourism Society
SD: Sustainable Development
WCED: World Commission on Environment and Development
UN: United Nations
EIA: Environmental Impact Assessment
WTO: World Tourism Organization
ECDC: Eastern Cape Development Corporation
ECPG: Eastern Cape Provincial Government
PGDP: Provincial Growth and Development Plan
IDP: Integrated Development Plan
HDI: Human Development Index
GDP: Gross Domestic Product
UNDP: United Nations Development Program
RDP: Reconstruction and Development Program
THETA: Tourism, Hospitality and Sport Education and Training Authority
TESCA: Tourism Empowerment Council of South Africa
TEP: Tourism Enterprise Partnership
BEE: Black Economic Empowerment
PHASA: Professional Hunters’ Association of South Africa
DEAT: Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism
UNESCO: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
WWF: World Wildlife Fund
Chapter 1

Introduction

1.1 Overview of Research:

Tourism is widely recognized as the world’s largest industry. By 2010 the economic contribution of travel and tourism is estimated to grow to 11.6% of global GDP and will support 250 million jobs (Page and Hall, 2006). With this rapid and immense growth come both positive and negative consequences. While tourism represents a significant opportunity for South Africa the national government has recognized that,

“To achieve the true potential of the tourism industry it must be clear that any old tourism will not work. A new tourism is required that would boost other sectors of the economy and create entrepreneurial opportunities for the previously neglected groups; that would be kind to the environment; that will bring peace, prosperity and enjoyment for all South Africans.” (Government of South Africa, 1996, Sec 3.3)

One type of tourism which has the potential to contribute to the sustainable development of South African communities is ecotourism. Ecotourism implies responsibility to the environment, to local communities and responsibility to respect, invest in, and develop local cultures (Government of South Africa, 1996). While in principle ecotourism is meant to be responsible it can also have a variety of negative impacts which will be further explored in chapter 2.

This study will examine ecotourism, and more specifically backpacking as a form of sustainable development in the Eastern Cape of South Africa. Ecotourism and
backpacking can provide a superior and sustainable alternative to traditional, resource dependent industries that are prevalent in developing countries. The benefits of backpackers tend to be distributed more wildly and tend to contribute directly to local economies which in theory makes them excellent tourists for the Eastern Cape. The Eastern Cape of South Africa remains one of the country’s most impoverished areas and is characterized by extreme levels of uneven development. The Eastern Cape is a frontier of social and ecological diversity, potential and economic opportunity, which could significantly benefit from sustainable tourism development.

This research will offer a multi-disciplinary perspective incorporating economic, environmental and social issues surrounding the implementation of an ecotourism industry. A framework for sustainable ecotourism development will be created using indicators developed by the World Tourism Organization (WTO, 2004). The development and use of indicators is increasingly being viewed as a fundamental part of destination planning and management, and an integral element in efforts to promote sustainable development for the tourism sector at all scales. This framework will then be applied to the ecotourism industry in the Eastern Cape. Case studies of three municipalities with tourism potential will be discussed to gain a comprehensive view of the challenges and opportunities for ecotourism within the Eastern Cape.

The end result of this project is to create a better understanding of the tourism-environment relationship, and to explore how ecotourism and backpackers can contribute to sustainable development. A framework of indicators for sustainable ecotourism
represents the final product of this research. This framework is unique in the fact that it captures social, economic and environmental issues, while traditionally tourism studies tend to be narrow in focus. While it cannot possibly grasp all of the relevant features of an area, this framework will allow a destination to gain an initial view of their tourism industry and the areas in which further research and development need to take place. This framework could be applied by local governments and organizations to aid in the planning and management of ecotourism both in South Africa and other developing nations, and lead to improvements in both the physical and social environments.

1.2 Supporting Theoretical Perspective

The supporting theoretical framework for this research is the theory of Social Justice. John Rawls offers one of the most comprehensive examinations of social justice: based on the fair and equitable distribution of goods in society as well as individual freedom (Fennel, 2006). Justice is something that can be found within all cultures. It is hinged on what is right for individuals in association with what is right for the group (Fennel, 2006). Rawls argues that the best way of making socially just decisions is to set-a-side one’s distinguishing social characteristics, a position he termed the veil of ignorance, in order that we try to be as fair to everyone in our decision making as possible (Fennel, 2006).

Tourism is very much a justice issue; it is fraught with disparities, racism and corporate power (Fennel 2006). The indicators developed and applied through this research, have been so in the effort to put the benefits of the many (communities) over
the benefits of the few (industry leaders). Rawls theory urges us to conceive of society as “a fair system of cooperation over time, from one generation to the next” (Garrett, 2005). This is applicable to ecotourism, and sustainability as it is necessary to preserve the environment for future generations, while meeting the economic, environmental and social needs of current generations.

1.3 Research Purpose, Objectives and Contribution

Little research has been done on ecotourism within the Eastern Cape of South Africa. This area remains one of the most disadvantaged provinces of South Africa as a result of a history of apartheid and underdevelopment. The Eastern Cape also contains all seven of South Africa’s biomes and offers an unrivalled range of climates, landscapes and cultures (Eastern Cape Tourism Board, 2009). The variety of natural capital and the need for local economic development make ecotourism an excellent opportunity. This research will attempt to fill the void of academic research on ecotourism promotion within the Eastern Cape.

A case study approach is used for this research to gain a comprehensive view of the potential for ecotourism within local municipalities throughout the Eastern Cape. Three municipalities were choosen based on levels of development, natural capital, location and ecotourism potential. In order to determine the challenges and opportunities for ecotourism development, a set of indicators developed by the world tourism organization have been adopted. Based upon the information collected in response to the indicators the opportunities and challenges for ecotourism development will be identified.
The thesis is broadly structured around the following research objectives and questions:

1. Are tourism and sustainability compatible, specifically in South Africa?

2. What are the challenges and opportunities for ecotourism development in South Africa’s Eastern Cape?

3. What role do indicators play in sustainable tourism development?

These questions will be revisited in Chapter 7 and 8. This research will contribute to the literature on ecotourism, sustainable development and tourism indicators. The framework of sustainability indicators and recommendations for the Eastern Cape represent the final products of this research and will hopefully add support to the development of a sustainable ecotourism industry, not only within the Eastern Cape, but elsewhere in the world.
Chapter 2

Literature Review

2.1 Tourism

2.1.1 The Meaning of Tourism:

Regardless of the reasons- religious practice, social interaction, leisure activities, cultural exchange or just plain curiosity- people like to travel (Burkart & Medlik, 1974). Proof of this can be found in the fact that the demand for travel and tourism services is growing at a faster rate than ever before. As the tourism industry continues to grow attempts to define the meaning and nature of tourism have also continued to grow. A review of tourism literature, done by Hunt and Layne (1991), reveals that inconsistencies in the meaning of tourism have existed since it was first articulated in the early 19th century. Since the appearance of the term in the English language, there have been more than 550 variations of tourism definitions (Hunt & Layne, 1991). It has been concluded, by a number of studies, that a concise and universal definition, valid for all types of tourist study, is neither necessary nor desirable (US Department of Commerce, 1967, Western Council for Travel Research, 1963, National Tourism Resources Review, 1973).

Throughout the mid 1970’s, however, there was a growing interest in standardizing definitions in travel and tourism (Hunt & Layne, 1991). The World Tourism Organization (WTO) analyzed the definitions used by 22 countries and concluded that three elements were common to all definitions: (1) residence of tourists,
(2) geographical setting of tourism and (3) duration of travel (Hunt & Layne, 1991). The WTO developed a definition in the broadest sense which included only the elements necessary to facilitate the collection of data and comparison between countries (Hunt & Layne, 1991). The definition proposed by the WTO and subsequently endorsed by the UN Statistical Commission was: “Tourism comprises the activities of persons traveling to and staying in places outside their usual environment for not more than one consecutive year for leisure, business, or other purposes” (Holden, 2000). It has been widely accepted that tourism does not need to be defined with precision, but should instead represent an umbrella term covering all aspects of a tourist’s activities. Although there is no definitive definition of tourism, this brief introduction to the meaning of tourism demonstrates its complexity.

2.1.2 The Current Tourism Industry:

Tourism is widely recognized as the world’s largest industry. At a global level the World Travel and Tourism Council has measured that in 2000, the travel and tourism industry constituted 11 percent of global GDP (US $3575 billion) and supported 200 million jobs worldwide (Page & Hall, 2006). By 2010 the economic contribution of travel and tourism is estimated to grow to 11.6 per cent (US $6591 billion) of global GDP and will support 250 million jobs (1 in every 11 jobs) (Page & Hall, 2006).

Although these represent impressive statistics, and reference is often made to tourism being one of the world’s largest industries, trying to define the tourism industry is extremely difficult. The tourism industry cannot be considered similar to other
industries as it does not produce a single identifiable product and its services are not used exclusively by tourist (Holden, 2000). When the term tourist industry is used it is important to recognize that it is a combination of different businesses and organizations connected by the common factor of providing services to tourists.

Another approach to understanding tourism is to think of tourism as a system incorporating not only businesses and tourists, but also societies and environments. Some argue that tourism should be interpreted as a system because every part of tourism is related to every other part, and that no manager or owner involved in the tourism system has complete control over his or her own destiny (Gunn 1994, Holden 2000). An advantage of a systems approach is that it allows the complexity of a real life situation to be accounted for in a simple model, demonstrating the inter linkages of all the different elements (Page 1995, Holden 2000). Interpreting tourism as a system also discourages one-dimensional thinking and facilitates a multi-disciplinary perspective (Laws 1991 as found in Holden, 2000).

In recent years tourism has seen dramatic growth, and many countries which had previously experienced little tourism have developed as international destinations. Tourists are demanding the experience of new cultures and physical environments which has led to indigenous cultures and special physical environments becoming the focus of tourism (Poon, 1993). As the peripheries of tourism continue to be stretched the social, economic, and environmental impacts of tourism continue to become more dramatic.
2.1.3 The Impacts of Tourism

The impacts of tourism are traditionally divided into three major categories: economic, environmental and socio-cultural. It can be argued that this three-fold division is inadequate for there are other consequences of tourism, such as political and institutional effects, which do not tightly fit into one of these three categories (Wall, 2001). This division is somewhat artificial but convenient, however, as it allows us to distinguish between varying impacts.

Impacts are both direct and indirect. This is most clearly articulated in economics where visitor spending is seen as a direct economic impact, while the expenditures of the hotel on supplies to meet tourist demands are indirect (Wall, 2001). Similar phenomena occur in the environmental and social domains as impacts ripple through the respective systems and give rise to additional associated consequences (Wall, 2001).

The impacts of tourism are highly dependent on the type of tourism, the community characteristics and the nature of the host-guest relationship in any given tourism project (Wall, 2001). These three groups of factors are likely to be associated with consequences of different magnitudes and types, but are relevant across economic, environmental, and social domains (Wall, 2001). It is very dangerous to over-generalize the impacts of tourism. There are an abundance of different tourism types that occur in a range of locations, each with varying implications. Even if changes associated with tourism could be identified with certainty, they will not necessarily be regarded in a similar manner by different people with different values and different types of
involvement in tourism (Wall, 2001). Large numbers of visitors may be welcomed by the business community but resented by individuals who are searching for peace and quiet.

The impacts of tourism are large, diverse, growing, vary by gender and socio-economic status, difficult to assess and challenging to manage (Wall, 2001). As tourism is one of the most rapidly growing industries in the world, it is vital that its impacts are foreseen and understood, so that they can be accurately incorporated into environmental planning and management.

2.1.4 Tourism and Environment Relationship

The natural environment is fundamental to the success of tourism (Krippendorf, 1982). Today there is a growing interest in the environmental effects of tourism from governments, non-governmental organizations (NGO’s), the private sector, academics, and the public. This interest is reflective of a marked change in attitudes to our interaction with the environment that has occurred within the last few decades (Holden, 2000). Until the 1970’s tourism remained largely immune from environmental criticism, the image of tourism being of an environmentally friendly activity; the smokeless industry (Holden, 2000). During the 1970’s, questions about the environmental impacts of tourism began to be raised more widely, as tourism expanded internationally and the negative effects of its development became more obvious. The acknowledgement of the negative effects of tourism lead the Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development to establish, in 1977, a group of experts to examine the interaction between tourism and the environment (Holden, 2000; Page and Dowling, 2001).
During the 1980’s the spread of mass tourism into new areas, including south-east Asia, Africa and the Caribbean, meant that there was increasing focus on tourism as a form of economic development in less developed countries (Holden, 2000). On top of economic development, this focus also included concern over the environmental and cultural consequences of tourism development. The importance of stewardship of resources and the inclusion of community views were both advocated for tourism development planning (Page and Dowling, 2001). The awareness that tourism could have negative effects was increasingly being recognized by NGO’s. Pressure groups such as Tourism Concern, and the Ecotourism Society were established in the 1980’s to promote ethically based tourism for both indigenous peoples and the environment (Holden, 2000). There was also evidence of increasing dissatisfaction by tourists with areas that were perceived as being overdeveloped, or having lost their original attractiveness (Barke and France, 1996).

In the 1990’s the tourism industry began to take action over the environment, with many tour operators, hotels and airlines attempting to improve their environmental credibility (Holden, 2000; Page and Dowling, 2001).

2.2 Ecotourism

2.2.1 The Rise of Ecotourism: Definitions

The rise of the term ecotourism has been relatively rapid. In 1970 the term did not exist and now more than 30 years later, the term ecotourism has become the subject of much debate. Although the origins of the term ecotourism are not entirely clear, it
developed within the atmosphere of the environmental movement in the 1970’s and 1980’s (Blamey, 2001). Since its inception, ecotourism has consistently grown, and is now widely considered the fastest growing sub-component of the tourism industry (Donohoe and Needham, 2006; Pforr, 2001; Page and Dowling, 2001; Fennell, 2003). The proliferation of ecotourism has generated interest from a multitude of stakeholders as it attempts to satisfy contrasting conservation and tourism development needs (Donohoe and Needham, 2006; Pforr, 2001). As a result researchers from a wide range of perspective have become actively involved in the complexities and confusions associated with ecotourism. Despite such intense interest, nearly 25 years after the first definition of ecotourism was published, there remains little consensus and a great deal of confusion about its meaning (Donohoe and Needham, 2006; Page and Dowling, 2001). This lack of definition, although characteristic of the broader tourism discourse, is causing numerous difficulties for managers and planners who are in need of operational guidance (Donohoe and Needham, 2006; Fennell, 2003). This has lead to the ecotourism industry developing into many different forms which puts at risk the natural environment upon which it depends, the environmental ethics upon which it is conceptualized and the legitimacy of the ecotourism industry itself.

The first formal definition and one of the most widely embraced definitions of ecotourism is credited to Ceballos-Lascurain in 1983 and focuses on the importance of natural areas, cognitive and affective domains, and behavior:
“Traveling to relatively undisturbed or uncontaminated natural areas with the specific objective of studying, admiring and enjoying the scenery and its wild plants and animals, as well as any existing cultural manifestations (both past and present) found in these areas (Ceballos-Lascurain, 1987 in Fennell, 2001).”

Since the first formal definition of ecotourism in 1983 hundreds more have been written both by individuals and organizations alike. Despite some of the limitations of Ceballos-Lascurain’s definition aspects of this original have been built into many of the more recent definitions of ecotourism.

A number of comprehensive studies of ecotourism definitions have been completed (Fennell, 2001; Donohoe and Needham, 2006; Pforr, 2001), and within these studies a number of variables re-emerge throughout the majority of definitions. Fennell (2001) identified five of the most frequently cited variables within ecotourism definitions as, (1) reference to where ecotourism occurs (natural areas), (2) conservation, (3) reference to culture, (4) benefits to locals, and (5) education. It has been suggested that for ecotourism, and tourism in general, precise definitions are perhaps unnecessary, and it would be unreasonable to assume that any one definition of ecotourism would suffice. Fennell (2001) suggests that there may be some root variables, as identified above, that should be included in forthcoming definitions of ecotourism. From this basis, industry, government, NGO’s and academics could then develop definitions that are more
consistent with their own local conditions, which in turn would emphasize local values (Fennell, 2001).

2.2.2 Characteristics and Principles of Ecotourism:

Most academics would agree that real ecotourism is more than travel to enjoy or appreciate nature; it also involves a number of important characteristics and principles. Ecotourism comprises a number of interrelated components all of which should be present for authentic ecotourism to occur. Page and Dowling (2001) identify five core principles fundamental to ecotourism they are (1) nature-based, (2) ecologically sustainable, (3) environmentally and culturally educative, (4) locally beneficial, and (5) generates tourist satisfaction. These core principles are consistent with the five most common variables found in ecotourism definitions identified by Fennell with the addition of tourist satisfaction. The first three characteristics are considered to be essential for a product to be considered ecotourism, while the last two are viewed as being desirable for all forms of tourism (Dowling, 1996).

2.2.2.1 Nature Based:

Ecotourism is based on the natural environment with a focus on its biological, physical and cultural features. Ecotourism occurs in, and depends on, a natural setting. The conservation of the natural resource is essential to the planning development and management of ecotourism (Krippendorf 1982, Page and Dowling 2001).
2.2.2.2 Ecologically Sustainable:

Ecotourism, in theory, is ecologically sustainable tourism undertaken in a natural setting. Yet, even this phrase is fraught with philosophical and operational problems. The incorporation of ‘eco’ in the title suggests that ecotourism should be an ecologically responsible form of tourism that employs sound environmental management and maintenance of environmental capital which in turn should provide a viable economic alternative to exploitation of the environment (Carter, 1994).

Ecotourism has the potential to bring considerable attention to how tourism as a whole may be made more ecologically sustainable. The substantial goal of protecting or enhancing the environment represents both the strengths and weaknesses of ecotourism (Page and Dowling, 2001). Its strength is that ecotourism differentiates itself from the more traditional consumptive forms of tourism, while its weakness is inherent in the tension that often prevails between achieving economic goals at the expense of ecological aims (Page and Dowling, 2001). The ecotourism industry faces the paradoxical situation that the more popular the product becomes, the more difficult it becomes to provide.

2.2.2.3 Environmentally and Culturally Educative:

A key feature of ecotourism is education and interpretation about the natural environment and any associated cultural manifestations. There are two main purposes of environmental education in the context of ecotourism. The first purpose is to satisfy the tourist demand for information regarding natural and cultural attractions, thereby providing a satisfying recreational experience (Blamey, 2001). The second involves
changing in a pro-environmental way, the knowledge, attitudes and/or behaviors of tourists, with a view to minimizing negative impacts and producing a more environmentally and culturally aware citizenry (Blamey, 2001).

2.2.2.4 Locally Beneficial:

The involvement of local communities is not only beneficial to the community and the environment but it also improves the quality of the tourism experience (Page and Dowling, 2001). Local communities should have the opportunity to become involved in ecotourism operations, and in the provision of knowledge, services, facilities and products (Page and Dowling, 2001). Drumm (1998) argued that local communities view ecotourism as a development alternative, which can enable them to improve their living standards without having to sell off their natural resources or compromise their culture. Norris (1992) noted that ecotourism should integrate both the protection of resources with the provision of local economic benefits, such as generating revenue for management of natural areas and the creation of employment opportunities for the local population.

2.2.2.5 Tourist Satisfaction:

Satisfaction of visitors with the ecotourism experience is essential to the long-term viability of the ecotourism industry. This incorporates elements of the visitor experience, the ecotourism experience and visitor safety (Page and Dowling, 2001).

2.2.3 Ecotourism and its Relationship to Other Tourism Types

Part of the confusion and complexity that accompanies ecotourism is due to the wide range of different types of tourism that share commonalities with ecotourism, and
the varying positions that ecotourism occupies within the broader umbrella of tourism. The term ecotourism has co-evolved along with a number of related terms, including nature based tourism, adventure tourism, alternative tourism, and trekking (Weaver, 2001). Although all of the above types of tourism have many similarities they are not synonymous, and should not be considered one and the same.

Ecotourism has often been portrayed as being indistinguishable from nature-based, or nature tourism. This tendency was likely fostered by the association of nature with a relatively unspoiled environment, and with the close association between ecotourism and that same sort of pristine environment (Weaver, 2001). However ecotourism implies adherence to some set of sustainability values, while nature-based tourism is simply leisure travel that involves utilization of the natural environment (Ingram and Durst, 1987). There is growing consensus that ecotourism is just one component within the broad category of nature based tourism.

As with nature tourism, the term adventure tourism has sometimes been used interchangeably with ecotourism. Adventure tourism is differentiated from ecotourism by three main factors (a) an element of risk in the tourism experience, (b) higher levels of physical exertion by the participant, and (c) the need for specialized skill to facilitate successful participation (Weaver, 2001). Activities associated with adventure tourism include things like white water rafting, wilderness hiking and skydiving. The essential factor that places such activities within adventure tourism and not ecotourism is the nature of the interaction with the surrounding environment. Where ecotourism places the
stress on an educative or appreciative interaction with the environment, adventure tourists are primarily interested in accessing settings that facilitate the desired level of risk (Weaver, 2001). The relationship between ecotourism and adventure tourism is one of partial overlap; the harder, or more dedicated forms of ecotourism will entail a significant element of risk and therefore fall into both categories.

Trekking is a form of tourism activity that typically entails some combination of distance hiking, visits to local villages, adventure experiences, and nature/scenery appreciation (Weaver, 2001). Trekking, therefore, represents a combination of cultural tourism, ecotourism and adventure tourism in varying degrees. Fennell (1999) describes such combinations as ACE tourism (adventure, cultural, ecotourism) and acknowledges that these combinations are preferred by some practitioners and marketers over terms such as ecotourism. Combinations of tourism types are popular for a number of reasons. Firstly there are many circumstances where it is virtually impossible to differentiate among the three components; the distinctions are not likely to be made by tourists as they simultaneously engage in cultural, nature-based and adventurous activities (Weaver, 2001). Secondly, such a synthesized tourism product may be popular among consumers seeking a diversified and more holistic tourism experience, as opposed to one that is over specialized (Weaver, 2001).

Within the tourism literature, ecotourism is commonly regarded as a form of alternative tourism. Alternative tourism was introduced in the early 1980’s as a response to the negative effects of mass tourism. Typically this relationship is depicted in
dichotomous terms, with alternative tourism being the good option and mass tourism the bad option (Weaver, 2001). However this perspective is being increasingly challenged. This new perspective suggests that alternative tourism and mass tourism are merely at opposite ends of a continuum, and that the movement from one to the other is a matter of slight transition rather than abrupt boundary (Weaver, 2001). As the line between mass tourism and alternative tourism becomes blurred so too does the boundary between mass tourism and ecotourism.

For many academics and practitioners the idea of large-scale or mass ecotourism is an oxymoron. However, while small scale ecotourism projects are more likely to meet the requirement of sustainability, there is no reason why a large-scale product cannot be sustainable (Weaver, 2001). Most ecotourism activity in high profile ecotourism destinations, such as Costa Rica and Kenya, already fits into this category of “mass ecotourism”. Ecotourism can strengthen the mass tourism product by offering opportunities for diversification, as well as impart a culture of sustainability and environmental awareness to the mainstream sector (Weaver, 2001). In turn mass tourism creates a larger market of ecotourists which helps to position ecotourism as an important stakeholder capable of lobbying with stakeholders in other competing sectors such as agriculture and logging (Weaver, 2001).

This research will adopt the definition developed by The International Ecotourism Society (TIES). TIES defines ecotourism as “responsible travel to natural areas that conserves the environment and improves the well being of local people.” (TIES, 1990)
Along with this definition TIES believes that those who participate and implement ecotourism activities should follow the following principles:

- Minimize Impact
- Build environmental and cultural awareness and respect
- Provide positive experiences for both visitors and hosts
- Provide direct financial benefits for conservation
- Provide financial benefits and empowerment for local people
- Raise sensitivity to host countries’ political, environmental and social climate

(TIES, 1990).

This definition is broad in perspective and includes the most common variables identified by Fennel (2001), and others. For a more elaborate and in depth analysis of ecotourism definitions please see A Content Analysis of Ecotourism Definitions (Fennell, 2001) or Ecotourism the Evolving Contemporary Definition (Donohoe and Needham, 2006).

2.2.4 Impacts of Ecotourism:

2.2.4.1 Environmental

Impacts of ecotourism in sensitive environments include overcrowding, overdevelopment, unregulated recreation, pollution, wildlife disturbance, and vehicle use (Page and Dowling, 2001). These effects are magnified for ecotourism, because ecotourism is highly dependent on relatively pristine natural environments in order to attract new travelers (Page and Dowling, 2006). Ecotourists often visit environmentally
sensitive areas, during sensitive seasons, and may cause off-site, as well as on-site impacts (Page and Dowling, 2001).

McLaren (1998) suggested that tourism development, even in ecotourism destinations, is often at odds with both ecological preservation and local use. McLaren (1998) argued that the patterns of tourism development divert resources (energy, land and water) away from the local population to accommodate the tourist sector. It also puts heavy stress on the environment, since tourist sites require reconstruction of the landscape and increased use of petroleum products and toxins (Page and Dowling, 2001). While ecotourism attempts to be both environmentally and culturally sensitive, and adhere to a low-impact ethic, ecotourists still hike, camp, and have measurable impacts on protected areas, impacts that are often compounded with those of other tourists, recreationists and even local residents (Page and Dowling, 2001).

2.2.4.2 Social

The study of the social impacts of ecotourism has tended to focus on how the industry has affected local people and their lifestyles. While economic impacts may be measured and quantified, social and cultural impacts on visitors and host communities are often only considered when tourism development leads to local opposition (Page and Dowling, 2001). According to Fox (1977) cited in Mathieson and Wall (1982: 133) cited in Page and Dowling (2001: 170):
“The social and cultural impacts of tourism are the ways in which tourism is contributing to changes in value systems, individual behavior, family relationships, collective lifestyles, safety levels, moral conduct, creative expressions, traditional ceremonies and community organizations.”

These impacts result from the introduction of tourists to host communities. The analysis of social and cultural impacts of ecotourism involves not only the analysis of the tourist and the host, but also the relationship between them (Page and Dowling, 2001).

As with the natural environment the socio-cultural environment serves as both an attraction and a recipient of ecotourism’s impacts, and if these impacts become too negative the local sustainability of ecotourism can be jeopardized. One of the main concerns for the ecotourism industry is to ensure that the local population is not alienated or adversely impacted, to the point that they may want to deny or limit tourist access to a particular resource or area (Page and Dowling, 2001).

One of the key principles of ecotourism is that it is locally beneficial, which raises issues related to the empowerment of local people, and the degree of control local people have over tourism ventures (Page and Dowling, 2001). Ecotourism especially small-scale development, provides opportunities for local empowerment, encourages the use of local knowledge and labor, promotes local ownership, perpetuates local identity and strengthens economic equity (Page and Dowling, 2001, Scheyvens, 1999). Although ecotourism has the potential to empower local communities, according to Zeiger and
MacDonald (1997) ecotourism also raises the risk of “hit and run” tourism. This is described as an influx of nature lovers to the latest wild spot, followed by its abandonment once discovered and degraded.

Ecotourism has the possibility to be a powerful social force, the impacts of which could include improving individual well being, fostering cross cultural understanding, facilitating learning, contributing to cultural protection, supplementing development, fostering environmental protection, promoting peace and inspiring a global consciousness which contributes to the formation of a global society (Higgins-Desboilles, 2006). But as Scheyvens (1999) noted, for ecotourism ventures to be considered successful local communities must have some measure of control over them and share equitably in the benefits.

2.2.4.3 Economic

Ecotourism is increasingly being viewed as a mechanism to aid ailing economies, and in less developed countries, to stimulate economic development. There is a prevailing perception, among local and national governments, that economic benefits accrue to tourism destinations which then create employment opportunities and stimulate the development process while providing a positive contribution to the local economy (Page and Dowling, 2001). Although tourism will always create an infusion of money into local economies, the amount of money that stays in that economy, and the stability of that income are subject to a number of factors (Fennel, 1999).
Tourism is a fickle industry, being highly seasonal, which has implications for investment and the type of employment created (Page and Dowling, 2001). Tourism employment is often characterized as being low skill, poorly paid, and lacking stability. The demand for tourism can easily be influenced by external factors which are beyond the control of destination areas, tsunamis and hurricanes being excellent examples (Page and Dowling, 2001). Lastly the motivations for tourist travel are complex and variable and are constantly changing in the competitive marketplace.

The evaluation of the economic impact of tourism can be a long and complicated task. One immediate problem is that there is little agreement within the literature on what constitutes the tourism industry. After such a working definition has been agreed upon for the purpose of economic analysis, isolating the flow of income in the local tourism economy is extremely difficult. There are a range of factors which influence the economic impact of tourism, these include:

- the volume and scale of tourist expenditure in the locality;
- the state of economic development and economy in the individual city;
- the size and nature of the local economy;
- the extent to which tourist expenditure circulates around the local economy;
- and, the degree to which the local economy has addressed the problem of seasonality (Page, 1995 found in Page and Dowling, 2001).
On the basis of these factors it is possible to assess whether the economic impact will be beneficial or if it will have a detrimental effect. In this way it is possible to identify some of the commonly cited economic benefits and costs of tourism.

Table 2-1: Commonly cited economic benefits and costs of tourism development.
(Adapted from Page and Dowling, 2001).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Benefits</th>
<th>Costs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-the generation of income for the local economy</td>
<td>-the potential for economic overdependence on one particular form of activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-the creation of new employment opportunities</td>
<td>-inflationary costs in the local economy as new consumers enter the area and potential increases in land prices as the tourism development cycle commences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-improvements to the structure and balance of economic activities within the locality</td>
<td>-a growing dependence on imported rather than locally produced goods, services and labour as the development of facilities and infrastructure proceeds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-encouraging entrepreneurial activity.</td>
<td>-seasonality in the consumption and production of tourism services leading to limited returns on investments.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-contributes to local infrastructure</td>
<td>-leakages of tourism expenditure from the local economy.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.3 Ecotourism in the Developing World: A tool for development

2.3.1 Current Extent of Ecotourism in the Developing World

Since the mid 1990’s wild areas have increasingly been integrated with the global economy through ecotourism. The basic economic appeal of tourism lies in its contributions to foreign exchange earnings, and creations of employment and income. Organizations as diverse as the World Bank, development NGOs (non-government
organizations), indigenous rights groups, tour operators, bilateral donors, and environmental NGOs have all placed faith in ecotourism as a sustainable development strategy (Duffy, 2006).

One of the most noticeable characteristics of ecotourism growth is the continuous thrust to the periphery, such that most, if not all, regions of the world are now touched by tourism and its effects (Butler, 2002). Such trends have been fueled by tourists increasing interest in natural environments, traditional cultures, and in places that are truly different from their home situations. The developing world has an undeniable competitive advantage in terms of the variety and extent of unspoiled natural environments (Carter, 1994, Brohman, 1996). Ecotourism offers tourism companies and destination areas the opportunity of capitalizing on this comparative advantage. The significance of ecotourism in terms of tourism revenue to certain individual developing nations is obvious when prime ecotourism destinations are examined. Table 2.1 shows how the increasing popularity of ecotourism is evidenced by the growth in receipts over the past two decades
Table 2-2: Growth in tourism to selected destinations.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Tourist Arrivals (Thousands)</th>
<th>Tourism Receipts (US$ Millions)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Belize</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecuador</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dominica</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kenya</td>
<td>373</td>
<td>801</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Botswana</td>
<td>227</td>
<td>844</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madagascar</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The promotion of ecotourism provides opportunities for developing countries to capitalize on bountiful natural attractions. For the eco-tourist such destinations provide a unique experience of natural environments which contrast with the environments of their homes. Ecotourism, however, contains heavy economic and non-economic costs which taken together, may raise doubts about the development potential of tourism (Dieke, 1989). Ecotourism as a development tool raises a variety of issues, with both positive and negative components, which will be outlined in the following sections.

2.3.2 Issues and Effects of Tourism in the Developing World:

Historically tourism in developing nations has been allowed to develop with very little planning or regulation. This has resulted in unexpected problems and dramatic changes to destination areas (Doan, 2000). There are a number of common problems that have been linked to “Third World Tourism” which calls into question its usefulness as a development strategy (Brohman, 1996). According to Brohman (1996) these problems
include foreign domination and dependency, socio-economic and spatial polarization, environmental destruction, cultural alienation and the loss of social control and identity among host communities.

2.3.2.1 Foreign Domination and Dependency:

The domination of third world tourism and ecotourism by multinational enterprises tends to reproduce historical patterns of inequality between developed and developing nations (Brohman, 1996). Foreign domination and external dependency often seriously reduce tourism’s potential for generating growth, and financial advantages in developing economies (Brohman, 1996). The foreign authority over the Third World tourism industry has also lead to loss of control over local resources, which in turn can have adverse effects on the social, economic and ecological well being of host communities.

Foreign domination of the tourism industry often contributes to the overseas leakage of a substantial portion of tourism earnings. In many tourism sectors, multinationals construct and own a major part of hotel accommodations, restaurants and other services, as well as the principal transportation links and travel agencies (Khan, Chou and Wong, 1990). Profit repatriations and payments for imported goods and services widen the leakage of foreign exchange earnings from tourism and often put a heavy burden on the host country’s balance of payments (Brohman, 1996). Data collected by a number of authors show that such leakages are often substantial, especially in smaller countries with tourism sectors dominated by foreign control.
### Table 2-3: Leakage in Third World Tourism Destination

(Britton, 1987; English, 1986; Khan, Chou and Wong, 1990; Richards, 1983; Seward and Spinard, 1982; cited in Brohman, 1996)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Destination</th>
<th>% Profits lost to Leakages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cook Islands</td>
<td>50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Lucia</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahamas</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antigua, Aruba, Hong Kong</td>
<td>41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Leakages can be reduced through more dispersed, smaller-scale, locally owned operations that tend to be better linked to the local economy. Studies of the Cook Islands done by Milne (1987) argue that small, locally owned firms are more successful in generating income, employment, and government revenue than larger, internationally owned establishments. Small-scale ecotourism operations are seen as a plausible alternative to conventional resorts as a means of increasing local benefits and decreasing foreign leakage.

2.3.2.2 Socio-economic and Spatial Polarization

In many Third World Countries tourism has reinforced longstanding patterns of socioeconomic and spatial polarization (Brohman, 1996). In the Caribbean, for example, a pronounced spatial dichotomy has evolved between a privileged space along choice spots of coastline and an underprivileged space in the interior of the country (Brohman,
1996). This illustrates the tendency of tourism to perpetuate existing structural and spatial inequalities in destination countries.

2.3.2.3 Environmental Destruction and Cultural Alienation

As more and more of the Third World is being subjected to ecologically destructive and unsustainable forms of tourism, development conflicts have begun to emerge among various operations and other economic sectors and social groups (Brohman, 1996). Ecological destruction from international tourism has the potential to provoke considerable anger as local people see their environments being consumed by international tourists. In addition to environmental destruction, other problems that often accompany tourism (overcrowding, resource use, rising crime and the loss of cultural identity) have contributed to a perception among the local population of a declining quality of life which in turn has lead to negative perceptions and attitudes towards tourism and tourists (Tsartas, 1992).

In many Third World destinations contact with the indigenous culture tends to be packaged rather than spontaneous and contrived rather than original (Brohman, 1996). Increasingly local people feel a sense of alienation rooted in feelings of a loss of social control and cultural identity. This can be manifested in strong feelings of resentment towards foreign tourists- evident in the following quote from a native Hawaiian at a conference on Third World Tourism:
“We don’t want tourism. We don’t want you. We don’t want to be degraded as servants and dancers. This is cultural prostitution. I don’t want to see a single one of you in Hawaii. There are no innocent tourists” (quoted in Pfafflin found in Brohman, 1996, pp 59).

Tourism clearly has the potential to lead to many negative issues in developing nations. The following sections will demonstrate ways in which the effects of tourism in developing countries can be remediated through alternative forms of tourism, such as ecotourism, and through better planning and more collaboration between tourism providers and host communities.

2.3.3 Ecotourism Policy, Government Intervention and Planning

2.3.3.1 Policy and Government Intervention

The previous discussion clearly illustrates that ecotourism in the Third World cannot be regarded as some sort of miracle hybrid, bringing numerous returns without any adverse impacts (Carter, 1994). A proactive stance needs to be taken by local governments to ensure that the benefits of ecotourism are maximized while the adverse effects are minimized. Allowing the free play of market forces is not conducive to sustainable outcomes, as the carrying capacity of destinations will continue to be exceeded as environmental costs continue to be externalized (Carter, 1994). According to de Kadt (1992) there is a need to “force tourism companies to internalize these
externalities by building in appropriate cost and price signals, via legislation, together with incentives and disincentives, such as appropriate taxation measures” (cited in Carter, 1994). Without state intervention tourism development will likely lack the cohesion and direction necessary to sustain itself over the long term.

Nelson (1993) has developed an action strategy for sustainable tourism development, where he argues state intervention is necessary in a number of areas, including:

- Undertaking area and sector specific research on overall tourism effects.
- Assisting and supporting lower levels of government to develop their own tourism development strategies in conjunction with conservation strategies.
- Developing standards and regulations for environmental and cultural impact assessments, and monitoring and auditing existing and proposed tourism developments.
- Designing and implementing public consultation techniques and processes in order to involve all stakeholders in making tourism related decisions.
- Designing and implementing educational and awareness programs which will sensitize people to the issues of sustainable tourism development.
- Developing design and construction standards which will ensure that tourism development projects are sympathetic with local culture and natural environments.
- Ensuring that carrying capacities of tourism destinations reflect sustainable levels of development and are monitored and adjusted appropriately.

- Regulating and controlling tourism in environmentally and culturally sensitive areas, and incorporating tourism in land-use and spatial planning.

In many developing countries, more active involvement by the state is needed to coordinate tourism with other economic sectors and with national planning objectives (Brohman, 1996). In order to ensure the equitable division of tourism benefits state intervention may be necessary to allow local residents to take better advantage of tourism opportunities (Brohman, 1996).

2.3.3.2 Ecotourism Planning

Uncontrolled tourism development is a market led view of tourism that simply provides attractions, facilities and services that the tourist market demands (Timothy and Tosun, 2003). The ad hoc nature of unregulated tourism development lacks long term vision and usually results in environmental degradation and loss of socio-cultural integrity, even though it brings short term economic benefits (Timothy and Tosun, 2003). In order for ecotourism in developing nations to be successful, those countries have to recognize the importance of, and need for comprehensive planning. In recent decades, several tourism planning paradigms have emerged with the general aim to reduce tourism’s negative impacts and enhance its positive impacts (Timothy, 1998). These paradigms include community-based or participatory planning- where locally defined
goals and local development are an integral part of tourism planning, incremental planning- which allows for high levels of predictability and flexibility, and collaborative or cooperative planning- where all stakeholders are permitted and encouraged to participate in the decision making process (Timothy, 1998; Getz, 1986).

Another tourism planning paradigm is integrative planning which seeks to integrate tourism into the overall plan and total development strategy of a country or region (Timothy, 1998). Timothy (1998) has stressed the importance of not singling out tourism alone for development, but rather, it should be planned in conjunction with a region’s broader development goals (Timothy, 1998). Integrative tourism development requires cooperation between a large number of planning sectors. In the case of tourism, integrative planning is especially difficult to accomplish, as there is no other industry that is linked to so many diverse and different kinds of products and services (Timothy, 1998).

In a more recent development in tourism planning, Timothy and Tosun (2003) have combined three prominent planning theories to create a normative model of destination community tourism planning referred to as PIC planning. PIC refers to the three broad planning strategies described previously: participation, incremental and collaboration/cooperation. Figure 2.0 outlines these three principles, which ought to be paramount in the planning process if the goals of sustainability are to be met in the communities where the tourist experience takes place.
Figure 2-1: PIC planning principles: Steps in the Planning Process

(Timothy and Tosun, 2003)

The approaches and principles in the PIC model are not meant to replace procedural planning, but instead should function as the broader context within which the comprehensive planning steps should be taken (Timothy and Tosun, 2003). Participatory and collaborative principles should be included at every stage of the planning process while the principles of incremental planning fit best towards the end of the process when plans have been drafted and recommendations made (Timothy and Tosun, 2003).

Timothy and Tosun (2003) believe that if the PIC principles are utilized by destination

35
communities and their planners, a sustainable product will result, in which the sustainability of the industry and the destination will be more likely.

2.3.4 Collaboration and Community Involvement

One important aspect of PIC planning is collaboration and cooperation with communities. In many developing nations a better planned tourism development process is needed to spread the benefits and costs of tourism more equitably, and respond more sensitively to tourism’s social and cultural impacts. A community based approach to tourism development considers the needs and interests of the popular majority alongside the benefits of economic growth (Brohman, 1996). Community based tourism development would seek to strengthen institutions designed to enhance local participation and promote the economic, social and cultural well being of the majority (Brohman, 1996).

Tourism can be a positive force for development if the needs and interests of communities are given priority over the goals of the industry. Not only does involvement and collaboration increase benefits to the community there are also benefits to the industry; it has been found “that for long term stability of the tourism industry, residential input and positive residential attitudes are essential and that local attractions should only be promoted when endorsed by residents” (Clark 1988 cited in Brohman, 1996).

In most countries increased local participation in tourism requires institutional reform to provide possibilities for various groups to organize, represent themselves, and exert influence over decision making (Brohman, 1996). The institutional design of
tourism planning should facilitate the participation of various social groups that represent the diverse interests of the broader community (Brohman, 1996). In order for ecotourism to result in long term sustainable development, community involvement and collaboration are essential. Not only are local benefits a founding characteristic of ecotourism, they are also a significant component of sustainable development, which will be further discussed in the following section.

2.4 Ecotourism and Sustainable Development

2.4.1 Sustainable Development Defined

The growing awareness of the many challenges and pitfalls of traditional development has lead to the acceptance of a new concept- sustainable development. Over the past two decades sustainable development has become the watch word for international aid agencies, the jargon of development planners, the theme of conferences, and the slogan of developmental and environmental activists (Lele, 1991). Sustainable development (SD), much like tourism and ecotourism suffers from a lack of precise definition. While some believe that SD should not be defined too strictly, its lack of definition makes SD susceptible to misinterpretation, distortion, and even co-option (Lele, 1991).

When the World Commission on Environment and Development presented its 1987 report, Our Common Future, it sought to address the conflicts between environment and development goals by formulating the following definition of sustainable development:
“Sustainable development is development which meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.”
(WCED, 1987)

Since 1987, the concept of sustainable development has been extensively discussed and put to use. Over the past two decades there has generally been a recognition and consensus of three main aspects of sustainable development:

**Economic:** An economically sustainable system must be able to produce goods and services on a continuing basis, to maintain manageable levels of government and external debt, and to avoid extreme sectoral imbalances (Harris, 2001). Economic sustainability is an economic process that continues into the long-term, it is about ensuring we are not only concerned with the quantity of economic growth but also its quality (NZ Ministry of Economic Development, 2005).

**Environmental:** An environmentally sustainable system must maintain a stable resource base, avoiding over exploitation of renewable resource systems, and depleting non-renewable resources only to the extent that investment is made in adequate substitutes (Harris, 2001). This includes maintenance of biodiversity, atmospheric stability, and other ecosystem functions not ordinarily classed as economic resources.
Environmental sustainability is about maintaining and enhancing the capacity of our natural resources to supply environmental goods and services for people and nature (NZ Ministry of Economic Development, 2005).

**Social:** A socially sustainable system must achieve distributional equity, adequate provision of social services including health and education, gender equity and political accountability and participation (Harris, 2001). Social sustainability is about ensuring that as far as possible, all individuals are given the opportunity to participate and belong to their local communities as well as the wider society in which they live (NZ Ministry of Economic Development, 2005).

The principles of sustainable development outlined above have resonance at a common sense level; they represent a powerful, easily grasped concept which can have wide applicability (Harris, 2001). These principles suggest new guidelines for the development process; economic growth is clearly needed, but must be subject to global limits and should not be the prime objective for countries already at high levels of consumption (Harris, 2001). There is an obvious need for a process of development that not only achieves the traditional objectives, but also results in ecologically sustainable patterns of resources use and is implemented in a participatory manner (Lele, 1991). While sustainable development offers a more inclusive development process, accessible to people and countries in a variety of situations, it does not come without weakness.
2.4.2 Weaknesses of Sustainable Development

The basic impact of the sustainable development movement has been the rejection of the notion that environmental conservation necessarily constrains development or that development necessarily means environmental pollution (Lele, 1991). While this has been no small feat, the sustainable development movement has fallen short in its inability to develop a set of consistent and coherent concepts, criteria and policies. The Bruntland Commission’s definition of sustainable development (outlined above) is an imprecise statement that asks more questions than it answers. A great deal of controversy has surfaced regarding the true meaning, if indeed a universal one can be found, of this term (Dwivedi et al, 2001). There has also been a tendency to view the term as misleading, lulling citizens into the false belief that things are being done to benefit the environment in the long term, although in fact little is taking place (Dwivedi et al, 2001).

At the base of the sustainable development movement is the two-way link between poverty and environmental degradation (Lele, 1991). A large number of factors affect the relationship between poverty and environmental degradation and both have deep and complex causes. While these many factors have not been ignored, there has been a tendency in the mainstream sustainable development movement to largely focus on the technological and economic factors influencing poverty and environmental degradation while deeper socio-political factors and cultural values have been ignored (Lele, 1991).

Many past attempts at defining sustainability have been muddled; this has resulted in the very real danger of the term becoming a meaningless cliché, unless a significant
effort is made to add precision and content to the definition. In addition to muddled
definitions attempts at measuring sustainability create even more confusion (Campbell,
1996). Campbell (1996) argues that by adding the term sustainable to documents and
tools gives a false sense that sustainability is actually being achieved. Differentiating
between ecological and social sustainability should be a first step towards clarifying some
of the discussion (Lele, 1991). While many have attempted to define the ecological
principles of sustainability, it is imperative that the social conditions that determine
sustainability also be defined.

Sustainable development is a fairly demanding concept. It demands restraint from
current activities and for the sake not of current populations, but for future generations
whom we will never know personally. Beyond this there are many fundamental
disagreements about what types of activities merit condemnation or approval. It is
important that before sustainable development is incorporated into tourism we
acknowledge the many weaknesses inherent in this concept.

2.4.3 The Principles of Sustainability in Tourism

Since tourism and more specifically ecotourism do not have one comprehensive
or all encompassing definition, tourist activities are often examined or assessed according
to whether they satisfy a number of criteria of sustainability. The following subsections
will discuss a number of components of sustainability and their relation to tourism.
2.4.3.1 Ecological Sustainability

The need to avoid or minimize the environmental impact of tourist activities is clear. In terms of sustainable tourism, ecological sustainability is often the only aspect which is publically perceived. Maldonado et al (1992) suggest that the calculation of carrying capacities is an important method of assessing environmental impact and sustainability in tourism (Cited in Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

2.4.3.2 Social Sustainability

Social Sustainability in tourism refers to the ability of a community to absorb inputs, such as extra people, for short or long periods of time, and to continue functioning either without the creation of social disharmony or by adapting its functions and affairs so that the disharmony created can be alleviated or mitigated (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). Some of the negative effects of tourism in the past have included the creation of social divisions or the exacerbation of already existing divisions. It is the purpose of social sustainability to minimize the effects of these divisions to a point at which they can be excused (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

2.4.3.3 Cultural Sustainability

Societies may be able to continue to function in social harmony despite the effects of changes brought about by tourists, but the relationships within that society (including lifestyles, customs and traditions) are all subject to change through the introduction of visitors with different habits, styles and customs (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). Even if social sustainability is maintained, a society’s culture may be irreversible altered.
Cultural sustainability refers to the ability of people to retain or adapt elements of their culture which distinguishes them from other people (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). Cultural influences from tourism are inevitable, but the prevention of distortion of local culture is an essential element of sustainable tourism.

2.4.3.4 Economic Sustainability

Economic sustainability is equally as important as other aspects of sustainability in tourism development. According to Mowforth and Munt (2003) economic sustainability is not a condition which competes with other aspects of sustainability, but rather it can be seen as equally important, a condition in its own right. Sustainability in these terms refers to a level of economic gain from tourism sufficient to either cover the cost of any special measures taken to cater for tourism and to mitigate the effects of the tourist’s presence, or to offer an income appropriate to the inconvenience caused to the local community (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

The above section illustrates the way in which the principles of sustainable development can work to improve the sustainability of tourism, and more specifically ecotourism. The following sections will elaborate on the role of Agenda 21 in sustainable tourism and tools through which sustainability in tourism can be improved.

2.4.4 Agenda 21 and Sustainable Tourism Development

Agenda 21 is a global action plan endorsed by the 1992 Rio Summit in Brazil which sets out the priorities for sustainable development into the twenty-first century

“Agenda 21 directly refers to tourism as offering sustainable development potential to certain communities, particularly in fragile environments. Within Agenda 21 governments are urged to:

- improve and re-orientate pricing and subsidize policies in issues related to tourism;
- diversify mountain economies by creating and strengthening tourism;
- provide mechanisms to preserve threatened areas that could protect wildlife, conserve biological diversity or serve as national parks;
- promote environmentally sound leisure and tourism activities.

Business and industry, including transnational corporations, are urged to:

- adopt codes of conduct promoting best environmental practice;
- ensure responsible and ethical management of products and processes;
- increase self regulation.”

(Stancliffe, 1995 cited in Mowforth and Munt, 2003)

According to Agenda 21 the true test of sustainable tourism will be the sustainable development of local communities which serve as tourist destinations (International Council on Local Environmental Initiatives, 1999). Agenda 21 calls upon the tourism industry to become accountable to locally-defined development visions, and to increase the positive contribution of tourism business and consumption activity (International Council of Local Environmental Initiatives, 1999). There are a number of tools which can be used to increase and measure the sustainability of tourism. These tools can aid tourism in conforming to Agenda 21’s priorities for sustainable development.
2.4.5 The Tools of Sustainability in Tourism

2.4.5.1 Area Protection

One method of increasing sustainability in tourism is area protection through the designation of land as a national park or as some other category of protected area. Those countries with high proportions of their land area under some form of legislated protection might be considered as practicing more sustainable tourism than those with low proportions of their land protected (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). This assumption can of course be questioned; the very idea of protected areas begs the question of who is protecting the area for whom and from whom.

2.4.5.2 Industry Regulation

Unrestricted tourism growth creates many unwanted social and environmental impacts at destinations: there is a growing call to develop regulation which reduces these impacts, but allows the industry to continue (Forsyth, 1997). Regulation of the tourism industry can come from a variety of sources including local governments, national governments, professional associations and international bodies.

The tool of regulation allows specific groups to take control of the industry. It is important that a combination of regulatory bodies play a role in order to ensure that the industry is not only economically sustainable, but also socially, culturally and environmentally.
2.4.5.3 Visitor Management Techniques

Visitor management techniques cover a range of processes for managing visitors, their activities, and their impacts, in specific areas. It is a key aspect of tourism management, especially in natural areas, with special values that need protection (Chin et al, 2000). Visitor management techniques can include zoning, visitor dispersion, channeled visitor flows, restricted entry, vehicle restriction and differential pricing structures (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). The management of visitors to a specific tourist destination can increase the sustainability of said destination, by ensuring a balance of economic, environmental and social concerns (Chin et al, 2000). Visitor management ensures that the number of visitors is consistent with the environmental and social capacity of a particular destination or attraction.

2.4.5.4 Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA)

EIA has been described as among the foremost tools available to national decision makers in their efforts to prevent further environmental deterioration (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). In order for the tourism industry to develop in a sustainable manner an anticipatory approach is essential, and EIA can help tourism planners to predict the impact of future tourism development (Green et al, 1989).

Nevertheless EIA’s are not an exact science and can be manipulated like most other techniques. The results of EIA’s are responsive to those factors used as inputs and
assessment can be both qualitative and quantitative, and hence subject to degrees of subjectivity (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

2.4.5.5 Consultation/Participation Techniques

Stewart and Hams (1991) argue that sustainable development must be built by, through and with the commitment of local communities (cited in Mowforth and Munt, 2003). The requirements of sustainable development cannot merely be imposed; active participation by local communities is needed. In the field of tourism, participation of the destination communities is almost always viewed as an essential element or principle of sustainability (Novelli and Gebhardt, 2007). Techniques which allow for consultation and participation are still young in their development and subject to problems of definition and interpretation (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

2.4.5.6 Codes of Conduct

In recent years codes of conduct have become popular tools to increase sustainability within the tourism industry. Their design, promotion, contents, relevance, uptake, effectiveness and monitoring have become important features of the industry (Fennell, 1999). Many codes of conduct are impressive in their range of issues and in their depth of information. However they can be abused by the industry as marketing ploys or as veils extending over many of its impacts (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

2.4.5.7 Sustainability Indicators

The most recent tools of sustainability are sustainability indicators, the development of which arose from the Rio Summit of 1992. It is the search for indicators
which shows the linkages between economic, social, and environmental issues and the power relationships behind them which has given rise to the development of so-called “sustainability indicators” (Mowforth and Munt, 2003). The acceptance of sustainability indicators will be an uphill struggle. Traditional indicators are concerned primarily with the economy and other relevant factors are ignored, or externalized (Miller and Twining-Ward, 2005). Sustainability indicators will be discussed and explored further in later chapters.

2.5 Specific Ecotourism Focus: Backpacking

2.5.1 What is Backpacking?

The term “backpacker” is widely used by the tourism industry, participants and host communities, as a description of predominantly young, budget tourists on extended vacations or working holiday (Murphy, 2001). Backpackers as defined by Loker-Murphy and Pearce (1995) are young, and budget-minded tourists who exhibit a preference for inexpensive accommodation, an emphasis on meeting other people, an independently organized and flexible itinerary, longer rather than brief vacations, and an emphasis on informal and participatory recreation activities.

Only recently has this unique tourism segment been recognized as important in economic terms (Loker-Murphy and Pearce, 1995). In the past backpackers have been overlooked by government and industry bodies in favor of more traditional tourists who are assumed to spend more money (Loker-Murphy and Pearce, 1995). A lack of baseline information and detailed research on the economic impacts of backpacker tourism has
contributed towards prejudicial attitudes towards these “hippies” or “drifters” by tourism officials all over the world (Hampton, 1998). Australia is at the forefront of both attracting and researching backpackers, where it is estimated that they account for 8% of their international tourists (Loker-Murphy and Pearce, 1995).

Backpackers are predominately of western origin, and the vast majority comes from North America, Australia, New Zealand, and Western Europe (Sorensen, 2003). Several studies report on gender distribution but results vary. Australian data suggest an even male/female split, while other studies suggest a slightly higher percentage of male backpackers (Sorensen, 2003). The vast majority of backpackers are 18-33 years of age (Sorensen, 2003). The impression is that most belong to a 22-27 age group, with more in the above 27 than in the below 22 group (Sorensen, 2003). This age range is consistent with the idea that many, if not most, have completed an education and worked a couple of years before embarking on their first backpacker trip.

Sorensen (2003) argues that backpackers no longer fit the description of drifters, deviants and escapees as they have been depicted in the past, but rather, they are future pillars of society, on temporary leave from affluence, but with clear and unwavering intentions to return to “normal” life. While this section provides a basic understanding, and definition of the backpacker, for a more in depth history of the development and evolution of backpacking see “Young Budget Travelers: Backpackers in Australia” by Laurie Loker-Murphy and Philip L. Pearce (1995).
2.5.2 Backpacker Characteristics

Backpackers can be identified based on a number of common characteristics. As mentioned earlier Australia is at the forefront of harnessing opportunities from the growing backpacker industry, and the following backpacker profile has been developed by Tourism New South Wales (2007). Despite their reputation as tourists on tight budgets, backpackers spend more, travel further and stay longer than other tourists. The typical backpacker is young, educated, adventurous, and price conscious; their travelling style can be characterized by the following factors;

Preference for Budget Accommodation:

The majority of backpackers stay in hostels. According to Tourism New South Wales while they prefer to spend as little as possible for accommodation; they also want value for money and may not always choose the cheapest available.

Eager to Mix with Travelers and Locals:

Social contact is a primary motive of backpackers. Backpackers are interested in not only meeting other travelers (for comradeship and travel tips) but are also interested in meeting and living with local people, and gaining a taste of the local culture.

Price Conscious:

Whilst aware of prices and wanting to spend their money over a longer period, backpackers spend on average, double the amount of other international visitors. In Australia backpackers typically spend $4,747 compared to $2,370 for tourists participating in mass tourism.
Flexible Itinerary and Extended Stay:

Backpackers typically stay longer than the average international visitor: 65 nights compared with 26 nights. They are also more inclined to travel “off the beaten track” and they seek diverse experiences in varied locations. According to Tourism NSW, backpackers arrive in Australia with flexible itineraries and travel ideas but few actual bookings.

Active Adventure Seekers:

Of particular interest to backpackers are adventure tours and attractions that require active participation. Backpackers seek experiences that are removed from the mainstream tourist experience, and that allow them to interact with local culture and traditions.

(Tourism NSW, 2007).

2.5.3 Backpacker Tourism and Third World Development

Almost wherever it is viable, Third World governments are actively pursuing tourism growth in their countries. Up until recently it has been assumed that more money is earned by attracting tourists who can afford luxury goods and services, despite the fact that this often leads to a country’s dependence on imported products and foreign investment, resulting in the leakage of significant profits (Scheyvens, 2002). As outlined earlier because of its association with the hippy and drifter tourism of the 1960s and
1970s, the backpacker segment of the tourism market has not always been welcomed by Third World regional organizations or national governments (Scheyvens, 2002). According to Hampton (1998) this sector is at best tacitly ignored, or at worst actively discouraged in official tourism planning.

In economic terms backpackers are worth more to the local economy than they commonly receive credit for. The very nature of backpacking often results in their spending more money locally, while the more structured nature of packaged tours limits contact with local people (Scheyvens, 2002). An example of this can be found in Pobocik and Butalla’s (1998) comparison of the economic contributions of independent backpackers and group tours in the Annapurna Conservation Area Project in Nepal. They found that while group tour participants spent $31 a day in Nepal, compared to only $6.50 a day for independent backpackers, backpackers were found to contribute much more to the local economy (cited in Scheyvens, 2002). This is largely because the companies providing group tours brought in most provisions for their clients, whereas backpackers stayed in local lodges, consumed local food and purchased local souvenirs (Scheyvens, 2002).

Backpackers continue to support the local economy because local people and products can meet their needs, mainly because they do not demand luxury. When local resources and skill are used to provide facilities for tourists there can be important multiplier effects. For example, in eastern Indonesia, backpacker bungalows are built of local bamboo and concrete blocks manufactured in the village, and they are furnished
with bamboo tables and chairs made in neighboring communities (Hampton, 1998). The spread of economic benefits within communities may be greater when catering to backpackers, as more community members can participate. Catering to backpackers does not usually require community members to have any formal qualifications; rather they can develop skill on the job or build on their existing skills (Scheyvens, 2002).

Catering to backpackers does not only make economic sense, but there are also significant social and environmental benefits to consider. It has been suggested that through supporting smaller players, backpackers pose a threat to the corporate domination of the tourism industry (Scheyvens, 2002). Backpackers sustain local ownership and participation, which leads to a more socially equitable and ecologically sustainable tourism industry (Scheyvens, 2002). According to Scheyvens (2002), when communities control their own tourism enterprises they are in a better position to participate in local business or tourism organizations through which wider development goals and the well being of their people can be promoted.

Although there are many benefits associated with backpacking, it does not come without flaws. The independent nature of backpacker travel and the cultural sensitivity of participants have been questioned in academic writing. One criticism of backpackers is that in their focus on budget travel, they become excessively concerned with bargain hunting, to the extent that they exploit artisans and traders (Scheyvens, 2002). The tendency for backpackers to seek out more intensive contact with local people has generally been posed in positive light; however some have recognized that the desire for
backpackers to go “off the beaten track” is more invasive. Some suggest that backpackers simply do not care about local customs and acceptable behavior, and in the celebration of their perceived freedom behave in culturally and socially inappropriate ways (Scheyvens, 2002).

While self gratification and indulgence may by the primary motivation for one category of backpackers, others may be driven by a genuine interest in learning about other people and environments (Scheyvens, 2002). There are positive signs which indicate that by catering to backpackers, Third World populations are able to gain real benefits from tourism.

2.5.4 Regional Focus

More specific detail regarding South Africa and its experience with ecotourism, sustainable development and backpacking will be covered in the following chapter. In chapter four the contextual background for this study will be provided including South Africa’s history of development, the current economic and political situation and the current tourism and backpacking market as well as potential for future sustainable ecotourism development.

2.6 Community Based Ecotourism: A Conceptual Framework

The following conceptual framework, based on the findings in the literature review, is meant to illustrate one possible approach to ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape. The framework illustrates the necessary preconditions for ecotourism to
lead to community benefits through both the generation of jobs and the conservation of ecosystems.

**Figure 2-2: Community Based Ecotourism Conceptual Framework**
Figure 2.1 above shows in order to have a successful and sustainable community-based ecotourism project the involved persons must undergo training in order to provide them with the skills necessary to manage the project effectively and profitably without destroying the ecotourism attractions: primarily the environment.

The diagram also highlights five necessary preconditions necessary for ecotourism to be successful. These stem from Fennell’s five most frequently cited variables within ecotourism definitions (natural areas, conservation, reference to culture, benefits to locals, and education). If one of these aspects is missing both the community and tourist satisfaction with the ecotourism project as well as environmental protection and conservation will suffer.

The diagram also presents the importance of collaborative work between local operators, government and NGO’s that can support the project through training opportunities, fund raising, environmental protection and the enforcement of environmental regulations.

Community-based ecotourism projects, when properly managed, will lead to host and visitor satisfaction which will contribute to the long term sustainability of the project and allow for the continued provision of jobs and conservation of the ecosystem.
Chapter 3
Methodologies

This chapter outlines the methodological approach employed for this research. This research involves empirical inquiry into ecotourism development, primarily through the use of document analysis. The Case Study approach was the primary methodology used, accompanied by an indicator framework applied to the three chosen cases. The benefits and challenges of these research approaches are discussed below, followed by a discussion of the research implementation, and the limitations to the chosen methodologies.

3.1 The Case Study Approach:

The case study facilitates the exploration of a phenomenon within its context using a variety of data sources (Baxter and Jack, 2008). Case studies can involve either single or multiple cases, and numerous levels of analysis. They can be used to accomplish various aims: to provide description, test theory, or generate theory (Eisenhardt, 1989). Case studies provide an empirical inquiry that investigates a phenomenon, in this case ecotourism, within its real life context: South Africa’s Eastern Cape. For this research a multiple case study approach has been adopted. Several cases are examined to understand the similarities and difference between the cases (Baxter and Jack, 2008). The case studies adopted for this research allowed for the researcher to explore and compare
levels of development, environmental protection, preservation of cultural assets, and the sustainability and social responsibility of the existing tourism industry.

The case study approach is very useful for this research because, as Berg (2004) states, this method “is able to capture various nuances, patterns, and more latent elements that other research approaches might overlook” (pg 251). The analysis of the three municipal case studies allows for the discovery of both localized and province wide issues, which may otherwise have been overlooked, had only provincial documents been considered. A criticism of the case study approach can materialize if findings are overly generalized beyond the scope of the research (Berg 2004). The scope of this research is kept relatively narrow, based on the understanding of ecotourism promotion in South Africa’s Eastern Cape, using the case studies to illustrate and understand this central objective. In order to better understand the potential of ecotourism in the three municipal case studies a set of indicators is applied. The rationale and benefits of using indicators for sustainable tourism development along with the challenges of doing so will be discussed below.

3.2 Indicator Development:

Indicators are measures of the existence or severity of current issues, signals of upcoming situations or problems, measures of risk and potential need for action, and a means to identify and measure the results of our actions (WTO, 2004). Within this research indicators are used to measure the existence of ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape and to signal potential opportunities and challenges. The development
and use of indicators is more and more being viewed as an essential part of destination planning and management and a vital element in efforts to promote sustainable development for the tourism sector (WTO, 2004). In general, the planning and management of tourism in many destinations has occurred with insufficient information, particularly with regard to the impacts of tourism on destinations. Tourism sector decision makers need to know the links between tourism and the natural and cultural environments (WTO, 2004). According to the WTO (2004) some of the benefits of good indicators include:

1. Better decision making- lowering risks or costs;

2. Identification of emerging issues – allowing prevention;

3. Identification of impacts- allowing corrective action when needed;

4. Performance measurement of the implementation of plans and management activities- evaluating progress in the sustainable development of tourism;

5. Reduced risk of planning mistakes- identifying limits and opportunities;

6. Greater accountability- credible information for the public and other stakeholders of tourism;

7. Constant monitoring can lead to continuous improvement.

Within this research indicators are applied to three municipalities to identify key assets, the state of the tourism sector, potential risks and performance. The indicator framework being applied integrates different types of indicators including measures of the current state of the industry and measures of the impact of tourism development on
the biophysical and socio-economic environments. In this study normative indicators, related to the existence of certain elements of tourism management and operation, are used. This facilitates the empirical inquiry into indicators which results in a clear understanding of existing tourism within the selected destinations. In instances where a specific measure was not available, the normative indicators allows for further explanation.

Indicators cannot be a goal in their own right. As a technical approach to a very human problem, indicators cannot themselves create sustainable tourism (Miller and Twining-Ward, 2005). They give us only a partial description of the bigger picture: they are tools, not an end in themselves, but rather signals of important trends and changes, a catalyst for discussion (WTO, 2004). Indicators are also not a one-time procedure; they are most useful when measured repeatedly and consistently through long term monitoring programs. While indicators cannot possibly cover all of the issues facing ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape, they do provide an initial view of the existing tourism industry and the primary challenges and opportunities to tourism development. This represents a starting point for the promotion of ecotourism as a form of sustainable development within the Eastern Cape.

3.3 Research Implementation:

The indicators used in this research are adapted from the World Tourism Organization’s guidebook for *Indicators of Sustainable Development for Tourism Destinations*. In order to develop and apply indicators to the three chosen municipalities
(Baviaans, Buffalo City and Mbizana) the indicator development procedures within the guidebook were followed as closely as possible given the scope of the study. Upon researching and establishing the historic, social, economic and political context within the Eastern Cape, the desired indicators were selected and justified (see chapter 5). The indicators were selected using a policy driven approach meaning that indicators were based first on needs, and then what can be done to satisfy those needs (WTO, 2004). Once a framework of indicators was established they were applied to the chosen case studies. Before data could be collected a number of steps were required.

First, each municipality or destination was defined. For a successful indicator program, it is important to be completely clear on the geographic boundaries and political jurisdictions, to which the indicators are to apply. The second step was the identification of tourism assets and risks. The objective of this step is to have as clear an understanding as possible of what the key assets and risks are in a destination, and which elements of them are valued by both the residents and the current or potential tourists (WTO, 2004). The third step involves identifying the long-term vision of a destination. This step is critical in determining what is most important for a destination and what issues are considered most significant. The next step involves the identification of priority issues within the destination. The objective of this step is to develop a list of issues which are likely to be of greatest importance. The fifth step involves the collection of data. Lastly is the communication and reporting of both the indicators and results. Every effort was
made to follow the steps developed by the WTO; however some steps, including the use of the participatory process were beyond the scope of this study.

The data used to measure the indicators comes from a variety of government documents and websites. This information was found online and explains the plethora of online resources found within my reference list. The majority of websites are government or tourism based and represent reliable sources of information, accessible from a Canadian location.

3.4 Limitations of Methods:

The methodologies employed throughout this research face two major limitations. The first revolves around the multiple case study approach. In order to gain an understanding of ecotourism within the Eastern Cape, three municipal case studies were used (Baviaans, Buffalo City and Mbizana). While all of these case studies are in different districts and face varying opportunities, there are 6 districts in total, and completing a case study within each would have provided a more comprehensive view. However this was beyond the scope of this study. While this study has attempted to gain an overview of the Eastern Cape, there are issues specific to each district and each municipality which could not possibly be captured within just one paper.

The second major limitation to the chosen methodologies has to do with the use of indicators. The WTO (2004) states that indicators are most useful when measured repeatedly and consistently through long term monitoring programs. Many indicators begin as measurements done through academic research. This study, like many other
academic studies, has been a one-time initiative, the initial study of a problem and the establishment of baseline information, but without follow up through longitudinal studies and monitoring. While this study provides an initial view of the challenges and opportunities for ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape, it lacks the long term monitoring necessary to measure change within the destination.

Finally, the researcher was unable to travel to South Africa for fieldwork, and hence the thesis relies on data and other information available from a Canadian location, primarily online government resources. Had fieldwork been possible more insight into the community attitudes towards tourism development could have been obtained, along with first hand observation of the relationship between tourism, local communities and the natural environment in South Africa’s Eastern Cape.
Chapter 4

Contextual Background: The Eastern Cape

4.1 General Information:

The Eastern Cape, on the southernmost coast of Africa, is the second largest of South Africa’s nine provinces, covering about fourteen percent of the country’s land mass (ECDC, 2008). Sixty five percent of the province’s 6.9 million people live in rural areas, while most of the remaining population live and work in towns and cities, primarily the two main cities of Port Elizabeth and East London (ECDC, 2008).

The Eastern Cape contains all seven of South Africa’s biomes and offers an unrivalled range of climates, landscapes and cultures (Eastern Cape Tourism Board, 2009). Not only does the Eastern Cape have a diverse environment it also has a complex history. While South Africa and The Eastern Cape have overcome an abundance of problems, including the struggle against apartheid and the rebuilding of a democratic nation, the province and country as a whole still face extreme challenges (Halisi and O’Meara, 1995). The Eastern Cape is still a frontier. For both the tourist and the tourism industry, it represents a frontier of cultural and ecological diversity, potential and economic opportunity.

4.2 History

South Africa only emerged as a state a century ago when the diverse polities of the region were brought together for the first time by the Act of Union of 1910; this was
made possible by the encroachment of colonial power over the region during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries (Worden, 2007). One of the many myths of South African history held that colonists moved into an empty land, or at least only began to settle in the interior of the region at the same time as indigenous pastoralists and cultivators were moving into it from the north (Worden, 2007) In fact, the earliest inhabitants of the Eastern Cape were hunter-gathers who roamed across the vast grasslands. These people, the San, left thousands of rock paintings, some of which are preserved throughout the Eastern Cape (ECDC, 2008). The San were joined by the Khoi pastoralists, whose legacy lives on in place names like Kieskamma, Kei and Tsitsikamma (ECPG, 2007). Approximately 2000 years ago the, Nguni-speaking people, arrived in the Eastern Cape bringing with them a totally new way of life, cattle and crop farming (ECPG, 2007). They became the dominant group absorbing most of the Khoi and San. The Eastern Cape had become both socially complex and economically diverse before colonial settlers moved in (Worden, 2007).

1652 has been etched into white South African history as the date of the ‘beginning of South Africa’ because it is that year that the Dutch East India Company established a fort at Table Bay as part of its expanding network of trade (Worden, 2007). The conquest of South Africa by people of European origin was by no means a steady or an inevitable one but was marked by setbacks, uneven population movements and uncertain goals. As late as the 1870’s South Africa was divided into a large number of polities, chiefdoms, colonies and settlements of differing size without political unity or
cohesion; yet within fifty years a unified and distinctively capitalist nation had come into being which was an integral part of the British Empire, was ruled by whites, and had firmly entrenched colonial and settler interests (Worden, 2007).

In the 18th and 19th centuries, as colonialists tried to expand their empires, the Xhosa people provided the first determined resistance, and the Eastern Cape became the site of the first real colonial wars in Africa (ECPG, 2007). Nine border wars were fought between the British and the Xhosa for the control of the Eastern Cape. With the victory of British colonialism and then Afrikaner nationalism, the Xhosa came under control of the Cape, and later National Party governments (ECPG, 2007).

The discovery of diamond and gold was central to the colonial conquest of South Africa (Beck, 2000). The Mineral Revolution also brought about fundamental changes in the economy and society of South Africa between the mid nineteenth century and the 1940’s (Beck, 2000). It was during this period that a capitalist and industrial economic system was introduced into South Africa, and set the scene for the emergence of racial segregation and for the policy of apartheid in the late 1940’s.

The end goal of apartheid was “separate development”. The proponents of apartheid declared a series of areas independent, and therefore not a part of “white” South Africa. The Eastern Cape was its guinea pig- the Transkei was the first to be given this status, followed by the Ciskei (ECPG, 2007). These areas are now part of the new South Africa, but have inherited massive under-development from apartheid.
The Eastern Cape has a rich history and today the traditions of the early Xhosa, Dutch, British and German people live on in the people of the province. The Eastern Cape embodies a history that has fought numerous frontier wars and the long struggle for liberation from apartheid, and ultimately reconciled, producing a rich, multicultural society (ECDC, 2008). While the Eastern Cape has the benefits of a diverse environment, history and culture, they have also inherited extreme underdevelopment as a result of apartheid. The high poverty, low development levels and persistent racial inequalities represent a major obstacle to sustainable development with the Eastern Cape.

4.3 Environment and Climate

The Eastern Cape has a diverse topography and climate. There is an extensive coastline on the Indian Ocean where beaches are increasingly becoming a tourist attraction. Much of the Eastern Cape consists of grasslands, but the north-western section is part of the sparsely vegetated Great Karoo, a large, arid plateau (Encarta, 2009). During most of the year the Great Karoo is parched, however some parts are irrigated and very fertile. Extensive forests cover the southern section of the province, while a series of mountain ranges run through the centre of the Eastern Cape (Encarta, 2009).

This ecological diversity gives the Eastern Cape a tremendous diversity of climates. Climatic zones within the Eastern Cape vary from stable temperate and subtropical climates along the coast to extreme inland temperatures including hot and dry summers, and frost in the winter (PGDP, 2004). Some of the Drakensburg mountain areas
even have snow in the winter and are among the coldest in the country, explaining why South Africa’s only ski resort is located within the Eastern Cape.

The Eastern Cape has a number of conservation areas and nature reserves, which are home to a wide range of flora and fauna, including the “big five” (elephant, lion, leopard, rhino and buffalo). The coastal waters are also rich in marine wildlife, including the Southern Right whale, the Humpback whale, the Bryde’s whale, Bottlenose dolphins, Cape Fur seals and a variety of sea birds (Nelson Mandela Bay Tourism, 2003). The Eastern Cape is the meeting ground of six major converging biomes, which allows for a wide variety of landscapes and natural areas, and a rich diversity of wildlife and vegetation. The unique climate and environment of the Eastern Cape makes it an ideal location for ecotourism.

4.4 Provinces and Districts

Southern Africa’s political system has undergone significant changes since the early 1990’s. Under the segregated apartheid system prior to 1994, South Africa was divided into four provinces, and four independent Bantustans, or homelands and six non-independent ones (Beck, 2000). The country’s interim constitution, which took effect in April 1994, divided South Africa into nine provinces, incorporating all former homelands into the republic. The provinces include: Gauteng; Northern Province; Mpumalanga; North-West Province, Free State; KwaZulu-Natal; Northern Cape; Western Cape; and lastly the Eastern Cape (Beck, 2000). The Eastern Cape is divided into 6 districts and one metropole, and just as the topography of the Eastern Cape varies greatly so do the
districts. Each district has its own strengths, challenges and opportunities. The districts of the Eastern Cape include Alfred Nzo, Chris Hani, Amathole, OR Tambo, Ukhahlamba and Cacadu with one metropolitan area, the Nelson Mandela Metropole (ECDC, 2008). Within these 6 districts there are 38 distinct municipalities. Within this study the focus will be on three specific municipalities: Baviaans, Buffalo City and Mbizana, from the three districts of Cacadu, Amatole and Oliver Tambo.

Districts and local municipalities play an important role in local economic development, through the provision of public services and development projects, especially in the poorest areas (ECDC, 2008). Each district and municipality has developed an Integrated Development Plan (IDP) to identify their priorities and opportunities for economic and social development. The Eastern Cape Development Corporation believes that in time, the 38 local municipalities will become the main point of delivery for social services, including education, health and welfare (ECDC, 2008). Before this is possible a great deal of investment must be made to facilitate the development of infrastructure and human capital. This will require cooperation by the municipalities, districts and the provincial government.

4.5 Demographics

The Eastern Cape is the third most populous province in South Africa with a population of 6.9 million people (South Africa.info, 2008). The provincial population is distributed disproportionately between the districts, with the two largest districts, OR Tambo and Amatole, just short of 2 million inhabitants each (PGDP, 2004).
In the Eastern Cape the majority of the population is women (54%); this is a reflection of the migrant labour system and is particularly visible in rural labour supplying areas (PGDP, 2004). In the Eastern Cape women not only constitute the majority of the population, but also the majority of household heads: the percentage varies from 61% to 51% depending on the district (PGDP, 2004). This has several important implications, the most important being that households headed by women are more likely to be poor, as women are generally marginalized from economic opportunities. Furthermore, women have multiple roles in the household which often prevent them from seeking formal employment.

The Eastern Cape is overwhelmingly African in terms of racial composition (88%), followed by Coloured (7%), White (5%) and Indian (less than 1%) (PGDP, 2004). Over 80% of the population speaks Xhosa as their home language with few speaking Afrikaans (9%) and English (4%) (PGDP, 2004). The population of the Eastern Cape is also very young, with the majority aged between 0-22 years (55%) (PGDP, 2004).

4.6 Economy

The economy of the Eastern Cape is characterized by extreme levels of uneven development. By many measures the Eastern Cape is still the country’s most impoverished area, having inherited the apartheid government’s deliberate underdevelopment of the homeland areas (ECDC, 2008).

During 2002, the Eastern Cape produced only 7% of the national GDP, while some 15% of South Africans resided in the province (PGDP, 2004). While the Eastern
Cape is South Africa’s third most populous province, it is ranked fifth in terms of its overall contribution to GDP (PGDP, 2004). While the Eastern Cape remains one of the poorest regions in South Africa, there is great potential for growth of existing industry and establishment of new industry. Its geographic location, quality sea and air ports, and abundance of natural resources bode well for the growth of a tourism industry.

4.7 Tourism

4.7.1 Current Tourism Market

According to Statistics South Africa, in 2002 foreign arrivals to South Africa increased by 11% following two consecutive years of decline (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2005). In 2002 South Africa received 6.42 million arrivals; these arrivals included both overseas and African travellers (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2005). The survey of South Africa’s Foreign Visitor Market, commissioned by South Africa Tourism, shows that 7% of all foreign arrivals to South Africa visited the Eastern Cape, which is equivalent to approximately 465 000 foreign visitors (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2005).

The Eastern Cape has acknowledged that the development of provincial tourism has high potential to create employment and raise incomes in rural areas through community tourism programs (PGDP, 2004). Current tourism priorities for the Eastern Cape include the development and protection of existing and new parks and reserves, improvement of infrastructure (especially along the Wild Coast), and the development of a strong marketing brand showcasing core attractions and themes (PGDP, 2004). In the
Provincial Growth and Development Plan for the Eastern Cape, the tourism program is being developed to include not only management and promotion of nature based tourism, but also tourism based on the Province’s rich cultural and political heritage (PGPD, 2004).

Binns and Nel (2002) found that while tourism represents an important local economic development strategy and has increased employment opportunities in South Africa, social advancement has been limited and the poorest elements of the community in reality do not truly own or have much control over the development process. A range of localities within the Eastern Cape clearly identify tourism as a development strategy to pursue. There is a danger that market saturation could threaten activities such as game parks and craft centres (Binns and Nel, 2002). On a broader scale issues such as the over-use of local resources, high levels of pollution and negative social impacts on local residents are problematic and need to be balanced against employment and economic gains (Binns and Nel, 2002).

4.7.2 Backpacking

The South African white paper on tourism identifies responsible tourism as the most appropriate concept for the development of tourism in South Africa (Government of South Africa, 1996). Responsible tourism implies that local communities, governments, tourists, employers and employees practice sustainable development, respect the environmental and culture of the country and act in a responsible manner (Government of South Africa, 1996).
Backpacker tourism, as a form of responsible tourism and ecotourism, can facilitate the achievement of local economic and non-economic development objectives, while reducing the impact on the natural environment (Visser, 2004). Until recently, backpackers have been dismissed due to the belief that their budget conscious behaviour brings little revenue to the destination. As mentioned in chapter 2, recent research in Australia found that due to the longer duration of their stay, international backpackers actually spend more money than any other tourist category (Visser, 2004). Furthermore, Scheyvens (2002) notes that backpackers spread their spending over a wider geographic area, bringing benefits to remote and otherwise marginalized regions.

The combination of cost containment and the adventuresome nature ascribed to backpacker tourists, hold broad ranging opportunities for local economies in the Eastern Cape. Firstly the entrepreneur can utilise existing skills and activities to generate income, with backpackers enhancing the demand for local goods (Visser, 2004). Secondly since these services and functions already exist, little capital needs to be invested in income generating activities (Visser, 2004). Lastly, the spread of economic benefits within communities may be greater when catering to tourists on a budget, as more community members participate through a range of economic linkages that focus on the local economy (Visser, 2004). It has also been found that women, often excluded from formal economic activities, are more likely to operate informal tourism enterprises by selling handicrafts, operating food stalls or working as beach vendors (Visser, 2004). Catering to backpackers does not usually require any formal qualifications, so community
members can develop skills on the job. The combination of lack of human capital, poverty and a majority of female headed households makes backpacking an excellent opportunity for the Eastern Cape.

Backpacker tourism holds potential in terms of its contribution towards local economic development; however a number of challenges remain in incorporating the full potential of backpacker tourists and hostels into the larger South African tourism economy. The local backpacker industry is still in its infancy, thus it remains to be seen in what way backpacking will contribute towards local development (Visser, 2004). Visser (2004) notes that within South Africa the main beneficiaries of backpacker tourism continue to be mainly white-owned small, medium and micro-enterprises. Although backpacking has potential to benefit disadvantaged rural communities, proof of this has yet to be seen.

Backpacking within South Africa is still emerging. There are currently 118 backpacker hostels registered within the nine provincial tourism boards in South Africa (Visser, 2004). The largest proportion of backpacker establishments is found in the Western Cape, followed by the two coastal provinces: the Eastern Cape and KwaZulu-Natal (Visser, 2004). The Department of Trade and Industry (DTI) claims that South Africa receives about 90 000 backpackers each year, who contribute R900 million in direct spending to the economy (South Africa Info, 2007). South Africa and the Eastern Cape have recognized the importance and impact of the backpacking industry on local development. This research will attempt to build on this recognition while providing
additional information and strategies to continue the local economic and environmental benefits of backpacking tourism within South Africa.
Chapter 5

Identification of Desired Indicators

According to the World Tourism Organization’s Guidebook for *Indicators of Sustainable Development for Tourism Destinations*, ecotourism is a microcosm of all the issues of sustainable tourism, but focused in a more concentrated way on specific ecosystems and traditional cultures. Relevant areas of focus for ecotourism are:

1) Conservation of the Natural Environment
2) Relations with local community and preservation of cultural assets
3) Operations
4) Information and Interpretation
5) Marketing and Management
6) Safety for Ecotourism Activities
7) Economic Sustainability (Addition to recommendations of the WTO)

The following table outlines the priority areas relevant to ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape, the proposed indicators and the rationale for choosing the indicators. The table is divided into the seven main sections outlined above. The indicators were developed by the WTO and compiled based on the priority areas for both ecotourism and the Eastern Cape.
Table 5-1: Indicator Identification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Areas</th>
<th>Indicators (used or proposed)</th>
<th>Rational for Indicator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1) <strong>Conservation of the Natural Environment:</strong> The fact that ecotourism normally takes place mainly in relatively un-disturbed natural areas, which are sensitive to possible impacts by tourism activity, implies that precautions need to be taken to manage tourism.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Representativeness | -Is the No of species typical of the area present at the site? 
-Are there unique or rare species present at the site? | In many destinations certain species are the reason why tourists visit. They are the principle draw, also called “flagship species”. Harem to the species can derive from impacts of tourism or other sectors. Knowledge of the health of the species is therefore invaluable from both the point of view of the ecology and the tourism industry. |
| Uniqueness | -Is the site occupied by rare or unique species? 
-Are the No of individuals in the populations of rare and unique species acceptable? 
-Are there endemic species at the site? | |
| Level of Site Protection | -Is the area subject to control? 
-Is the site recognized by international programmes (i.e. UNESCO)? 
-Are any of the sites/ecosystems/assets considered to be damaged or threatened? | For known areas of fragility or important habitats the area protected can be an important measure of potential protection of the key species (assets for tourism). |
| Water Quality | -Does the local population have access to treated water? 
-Have there been incidents of violation of water standards, resulting in significant health effects or death? | Responds to the need to manage supply and demand of water. This indicator can be a measure of physical carrying capacity for water-poor destinations, and can also provide warning of potential limits or stresses on the supply system. |
### Impacts on Flora and Fauna
- Are the population sizes of key species acceptable?
- Is there illegal hunting and fishing at the site during high season?
- Are there introduced species at the site?

(See justification for representativeness and uniqueness)

### Tourism carrying capacity of the site
- Is there a defined capacity estimate for the site?
- Is the capacity estimate for the location acceptable?

Many sites have known or defined capacity limits. This indicator can be used to show the need for new infrastructure, or where peak use reaches or exceeds regulations or design limits, this information can be used to support a range of responses.

### Fragility
- Are there endangered and endemic endangered species?

(See justification for representativeness and uniqueness)

### Local Community Participation
- Are local products and services consumed by tourism?
- Does Employment of local residents take place? (numbers, income levels)
- Is there assistance to local environmental awareness?

The degree of involvement of the community and their attitude towards tourism, the planning and management of tourism in their destination and the impact on the community itself is a central part of sustainability.

### Impact on Infrastructure and Services
- Is there investment in infrastructure or services for tourism?

Often land use plans are easier to write than implement. This indicator

---

2) **Relations with Local Community and Preservation of Cultural Assets:** An important part of ecotourism activities is experiencing the traditional lifestyles of communities that inhabit the natural areas. These small traditional, often indigenous communities are highly sensitive to the socio-cultural impacts of tourism.
| Community attitudes to tourism | - Is there local satisfaction with the level of tourism?  
- Existence of a community tourism plan  
- Has the tourism plan been updated? | Changes in level of satisfaction can be an early warning indicator of potential incidents or hostility, and a means to obtain information about emerging problems before they become serious. |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Tourism as a catalyst for social or cultural change | - Ratio of average tourist income to that of local residents  
- Has there been a change in traditional activities and customs (e.g. land use, language, ceremonies, religion, clothing, food, etc)? | To allow community to monitor the impacts tourism is having on the socio-cultural fabric of the community. |
| Capture of the benefits from tourism for the community | - Are local people employed in tourism?  
- Is community income derived from tourism? | These indicators are important for communities in destinations with high tourism values. Small communities may risk being taken over and being turned into a tourism town in which the original residents are marginalized. |
| Social Benefits associated with tourism | - Are social services available to the community?  
- Are any of these services attributable to tourism? | To identify the degree to which tourism contributes to what are seen as social benefits or dis-benefits for a community. |
| General impacts on community life | - Number of tourists per day, per week etc  
- Ratio of tourists to locals | To set targets or limits for the number of tourists a community believes it can handle. |
3) **Operations:** Ecotourism operations are usually expected to minimise negative impacts upon the natural and socio-cultural environment, and contribute to the conservation of natural areas. The level of sustainability depends on the operating practices and on the quality of the offered service.

| Total number of tourists visiting the destination | -Total tourist numbers | This is a basic information requirement for nearly all forms of tourism planning and management. |
| Amount of economic stimulus provided by tourism | -Amount spent per day per tourist | As a basis to monitor the increase/decrease in tourist spending, contribution to the GDP, and to community revenue |
| Accessibility | -Are there access routes in good condition for tourism use? (paths, motorized, airstrips, boat access etc) | Some destinations can be considered friendly to those who have mobility constraints while others can have significant barriers. |
| Attractiveness | -Is there a presence of key ecological features of the site in media and tourism promotional materials? | Expected to increase tourist numbers in the form of low impact, green, or cultural tourism. |

4) **Information and Interpretation:** One of the basic elements of ecotourism is knowledge of nature or culture that the visitor obtains through the interpretive experience. Poor information can lead to negative impacts on destinations.

<p>| Educational-interpretive value (value of the site for educating and awareness raising) | -Are there opportunities for interpretation and education at the site? (existence of guided visits, printed materials, interpretive panels and interpretation centres) | -These indicators help to ensure that tourists not only experience the natural environment but also take away some knowledge, and ideally a |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Availability of Information</th>
<th>-Do avenues/channels to promote sustainable tourism exist?</th>
<th>These indicators help community leaders understand the level to which the community is engaged, whether the information they receive is appropriate, and whether it is affecting their attitudes and behavior.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Application of Information  | -Is information on sustainable tourism used within the broader community context?  
-Are agencies applying information on sustainability aspects to their strategic planning process? | These indicators help community leaders understand the level to which the community is engaged, whether the information they receive is appropriate, and whether it is affecting their attitudes and behavior. |
| Action/impact of the Information | -Are tourism operators providing interpretation on sustainable tourism practice?  
-Do residents have an understanding of what constitutes sustainable tourism practices? | These indicators help community leaders understand the level to which the community is engaged, whether the information they receive is appropriate, and whether it is affecting their attitudes and behavior. |

5) **Marketing and Management:** Ecotourism, to provide the expected benefits to conservation and community development, has to be an economically viable activity, therefore indicators and a good knowledge of the ecotourism market are also contributing factors to sustainability.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identifying the market for more sustainable products</th>
<th>-Do visitors seek environmentally friendly and culturally sensitive experiences?</th>
<th>Managers of destinations can obtain information on the nature and extent of demand for more sustainable products.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Measuring the image of the destination of products considering sustainability aspect | -Do establishments and operations market sustainable, sensitive or green products or experiences?  
-Do businesses include information on environmental and social aspects of their operation? | If a destination has a green or culturally and environmentally sensitive image, it may be the basis for marketing or the result of past marketing. If the numbers change, it can be a signal of risk to the image. |
| Tourism management plan for the site | -Existence of a tourism management plan for the site | Many destinations are outside of the formal land use planning zoning and |

value given to the site by educators, NGO’s, tour operators etc?

new found respect for the natural environment
control process which in many countries has been primarily urban in focus. This is a very simple indicator. Over time as planning is put into place additional indicators should be included.

| Regulation of the Site | -Existence of rules to regulate construction, hunting and fishing, and extraction of natural resources at the site  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>-Does the site have regulated zoning or tourism use zones?</th>
<th>These indicators measure both the existence of regulations and the level of enforcement (as a function of the $ spent on management). Many jurisdictions have regulations that are strong on paper but seldom enforced.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tourism management capacity of the site</td>
<td>-Annual expenditure on management and control</td>
<td>These indicators measure both the existence of regulations and the level of enforcement (as a function of the $ spent on management). Many jurisdictions have regulations that are strong on paper but seldom enforced.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Responsibility</td>
<td>-Existence of company policies aiming at social issues of employment and relation with host communities.</td>
<td>The % of establishments is a good indicator of management effort to take charge of social and environmental factors and reduce risks.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6) **Safety for Ecotourism Activities:** Ecotourism activities are often organized in remote areas with specific conditions and involve physical activities. Indicators that respond to safety and security of ecotourism destinations and operations are important.

| Tourist Security | -Have tourists been harmed or injured?  
|                 | -Has there been mention of destination in international news of incidents?  
|                 | -Presence of the destination in magazines, guidebooks, and other media dealing with places considered to be dangerous and risky  
<p>|                 | -Is there a rating of the destination on traveler’s advisory in principle | These indicators measure the results of security issues. These indicators help to judge the severity of impacts, and to measure recovery and the effects of actions to reduce impact or change security levels. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>countries of origin, government websites?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Local Public Safety**       | - Have there been crimes reported involving visitors?  
|                                | - Does destination security focused on tourism exist? | Local harassment/crime can be an early warning of community problems which affect tourism. It can also warn of emerging problems which may affect the industry. |

7) **Economic Sustainability:** Economic sustainability is a key function of overall sustainability. Ecotourism cannot improve the environment and local communities if it is not economically sustainable. In order to be economically sustainable it is imperative that economic benefits are extended to local communities and the poor.

| Economic Leakages              | - Are goods imported?  
|                                | - Are services imported?  
|                                | - Are goods imported for visitor use and consumption? | These indicators are used to measure the amount of tourism dollars that are being leaked outside of the destination. |

| Tourist Contribution to the Local Economy | - Revenues generated by tourism as % of total revenues generated in the community  
|                                          | - Local GDP and % due to tourism | As a basis to monitor the increase/decrease in tourist spending, contribution to GDP and to community revenue. |

| Employment and Income Opportunities | - Are local people employed in tourism?  
|                                    | - Ration of tourism employment to total employment  
|                                    | - Average tourism wage/average wage in community | Employment is a key factor in many decisions to support and invest in tourism. Leaders and politicians are often heard to quote the number of jobs tourism development will bring. |

| Equity                          | - Does tourism make a financial contribution to community projects?  
|                                | - Is there infrastructure development stimulated by tourism that also benefits the poor in the locality? | To directly measure tourism’s contribution to community earnings, and to determine whether the benefits of tourism extend. |
The above indicators will be used to measure the existence of ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape and to signal potential opportunities and challenges. This indicator framework integrates different types of indicators including measures of the current state of the industry and measures of the impact of tourism development on the biophysical and socio-economic environments. The primary goal of these indicators is to gain an initial view of ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape.
Chapter 6

Case Studies

6.1 Introduction:

This chapter will apply the methods and indicators developed by the World Trade Organization and outlined within the methodologies and the previous chapter to three case studies within the Eastern Cape. The purpose of these case studies is to gain an overview of the existing ecotourism industry in the Eastern Cape and to identify the potential for ecotourism development. Each case study has different opportunities and challenges and was chosen to reflect the varying environments and cultures of the Eastern Cape. Each case study is located within separate districts and each has some form of existing tourism development or the natural and cultural capital necessary to support an ecotourism industry. Each municipality has different strengths; Baviaans’ strength lies in the high percentage of conserved land, Buffalo City, on the other hand, has a well-developed urban corridor, and Mbizana is a part of the Wild Coast and home to exiting community based tourism operations. All three case studies are located near or along the coastline, which is where the Eastern Cape’s tourism potential lies. The case studies are useful as they provide a context to which the indicators can be applied, and help to illustrate many of the theories presented in the literature review.

The World Tourism Organization’s *Indicators of Sustainable Development for Tourism Destinations: A Guidebook* was chosen because it represents one of the most
comprehensive compilations of indicators developed specifically for tourism. Since the early 1990’s the WTO has pioneered the development and application of sustainability indicators to tourism and to destinations (WTO, 2004). The guidebook was built on the studies, workshops and experience of some 60 experts and practitioners working on indicators in more than 20 countries (WTO, 2004). Not only does this guidebook provide an extensive listing of indicators covering a variety of issues, it also offers suggestions on their appropriate use and examples of their use in a number of case studies.

The data required to measure the indicators come from a variety of sources. The primary source used in all of the case studies were the municipal and district Integrated Development Plans (IDP). Integrated development planning is an approach to planning that involves the entire municipality and its citizens in finding the best solutions to achieve good long term development (PGDP, 2004). The IDP’s aim to co-ordinate the work of local and other spheres of government in a coherent plan to improve the quality of life for all the people living in an area (PGDP, 2004). The IDP’s include information regarding the existing conditions, problems and resources available for development, the economic and social development for the area as a whole, what infrastructure and services are needed and how the environment should be protected.

In addition to the IDP’s a variety of other government sources were utilized including the provincial growth and development plan (PGDP), the Eastern Cape state of the environment report, municipal zoning and budget documents, quality of life surveys, city development strategies, and the tourism master plan for Buffalo City.
The following section will apply the indicators adapted from the WTO to three municipalities Baviaans, Buffalo City and Mbizana.

**Figure 6-1: Eastern Cape Provincial Map**

Source: ECDC (2008)

**6.2 Case Study #1: Baviaans Municipality, Cacadu District**

**6.2.1 Definition of the Destination:**

The Baviaans municipality encompasses the Baviaanskloof and the Karoo towns of Willowmore and Steytlerville, and together with 8 other municipalities forms the
Cacadu District (Baviaans Local Municipality, 2007). The Baviaanskloof or “Valley of Baboons” is a 192,000ha conservation area and World Heritage site with an amazing diversity of habitat types and abundance in bird and animal life (Cacadu District, 2004). 90% of this mega-reserve is located within the Baviaans municipality (Baviaans Local Municipality, 2007). Due to the presence of this World Heritage site, the future economic development of this area is based on the development of ecotourism (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008).

The Baviaans municipality has committed itself to uplifting the living standards of its residents by creating job opportunities and by promoting development projects within the Baviaans region. Agriculture, tourism and service industries form the basis of the area’s economy (Baviaans Local Municipality, 2007). The municipality believes that in addition to simply creating jobs, it is essential that opportunities are created for people to start their own businesses and to become employers in their own right (Baviaans Local Municipality, 2007)
6.2.2 Current Reality in Baviasns:

6.2.2.1 Economic Analysis:

The 2001 Census indicated that over 85% of the people in Baviasns earn less than R800 or $110 CAD per month (Baviasns Municipality IDP, 2008). According to the integrated development plan for the district of Cacadu, Baviasns Municipality has one of the highest dependency ratios in the district, meaning there are four times more unemployed/not economically active, than employed (Baviasns Municipality IDP, 2008). Only 19% of the people in the area are employed while just over 56% are economically inactive (Baviasns Municipality IDP, 2008). A great deal of pressure is placed on the municipality as only 19% of the population currently can contribute to the municipality’s revenue base.
6.2.2.2 Environmental Analysis:

The Baviaans local municipality forms part of the Eastern Subtropical Thicket Ecosystem (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). The municipal area is characterized by central plains and lowlands bordered by low parallel hills and mountains to the north and south (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). The Baviaanskloof Nature Reserve is in the southern mountainous portion of the area. The area covered by the reserve forms part of the Cape Floral Kingdom, a World Heritage Site, which is managed by the Eastern Cape Parks Board (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). Baviaans municipality is located in a transitional climate zone, between summer and winter rainfall areas, which makes the municipality prone to fairly harsh climate conditions (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008).

6.2.2.3 Socio-Economic Analysis:

One major obstacle facing the Baviaans municipality is its population growth rate. The medium and long term growth rate of the municipality is negative, which means the area is losing economically active people that could have contributed to the growth of the local economy (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). If this pattern of population decline continues the revenue base of the municipality will suffer, and as the community is unable to stimulate development, people will continue to leave the area (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). The need for programs and projects which promote growth in the area is essential for the future survival of the community.

A social measure which seeks to gauge an area’s level of development is the Human Development Index (HDI) which combines measures of life expectancy, literacy,
educational attainment and GDP per capita (UNDP, 2008). The HDI is a means of measuring human development, a concept that, according to the United Nations Development Program, refers to the process of widening the options of persons, giving them greater opportunities for education, health care, income and employment (UNDP, 2008). The Baviaans’ HDI, as of 2005, was 0.55; this is slightly lower than that of the Cacadu district (0.57), but slightly higher than that of the Eastern Cape Province as a whole (0.53) (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008).

According to the Cacadu District IDP, 42.2% of the Baviaans population lives in poverty (Cacadu District Municipality, 2008). The number of people in poverty is determined by the number of household members who reside in households whose total income falls below a particular level. The level used to establish a poverty line was based on Global Insight Data which ranged from R893 for a single person household to R3314 for an eight person household (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). Due to the high levels of poverty in the Baviaans Municipality over 75% of the population is dependent upon social grants, the highest proportion of these being child support grants (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008).

The Baviaans Municipality faces a range of social, economic and environmental obstacles to development. Baviaans has been identified by the Cacadu district as one of the four out of nine municipalities that need the most attention (Cacadu District Municipality, 2008). The Province, District and Municipality have all targeted tourism, particularly ecotourism as a local economic development strategy. For ecotourism to be
successful in Baviaans it must occur at the community level, and create opportunities for environmental protection, increased economic freedom, and social stability.

### 6.2.3 Identification of Tourism Assets and Risks

**Table 6-1: Baviaans Municipality SWOT Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRENGTHS</th>
<th>WEAKNESSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Unspoilt nature</td>
<td>- Low number of tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Abundance of bird and animal life</td>
<td>- Spatial inequality in terms of visits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Large area covered by natural parks, reserves and game parks</td>
<td>- Lack of an international airport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Year round good weather (over 300 sunny days per year)</td>
<td>- Limited skill base</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rich in traditional culture and history</td>
<td>- Large economically inactive portion of population (56%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Located between two major tourism areas (bordered by the Western Cape, and the Kouga Municipality: Jeffrey’s Bay)</td>
<td>- Only 25% of the population with some secondary education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Weak basic infrastructure (especially in rural areas)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Long haul destination for international tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Malaria free</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Unique features</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPPORTUNITIES</th>
<th>THREATS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Significant potential to develop previously undeveloped tourism products</td>
<td>- Crime levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Culture and natural tourism expected to remain in demand</td>
<td>- Lack of collaboration between tourism actors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Growing desire for tourists to have and educative and cultural experience, with minimal impact</td>
<td>- Lack of coordination in tourism development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increase involvement of previously disadvantaged communities/individuals</td>
<td>- Increase exploitation of natural resources (most of the tourism in this municipality focuses on Eco-tourism/nature based tourism)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Job creation and increased entrepreneurship</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Potential for increase in HDI and decrease in poverty</td>
<td>- Possible over supply of nature based tourism products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Develop more tourism linkages with other sectors of the economy</td>
<td>- Potential for community alienation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
6.2.4 Long Term Vision for Bavinaans Municipalities Tourism Development:

The combination of a high percentage of the population living in poverty (>75%), a low human development index (0.55) and the majority of the population being economically inactive (56%) requires a development strategy that leads to economic and social benefits while maintaining and protecting the natural environment.

The long term vision for the community, as identified in the Integrated Development Plan, is:

“The Bavianaans Municipality strives towards the establishment of a progressive community within a safe environment where basic service delivery is guaranteed and wherein decision making is based on maximum participation from the community” (Bavinaans Municipality IDP, 2008, pg 55)

The municipality has identified tourism development as an economic development priority. If ecotourism is established in the municipality, and adheres to the main principles of ecotourism (nature based, ecologically sustainable, educative, locally beneficial, and satisfactory for tourists: see chapter two) the municipality believes it can help to achieve the long term vision of the community. Indicators identified in chapter five will measure the potential of ecotourism in the Bavinaans municipality and whether it has the possibility to lead to sustainable development and if so, under what conditions.

6.2.5 Priority Issues for Bavinaans Municipalities Tourism Development:

The Bavinaans Municipal Integrated Development Plan (IDP) has identified obstacles and problems associated with development. The four broad categories of
development priorities, identified by the municipality, include: building the institution, community services, economic development and infrastructure development (Baviaans Municipality IDP, 2008). Some of the priority issues identified, by the municipal government, deal specifically with tourism, while others do not, but do have an important impact on tourism development. These priority issues are outlined below.

Table 6-2: Baviaans Municipality Priority Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Issues Specific to Tourism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-Fragmentation of tourism</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Benefit from the Mega Reserve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Central marketing of area</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Information for tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Training of tourism operators</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Issue Not Specific to Tourism but with a Significant Impact on Tourism</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Building the Institution</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Not all policies are in place</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Inadequate funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Indifference by politicians in work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community Services</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-People can’t find work, lack of opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Drinking and drug abuse by both youth and adults leading to crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-School drop outs and low levels of education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Community members afford basic necessities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Language barrier, majority of the population speaks Afrikaans</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Inaccessibility of health care, inadequate health care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Police are unresponsive, and have negative attitudes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Lack of access to social development services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Economic Development</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Lack of knowledge regarding marketing and book keeping</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Nowhere for community members to sell products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Infrastructure Development</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Roads</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Electricity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Refuse removal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

94
6.2.6 Indicator Analysis:

The following is a summary of the primary indicator findings for the Baviaans Municipality. The summaries are divided into seven categories based on the suggestions of the World Tourism Organization. For a full table of indicators and findings please see appendix #1.

1. Conservation of the Natural Environment:

The Baviaans Municipality has a large number of rare, unique and threatened species and environments, and there is a significant percentage of the municipality protected by the Eastern Cape Parks Board. This percentage will grow significantly with the completion of the Baviaanskloof Mega-Reserve Project.

2. Relations with Local Community and Preservation of Cultural Assets:

Currently Baviaans is not a well established tourism destination so the majority of tourism operators are local and operate at the community level. While a tourism plan does exist, as tourism numbers increase the distinction between tourists and locals will grow, which could result in significant tensions between hosts and guests. Due to the scope of this study the community attitudes towards tourism could not be measured.

3. Operations:
Tourism operations represent the first primary challenge in Baviaans. While there is a strong presence of attractive ecological features, infrastructure, particularly roadways are not in good condition for tourist use.

4. Information and Interpretation:

There are significant opportunities for interpretation and education, and many individual tour operators offer their own forms of interpretation. However at this point a consistent and certified interpretive program does not exist. An interpretation centre is planned with the completion of the Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve. Numerous channels to distribute information on sustainability exist however the reach and the impact of this information into the community is unknown. It appears that many residents are unaware of sustainability issues.

5. Marketing and Management:

A large market for sustainable ecotourism exists. However the number of operators offering sustainable products is limited. Of the 59 accommodations listed only 14 had sustainable practices apparent on their website. All offered “green” activities in the form of wilderness viewing but the sustainability of these activities is unknown. There is a fairly strong level of environmental management within the Baviaans municipality, and a significant number of environmental and development NGO’s and government agencies that promote sustainable development exist

6. Safety for Ecotourism Activities:
At the time of this case study South Africa was not under any travel advisories. Destination websites and tourism guides maintain that tourists should exercise high levels of caution, as violence does occur on a regular basis.

7. Economic Sustainability:

The level of economic leakage, due to the import of goods and services is unknown at this point. While tourism still exists largely at the community level some leakage is bound to occur. A number of economic opportunities including job creation exist as a result of tourism development. However if tourism grows too much, too fast the local community may fail to benefit from development.

6.2.7 The Challenges and Opportunities for Tourism in Baviaans

The Baviaans municipality has all of the natural capital necessary to support an ecotourism industry. The municipality is home to rare natural environments and a unique culture and history. However the community also faces a large number of challenges before ecotourism can become a significant form of local economic development. The challenges and opportunities for ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape will be further explored in chapter 7.

The Baviaans community has identified ecotourism as a local economic development strategy, and while the community has the raw resources necessary for ecotourism it also faces significant challenges in the forms of infrastructure, training and fragmentation. The Baviaans municipality needs to put in place training and education for tourism providers so that tourist satisfaction is achieved, and improve infrastructure to
insure safety for both tourists and locals. Ecotourism can achieve sustainable
development in the Baviaans community if the necessary changes and investments are
made.

6.3 Case Study #2: Buffalo City Municipality, Amatole District

6.3.1 Definition of the Destination:

Buffalo City is situated relatively centrally in the Eastern Cape Province, and
includes East London, King William’s Town, Mdantsane and Bhisho (Buffalo City
Tourism, 2008). Buffalo City Municipality along with 7 other municipalities makes up
the Amatole district. Buffalo City’s population is estimated at about 1,020,000 people,
with an overall population density of just over 400 persons per km² (Buffalo City
Tourism Master Plan, 2004).

East London located within Buffalo City Municipality is South Africa’s 6th largest
city and is South Africa’s only river port (Buffalo City Tourism, 2008). East London
became a part of the Buffalo City Municipality in 2000, and represents the gateway to the
Wild Coast to the north-east and the Sunshine Coast to the west (Buffalo City Tourism,
2008).

King William’s Town is located 56km inland of East London at the foot of the
Amatole mountains, 389m above sea level. King William’s Town has a diverse
environment and a moderate year round climate. The favourable position of King
William’s Town made it a popular base for traders and the town grew into a large
established industrial base, producing a variety of products. A lucrative trade was
established with neighbouring East London. In recent years King William’s Town has experienced growth due to its close proximity to the Provincial Capital Bhisho (Buffalo City tourism, 2008).

Bhisho, the capital of the Eastern Cape Province, is headquarters to the Provincial Legislature as well as numerous other government departments. Bisho is situated just 3km north east of Kings William Town, and while it is a distinct city it has been seen by some as a suburb of Kings William Town. The town’s major structures include government buildings, a hotel and casino complex, and a branch of the University of Fort Hare (Buffalo City Tourism, 2008).

Unlike the other urban areas in the Buffalo City Municipality that have strong colonial roots, Mdantsane, situated between East London and King William’s Town, has its roots in the apartheid era and is the second largest township in South Africa, home to about 400,000 people. Established in 1962 as part of the government’s racist apartheid policies to provide living space for cheap African labour, the original inhabitants are people who were forcibly removed from the East Bank a formerly multiracial residential area in East London. Mdantsane was viewed as a homeland city to house East London’s labour needs. While transport links to East London were improved, the development of a solid infrastructure was never considered. Mdantsane faces numerous infrastructure and health care challenges, however, the opening of the Mdantsane City Mall is transforming the area from a housing development to a self-contained suburb (Buffalo City Tourism, 2008)
The natural features of Buffalo City and its hinterlands offer notable potential for sensitive and managed ecotourism development. Ecotourism development has the potential to enhance the quality of the existing and future built environment, as well as creating opportunities for local economic development. There are several social and cultural aspects of Buffalo City that are of potential interest to tourists; the area has a rich history that stretches from pre history to the 20th century and the defining struggle for democracy in South Africa (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2004). These aspects in conjunction with the natural and built environments, offer the potential to develop a much improved tourism industry in the area (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2004).

Figure 6-3: Buffalo City Municipality Location

Source: ECDC (2008)
6.3.2 Current Reality in Buffalo City:

6.3.2.1 Economic Analysis:

Within the national economy of South Africa, the area of East London to King William’s Town is now commonly regarded as a budding metropolitan corridor. In the national context this corridor is one of the poorest and economically least developed metropolitan areas in South Africa, with relatively low salaries and skills and with high unemployment rates (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Within the context of the Eastern Cape the East London- King William’s Town corridor is noted as the second most important contributor to the Gross Geographic Product (GGP), after the Port Elizabeth metropolitan area (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

Buffalo City acts as a gateway to the rest of South Africa with access provided by air, rail and road (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). East London the hub and industrial centre of Buffalo City has a diverse economic base with industrial activities including motor vehicle manufacturing, clothing, textiles, household consumer goods, food processing and agricultural activities including livestock, horticulture, pineapples, citrus, timber, mohair and wool (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.1.1 Income and Employment:

Buffalo City is facing serious socio-economic issues as population growth continues to outstrip economic growth (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). The population of Buffalo City suffers from high rates of unemployment and is relatively poor, with 71% of the city’s population earning less than the household subsistence level (R1,500/month).
The average unemployment rate across the municipality is just over 44% with the highest unemployment rate being 60% in rural King’s William Town (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.1.2 Tourism:

Buffalo City and its surrounding region have had a very limited tourism sector to date, but there is room for expansion. The existing tourism industry and potential for development is based on a wide variety of attractions from beaches, river valleys and mountains to indigenous and colonial cultures (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.2 Environmental Analysis:

The responsibility for environmental protection and management falls into the hands of the Environmental Services and Parks department (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). The Buffalo City Municipality has a diverse and relatively unspoiled natural environment that represents great tourism potential. However the hilly topography of the municipality has contributed to the problem of remote areas being difficult and costly to develop, manage and maintain (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). This has led to un-coordinated development and inappropriate land use planning which has resulted in environmental degredation (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Of particular concern are issues of deforestation, expansion of informal settlements, erosion, pollution particularly of watercourses, invasive species and illegal dumping (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).
6.3.2.2.1 Costal and Marine Environments:

The Buffalo City municipality has 68km of coastline subject to consumptive use, including sand mining, seaweed harvesting, shellfish collecting, and fishing as well as non consumptive recreation al uses (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Certain areas of coastline are unspoiled while other areas are over-utilised. The coastline is a national asset and has tremendous potential for tourism development that is currently not being realised. The proper management of the coastline will also lead to the upliftment of small coastal villages and their inhabitants (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.2.2 Water Pollution:

The overall picture of water quality in Buffalo City Municipality is one of very high quality, safe, well monitored water supply in urban areas, contrasted with a variety of mainly unmonitored water supplies in the more rural areas (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). The poor operational state and inadequate maintenance of most of Buffalo City’s sewage treatment works has resulted in major pollution problems and impacts on the quality of water resources (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.2.3 Energy:

Energy is essential for meeting basic needs, and stimulating economic growth and urban development; however it also comes with crucial environmental impacts. In the urban areas of Buffalo City energy is used excessively in the development sector while there is a scarcity of energy in the low income sector (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Within the municipality there is a high dependance on coal and coal fired electricity
which contributes to environmental problems such as global warming, acid deposition, deteriorated air quality and environmental degradation from coal mining activities (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.3 Social Analysis:

6.3.2.3.1 Health Care:

Health services are provided by a number of public health facilities spread across the municipality including clinics and mobile services. The community members, especially in rural areas, have to travel long distances for their health care needs, and the adverse road conditions and limited infrastructure accentuate poor service delivery (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). There is a critical shortage of medical staff serving the Buffalo City Municipality: the average nurse patient ratio requirement established by the World Health Organization is 1:25 per day, whereas professional nurses in Buffalo City consult approximately 60 patients per day (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.3.2 Environmental Health:

Resources available to combat pollution, provide safe drinking water, and adequate sanitation are limited. The communities lack skills on how to protect themselves from the hazards to which they are exposed, creating increased demand on already suffering health services (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Communities within Buffalo City are exposed to a range of environmental health problems including, food safety, infectious disease, industrial pollutants, and unsafe and unhealthy work and housing environments (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).
6.3.2.3.3 Community Facilities and Services:

The vast majority of community facilities are concentrated in the more affluent areas of East London and King Williams Town, with no, or very limited facilities in the outlying townships and rural areas (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). This is of major concern as the availability of community facilities has proven to be a positive factor in keeping children and unemployed off the street. The appropriate municipal departments cannot deal with existing service delivery, let alone expand delivery, due to budgetary constraints, inadequate staff and vehicles (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.3.4 Housing:

Adequate housing is regarded as a basic human right, however many of the people in Buffalo City do not have access to adequate shelter. Buffalo City is suffering from a severe housing shortage of approximately 85 000 units, in both rural and urban areas (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).

6.3.2.4 Infrastructure Analysis:

6.3.2.4.1 Transportation:

Transportation provides an essential link between activities and plays an important role in social and economic development. In developed urban areas the transportation network is that of a traditional city, and can adequately support the amount of traffic it is required to handle (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). In rural areas that dominate a major part of Buffalo City the transportation network leaves much to be desired and is unevenly distributed. The lack of mobility results in limited access to participate in
economic and social activities, which negatively affects the poor, and their opportunities for economic development.

6.3.2.4.2 Water and Sewage:

Adequate water supply and sanitation is essential for the health and wellbeing of people and the natural environment. The municipality has a vast network of water distribution infrastructure, which has deteriorated as a result of aging and the corrosive effects of soft water (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). This ageing infrastructure is prone to bursts and leaks which have been increasing in recent years. The Buffalo City IDP (2002) estimates that 26% of the population has to travel more than 200m to obtain water.

6.3.2.4.3 Electricity:

The electrical network in Buffalo City is in very poor condition due to budget constraints which have forced the electricity department to cut down on maintenance and replacement or upgrading of equipment (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). As indicated in the Quality of Life Survey (2001) just over 75% of homes in Buffalo City have access to electricity. There are however large discrepancies when it comes to access to electricity by settlement type. Almost 90% of homes in the informal areas have no electricity, while in formal areas the reverse is true.

The Buffalo City municipality faces a large number of obstacles to sustainable development, however it also has a variety of strengths and opportunities which lend themselves to ecotourism development. The municipality has identified tourism as a potential contributor to local economic development, and as an important aspect of their...
overall development plan. In the following section the strengths, weaknesses, opportunities, and threats to ecotourism development will be identified.

### 6.3.3 Identification of Tourism Assets and Risks

**Table 6-3: Buffalo City Municipality SWOT Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRENGTHS</th>
<th>WEAKNESSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Unspoilt nature, beaches and coastline and abundance of bird and animal life  
- Existing nature reserves are well managed  
- Year round good weather (over 300 sunny days per year)  
- Rich in traditional culture and history  
- Malaria free  
- King William’s Town provincial capital  
- Clean city public campaigns and educational programs  
- Good public facilities and community services in King William’s Town and East London  
- Bulembo Airport  
- East London harbor, airport and railway | - Spatial inequality in terms of visits  
- Limited skill base, low education levels  
- Limited environmental awareness  
- Weak basic infrastructure (rural areas)  
- Storm water backlogs leading to flooding  
- Long haul destination for tourists  
- Population growth > economic growth  
- Departments with insufficient resources and shortage of public staff  
- Limited interdepartmental collaboration  
- Poor to non-existent levels of environmental rehabilitation in rural areas  
- Insufficient protection of reserves and inadequate reserves to protect biodiversity  
- Fragmentation of law enforcement agencies and services  
- No defined housing program |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OPPORTUNITIES</th>
<th>THREATS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - Significant potential to develop previously undeveloped tourism products  
- Culture and natural tourism expected to remain in demand  
- Growing desire for tourists to have and educative and cultural experience, with minimal impact  
- Increase involvement of previously disadvantaged communities/individuals  
- Creation of public/private partnerships  
- Job creation and increased entrepreneurship | - Crime levels and poor enforcement  
- Vulnerable to loss of investment and decreased tourism due to crime levels.  
- Lack of collaboration between tourism actors  
- Increase exploitation of natural resources  
- Possible over supply of nature based tourism  
- Potential for community alienation  
- HIV/AIDS as a burden on economy  
- Increased dumping and illegal squatting  
- Vandalism to beaches and coastlines |
-Develop more tourism linkages with other sectors of the economy
- Provincial subsidies for municipal health services and potential opportunities for overseas funding
- Pattern of development in East London area as a corridor lends itself to a more efficient public transport.

- Insufficient finding and fragmented services
- Rapid urbanization

6.3.4 Long Term Vision for Buffalo City Tourism Development

Historically levels of development in the Buffalo City area have been negatively affected by both its distant location in relation to the major centres of economic activity in South Africa and by the disastrous social, political and economic impacts of “separate development” policies which were focused on the area during apartheid (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2004). The social and cultural aspects of Buffalo City in conjunction with the natural endowments of the area and the existing built environment offer the potential to develop a much improved tourism industry in the area (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan, 2004). However the development reality is that priority lies with the improvement and provision of infrastructure and capacity to address the service backlogs and to meet the basic needs of those most disadvantaged at present. The Buffalo City municipality is formulating an integrated approach to development which acknowledges the need to meet basic needs but places considerable emphasis on expanding the resource base of the municipality (Buffalo City Tourism Master Plan,
In response the municipality has identified the tourism industry as one of the three main areas of focus for economic development and capacity building.

Buffalo City Municipality’s vision for the future reads “a people centred place of opportunity where the basic needs of all are met, in a safe, healthy, and sustainable environment” (Buffalo City Municipality, 2008). This vision serves as a long term “guiding star” for service delivery and developmental work that is undertaken by the municipality through its integrated development plan and its city development strategy (Buffalo City Municipality, 2008). Ecotourism development has the potential to contribute to a sustainable environment while empowering people to meet their basic needs.

6.3.5 Priority Issues for Buffalo City Municipality Tourism Development

The Buffalo City Integrated Development Plan (IDP) has identified a variety of obstacles and problems facing local economic development within the municipality. The five broad thematic areas of development priorities, identified by the municipality, include: social, economic, environmental, spatial and infrastructural, and financial and institutional (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). All of the priority issues identified below have a significant impact on tourism within the destination, and represent areas in which significant attention must be paid.
## Table 6-4: Buffalo City Municipality Priority Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross Cutting Issues</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-lack of sustainable development due to inappropriate use and management of resources</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-widespread poverty in Buffalo City</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-gender inequalities in the social, economic, physical, institutional environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-inadequate primary health care and poor health due to adverse environmental conditions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-insufficient community facilities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-high crime rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-insufficient and inappropriate housing provision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Development</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-high unemployment with too few jobs</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-majority of people live below the subsistence level</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-high crime rate</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-lack of mobility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Environment</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-unsustainable management and use of the environment</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-high pollution levels in water, soil and air</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-lack of capacity to provide environmental management and pollution control</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spatial and Infrastructure</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-rapid and unmanaged urbanization and low density settlements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-cultural and heritage sites not exploited to their full potential</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-limited access to land for development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-deficiencies in the transport system</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-fragmentation of water and sewage service provision</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-backlogs in the provision of and access to basic services</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-limited raw water supply</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-unsafe and unstable electricity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finance and Institutional</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-the financial viability and sustainability of Buffalo City Municipality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-chronic shortage of institutional resources including staff, tools and technology</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-shortage of technical, specialist, professional, technological and managerial skills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 6.3.6 Indicator Analysis:

The following is a summary of the primary indicator findings for Buffalo City Municipality. The summaries are divided into seven categories based on the suggestions
of the World Tourism Organization. For a full table of indicators and findings please see Appendix A.

1. Conservation of the Natural Environment:

Buffalo City is home to a wide range of rare, unique and endemic animals, birds and plants of which a large number have unacceptable population sizes. Major threats include agriculture, over grazing, alien invader plants and urbanization. Only 1% of the Buffalo City Municipality is located within conservation areas- this compares poorly with the 10% conserved provincially.

2. Relations with Local Community and Preservation of Cultural Assets:

Employment of local populations does take place within Buffalo City however the number of people employed and the quality of this employment is unknown. Buffalo City’s Tourism Master Plan, completed in 2004, is an attempt to guide and manage future tourism development however the progress of the plan to date is unknown. There is potential for community relations to become problematic if tourism grows too quickly.

3. Operations:

Operations are primarily concerned with infrastructure, access routes and attractiveness. Generally the municipality has sound existing infrastructure and East London, the business centre of Buffalo City, is well served by air, rail and sea. There is also a strong presence of ecological features in Buffalo City’s promotional materials, making it an attractive destination for ecotourists.
4. **Information and Interpretation:**

There are a significant number of local and private nature reserves that lend themselves well to interpretation. Buffalo City’s tourism master plan identifies a number of tourism projects based on the interpretation of the area’s culture, including the Struggle Route, Military and Marine History Route, and a Bird Watching Route. A variety of channels to promote sustainable tourism exist, however the incorporation of sustainable practices into tourism businesses is still mostly non-existent, with only 11 out of 119 accommodations found to have some form of sustainable practice.

5. **Marketing and Management:**

A large market for ecotourism exists and the majority of accommodations in Buffalo City market sensitive or green experiences; however the sustainability of these experiences is in question. Buffalo City has a fairly well developed tourism master plan which guides the municipality’s future tourism development however more expenditure on the management and regulation of natural resources is necessary.

6. **Safety for Ecotourism Activities:**

There are not specific safety warnings for Buffalo City; however travel advisories for South Africa as a whole are common in countries of origin. These advisories warn against violent criminal activity and suggest that visitors maintain a high level of caution when visiting.
7. Economic Sustainability:

Tourism in Buffalo City has created a number of economic opportunities and contributed to the local economy. Considering the number of accommodations and attractions in the municipality there are likely a significant number of local people employed in tourism, however the quality of this employment is unknown. While specific data were unavailable it is highly likely that economic leakage takes place in the form of imported goods and services.

6.3.7 The Challenges and Opportunities for Tourism in Buffalo City

The Buffalo City municipality has a variety of natural, historic and built capital which could support a successful ecotourism industry. However the community also faces a large number of challenges before ecotourism can become a significant form of local economic development. The primary opportunities and challenges for tourism in Buffalo City will be further discussed in chapter 7.

The Buffalo City municipality needs to implement training and education for tourism providers, and improve infrastructure to ensure safety for both tourists and locals. Ecotourism can achieve sustainable development in the Buffalo City community if the necessary changes and investments are made. Buffalo city faces additional challenges as the municipality is not starting with a clean slate; tourism developments already in existence must be reformed and made sustainable for an ecotourism industry to be successful.
6.4 Case Study #3: Mbizana Municipality, Oliver Tambo District

6.4.1 Definition of Destination:

The Mbizana Local Municipality is one of seven municipalities that make up the OR Tambo District. The Mbizana Municipality covers approximately 2800 square km and borders KwaZulu-Natal (Mbizana Municipality, 2009). Dominant land uses within Mbizana Municipality are mostly rural with a large emphasis on subsistence agriculture in the interior and some tourism development along the coast. The natural environment in the coastal belt of the area is largely unspoilt and holds an exceptionally high conservation value. The Mbizana coastal belt is part of an area that is referred to as the Wild Coast (Mbizana Municipality, 2009).

The municipality has a population of 251,545, with a population density of approximately 84 people per square km (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Within the OR Tambo district, Mbizana constitutes 12.7% of the population and falls within the top four highly populous local municipalities (Mbizana, IDP, 2008). Approximately 95% of the municipal area is rural while the remaining 5% is urban; settlements are loosely scattered throughout the municipal area and are surrounded by communal grazing and pockets of arable land (Mbizana IDP, 2008).

Like many municipalities in the Eastern Cape, Mbizana has a predominately young population; it is estimated that about 58% of the population is aged 19 years or younger (Mbizana IDP, 2008). This has important implications for planning and development as Mbizana’s population is composed of over 70% people below the age of
35 (Mbizana IDP, 2008). This means that a very small proportion of the population is economically active. The following sections will elaborate on the current social, environmental and economic situations within the Mbizana municipality.

Figure 6-4: Mbizana Municipality Location

Source: ECDC (2008)

6.4.2 Current Reality in Mbizana:

6.4.2.1 Economic Analysis:

The Mbizana Municipality’s unemployment rate, at 75.4%, is not only the highest unemployment rate in the OR Tambo District, but is also the highest unemployment rate provincially and nationally (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Similar to the unemployment rate, the Mbizana Municipality also has a very high poverty rate which increased from 75% in
1999 to 77% in 2003 (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Education, appropriate skill development, and literacy improvements, are some of the challenges that the municipality has to address if it is to succeed in reversing the legacy of neglect and underdevelopment (Mbizana IDP, 2008).

The human development index is a good measure of the level of development for a country, region or local economy. The Mbizana Municipality has a relatively low level of human development at 0.42, compared to the OR Tambo District (0.44), Eastern cape Province (0.51) and South Africa (0.59) (Mbizana IDP, 2008). The average annual household income in the municipal area is very low compared to the national average. The household income in Mbizana municipality is 127% lower than the national average and 44% lower when compared with the Eastern Cape Provincial average (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Government programs will play an important role in job creation, poverty alleviation, and economic development, by helping to establish a consistent economic growth rate (Mbizana IDP, 2008).

6.4.2.2 Environmental Analysis:

Mbizana Municipality’s Spatial Development Framework states that the natural environments in the coastal belt are relatively in unspoilt condition and have exceptionally high conservation value (Mbizana IDP, 2008). The coastal belt forms part of what has been defined as the Pondoland Centre of Endemism, which is regarded as the second most species rich floristic region in Southern Africa (Mbizana IDP, 2008). The terrestrial biodiversity in the OR Tambo district is matched by extremely rich marine
biodiversity, which has earned the Wild Coast the classification as one of WWF International’s Global 200 Ecoregions of Global Significance (OR Tambo IDP, 2006).

While Mbizana municipality has a wealth of untapped environmental resources, they still face a variety of environmental issues. These issues include the over-exploitation of natural resources due to extraction and changes in land use, poorly controlled and ill-planned agricultural and settlement expansion, informal and illegal developments, over-exploitation of marine resources, the disruption of natural ecosystem functioning, loss of sensitive coastal habitats, and lastly pollution due to lack formal waste management services (Mbizana IDP, 2008). It is important that the natural environment within the Mbizana Municipality is monitored and maintained as the environment is one of the municipalities key tourism attractions.

6.4.2.3 Social Analysis:

The enormity of poverty characterized by illiteracy, low income levels, and lack of access to employment opportunities is a serious challenge for the Mbizana Municipality. Community facilities and social services until recently were only available in the urban areas of the municipality. While progress is being made in the provision of community facilities the municipality faces serious deficiencies in the provision of education. According to the 2006/2007 provincial infrastructure plan Mbizana has 32 000 learners without minimum norm classrooms, 94 000 learners without access to resource centres, and approximately 23 150 learners without access to minimum toilet facilities (Mbizana IDP, 2008). The total estimated cost to eradicate the current backlog is R676
322 913 excluding costs to upgrade and repair current schools. In addition to access to education, access to health care also represents an important social issue within the Mbziana Municipality. There are 2 hospitals, 18 clinics and 34 sites served by mobile clinics within the municipality yet the spread and availability of health services remains a challenge (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Many of the clinics experience shortages of personnel, medicines and equipment and the majority of clinics lack access to telecommunication, electricity and have poor water supply (Mbizana IDP, 2008).

The provision of security services is inadequate in the Mbizana Municipality on average one police station is serving an area of approximately 700 square kilometers, and 58 831 people (Mbizana IDP, 2008). In addition to inadequate services the existing police stations lack personnel, equipment and vehicles.

The Mbziana municipality faces a range of social issues but is committed to uplifting its people for the provision of sustainable and affordable service delivery. Tourism could play an important role in providing the much needed local economic development to facilitate the delivery of much needed social services.

6.4.2.4 Infrastructure Analysis:

As of 2004 it is estimated that 77% of the population in Mbizana does not meet adequate standards for access to sanitation (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Proper operation and maintenance of the sewage system has not been followed, resulting in uncontrolled waste (Mbizana IDP, 2008). According to the Department of Water and Forestry 45% of the population in Mbizana does not meet RDP (The Reconstruction and Development
program) standards for access to water services (Mbizana IDP, 2008). Water treatment plants within the municipality are not properly run or staffed, resulting in the distribution of untested, poor quality water (Mbizana IDP, 2008). In rural areas, water is supplied from springs, temporary drought relief schemes, small rudimentary water supply schemes or household rain collection systems (Mbizana IDP, 2008).

The Mbizana Municipality faces a range of social, economic and environmental obstacles to development. The Province, District and Municipality have all targeted tourism, particularly ecotourism as a local economic development strategy. For ecotourism to be successful in Mbizana it must occur at the community level, and create opportunities for environmental protection, increased economic freedom, and social stability.

6.4.3 Identification and Tourism Assets and Risks

Table 6-5: Mbizana Municipality SWOT Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STRENGTHS</th>
<th>WEAKNESSES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Unspoilt nature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Abundance of bird and animal life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Existing Nature Reserves.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Year round good weather (over 300 sunny days per year)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Rich in traditional culture and history</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Malaria free</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Mbizana represents on 10% of the wild coast but 25% of tourism beds along the coast</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Developed hotels and tour operators</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- OR Tambo Cultural Village</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Low number of tourists</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Spatial inequality in terms of visits</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Lack of an international airport</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Poor transportation infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Limited skill base</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Large economically inactive portion of population</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Limited education and low literacy levels</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Low level of community involvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Long haul destination for international tourists</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OPPORTUNITIES</td>
<td>THREATS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Significant potential to develop previously undeveloped tourism products</td>
<td>-Crime levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Culture and natural tourism expected to remain in demand</td>
<td>-Lack of collaboration between tourism actors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Growing desire for tourists to have and educative and cultural experience,</td>
<td>-Increase exploitation of natural resources</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>with minimal impact</td>
<td>-Possible over supply of nature based tourism products</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Increase involvement of previously disadvantaged communities/individuals</td>
<td>-Potential for community alienation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Job creation and increased entrepreneurship</td>
<td>-Similar and nearby tourism products may be more attractive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Potential for increase in HDI and decrease in poverty</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Develop more tourism linkages with other sectors of the economy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4.4 Long Term Vision for Mbizana Municipalities Tourism Development:

Mbizana Municipality requires a development strategy that leads to economic and social benefits while maintaining and protecting the natural environment. Mbizana suffers from a variety of social and economic issues, including high poverty rates, low literacy rates and a low human development index rating. Tourism represents a local economic development strategy that can lead to significant economic gains directed towards the most disadvantaged groups of society, while continuing to offer environmental protection. The Mbizana Municipality has acknowledged the importance of tourism in its development strategy and in its Integrated Development Plan. The following long term vision for the municipality is consistent with the promotion of tourism as a form of sustainable development.

The long term vision of the municipality as identified by the IDP is as follows:
“Mbizana: a flourishing local municipal area with a growing employment creating economy and sustainable communities where everyone has access to equal opportunities.” (Mbizana IDP, 2008, pg 73).

The vision of the Mbizana Municipality is carried out by its mission which states that:

“Mbizana Local Municipality will be a well governed municipality committed to discharging its legislative and constitutional mandate through: investing in its people to fight poverty, providing affordable services, facilitating a people driven economy, building sustainable communities, protecting and preserving its environment to the benefit of its people and strengthening a culture of public participation” (Mbizana IDP, 2008, pg 73).

6.4.5 Priority Projects and Issues for Mbizana Tourism Development

The Mbizana Integrated Development Plan (IDP) has identified priority projects and issues associated with development. The four broad categories of development priorities and issues include: building the institution, community services, economic development and infrastructure development. Some of the priority issues identified, by the municipal government, deal specifically with tourism, while others do not, but do have an important impact on tourism development. These priority issues and projects are outlined below.

Table 6-6: Mbizana Municipality Priority Issues

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Issues and Projects for Tourism Development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Building the Institution</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Lack of human capital, and municipal staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Building partnerships with district and provincial organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Creation of an environmental management plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Development of a social package policy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Indicator Analysis:

The following is a summary of the primary indicator findings for Buffalo City Municipality. The summaries are divided into seven categories based on the suggestions of the World Tourism Organization. For a full table of indicators and findings please see appendix #1.

1. **Conservation of the Natural Environment**

   The Eastern Cape State of the Environment report estimates that 50-60% of the land within Mbizana has been transformed. This represents a major challenge for biodiversity conservation. There are a number of threatened and endangered species at risk due to lack of protection and poor land use planning. According to the State of the Environment Report, 0% of the municipal area is formally conserved.
2. Relations with Local Community and Preservation of Cultural Assets:

A large number of tourism businesses within Mbizana operate as community projects, which ensures that local residents are profitably employed within the tourism industry. While tourism is recognized as a community development strategy, Mbizana does not have an official tourism plan and without proper control tourism could grow to quickly resulting in negative community relations.

3. Operations:

Indicators for operations deal primarily with accessibility and attractiveness. Over the past five years Mbizana has constructed and improved many of their roadways allowing accessibility to most areas. While a great deal of tourism information exists for the wild coast, there is little specifically directed towards Mbizana.

4. Information and Interpretation:

There are a number of existing tour companies providing interpretation in Mbizana, and proposals for the entire coastal area to be declared a national park, providing additional opportunities for education and interpretation. While channels to promote sustainable tourism exist few operators are incorporating sustainable tourism practices and it is unknown whether residents have an understanding of what constitutes sustainable tourism practices.
5. Marketing and Management:

Mbizana has a significant lack of tourism marketing. The majority of information regarding tourism is not specific to Mbizana but rather to the Wild Coast. Mbizana also suffers from a lack of tourism management; the closest thing to a tourism management plan is the Wild Coast Spatial Development Initiative- which does not incorporate environmental and social management.

6. Safety for Ecotourism Activities:

Safety information specific to Mbizana was not available, however government websites in countries of origin warn against violent criminal activity and advise visitors to exercise a high amount of caution at all times.

7. Economic Sustainability:

Within South Africa as a whole tourism is responsible for over half a million jobs. Many tourism establishments within Mbizana are community operated and employ marginalized populations. While tourism makes a contribution to the local economy it is highly likely that some economic leakage in the form of imported goods and services takes place.

6.4.7 The Challenges and Opportunities for Tourism in Mbizana Municipality

The Mbizana Municipality has all of the natural capital to support an ecotourism industry including unspoilt coastline, rare plants, animals and environments and a unique and varied culture. The Wild Coast, of which Mbizana is a part, has tremendous potential
as a tourism destination. The existing tourism within Mbizana is to date mostly community based, which lends itself well to Ecotourism and local economic development. However, Mbizana also faces a number of significant challenges. Before ecotourism can successfully lead to sustainable development, significant improvements in infrastructure and skill development must be made. The opportunities and challenges for ecotourism development in Mbizana will be further discussed in chapter 7.

The Mbizana community has already identified ecotourism as a local economic development strategy, while the community has the raw resources necessary for ecotourism; it also faces significant challenges in the forms of infrastructure, training and differentiation from the rest of the Wild Coast. For ecotourism to be successful it is imperative that it is locally beneficial, and contributes to environmental protection. The Mbizana municipality needs to put in place training and education for tourism providers so that tourist satisfaction is achieved, and improve infrastructure to insure safety for both tourists and locals. Ecotourism can achieve sustainable development in the Mbizana community if the necessary changes and investments are made.
Chapter 7

Opportunities, Challenges and Recommendations

7.1 Challenges and Opportunities:

South Africa’s Eastern Cape faces a variety of challenges and opportunities to ecotourism development that vary across the province according to different economic, social and environmental conditions. However throughout the three case studies a number of challenges and opportunities were reoccurring. The following section will discuss the overarching issues and implications of ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape as well as the site specific opportunities and challenges within each municipal case study. These challenges and opportunities arose as a result of the indicator process, and they illustrate a number of theoretical perspectives introduced during the literature review.

7.1.1 Overarching Issues within all three Cases:

7.1.1.1 Opportunities:

1. Eastern Cape’s Natural Capital

The Eastern Cape is home to the highest number of biomes and vegetation types out of all nine provinces in South Africa (Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, 2004). The province has many sensitive and conservation worthy areas within its region, such as the subtropical thicket, wetlands, river systems, cultural sites and its coastal areas (Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, 2004). A relatively high proportion
of the Eastern Cape Province (10.18%) is formally and informally conserved, totaling over 1.7 million hectares. Once the State forests have been transferred to the Provincial conservation authority and a number of mega-parks have been developed as planned, this figure will increase substantially to more than 16% (Department of Environmental Affairs and Tourism, 2004). These protected areas are vital to conserve species that decrease as a result of agricultural practices and over use by humans, and to ensure the long term maintenance of viable populations of especially large mammals.

The natural environment of the Eastern Cape provides the setting for a variety of activities in which eco-tourists tend to participate, including hiking, fishing, wildlife viewing and natural and cultural interpretive tours. The maintenance and protection of the natural environment is of utmost importance in the facilitation of ecotourism as the unique environment and rare species represent the most valuable tourism asset in the Eastern Cape. It has been largely agreed upon that the conservation of natural resources is essential to the planning and management of ecotourism (Krippendorf, 1982; Page and Dowling, 2001; Fennel, 2001; Carter, 1994). Ecotourism occurs in and depends on a pristine natural setting.

2. Recognition of Tourism as a Development Strategy

The second opportunity for ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape is the existing support from national, provincial, district and municipal governments for tourism development. The national white paper on *The Development and Promotion of Tourism*
In South Africa identifies tourism as a noteworthy local development strategy. The white paper identifies tourism in South Africa largely as missed opportunity. The South African government argues that tourism has the potential to achieve the objectives of the Reconstruction and Development Program (RDP) of the new government by creating opportunities for the small entrepreneur, promoting awareness among different cultures, protecting the environment, creating linkages with other economic sectors, and providing dignified employment opportunities (Government of South Africa, 1996).

The Eastern Cape provincial government also supports the notion of tourism as a development strategy. Within the provincial growth and development plan (PGDP) a tourism program has been developed. The Eastern Cape tourism program’s overarching objective is to facilitate the unlocking of the tourism potential for the benefits of its people (PGDP, 2004).

At the district and municipal level the Integrated Development Plans (IDP) guides all future development. The three case studies all identify tourism as a key development strategy at both the district and municipal level. While each case study has different challenges and varying levels of tourism development, they all see potential in tourism to bring local economic development, while protecting the natural environment. The fact that the national, provincial, district and municipal governments all share support not only for tourism development, but for responsible tourism development will make the implementation of an ecotourism industry much easier and will hopefully help to establish partnerships between varying levels of government.
Carter (1994) argues that the proactive stance of government helps to ensure that the benefits of ecotourism are maximized while the adverse effects are minimized. Carter (1994) theorizes that without state intervention tourism development will likely lack the cohesion and direction necessary to sustain itself over the long term. Nelson (1993) developed an action strategy for sustainable tourism development where he argues state intervention is necessary in a number of areas. National and provincial government in South Africa and the Eastern Cape have already intervened in a number of important areas including tourism research and support for lower levels of government in tourism development strategies. The continued intervention of government is necessary in the development of regulations, continued monitoring, public consultation and training and awareness programs (Nelson, 1993).

Brohman (1996) argues that in most countries increased local participation in tourism requires institutional reform to provide possibilities for various groups to organize, represent themselves and exert influence over decision making. While the varying levels of government in South Africa all have faith in ecotourism, its success will require continued government intervention and institutional reform.

3. Tourism Infrastructure

The third overarching opportunity for ecotourism development within the Eastern Cape is the existing tourism infrastructure. While the Eastern Cape still remains a frontier for tourism, existing accommodations and attractions are present and little new tourism
infrastructure needs to be developed in order to cater to backpackers. Riley (1988) acknowledges that backpackers are not so concerned about amenities, restaurants and transportation geared specifically to the tastes of the mass tourist. The minimal importance accorded to infrastructure is witnessed in many different contexts including beach shacks selling food and drinks to backpackers in Goa, families renting out rooms in their homes to backpackers in Bali, or homestays in villages along the Wild Coast of the Eastern Cape (Visser, 2004). The combination of cost containment and the adventuresome nature ascribed to backpackers means that very little additional tourism specific infrastructure needs to be developed within the Eastern Cape.

According to Visser (2004) individuals do not need capital, a broad range of skills, or a good command of a foreign language to participate successful in the backpacking industry, this is important in the Eastern Cape as the majority of the population speak Xhosa. Catering to backpackers does not usually require any formal qualifications; rather, community members can develop skills on the job. Because the Eastern Cape is still relatively undeveloped as a tourism destination, tourism occurs largely at the community level. This must be maintained as Scheyvens (2002) suggests that when communities control their own tourism enterprises, they are in a better position to participate in local tourism enterprises through which wider development goals and the well-being of their people can be promoted.
7.1.1.2 Challenges:

1. Human Capital: Inadequate training, education and awareness

One of the greatest challenges to tourism development in the Eastern Cape is the absence of adequate education, training and awareness opportunities, both in tourism and other sectors of the economy. The Eastern Cape faces a major deficiency in educated people to fill not only tourism positions but to also fill high level positions in government and other service sectors. The previously neglected groups in society are highly disadvantaged and the job of leveling the playing field is a massive one (Government of South Africa, 1996). One of the key vehicles for doing so is education and training- a basic necessity that the majority of the population has had no access to. Neither current accommodation owners nor the surrounding communities seem to be aware of the manner in which they could assist each other in developing and enhancing ecotourism through closer business ties (Visser, 2004).

In all three case studies human capital and lack of training emerged as significant challenges to ecotourism development. In order to ensure that tour operators function in a safe and consistent manner, a monitoring and training body needs to be put into place at the community level. While some tourism training programs are in existence, it is estimated that South Africa is not capable with present output to satisfy more than 10% of its tourism training needs (Government of South Africa, 1996). Municipalities are in
need of a skill development and training program at the community level to enable tourism providers to offer consistent and safe service.

According to Brohman (1996) in order for increased local participation in tourism to take place, institutional reform is needed to provide possibilities for various groups to organize, represent themselves, and exert influence over decision making. According to Stewart and Hams (1991) active participation of local communities is needed to ensure the sustainability of tourism, and in order for communities to effectively participate they must receive proper training and education.

2. Rural Infrastructure

The provision of infrastructure is another major challenge facing the Eastern Cape, particularly infrastructure in rural areas. Rural areas are suffering from deficiencies in water, sewage, electricity, roadways and social services. This lack of infrastructure severely limits the participation of rural communities in the tourism industry. The provincial average for piped water within a dwelling or yard is 37% (PGDP, 2004). In terms of sanitation, 33% of Eastern Cape households have flush toilets, but more shocking is the 30% of households with no sanitation what-so-ever (PGDP, 2004). On average 49% of the province is electrified and 13% of households have access to telecommunication (PGDP, 2004). The above percentages are not consistent across the province; the Eastern part of the province is where levels of service are the lowest, while service provision is the highest in urban areas.
While backpackers do not require a great deal of tourism specific infrastructure, basic services are a necessity. In order for tourism development to really affect the areas most in need of local economic development the provision of infrastructure must be improved. Lack of basic services not only limits local people from participating in tourism but it also limits tourist access to these areas. Before investment in tourism should take place basic services should be provided to members of the local population. Should tourists be provided with basic services while local populations are not, the relationship between tourists and host will suffer.

7.1.2 Site Specific Issues within Each Case Study

7.1.2.1 Baviaans

Opportunities:

1. Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve

The Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve is one of the largest assets to the Baviaans Municipality in terms of ecotourism. The vision of the Baviaanskloof Mega-reserve is to expand and consolidate the existing protected area and create a mega-reserve in which the conservation of the region's biodiversity and natural resources is aligned with rural and agricultural development needs (C.A.P.E., 2008). The Baviaanskloof region is one of the most biodiverse areas within Southern Africa, with representation of all seven of South Africa’s biomes (C.A.P.E., 2008).
The Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve offers important opportunities in three different fields, biodiversity conservation, water provision and local and regional economic growth. The development of the mega reserve and the appropriate development of its tourism potential could provide a number of socio-economic benefits at the local level; including permanent and casual jobs, opportunities for public/private partnership, and training opportunities.

Challenges:

1. Fragmentation

Fragmentation is a significant issue within the Baviaans Municipality. Fragmentation results from a lack of coordination and cohesion between tourism actors in the community. With the establishment of a district wide tourism plan this fragmentation could be improved. Tourism planning must be integrated with all other planning for social and economic development (Jamal and Getz, 1995).

The IDP guides all development plans for the community and attempts to integrate all future development. While the Baviaans Municipal IDP acknowledges social and economic development it fails to adequately take into consideration the environment, the main attraction for ecotourists. While the IDP sounds like an acceptable development plan, what is written within documents and what occurs on the ground are often two very different things. Baviaans requires an effective organizational structure for tourism management and continuous, integrated planning in order to ensure the sustained success of tourism (Jamal and Getz. 1995)
7.1.2.2 Buffalo City

*Opportunities:*

1. **Urban Corridor**

   East London is South Africa’s 6th largest city and the area of East London to King William’s Town is regarded as a budding metropolitan corridor. Within the context of the Eastern Cape the East London- King William’s Town corridor is noted as the second most important contributor to the Gross Geographic Product (GGP), after the Port Elizabeth metropolitan area (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). This metropolitan corridor is a significant asset for tourism, as it provides tourists with the comforts of an urban area, including well developed social services, government offices, and exceptional accommodations, shopping and attractions. This makes Buffalo City unique as tourists are able to experience both urban luxuries and natural environments within a short distance from one another.

2. **Transportation Infrastructure**

   Buffalo City Municipality, specifically East London is well served by a variety of transportation options. Buffalo City has two major airports, the East London Airport which is connected via frequent daily flights to Johannesburg, Cape Town, Durban and Port Elizabeth, from which connections can be made to international airports, and the Bulembu airport which currently has no scheduled flights but has plans to upgrade to a cargo airport. East London is also home to the only port in the Eastern Cape. The East
London Port only imports and exports cargo, with no public transport facilities. East London also has well established rail facilities for both long distance trips to Cape Town and Johannesburg, and local trips from East London Station to Berlin Station. The Buffalo City Municipality is also well serviced by bus, minibus and tour operators including: Greyhound, Translux, The Baz Bus, Minilux, SA Connection and a variety of others.

Access to transportation is very important to the development of a successful ecotourism industry. The variety of transportation options within the Buffalo City Municipality provides ample access to tourists both coming and going to a variety of other South African destinations.

**Challenges:**

1. **Environmental Degredation**

   The different departments within the environmental sphere are all dealing with insufficient resources concerning staff, vehicles, equipment and funding (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Generally, there is insufficient protection of reserves due to inadequate policing, as well as insufficient conservation areas to adequately protect existing biodiversity (Buffalo City IDP, 2002). Increased vandalism is a threat to the beaches and coastlines, as well as degradation of ecologically sensitive coastal systems due to limited environmental awareness (Buffalo City IDP, 2002).
Within Buffalo City game farming is increasingly proposed as a vehicle for economic growth and the empowerment of local communities. However this has motivated the introduction of many large mammals. The extent of non-native species in private wildlife operations ranged from 10-57% with two thirds of all operations having 25% or more non-native introductions (Ithemba Environmental, 2003). The rising number of private game-based operations may contribute to the survival of South Africa’s biodiversity, however they must be environmentally sustainable and not compromise the health of ecosystems. Buffalo City’s natural environment is the primary attraction for ecotourists, and as such it is vital that it is properly managed, monitored and protected.

2. Alienation of Local Communities

As tourism continues to develop the potential for the alienation of local communities increases. Tourism development has to provide benefits to local people. Tourism development must also come second to the development of basic necessities, such as infrastructure and social services. If tourism is to co-exist with local communities the needs of tourists must come second to the needs of local populations.
7.1.2.3 Mbizana

*Opportunities:*

1. Wild Coast Sun

The Wild Coast Sun is the largest hotel on the Wild Coast and accounts for nearly 25% of the total beds on the coastline. The hotel is a substantial tourism draw and asset for the area. The resort is situated just within the Eastern Cape one kilometre over the border from Kwa-Zulu Natal. The resort is set on 750 ha of natural bush between the Umtamvuna and Mzamba rivers overlooking the Indian Ocean. Sun International has recently facilitated the establishment of the Wild Coast Sun Mbizana Trust, which holds 30% black economic empowerment shareholding in the Wild Coast Sun.

*Challenges:*

1. Differentiation

A major challenge to tourism development in Mbizana is the ability to differentiate the municipality from other nearby municipalities along the Wild Coast. Mbizana and its neighboring municipalities all have similar natural capital, and offer similar tourism products. Some of the neighboring areas have better developed conservation areas, nature reserves, and tourism developments. In order for Mbizana to be a successful ecotourism destination it will have to find some way to differentiate itself from other areas of the wild coast.
7.2 Recommendations:

Based on the primary opportunities and challenges identified, ecotourism and more specifically backpacking are a well suited development strategy for the Eastern Cape. The Eastern Cape is home to the natural and cultural attributes that backpackers typically look for in a destination. According to Maoz (2007), backpackers are often keen to experience the local lifestyle, and their recreational activities are likely to focus around nature, culture or adventure. Backpackers also have a tendency to travel more widely, seeking unusual and unexplored routes. This makes them the ideal tourists for the Eastern Cape as they can bring benefits directly to local municipalities, still struggling from the deliberate underdevelopment of apartheid.

7.2.1 The Potential of a backpacking Industry in the Eastern Cape

According to recent research conducted by World Youth Student and Educational (WYSE) travel confederation backpacking and youth travel is the fastest growing tourist segment representing 20% of all international visitors and generating about $109 billion dollars annually (DTI, 2008). South Africa has a growing international backpacking and youth travel market which is complementary to South Africa’s tourism mandate of halving unemployment and poverty, because it offers greater opportunities for the involvement of many local communities in rural areas than do other forms of tourism (DTI, 2008). Within South Africa the Eastern Cape is one of the most visited provinces, just behind the Western Cape and Gauteng (DTI, 2008). The average total spent per
A backpacker in South Africa is R10 294 ($1,380 CAD) per trip or R388.51 ($52 CAD) per day (DTI, 2008).

Backpacking eco-tourists represent a significant opportunity for the Eastern Cape, their interest in rural areas and authentic experiences directly benefit some of the poorer regions and communities. A case in point is the Wild Coast where the backpacking industry has already made a significant contribution to local economic development (South Africa Info, 2008). Backpacker routes often include regions distant from the international tourism routes, which generates investment where their previously would have been none (Visser, 2004). The backpacking industry allows entrepreneurs in the Eastern Cape, with few resources, to participate in the tourism system as owners of businesses (Visser, 2004). The economic benefits resulting from backpackers are highly concentrated in rural communities rather than dispersed throughout the local economy. Ecotourism can also succeed with smaller numbers of tourists and may represent the best opportunity for providing earning potential in rural communities and peripheral regions.

While backpackers have the potential to bring a variety of benefits to the Eastern Cape, the indicators applied to the three case studies show that even as the Eastern Cape is well suited to ecotourism and could benefit drastically there are also a wide range of challenges identified above. In order for ecotourism to be a successful sustainable development strategy in the Eastern Cape a number of preconditions must be in place.

Firstly ecotourism must consist of small-scale, dispersed and low density developments located in and organized by villages or communities. Secondly ownership
patterns in ecotourism should be weighed towards local, relatively small-scale businesses ensuring that economic benefits remain within the community. Thirdly ecotourism must encourage community participation in planning, and strengthen institutions designed to enhance local participation and give priority to local needs and enterprises. Lastly ecotourism must emphasize sustainability, both in an environmental and cultural sense, to ensure its lasting success. If ecotourism within South Africa’s Eastern Cape does not meet the above conditions its chances of success are limited. These preconditions are supported by the literature from a variety of authors including; Visser, 2004; Scheyvens, 2002; Loker-Murphy and Pearce, 1995; Mowforth and Munt, 2003, Fennell, 1999 and Stancliffe, 1995. In the following chapter the contextual background introduced in the literature review will be revisited to demonstrate the relationship between the academic literature and the case study findings.

**7.2.2 Potential Shortcoming of Backpacking Ecotourism Development**

If a responsible tourism approach is not adopted and the industry is not adequately planned a number of negative impacts can occur. These include environmental degradation, seasonality and unemployment during the off season, leakage of foreign exchange earnings, increased urban/rural polarization, and the exploitation of local cultures and community groups (Government of South Africa, 1996). There are a number of challenges to incorporating ecotourism into the Eastern Cape’s existing economy. The local ecotourism industry is still in its infancy, thus it remains to be seen in what way and to what extent this sector will contribute towards local development. Much needs to be
done in order to inform and educate the public in respect of the potential benefits that ecotourism presents to host communities.

7.2.3 The Role of Social Justice Theory in Backpacking Tourism

Rawls theory of Social Justice was briefly explored in the introduction as an important theoretical strand for this research. Fennel (2006) argues that justice can be found within all cultures, and hinges on what is right for individuals in association with what is right for the group. Social Justice in tourism seeks to achieve mutual understanding, solidarity and equality amongst all participants (Scheyvens, 2002).

According to Scheyvens tourism that is socially just has the following attributes:

- Builds solidarity between visitors and hosts
- Promotes mutual understanding and relationships based on equality, sharing and respect.
- Supports self-sufficiency and self-determination of local communities.
- Maximizes local economic, cultural and social benefits.

Backpackers often participate in organized tours and socially just tours can improve tourists’ understanding of local heritage and poverty issues by taking them to areas previously ignored by tour operators. Goudie et al. (1999) suggest that to exclude places like townships or shanty towns from a tour, essentially isolates them further from a country’s social and economic life, reinforcing inequalities of the past. Township tours have now become a popular activity in South Africa, particularly in Johannesburg and Capetown (Scheyvens, 2002).
The theme of social justice is reoccurring throughout the tourism literature. Brohman (1996) suggests that tourism can be a positive force for development if the needs and interests of communities are given priority over the goals of the industry. The components of sustainable development are also compatible with social justice. A socially sustainable system must achieve distributional equity, adequate provision of social services, gender equity and political accountability and participation (Harris, 2001). Some of the negative effects of tourism in the past have included the creation of social divisions or the exacerbation of already existing divisions. It is the purpose of social justice to minimize the effects of these divisions to a point at which they can be excused (Mowforth and Munt, 2003).

It is the process by which tourism occurs, not just the product, which signifies whether or not tourism is socially just (Scheyvens, 2002). Socially just tourism should not be about the rights of western travelers to explore untamed, dangerous and exotic places and peoples, rather it should be about securing the human rights of people living in areas which tourists visit (Scheyvens, 2002). One of the primary goals of this research was to determine whether ecotourism has the potential to contribute to sustainable development in the Eastern Cape and to improve the quality of life and secure human rights for its inhabitants. This question will be elaborated on in the following chapter.
Chapter 8

Conclusions and Opportunities for Further Research

8.1 General Conclusions:

8.1.1 Are Ecotourism and Sustainability Compatible in South Africa’s Eastern Cape?

Ecotourism has the potential to contribute to sustainable development, and provides an alternative to more resource dependant industries prevalent throughout the developing world. While in theory ecotourism and sustainability are compatible what occurs in reality is often much different. As previously noted there are a number of preconditions necessary in order for ecotourism to be both successful and sustainable. The indicators developed by the World Tourism Organization and applied to the case studies identified in chapter 6 are meant to ensure that ecotourism is as sustainable as possible. If the indicators are appropriately applied they provide an initial view of the potential of ecotourism in a destination, and over time provide checks and balances to ensure that ecotourism remains sustainable. The three case studies completed illustrate that ecotourism can play a role in a sustainable development strategy but must be applied in conjunction with other local economic development projects. In order for ecotourism to positively affect the livelihoods of local communities a social justice perspective is critical. Social justice is the theoretical underpinning for this research and is necessary for the benefits of ecotourism to truly reach local communities.
The developing world has an undeniable competitive advantage in terms of the variety and extent of unspoiled natural environments. Ecotourism offers destinations the opportunity of capitalizing on this comparative advantage. Place (1995) states that ecotourism has been widely promoted as a non-consumptive use of nature and a win-win development strategy for underdevelopment nations. Duffy (2006) has also acknowledged that organizations as diverse as the World Bank, development NGO’s, indigenous rights groups, tour operators, bilateral donors and environmental NGO’s have all placed faith in ecotourism as a sustainable development strategy. While there is evidence of the development potential of ecotourism in academic literature, there is also much concern over the heavy economic and non-economic costs. Doan (2000) acknowledges that tourism in developing nations has been allowed to develop with very little planning or regulation. The challenges in the Eastern Cape are consistent with some of the common problems identified by Brohman (1996), including socio-economic and spatial polarization, environmental destruction and cultural alienation.

The local municipalities used in the case studies, on their own, will be unable to tackle issues of infrastructure upgrading and development, and while training bodies, NGO’s and higher education institutions are increasingly lending their support by means of short courses and mentoring programs, government too must accept its responsibility. For ecotourism within the Eastern Cape to be both sustainable and successful, genuine co-operation and partnership between the public and private sectors and local communities is needed. Even in extremely marginalized areas, as long as adequate skills
and leadership exist, ecotourism development is possible by drawing on local attractions and resources. Within the Eastern Cape the natural resources and attractions are ideally suited to ecotourism, with the proper investment in human capital and infrastructure; community led ecotourism could promote sustainable development in the Eastern Cape.

8.1.2 What is Unique about South Africa’s Eastern Cape?

Some of the findings of this research can be generalized to all developing nations, however South Africa’s Eastern Cape has a number of attributes which make it unique. Wall (2001) emphasizes that the impacts of tourism are highly dependent on community characteristics and warns against the overgeneralization of these impacts. Wall (2001) argues that even if changes associated with tourism could be identified with certainty, they will not necessarily be regarded in a similar manner by different people with different values, and different types of involvement in tourism.

South Africa’s uniqueness provides both opportunities and challenges for ecotourism development. South Africa unlike other developing nations is home to a diversity of cultures including people of European decent, local indigenous people, and a strong immigrant population from India and Malaysia (South African Tourism, 2008). This diversity of cultures supports the African view of the world: Ubuntu. Ubuntu translates roughly as “we are who we are through others” (South African Tourism, 2008). This phrase supports a country in which the individual is never alienated. The African spirit of Ubuntu supports the development of community based tourism in which the
The benefits of tourism are spread amongst those with the greatest need. The African Ubuntu is also consistent with the theoretical framework of social justice supporting this research.

South Africa has, in recent history, undergone the political transition from apartheid to free democracy. The legacy of underdevelopment resulting from apartheid is still prevalent within the Eastern Cape and tension still exists between different racial groups. Brohman (1996) argues that tourism in the developing world can often reproduce historical patterns of inequality and reinforce longstanding patterns of socio-economic and spatial polarization. This could be particularly problematic in South Africa as racial and social tensions already exist and could easily be exacerbated. Under the apartheid system schools were segregated and the quantity and quality of education varied significantly across racial groups (US Dept. Of State, 2009). The lack of training and human capital remains one of the primary challenges for ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape. The restructuring of the education system is ongoing, while access to better opportunities in education and business are becoming more widespread, removing the legacy of apartheid will be a long term process.

8.1.3 Are indicators a useful tool in Sustainable Tourism Development?

Indicators in tourism can be used for a variety of purposes, including showing progress, assessing compliance, comparing actions with policies and identifying concerns and priority issues to address (Miller and Twining-Ward, 2005). In this case, indicators were used to gain an initial view of ecotourism in the Eastern Cape, and to identify opportunities and challenges for ecotourism development. The best indicators are those
which respond to the key risks and concerns regarding the sustainability of tourism. Indicators normally respond to issues concerning the natural resources and environment of a destination, concerns relating to economic sustainability, issues relating to cultural assets and social values, and more broadly to organization and management issues, both within the tourism sector and the broader destination (WTO, 2004). The development and use of indicators has been increasingly viewed as a fundamental part of overall destination planning and management. While indicators do help in identifying important issues, they cannot possibly grasp all of the relevant social, economic and environmental issues present within a destination. Indicators often try to quantify issues not typically quantified. In efforts to quantify social and environmental issues some of the most relevant information can be missed and the measurements can quickly become meaningless. Indicators represent an important tool in understanding the sustainability of tourism development, but like any tool it should not be used exclusively. Indicators can help to identify and monitor tourism development to promote sustainability, but should be supplemented with more detailed research into the most critical issues as identified by the indicators. Indicators help to identify and provide an overview of key issues, and open the door for future research.

In the hopes that the indicators developed throughout this research will aid in the long term monitoring of ecotourism development in the Eastern Cape, they will be passed on to the School of Economic Development and Tourism at the Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. The indicators developed through this research have the
potential to play an important role in policy development at the provincial and municipal level. Through the long term monitoring of the proposed indicators the success and sustainability of ecotourism in the Eastern Cape can be both monitored and maintained.

8.1.4 Conceptual Framework Revisited:

Figure 8-1: Ecotourism Conceptual Framework

[Diagram of Ecotourism Conceptual Framework]
The above conceptual framework, developed through an extensive literature review (chapter 2) illustrates some important processes in the development of community based ecotourism. Many of these relationships not only exist in the literature but can also be found within the case studies established in chapter 6. Two components of the conceptual framework that can be clearly identified within the case studies are highlighted with arrows. The first being the need for training and capability building. This is especially relevant in South Africa’s Eastern Cape as large groups of people have been, until recently, excluded from formal education. Proper training is pivotal to provide the people involved with the skills necessary to manage the project effectively and profitably without destroying the ecotourism attractions: primarily the environment. Upon creation of a community based ecotourism project, the conceptual framework highlights the need for government interaction and co-operation. Varying levels of government within the Eastern Cape have all identified tourism as an appropriate development strategy, and it is vital that cooperation continues into the future to maintain the sustainability of community based ecotourism projects.

The conceptual framework also highlights the importance of local values in community based ecotourism development. Local values play a critical role in the establishment and sustainability of ecotourism. Local values can be seen throughout the conceptual framework, in the local community’s cultural features, within ecotourism standards, in the maintenance and protection of local cultures and through the development of local livelihoods.
8.2 Opportunities for Future Research:

This research has provided a wealth of future research opportunities. A number of indicators could not be measured due to the scope of the current study. Each indicator which could not be measured represents a gap in available data and an opportunity for future research. For the indicators to be a success it requires follow up through longitudinal studies and monitoring. The indicators applied to the case studies in chapter 6 should be measured again in order to determine what progress or lack of is being made in ecotourism development within these destinations. While this study attempted to gain an overview of ecotourism with the Eastern Cape only three case studies were completed, and there is definitely room to look at other municipalities within the Eastern Cape, and even other provinces within South Africa. The study of other areas within South Africa could potentially facilitate a more cohesive tourism development strategy. A number of issues came to the forefront while applying the indicators including infrastructure development, human capital and tourism training. Each one of these challenges needs to be further studied and researched before the promotion of ecotourism can really occur. While this study has identified ecotourism development as a potential contributor to sustainable development, it has also identified a range of challenges. These challenges need to be addressed in additional research before ecotourism can successful be promoted as a sustainable development strategy.

This study sought to explore the potential for ecotourism development through the use of secondary sources, primarily government documents. While government documents and resources did provide a glimpse into the existing social, environmental
and economic situations in the municipalities, and allowed for the exploration of the
development potential of tourism, they were some areas where secondary sources were
not adequate. This study was unable to grasp the community attitudes towards tourism
development, and should be supplemented with the participatory process. In order to truly
understand what communities hope to gain from tourism development and how open they
are to the exploitation of their resources for tourism, the municipalities in question need
to be actively involved in the indicator process.

Tourism is one of the largest and fastest growing industries in the world. As
tourism has grown the impacts have also grown and become more diverse. The academic
community has not matched the growth in the tourism industry with growth in tourism
research. In order for tourism professionals to be familiar with the need for sustainable
practices academic and training institutions need to continue to promote tourism studies
and research.
References


Institute of Social and Economic Research (2001) *Buffalo City Quality of Life/Needs Assessment Survey*. Accessed on 06/22/at URL:  

International Council on Local Environmental Initiatives (1999) *Tourism and Sustainable Development: Sustainable Tourism a Local Authority Perspective*. UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Commission on Sustainable Development, Seventh Session. Accessed on 03/02/09 at URL:  

Ithemba Environmental (2003) *Analysis of Existing Environmental Characteristics*. Accessed on 06/22/09 at URL:  
http://www.buffalocity.gov.za/municipality/keydocs/tourism_masterplan/phase2/Environmental.PDF


164


## Appendix A

### Case Study Indicator Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Priority Areas</th>
<th>Indicators (used or proposed)</th>
<th>Y/N</th>
<th>Case Study #1 Baviaans Municipality</th>
<th>Case Study #2 Buffalo City Municipality</th>
<th>Case Study #3 Mbizana Municipality</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conservation of the Natural Environment:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Representativeness - Is the No of species typical of the area present at the site?</td>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The biodiversity index for the Baviaans municipality is 50.01-60.00 (on a scale from 0-100), Measured by the State of the Environment Report for the Eastern Cape. Land transformation is a major driver and indicator of biodiversity change. Within Baviaans Municipality the percentage of land transformed is approximately only 0-5.00%, transformed land includes cultivated land,</td>
<td>The biodiversity index for the Buffalo City Municipality is 60.01-70.00. The percentage of land transformed is approximately 15.01-20.00%.</td>
<td>The biodiversity index for the Mbizana municipality is 40.01-50.01. The percentage of land transformed in the Mbizana Municipality 55.01-60.00%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Are there unique or rare species present at the site?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Animals and Birds</td>
<td>Plants</td>
<td>Animals and Birds</td>
<td>Plants/Habitats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| - Kori Bustard  
- Kudu  
- Springbok  
- Cape Buffalo  
- Mountain Zebra  
- Cape Leopard  
- Baboons | Y | - Yellowwood Tree  
- Costal Fynbos  
- Dwarf Shrubs  
- Tiny Succulents  
- Umbrella shaped wild plum trees  
- Ancient Cycads | - Eland  
- Leopard  
- Elephant  
- Lion  
- Hippo  
- Right Whale  
- Duiker  
- Dolphin  
- Kynsa Lourie  
- Namie Trogon  
- Black Oyster catcher  
- Pied Kingfisher  
- Crowned Crane  
- Sambre Bulbul  
- Grey Sunbird | - Coastal Forest  
- Valley Thicket  
- Eastern Dune Thicket  
- Coastal Grassland  
- Riverine Thicket  
- Nama Karoo  
- Savana  
- Acia Thorn Trees  
- Tree Daisies | - Eland  
- Red Hartebeest  
- Blue Wildebeest  
- Trumpeter Hornbill  
- Yellow Throated Longclaw  
- Fish Eagle  
- Sugar birds  
- Croaking Asticolas  
- Red Shouldered Widows  
- Cape Vulture | - grassland  
- Forested Ravines and Gorges  
- Moorland  
- Woodland Thickets  
- Escarpment Subtropical Forests |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Uniqueness</th>
<th>-Is the site occupied by rare or unique species?</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>See previous indicator ↑</th>
<th>See previous indicator ↑</th>
<th>See previous indicator ↑</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are the No of individuals in the populations of rare and unique species acceptable?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>According to the state of the environment report 80.01-90.00% of plant species within Baviaans are threatened while only 5.01-10.00% of species are endangered.</td>
<td>A number of the unique species above are endangered or threatened, meaning the population levels of some of these species is unacceptable, and at risk of being in danger of extinction.</td>
<td>A number of the unique species above are endangered or threatened, meaning the population levels of some of these species is unacceptable, and at risk of being in danger of extinction.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are there endemic species at the site?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The Eastern Cape state of the environment reports high numbers of endemic or near endemic species. Out of the approximate 4000 plant species, approximately 15% are endemic. There are also</td>
<td>In terms of endemism Buffalo City is part of the Albany Centre- which is dominated by Sub Tropical Thicket. Overall endemicity for the 4000 species is estimated at 15%. Major threats include</td>
<td>The Mbizana Municipality is part of the Pondoland Centre of endemism. Endemism for the 1500 naturally occurring species is recorded at 8%. While the Pondoland region is very small geographically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of Site Protection</td>
<td>-Is the area subject to control?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td><strong>15.4%</strong> of the municipality is conserved and protected as a provincial nature reserve. The Baviaanskloof nature reserve is the largest provincial nature reserve in the Eastern Cape. In comparison 10.2% of the province as a whole is formally and informally conserved.</td>
<td>The East London Coast Nature Reserve is made up of 10 coastal reserves and 2 inland state forests. The 10 nature reserves include, Cape Morgan, Double Mouth, Cape Henderson, Cintsa West, Kwelera, Nahoon, Cove Rock/Gulu, Kidds Beach, Kayser’s Beach and Chalumna. The 2 inland forests are Umtiza Forest, and Fort Plato Forest. According to the State of the Environment Report for the Eastern Cape, <strong>1%</strong> of Buffalo City is conserved, compared with a provincial average of 10%.</td>
<td>The Mbizana Municipal homepage identifies the Mbizana Nature Reserve which protects 200ha within the commonage. Mbizana also is home the Umtamvuna Nature Reserve, which is a community based natural resource management initiative, along the border of Kwazulu Natal. According to the State of the Environment Report for the Eastern Cape, <strong>0%</strong> of the Municipal area is conserved, compared with a provincial average of 10%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Is the site recognized by</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The Baviaanskloof is a World Heritage Site recognized by</td>
<td>Buffalo City has identified a large number of Heritage</td>
<td>The Wild Coast, and more specifically the Pondoland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer</td>
<td>Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>international programmes (i.e. UNESCO)?</td>
<td></td>
<td>Sites within their municipality, along with a number of both private and public conservation areas. It is unknown whether any of these cultural and environmental sites have been recognized internationally.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| - Are any of the sites/ecosystems/assets considered to be damaged or threatened? | Y      | There are a large number of birds, reptiles, plants and mammals, classified as threatened, vulnerable, endangered and critically endangered. 
|                                                                         |        | 23% of plants which occur in the Thicket Biome are threatened. Bavians municipality is a part of this biome. 
|                                                                         |        | Bavians municipality is part of the subtropical thicket ecosystem which is not threatened but is a critical habitat for conserving species. 
|                                                                         |        | There are a large number of reptiles, amphibians, mammals, birds and plants which are threatened or endangered as identified by the State of the Environment Report. 
|                                                                         |        | The thicket biome of which Buffalo City is a part of contains 23% threatened plant species. While the ecosystem itself is not threatened it is critical to support threatened and endangered species. 
|                                                                         |        | There are a large number of reptiles, amphibians, mammals, birds and plants which are threatened or endangered as identified by the State of the Environment Report. 
<p>|                                                                         |        | The Pondoland Centre of which Mbizana’s coast is a part of is also considered to be threatened due to lack of protection and poor land use planning. |
| Water Quality                                                                 | -Does the local population have access to treated water? | Y &amp; N | Almost 1500 households have access to water within their homes, and another 1800 have access within their yards. However 538 households have to travel to obtain water from a variety of sources including, community stands, boreholes, springs and rain tanks. According to the Baviaans IDP R45 million is required to eradicate backlogs based on an acceptable level of service. In the Baviaans municipality the Water Service Authority staffing level is at only 9%, which could potentially have a serious effect on water quality. | The quality of life survey indicates that the majority of the traditional areas (72.3%) and informal areas (89.5%) rely on standpipes for their potable water supply. 26% of the population of Buffalo City does not have access to basic water service (water source &gt;200m away). Water and sewage infrastructure is at capacity and in poor condition. There is also a limited raw water supply (IDP). One of the prime objectives of the municipality is a reduction in the backlog of basic service provision. | The 2004 Department of Water and Forestry reference framework estimates that 45% of the population in Mbizana Local Municipality does not meet the Reconstruction and Development Program’s standards for access to water services. The Mbizana Municipality water treatment plants are poorly operated and maintained. Surface water requires high levels of treatment and the operators running the plants are not qualified to do so. |
| -Have there been incidents of violation of | Y | The Baviaans municipality is located within the Fish to Tsitsikamma water | Unknown | Unknown |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Impacts on Flora and Fauna</th>
<th>-Are the population sizes of key species acceptable?</th>
<th>__</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Is there illegal hunting and fishing at the site during high season?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>South Africa’s hunting season is year round, which makes it exceptionally costly to manage. Currently hunting is poorly regulated and managed resulting in illegal hunting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are there introduced species at the site?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The Eastern Cape State of the Environment Report has identified two indicator alien species: A. cyclops and A. mearnsii</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>However there is a lack of reliable invasive alien plant data for the Eastern Cape Province. Estimates range from 15-79% of the province being affected by invasive species.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism carrying capacity of the</td>
<td>-Is there a defined capacity</td>
<td>Y &amp; N</td>
<td>No defined carrying capacity</td>
<td>Buffalo City Municipality has identified 13 tourism nodes and the various capacity</td>
<td>No defined carrying capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>site</td>
<td>estimate for the site?</td>
<td>constraints facing these nodes. The main capacity constraints in Buffalo city are related to water and electricity supply, sanitation, the lack of tourism services and environmental protection.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Is the capacity estimate for the location acceptable?</td>
<td>There is no defined capacity for the location.</td>
<td>A specific capacity estimate for the site was not identified.</td>
<td>A capacity estimate for the municipality does not exist.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fragility</td>
<td>-Are there endangered and endemic endangered species?</td>
<td>There are a significant number or endangered and critically endangered reptile, bird, mammal and plant species, as identified in the State of the environment report. Some endangered species include: Wattled Crane, Rudd’s Lark, Roseate Tern, Damara Tern</td>
<td>There are a significant number or endangered and critically endangered reptile, bird, mammal and plant species, as identified in the State of the environment report.</td>
<td>There are a significant number or endangered and critically endangered reptile, bird, mammal and plant species, as identified in the State of the environment report.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Within Buffalo City 40.01-50.00% of plant species are endangered, while 60.01-70.00% of plant species are vulnerable.</td>
<td>The percentage of endangered plant species per municipal area within the Mbizana Municipality is 20.01-30.00%. While the percentage of vulnerable plant species is</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relations with Local Community and Preservation of Cultural Assets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Local Community Participation</strong></td>
<td><strong>-Are local products and services consumed by tourism?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Y</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourists want souvenirs, arts, crafts, and cultural manifestations, and in many tourist destinations, crafts people have responded to the growing demand and have made changes to their products to bring them more in line with consumer tastes. While this increase the self worth of the artists and contributes to the conservation of cultural tradition it may also result in the commoditization of cultural goods.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tourist operators promote local artwork and traditional cuisine among their visitors. Examples include local gardens providing refreshments, and a Sibange house recently established by the municipality in Willowmore to train disadvantaged persons in crafts and needlework.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>As an established tourism destination, local vendors may have difficulty competing with larger vendors and shopping malls which have been established.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Mbizana Gateway is being considered for development as a Tourism Gateway to the wild coast with expanded craft production facilities for local artists and crafters.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-Does Employment of local</strong></td>
<td><strong>Y</strong></td>
<td><strong>Because Baviana Municipality is yet to be established as a prime tourist</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Local employment does take place however the number of people employed and the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A number of tourism businesses within Mbizana including The Wild Coast</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Residents take place? (numbers, income levels) | Destination many of the accommodations and businesses are owned and/or operated by local residents. Some establishments run as empowerment projects to increase participation of marginalized groups in the tourism industry (Cedar Guest House). Quality of this employment is unknown. | Sun, Mbizana Tours, Amadiba Adventures, and Mtentu Lodge operate as community projects or are run by organization such as the ACCODA trust. This ensures that local residents are gainfully employed in the tourism industry.

<p>| Is there assistance to local environmental awareness? | Y | The State of the Environment Report for the Eastern Cape measures the expenditure on environmental management, research, education and awareness in the province. From 2001-2004 the expenditure on the environmental management budget has increased. The IDP represents the master plan for local development, and reference to the environment is a good indication of assistance to local environmental awareness. |
| Impact on Infrastructure and Services | -Is there investment in infrastructure or services for tourism? | N | Investment in infrastructure is one of Baviaans top development priorities. Provision and maintenance of infrastructure and basic services remains one of the biggest challenges for the Baviaans municipality. While there are significant attempts to improve infrastructure in general, there is no investment in infrastructure specifically for tourism. | Buffalo Cities Tourism master plan completed an inventory of existing infrastructure and required improvements. The tourism master plan also outlines a number of tourism projects which include interpretation centres, resorts and tourism routes which will all contribute to investments in infrastructure and services for tourism. However the progress of the tourism master plan is unknown. | Investment in infrastructure is one of the top priorities for the Mbizana municipality, including investment in the provision of electricity, road maintenance and development, water, sanitation and housing. Within the IDP and Municipal Webpage tourism related projects have been identified as local economic development strategies although it is unclear whether any infrastructure investment to support these projects has taken place. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community attitudes to tourism</th>
<th>- Is there local satisfaction with the level of tourism?</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Existence of a community tourism plan</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The tourism development plan is a component of the Integrated Development Plan for the Baviaans Municipality and was recently completed in 2008. In addition to the tourism plan specifically for the Baviaans Municipality there is also a tourism plan within the Cacadu District IDP and the Provincial Growth and Development Plan (141)</td>
<td>The Buffalo City Municipality Tourism Master Plan was completed in 2004 and in a comprehensive action plan, to support the development of a number of tourism attractions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Has the tourism plan been updated?</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>The community tourism plan for the Baviaans municipality is still recent.</td>
<td>According to my knowledge the Tourism Plan has not been updated since its creation in 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism as a catalyst for social or cultural change</td>
<td>-Is the average tourist income higher than that of local residents</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The majority of people in the Baviaans municipality make less than R800 or $110 CAD per month.</td>
<td>In Buffalo City the most commonly earned (48.7%) monthly household income is between R1 and R1500. The per capita income among African people is R524/month and R887/month for coloured people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-Has there been a change in traditional activities and customs</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capture of the benefits from tourism for the community</td>
<td>-Are local people employed in tourism?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Many of the accommodations and businesses are owned and/or operated by local residents. Some establishments run as empowerment projects to Local employment does take place however the number of people employed and the quality of this employment is unknown. Within South Africa as a whole tourism is expected to be responsible for A number of tourism businesses within Mbizana including The Wild Coast Sun, Mbizana Tours, Amadiba Adventures, and Mtentu Lodge operate as community projects or are</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer</td>
<td>Details</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is community income derived from tourism?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The chief executive officer of South Africa’s Tourism claims that the tourism industry is to make up 12% of the country’s GDP by 2010. South Africa receives R53.9 billion dollars from tourism of which R3.7 billion are spent in the Eastern Cape.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase participation of marginalized groups in the tourism industry</td>
<td></td>
<td>Many establishments are located on working farms. While the tourism master plan does not make specific mention of local employment. Sections 9 and 10 are the Skills Development Framework and the Enterprise Development Support Program. These reports outline the needed tourism skills and offer tourism awareness, development and support programs to local people, in hopes they will become employed in tourism.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.6% of total exports, or 1,650,140 jobs, or 8.2% of total employment by 2013.</td>
<td></td>
<td>While the tourism master plan does not make specific mention of local employment. Sections 9 and 10 are the Skills Development Framework and the Enterprise Development Support Program. These reports outline the needed tourism skills and offer tourism awareness, development and support programs to local people, in hopes they will become employed in tourism.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>run by organization such as the ACCODA trust. This ensures that local residents are gainfully employed in the tourism industry.</td>
<td></td>
<td>While no statistics on Mbizana are available within South Africa as a whole tourism is expected to be responsible for 14.6% of total exports, or 1,650,140 jobs, or 8.2% of total employment by 2013.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
There is no measure of the current contribution of tourism to the GDP of the Eastern Cape or the Baviaans municipality. The Amathole district of which Buffalo City is a part lacks reliable tourism data and statistics. However room occupancy rates within Buffalo City have increased from 54-57%.

The OR Tambo district of which Mbizana Municipality is a part lacks reliable tourism data and statistics. The amount of community income which is specifically derived from tourism with Mbizana is unknown.

<p>| Social Benefits associated with tourism | -Are social services available to the community? | Y | Social services are available to the community through the form of grants, and community centres. Over 75% of the population of the Baviaans Municipality rely on social grants (these grants include old age, disability, foster care and child support). THETA’s (Tourism, Hospitality, Sport Education and Training Authority) main function is the raising of skills for those employed or wanting to be employed in Buffalo City’s social services and facilities range from detailed well developed and properly maintained facilities to basic, underdeveloped and overused facilities. The vast majority of community facilities and services are concentrated in more affluent areas. These existing facilities are inadequate to cope with present demands which are cause for concern as they have been a positive factor for keeping unemployed people of the streets. Making Welfare Services are the responsibility of the provincial government, however the municipality plays an active facilitative role. This includes improving access to various grants that are meant to serve as safety nets. In terms of the Provincial Department, there has been a huge improvement considering that in 2001 only 15 577 people had access to these grants compared to 44... |
| General impacts on community life | Number of tourists per day, per week etc | South Africa’s eastern cape is still not well established as a tourism destination. South Africa receives approximately 1.8 million overseas arrivals, 7% of which visit the Eastern Cape. | There is no visitor information specifically for the Baviaans Municipality, or the Cacadu District. | Amathole district like many other districts within the Eastern Cape lacks reliable tourism data. The number of tourists that visit Buffalo City is unknown. | The number of tourists that visit Mbizana Municipality is unknown. |
| Operations | -Ratio of tourists to locals | -Are any of these services attributable to tourism? | Unknown | 583 in 2005 with access to grants indicating a 78% improvement in the past five years. | 183 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total number of tourists visiting the destination</th>
<th>Total tourist numbers</th>
<th>456,000 tourists visit the Eastern Cape annually.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>There is not a measure of the total tourist numbers within the Baviaans Municipality.</td>
<td>There is not a measure of the total tourist numbers within the Buffalo City Municipality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amount of economic stimulus provided by tourism</td>
<td>Amount spent per day per tourist</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accessibility</td>
<td>Are there access routes in good condition for tourism use? (paths, motorized, airstrips, boat access etc)</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some roads to tourist attractions need surfacing to improve access and district roads in general are gravel roads that need upgrading to improve town linkages.

The municipality, while noting that there are a few areas without access to well maintained roads, acknowledges that most areas in Mbizana have access roads, and that the priority of building new roads must be balanced against that of maintaining the existing ones.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Attractiveness</th>
<th>-Is there a presence of key ecological features of the site in media and tourism promotional materials?</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>-Ecological features are the primary attraction within the Cacadu District and are present on wide variety of internet promotional materials including the Eastern Cape Tourism Board, the Cacadu district Municipality webpage, the Cacadu tourism page, the Baviaans Municipality webpage and the Baviaans tourism webpage</th>
<th>Ecological features and Buffalo City’s coastline are some of the primary attraction within the municipality and are present on wide variety of internet promotional materials including the Eastern Cape Tourism Board, the Buffalo City Municipality Homepage, and the Buffalo City Tourism webpage. Buffalo City’s Tourism Master Plan also highlights the importance of the natural environment. One of their</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Mbizana Municipality website, as well as the OR Tambo district website has little information regarding tourism in the Municipality, let alone the ecological features of the site.

In order to find ecological features in media and tourism promotional materials it is necessary to look at materials regarding the Wild Coast which Mbizana is a part of.
tourism development priorities is the development of a Nahoon seaside resort.

Lastly the Eastern Cape Parks Board highlights the environmental features of the East London Coast Nature Reserve one of the municipality’s primary tourism destinations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Information and Interpretation</th>
<th>Educational-interpretive value (value of the site for educating and awareness raising)</th>
<th>There are a large number of 4X4 routes throughout the Baviaans Municipality, offered through local game reserves and guest houses. Guest Houses, Bush Camps and Farm Stays often offer their own tours. While there are many opportunities for interpretation and education, the existence of printed</th>
<th>There are a significant number of Provincial, Local and Private Nature Reserves in the Buffalo City Municipality, which could lend themselves to interpretation. There are also a number of established trails in the municipality, identifies in the Tourism Master Plan. The Tourism Master Plan also identifies priority</th>
<th>There are a number of existing tour companies that provide interpretation including: Mzamba tours and Amadiba adventures. Other opportunities for environmental interpretation exist in the form of the two nature reserves in Mbizana, namely the Umtamvuna Nature Reserve and the Mbizana Nature Reserve.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>-Are there opportunities for interpretation and education at the site? (existence of guided visits, printed materials, interpretive panels and interpretation</td>
<td>There are a large number of 4X4 routes throughout the Baviaans Municipality, offered through local game reserves and guest houses. Guest Houses, Bush Camps and Farm Stays often offer their own tours. While there are many opportunities for interpretation and education, the existence of printed</td>
<td>There are a significant number of Provincial, Local and Private Nature Reserves in the Buffalo City Municipality, which could lend themselves to interpretation. There are also a number of established trails in the municipality, identifies in the Tourism Master Plan. The Tourism Master Plan also identifies priority</td>
<td>There are a number of existing tour companies that provide interpretation including: Mzamba tours and Amadiba adventures. Other opportunities for environmental interpretation exist in the form of the two nature reserves in Mbizana, namely the Umtamvuna Nature Reserve and the Mbizana Nature Reserve.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>centres)</td>
<td>materials, interpretive panels or interpretation centres is unknown. However, according to the Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve Pamphlet, there is a planned World Heritage Site-linked interpretation centre at the eastern gateway to the mega reserve.</td>
<td>tourism projects. The following projects identified by the municipality lend themselves well to interpretation and education: -Struggle Route -Steve Biko Interpretation Centre -Military History Route -Marine History Route -Bird Watching Route While there are many opportunities for interpretation and education, the existence of printed materials, interpretive panels or interpretation centres is unknown.</td>
<td>Proposals have been tabled for the entire coastal area to be declared a National Conservation Park, which would represent even more interpretational value. The OR Tambo Cultural Village also represents an excellent opportunity for interpretation and education within Mbizana. Currently, the Mibizana Gateway is being considered for development as a tourism gateway to the Wild Coast, with a regional tourism and environmental information and interactive centre.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

-Does the site have an education value given to the site by educators, NGO’s, tour operators etc? | Y | As a World Heritage site, designated by UNESCO, it ascribes a certain level of educational value. | Unknown | The Wild Coast has been identified as one of WWF International’s Global 200 Ecoregions of Global Significance. This clearly gives Mbizana value in terms of environmental education.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Availability of Information</th>
<th>-Do avenues/channels to promote sustainable tourism exist?</th>
<th>Y</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

A number of avenues to promote sustainable tourism exist. The Eastern Cape Tourism Board is probably the most well established tourism resource within the Eastern Cape. The Baviaans Tourism Association is also a valuable avenue to promote sustainable tourism.

Other channels that could be used to promote sustainable tourism, that are not directly linked to tourism development include:

- Eastern Cape Development Corporation
- Eastern Cape Department of Sports Recreation, Arts and Culture
- Eastern Cape Department of Economic Development and Environmental Affairs
- Eastern Cape Parks Board
- THETA (Tourism, Hospitality, Sport Education, and Training Authority)

The Baviaans Tourism Association, the Baviaanskloof Mega Reserve webpage and booklet are also a valuable avenue to promote sustainable tourism.

The Buffalo City Tourism Association and the Buffalo City Municipal Government are also valuable avenues to promote sustainable tourism however they are not as well established as the Eastern Cape Tourism Board.

Mbizana Municipal Government is also a valuable avenue to promote sustainable tourism that is not being fully taken advantage of.

As tourism grows in Mbizana it would be in the municipality’s best interest to develop a municipal tourism authority, to manage issues and promote tourism at the community level.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Application of Information</th>
<th>-Is information on sustainable tourism used within the broader community context?</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are agencies applying information on sustainability aspects to their strategic planning process?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The district and municipal level IDP’s are both attempts to apply sustainable development principles to the strategic planning process. The PGDP is also an attempt at the provincial level to apply sustainable development principles to local economic development.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Action/impact of the Information | **-Are tourism operators incorporating sustainable tourism practices into their businesses?** | **Y** | **In order to determine whether local operators were employing sustainable practices, the Baviaans tourism association-accommodation listings were analyzed for the presence of sustainable practices.**

Out of the 59 accommodations listed by the Baviaans Tourism Association 14 were found to have some form of sustainable practices. These include:
- Run as empowerment projects
- Campsites within Nature Conservation Parks
- Participation in environmental conservation programs
- Offer educational programs and tours

| | **In order to determine whether local operators were employing sustainable practices, a variety of accommodation listings were analyzed for the presence of sustainable practices. These listings included the Buffalo City Tourism Authority, Eastern Cape Tourism Board, SA Venues, Rooms for Africa and Where to Stay.**

Out of the 119 accommodations listed only 11 were found to have some form of sustainable practices. While 50 made mention of access to nature based activities at their location. Sustainable practices included:
- Conservancies
- Hiking Trails
- Blue Flag Beaches
- Indigenous plants
- Forest reserves

| | **Mbizana is not a well established tourism destination and many accommodations along the Wild Coast are situated in and around East London and Port St. Johns. While Mbizana makes up only 10% of the wild coast it accounts for almost 25% of the total tourism beds available, due to the Wild Coast Sun.**

The Wild Coast Sun is the largest hotel on the Wild Coast and accounts for nearly 25% of the total beds on the coastline. The only other apparent accommodation within Mbizana is the Mtentu Lodge located on the southern border of Mbizana.

| | **Both of these accommodations incorporate sustainable tourism practices into their businesses. The Wild Coast Sun Mbizana** |
Trust is a part of the Black economic empowerment act, and the Mtentu Lodge is actively involved in conservation and is operated by the ACCODA Trust.

-Do residents have an understanding of what constitutes sustainable tourism practices?

<p>| | | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Marketing and Management**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identifying the market for more sustainable products</th>
<th>-Do visitors seek environmentally friendly and culturally sensitive experiences?</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>There is a growing demand for environmentally and socially sustainable tourist experiences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Action</td>
<td>Accommodation Description</td>
<td>Business Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measuring the image of the destination of products considering sustainability aspect</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Many of the accommodations listed by the Baviaans Tourism Association market “green” experiences. Almost all tourism providers offer some form of plant and wildlife viewing. Many offer 4X4, hiking or biking trails, as well as guided tours and campsites. However of the 59 accommodation website that were analyzed only 14 made mention of sustainable practices. Although many “green” or sensitive experiences are offered they may not be sustainable.</td>
<td>Many of the accommodations listing that I viewed make mention of “green” or nature based activities, such as hiking, fishing, wildlife viewing, surfing etc. However of the 119 accommodations that were analyzed only 11 made mention of sustainable practices. Although many “green” or sensitive experiences are offered they may not be sustainable. Both accommodation providers and tour operators market a variety of “green” products and experiences including horse, hiking and biking trails, wildlife viewing, and fishing to name a few. While a wide range of “green” experiences are offered the long term sustainability of these activities is unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do establishments and operations market sustainable, sensitive or green products or experiences?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Many of the accommodations listed by the Baviaans Tourism Association market “green” experiences. Almost all tourism providers offer some form of plant and wildlife viewing. Many offer 4X4, hiking or biking trails, as well as guided tours and campsites. However of the 59 accommodation website that were analyzed only 14 made mention of sustainable practices. Although many “green” or sensitive experiences are offered they may not be sustainable.</td>
<td>Many of the accommodations listing that I viewed make mention of “green” or nature based activities, such as hiking, fishing, wildlife viewing, surfing etc. However of the 119 accommodations that were analyzed only 11 made mention of sustainable practices. Although many “green” or sensitive experiences are offered they may not be sustainable. Both accommodation providers and tour operators market a variety of “green” products and experiences including horse, hiking and biking trails, wildlife viewing, and fishing to name a few. While a wide range of “green” experiences are offered the long term sustainability of these activities is unknown.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do businesses include information on environmental and social aspects of their operation?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Of the 59 businesses offering accommodations and activities only 14 made mention of the environmental and social aspects of their operations. Those businesses which incorporate sustainable practices into their operations do include information on the environmental and social aspects of their businesses, within their websites and All of the tour providers and accommodations listed on the Mbizana webpage include information on the social and environmental aspects of their operations.</td>
<td>Of the 59 businesses offering accommodations and activities only 14 made mention of the environmental and social aspects of their operations. Those businesses which incorporate sustainable practices into their operations do include information on the environmental and social aspects of their businesses, within their websites and All of the tour providers and accommodations listed on the Mbizana webpage include information on the social and environmental aspects of their operations.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These businesses participated in social empowerment and environmental protection programs. As mentioned earlier very few accommodations operate according to sustainable practices. Those which do operate sustainably participate in conservancy, the blue flag beach program, hiking trails and birding activities and protection.

Some of the sustainable practices of these businesses include:
- Black Economic Empowerment
- ACCODA Trust
- Community Based Natural Resource Management
- Located within Municipal commonage
- Community based tour operations

Tourism management plan for the site

Tourism management is done at a district level. Cacadu in partnership with its nine local municipalities is currently moving through a two tiered approach for tourism development and has recently obtained R2.4 million in funding for this process.

Once the outstanding tourism plans for the municipalities are completed the development of the district wide tourism plan will

The Buffalo City Municipality has a tourism master plan which guides the municipality’s tourism development. Included within the master plan are the tourism development plan, and action plan.

Other documents also guide and affect tourism development including the Buffalo City Development Strategy, the Integrated Coastal Zone Management

The Mbizana IDP guide development in the municipality, while there is some mention of tourism as a local economic development strategy- there is no management plan for tourism within the IDP.

The closest thing to a tourism management plan is the Wild Coast Spatial Development Initiative which attempts to develop partnerships between community tourism projects,
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Regulation of the Site</th>
<th>-Existence of rules to regulate construction, hunting and fishing, and extraction of natural resources at the site</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>The Professional Hunters Association of South Africa outlines the regulation of the trophy hunting industry. There are significant licensing requirements before hunting can occur, as well as specific areas and seasons within which hunting can occur.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Does the site have regulated zoning or tourism use zones?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>-15.4% of the Municipality is zoned as provincial park, managed by the Eastern Cape Parks Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The municipality tourism use zone is called “resort zones” the primary use of these zones is resort, resort accommodation, holiday accommodation, caravan park, camping site, place of assembly, recreation complex, caretaker's cottage, convenience shop, tourist facilities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism</td>
<td>-Is there any</td>
<td></td>
<td>The Mbizana IDP identifies areas of strategic importance, which include an Ecotourism Zone, Protected area Zone, and the Normal Control Zone. All of these zoning areas are along the coast and designed to protect the coast and facilitate ecotourism development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>management capacity of the site</td>
<td>annual expenditure on management and control</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Tourism, the backbone of local economic development in the Baviaans Municipality, increased from 0.6% of the budget to 1.2%. It is unclear however, how this budget is spent, and how much contributes to the management and control of tourism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Responsibility</td>
<td>-Existence of company/government policies aiming at social issues of employment and relation with host communities.</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>-THETA (Tourism, Hospitality, Sport Education and Training Authority) -TECSA (Tourism Empowerment Council of South Africa) -BEE (Black Economic Empowerment)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety for Ecotourism Activities</td>
<td>Tourist Security</td>
<td>-Have tourists been harmed or injured?</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Answer</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Has there been mention of destination in international news of incidents?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>South Africa has regular general strikes and demonstrations, which can escalate into violent mobs.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The recent election in South Africa, has so far been peaceful, but could potentially lead to demonstrations and riots.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presence of the destination in guidebooks dealing with safety concerns</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The Lonely Planet advises against crime and theft as it is the major risk that visitors face.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is there a rating of the destination on travelers advisory in principle countries of origin,</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>The USA does not have a current travel warning for South Africa, but it does warn against violent criminal activity and mob violence.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada also does not have an official warning at this time, but they do advise visitors to exercise a high amount of caution.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The UK also suggests that visitors maintain caution while visiting.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Most government websites offer the same warnings, to avoid mobs and large crowds as protests occur regularly with little warning. They also report that South Africa has a high level of serious crime, and all travelers should be cautious.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local Public Safety</td>
<td>-Have there been crimes reported involving visitors?</td>
<td>Most travel warnings pertaining to South Africa maintain that most violent demonstrations and crimes do not involve visitors. Specific reports of crimes involving visitors could not be found.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Does destination security focused on tourism exist?</td>
<td>Unknown Unknown Unknown Unknown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Economic Sustainability**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Leakages</th>
<th>-Are goods imported?</th>
<th>Y It is highly likely that goods are imported however specific sources providing this information were unavailable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are services imported?</td>
<td>Unknown Unknown Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-Are goods imported for visitor use and consumption?</td>
<td>Y It is highly likely that goods are imported for tourism, as tourists often prefer goods and foods from their home countries as a source of familiarity, however specific sources providing this information were unavailable</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
All three municipalities and districts being studied suffer from a lack of reliable tourism data. The country as a whole generated 5,232,000 tourism receipts in 2003. This represented 11.5% of the country’s exports.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tourist Contribution to the Local Economy</th>
<th>-Revenues generated by tourism as % of total revenues generated in the community</th>
<th>—</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local GDP and % due to tourism</td>
<td>The chief executive officer of South Africa’s Tourism claims that the tourism industry is to make up 12% of the country’s GDP by 2010.</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employment and Income Opportunities</th>
<th>-Are local people employed in tourism?</th>
<th>Y</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Because Baviaans Municipality is yet to be established as a prime tourist destination many of the accommodations and businesses are owned and/or operated by local residents. Some establishments run as empowerment projects to increase participation of marginalized groups in the tourism industry (Cedar Guest House). Many establishments are</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within South Africa as a whole tourism is responsible for over half a million jobs. Considering the number of accommodations and attractions in the municipality there are likely a significant number of local people employed in tourism. However the quality of this employment is unknown.</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Within South Africa as a whole tourism is responsible for over half a million jobs. Many establishments within Mbizana run as empowerment projects or community run operations to increase participation of marginalized groups in the tourism industry</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>located on working farms.</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ration of tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>employment to total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>employment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>wage/average wage in</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equity</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does tourism make a</td>
<td></td>
<td>Unknown</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>financial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>contribution to</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>community projects?</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is there infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any infrastructure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>development in the</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>form of roadways, water</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>electricity, sewage etc.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stimulated by tourism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>will have a direct</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>benefit to the locality.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question</td>
<td>Baviaans</td>
<td>Buffalo City</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>stimulated by tourism that also benefits the poor in the locality?</td>
<td>Currently the tourism industry in Baviaans is just beginning to take shape, and has not likely stimulated any infrastructure development.</td>
<td>Currently the tourism industry is just beginning to take shape in Buffalo City, and has not likely stimulated any infrastructure development.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The priority development projects for the Buffalo City Municipality are:  - Sport Centre of Excellence  - Marina Glen Multi-purpose Venue  - Struggle Route  - Steve Biko Interpretation Centre  - Nahoon Seaside Resort</td>
<td>Currently in the works is the Mbizana Gateway, which will not only provide an interpretive and educational centre for tourists but will also house facilities for local artists and crafters.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Are there development programs in places?</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- PGDP  - IDP  - BEE  - THETA  - TECSA  - TEP  - Another Way Trust (Baviaans only)  - Tourism Master Plan (Buffalo City)  - ACCODA (Mbizana Only)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>