NAVIGATING COMPULSORY CAREER STUDIES IN TIMES OF LOCAL AND GLOBAL ECONOMIC CHALLENGE: A TEACHER’S EXPERIENCE IN EASTERN ONTARIO

by

LORRAINE GODDEN

A thesis submitted to the Department of Education
in conformity with the requirements for the degree of Master of Education

Queen’s University
Kingston, Ontario, Canada
September, 2011

Copyright ©Lorraine Godden, 2011
Abstract

For some time, youth worldwide have faced high levels of unemployment, up to twice as high as adults in Canada (Quintini, Martin, & Martin, 2007). In an environment proliferated with economic recovery initiatives responding to the global economic downturn that began in 2008 (Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, 2010), navigation towards employment for youth is complex and dynamic. Many rural communities were damaged by the global economic downturn, particularly in eastern Ontario (Jinha, 2009). The value of career education in supporting youth with transition from school-to-work is widely supported (Bell & O’Reilly, 2008). To my knowledge, a teacher’s perspective on teaching compulsory career studies within times of significant economic challenge has remained unexplored.

Using two strands of data collection, document analysis was used to describe policies and strategies that comprised the Canadian and Ontario governments’ responses to the global economic downturn and the provincial policy on career education. I undertook interviews with a career studies teacher to document her knowledge of Canadian and Ontario governments’ responses, and how and from where she gained this knowledge. The teacher’s perceptions of challenges faced by career studies students’ when seeking employment, and of what this knowledge contributed to her teaching practice were also reported.

The documents revealed that Canadian and Ontario governments’ had responded to the global economic downturn with similar policies and strategies, influenced by future economic security. The Ministry of Education curriculum documents included economy
which was linked with the students’ learning and to the expectations of the curriculum.

The teacher had limited knowledge of federal and provincial policies and strategies, although she saw connections to the career studies curriculum. The teacher supported her career studies practice through experience gained in a combined role as a teacher of cooperative education and business subjects, and the experience of colleagues.

I concluded that the teaching of career studies was influenced by the teacher’s other teaching subjects, and career studies teachers’ need access to appropriate, current resources to meet curriculum expectations. Expanding the program to full-credit status might allow teachers greater flexibility to tailor the career studies program to meet individual students’ needs.
Acknowledgements

A life changing event in 1998 was the start of a long, complex journey that led to the completion of this thesis. Along the route there have been a number of people that have provided sustenance to help me reach my destination. I would like to take the time to acknowledge them, the part they have played, and my gratitude to them all.

To the lecturers who taught me in the early days, in particular Dr. Pamela Donnelly, Sharron Wardman-Brown, Allison Pawsey, Dr. Anthony Bennett and Ray Wright, who once upon a time asked me “have you ever wanted to teach?” You all in turn inspired me, and gave me the confidence to begin this voyage.

My time at Queen’s University Faculty of Education began with a conversation with Dr. Peter Chin. Peter, your advice in those early days was invaluable and was instrumental in helping me get the most from my program, you have my gratitude. The members of the faculty graduate studies office have consistently provided appropriate support with a friendly smile; you are all great at what you do. My fellow graduate students at Queen’s have provided companionship, enthusiasm, and a collegiality that has been both supportive and challenging. I have enjoyed both getting to know you, and the privilege of working alongside each of you.

I have been extraordinarily lucky to work with professor’s Dr. Nancy Hutchinson and Dr. Benjamin Kutsyuruba. Ben, I thank you for your patient guidance and enthusiasm in your role as committee for this thesis. I very much look forward to our future educational endeavors together. So many flattering and positive things come to mind when I think of Nancy, I have been so fortunate to work with you. You have endlessly
provided me with support, encouragement, and the right amount of challenge. Your skills as a mentor are second to none, and I thank you deeply for being such a great navigator on this voyage and for encouraging me to continue to travel and grow.

Julia, my participant teacher, without you there would be no thesis. I thank you for sharing the story of your career studies program teaching with me, talking to you was both enlightening and fun!

On a more personal level I turn to my friends and family. I have been blessed with many friends over the years, who have offered support and guidance just when needed. You come from far and wide, from Tollesbury and Colchester, England; Kingston and Westport, Ontario; and Sydney, Australia. The people in my life that matter…you each know who you are.

Pat and Roy, you have always respected and valued my dreams. You both have my deepest gratitude for your support, love, and encouragement. My parents, John and Joyce, who taught me to remain positive, determined, and focused on the journey's end. I could not wish for better role models than you both have been. Your love and nurturing allowed me to find the confidence to begin this journey. My wish is simple; that each of your dreams may also come true. My three children, Daniel, Abigail, and Amelia. I love each of you with all my heart and you unfailingly make me proud. I hope that you all will be inspired to make your own journeys in the years to come.

Paul, my partner and best friend in everything I do. Without you the journey would have been impossible to navigate.

I dedicate this thesis to you, with my love, always.
Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................................. ii
Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................. iv

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................................... 1
Purpose .................................................................................................................................................. 6
Autobiographical Signature ..................................................................................................................... 7
Theoretical Frameworks .......................................................................................................................... 9
Definition of Key Terms ......................................................................................................................... 16
Boundary of this Case Study ................................................................................................................... 17
Overview of Thesis ............................................................................................................................... 17

CHAPTER 2 REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE .............................................................................................. 19
International, National, and Provincial Contexts of Career Education ................................................. 19
- Canadian Context ............................................................................................................................... 25
Career Education and its Interconnection with the Labour Market: Influence of Federal (National) and Provincial Policies ......................................................................................................................... 30
Structure and Outcomes of Career Education as a School-to-work Transition Process ....................... 35
Guidance and Career Education in Ontario ............................................................................................ 39
Conclusion of Literature Review ........................................................................................................... 41

CHAPTER 3 METHOD .............................................................................................................................. 43
Rationale for Qualitative Methods ......................................................................................................... 43
Document Collection, Selection, and Analysis ...................................................................................... 44
- Definition of Document Types .......................................................................................................... 46
- Search and Selection Strategies for Documents .................................................................................. 47
- Analytical Framework for Analysis of Selected Documents ............................................................... 49
Interviews with a Teacher of Compulsory Career Studies .................................................................... 50
- Participant School ............................................................................................................................... 50
- Interviews with the Teacher ................................................................................................................ 51
Data Analysis ........................................................................................................................................ 53
- Administration of the Data ................................................................................................................ 53
- Coding and Interpreting the Data ...................................................................................................... 54
Chapter Summary ................................................................................................................................. 57
### CHAPTER 4 DOCUMENT ANALYSIS FINDINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Context for Document Analysis</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Stage Coding using Policy Cycle Model</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overview of the Documents</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second Stage Coding using Policy Cycle Model</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Findings from the Document Analysis</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agenda Setting Stage</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Formulation Stage</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Decision Making Stage</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Implementation Stage</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Policy Evaluation Stage</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Summary</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 5 PARTICIPANT TEACHER: INTERVIEW FINDINGS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data Analysis: First Stage Coding from Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Systems Theory</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview Data Analysis: Second Stage Coding from Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Systems Theory (Classifications)</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introducing Julia</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing Experience and Expertise, Making Connections, Sourcing Resources and Tools, and Networking and Relationships</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharing her Experience and Expertise</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making Connections</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sourcing resources and tools</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationships and Networking</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overlaps Between Bronfenbrenner’s Classifications</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergent Themes from the Data Analysis</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Complications in and Challenges to the Teacher’s Career Studies Curriculum</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Challenges</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Summary</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### CHAPTER 6 DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Answering the First Research Question</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What Policies and Strategies had been Formulated and Documented by Canada’s Federal Government and Ontario’s Provincial Government and Ministry of Education, in Response to the Current Economic Downturn? ................................................................. 135
Agenda Setting Stage ............................................................................. 136
Policy Formulation .................................................................................. 136
Decision Making ..................................................................................... 138
Policy Implementation ........................................................................... 139
Policy Evaluation ................................................................................... 140
Limitations of Document Analysis ......................................................... 140
Limitations of Policy Cycle Model ......................................................... 141
Defining a “Changing World” ................................................................ 141
Ecological Systems Theory ................................................................... 142
Answering the Second and Third Research Questions .......................... 142
  What Does the Teacher Know About the Policies and Strategies Outlined in Chapter 4 and their Impact Upon her Local and Wider Community? ................................................................. 142
Answering the Fourth Research Question ............................................. 144
  What Challenges are there in the Teacher’s Local and Wider Community for Students that are Seeking Employment? .................................................................................. 144
Answering the Fifth Research Question ................................................. 145
  What does Knowledge of the Current Economic Situation and any Challenges it Presents to Local and Wider Community Contribute to the Career Studies Program? ................................................................. 145
Emergent Themes from Data Analysis .................................................... 147
  Complications in and Challenges to the Teacher’s Career Studies Curriculum .................................................................................. 147
  Julia’s Particular Teaching Role .............................................................. 148
Limitations of Ecological Systems Theory in this Study ....................... 150
Extending Findings of Reviewed Literature ............................................ 150
Implications ............................................................................................. 152
  Implications of the Context of this Study ................................................ 152
  Implications for Methodology ................................................................. 153
  Implications for Policy ........................................................................... 154
  Implications for Practice ..................................................................... 156
  Implications for Further Research ........................................................ 156
References........................................................................................................................................... 158
Appendix A List of Documents Examined.......................................................................................... 167
Appendix B Ethics Clearance Letter ................................................................................................. 168
Appendix C Letter of Information.................................................................................................... 169
Appendix D Interview Instrument...................................................................................................... 173
Appendix E Example of Agenda Setting Stage per Document Coding Clusters ....................... 178
Appendix F Summary of Second Stage Coding from the Policy Cycle Model ....................... 179
Appendix G Interview Data Analysis: 2nd Stage Clusters, Bronfenbrenner (1979) Classifications
and Four Overarching Themes............................................................................................................... 180
List of Figures

Figure 1. Boundary of the Case................................................................. 18
List of Tables

Table 1. Five stages of the policy cycle and their relationship to applied problem solving ........ 11
Table 2. The policy cycle-actor hour glass applied to a teacher of career studies ................. 13
Table 3. Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) Ecological Systems Theory applied to a teacher of career studies .................................................................................................................................................. 14

Table 4. Second stage coding – interview data analysis ........................................................ 56
Table 5. Four Themes with Linkages to Bronfenbrenner’s Classifications ............................... 98
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

To prepare young people effectively for the modern world, we must nurture creativity, entrepreneurship and self-reliance; we must prepare young people for a world in which they may have to revise their skills on a regular basis and learn to use information independently. (Wyn, 2009, p. 4)

As someone who began a career in education from a business and enterprise background, I have become increasingly interested in how young people develop their approach to their career and work, and the role that compulsory career studies programs may have in this process. Navigation towards employment can be particularly challenging for young people. Even before the recent global economic downturn, youth worldwide were facing high levels of unemployment, up to twice as high as adults in Canada (Quintini, Martin, & Martin, 2007). Recent statistics show that current unemployment for youth (aged 15-24) in Canada stands at 16.8%, whilst the overall unemployment rate for Canada stands at 8% (Statistics Canada, 2010). Although many Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) countries including Canada are now experiencing economic recovery, the prospects for youth for the foreseeable future are still gloomy, with many unemployed youth likely to experience a prolonged period of joblessness (Scarpetta, Sonnet, & Manfredi, 2010).
The current global economic downturn which began in 2008 (OECD, 2009) has generated significant interest in Canada’s fiscal policy and management of its economy. Canada has been named as one of the few G7 countries that entered the current global economic downturn with a relatively strong domestic economy (Department of Finance Canada, 2010). Nevertheless, the current Canadian prime minister has made numerous public statements and the Canadian government has introduced new policy initiatives in response to the global economic downturn. In one of its responses, the government of Canada has stated that the future success of Canada’s economy depends on a skilled and educated workforce, and that Canada shines as an example of what can be achieved when people work together and combine the best of intellectual and natural resources to create jobs, growth, and opportunity (Prime Minister Stephen Harper’s Mission Statement, 2010). The recent global economic downturn has generated opportunities for the leaders of many nations, including Canada, to offer stimulus initiatives that aim to improve the working prospects of citizens, including those of youth.

Ontario is home to over 2.8 million children and youth aged 0-18 and approximately 135,000 children are born into the province each year (Ontario Ministry of Children and Youth Service, 2008). For young people in Ontario, the impact of the global economic downturn and its subsequent effect on job prospects are significant. Many small rural towns in Eastern Ontario have been particularly affected; for example, in one town the impact of the economic downturn has been considerable, with the loss of 1700
jobs over the past three to four years. When measured against a population of 9000 residents, these are significant job losses (Kelly, 2010).

Career education and career development have gained increasing attention since the OECD produced their 2004 report, *Career Guidance and Public Policy: Bridging the Gap*. The OECD report made the link between comprehensive, coherent career development and advancement of a country’s labour market, social equity, and learning goals (Bell & Bezanson, 2006). Career education is frequently seen as a facilitative method that can help to prepare young people for life beyond secondary school. Work-related learning and career education for school age students can play a vital role in helping young people achieve skills, qualifications, and experience that develop their understanding of the world of work and of the economy (McCarthy-Fry, 2009).

Encouraging students to explore careers and the pathways that lead to them, and facilitating development of post-secondary options for students, can help students to plan their working lives after they complete their studies (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2006).

Herr (2003) recognized that the iterations of career education and counselling “have been the subject of public policy and frequently of legislation that has mandated inclusion of career counselling as one of several interventions intended to address particular national, economic, political, and workforce issues” (p. 8). Linkages to societal economic and social needs are seen consistently in the Ontario Ministry of Education (OME) career education curriculum (1998, 1999, revised 2006), with the justification of
the preparation of students for the realities of living and working in a changing, less predictable society. In particular the career education program is seen by the OME as playing “a central role in secondary school by providing students with the tools they need for success in school, in the workplace, and in their daily lives” (2006, p. 3).

The OME produced a detailed discussion document in 1998 as a precursor to changes in career education policy for Grades 1 to 12 during 1999. The OME described the purpose of a reformed guidance and career education program within the total school program as to prepare students for such realities as living “in a society which is less constant, and less predictable than ever” (Ontario Ministry of Education, 1998, p. 3).

The OME identified that “as the pace of change in the labour market accelerates, it is increasingly important for schools to help students develop basic and transferable skills and connect their learning in school to conditions in the wider world, including the world of work” (1998, p. 3). Prior to the global economic downturn that began in 2008 (OECD, 2009), the OME was predicting that students would need to be prepared adequately for the future and that “research and public opinion” (1998, p. 3) demanded that schools;

- Teach career awareness early and throughout students’ education
- Ensure that students have the skills they need to set and achieve their learning goals now and in the future
- Teach students the skills to make transitions throughout their lives, from school to work and further education and training
• Prepare students to live in an increasingly diverse society by helping them develop the ability to interact positively and work effectively in a range of settings.

In addition, the discussion document produced by the OME (1998) contained specific references about the role of teachers in the implementation of the new career education policy, highlighting the essential role they have in the effective delivery of the Choices into Action program. The document outlined how the emphasis of the career education program had changed from an intervention and crisis orientation, to a prevention and education orientation. Included in the expectations of current guidance and career education policy for secondary schools in Ontario, was that students were able to “develop the skills needed to research information about learning, work, and community opportunities” and to “make connections between these opportunities and their personal career goals and learn to plan for secondary success” (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2006, p. 10).

Given the context, the expectations are considerable for the secondary school teacher to implement and teach career studies to meet these objectives, particularly during times of local and global economic downturn. The global economic downturn has increased challenges for youth who are already disadvantaged in securing employment at the end of their full-time education. In an environment proliferated with economic recovery initiatives, navigation towards employment is complex and dynamic. The present research uses a case study design to examine how one teacher, situated in a
school in an economically depressed area in eastern Ontario, is responding to the mission of implementing a compulsory career studies program during a period of local and global economic challenge. It is my hope that documenting this teacher’s experience will increase understanding of the role a teacher has in bridging the gap between context and theory and between policy and practice (Howlett, Ramesh & Perl, 2009).

**Purpose**

The overall goal of this research was to describe and understand how one teacher of compulsory career studies perceived (a) the impact of global economic downturn and (b) the impact of changes in the economy, society, and job market, and (c) how these changes were reflected in her teaching practice.

Therefore, the following questions guided this research

- what policies and strategies had been formulated and documented by Canada’s federal government and Ontario’s provincial government and Ministry of Education, in response to the current global economic downturn;
- what did the teacher know about these policies and strategies and their impact upon the teacher’s local and wider community;
- how and from where had the teacher gained this knowledge;
- what did the teacher perceive were the particular challenges in the local and wider economy for her students who were seeking employment; and
what did the teacher’s knowledge of the current economic situation, and any challenges it presents to the local and wider community, contribute to the compulsory career studies program.

**Autobiographical Signature**

My interest in career education and work-related learning stems from a number of personal and professional experiences that have occurred over the past 12 years. As a 30+ aged adult, I made a transition from being a stay at home mom to combining motherhood, full time employment, and part time study. I realized that my days spent at school had provided me with little preparation for taking on such a task. I was fortunate that supportive family and employers allowed me to thrive, gaining success in my studies and in my workplace. Although career information and guidance existed during these studies, reminiscent of when I was in school, I did not pursue this form of support. I have thought about this since and wondered why I did not seek career advice; I realize now that I felt that the support was irrelevant, and I perceived it to be directed toward other students.

I was, however, fortunate to undertake a module entitled Developing as an Undergraduate as part of my undergraduate degree. A course requirement stipulated that I analyse why I was making topic and course choices as a learner, and how these would impact upon my working life. The outcome was that I became focused on strengths and weaknesses of my own development, and how these could be used to plan my study and career. I was transformed by the realization that I had valuable skills, that I had learned them, and that I was able to appreciate for the first time how I was using them in the
workplace. The course also allowed me to begin to consider the bigger context within which I was trying to make my way. Making connections between economies and how they affected the workplace and understanding the macro environment enabled me to identify more clearly where my career opportunities might be.

Since then, discussions I have had, as part of my working role, with potential employees in a recruitment situation, and discussions with final year high school students in my business mentor role have increased my awareness that there are many other young adults who are not able to articulate links between their study and their career aspirations. In addition, the ability to make connections between one’s individual skills and their relevance to the workplace and the wider economy can be difficult for some young people. Understanding these links is particularly important in tough economic times and students are often expected to accomplish this in required career studies courses.

Describing Canada’s experience of the recent global economic downturn, and the subsequent impact upon policy that has direct or indirect influence on career studies programs, enables identification of differing environmental factors that career studies teachers might need to respond to. This may offer insight into a process of policy being transformed into curriculum and practice.

Through this research, I aim to contribute to both theory and practice in the field of career education, and to contribute to teacher professional development. It is my hope that teachers will see value in identifying how they gain the knowledge they use to
inform career studies programs, and that the understanding of how federal and provincial policy translates into practice can be used to further enrich career studies programs.

**Theoretical Frameworks**

A review of comparative research papers on school to work transition by European researchers was undertaken by Hannan, Raffe and Smythe (1996). Their review included research conducted in the United Kingdom, Germany, France, Norway, Spain, Ireland, the Netherlands, Russia, Estonia, Belgium, Italy, Japan, the United States, Canada, Sweden and Israel. The authors recognized that countries vary in their economic, socio-demographic and institutional context, and that each country’s institutional arrangements for education and training are firmly embedded in the national or regional context. The authors found that one of the biggest challenges in comparative research was to separate the impact of particular education and training policies on youth transition from the influence of other contextual factors.

Though the current research does not undertake comparative work, it shares with Hannan et al. similar complexities. This study seeks to distinguish how the Ontario curriculum stipulates consideration of economic contextual factors in the career studies program; the teacher’s perceptions of what these economic contextual factors are and how they are included in her teaching practice; and the response initiatives and strategies of both the federal and provincial governments. Therefore it is necessary to identify both what the Ontario career studies curriculum expectations are and any response by the Canadian and Ontario governments to the current global economic downturn. This will
inform this research in two ways; firstly, it presents a context for this study and, secondly, provides a contextual backdrop to guide the interviews with the participant teacher.

As a theoretical framework for the analysis of this case study, the policy cycle model (Howlett, Ramesh, & Perl, 2009) is helpful. It not only separates distinct tasks involved in the process of public policy making, but it also helps to clarify the differing and interactive roles played by policy actors, institutions, and ideas. The policy cycle model is not necessarily a sequential process; policy actors often do not undertake policy formation and implementation in a sequential, cyclical manner. The process is dynamic, multi-faceted, and far from systematic. Howlett et al. agree that conceiving of public policy as a series of sequential stages is a disadvantage as policy is rarely conceived in a cyclical, sequential manner; however, they argue that

The advantage of employing the cycle model lies in its role as a methodological heuristic: facilitating the understanding of the public policy process by breaking it into parts, each of which can be investigated alone or in terms of its relationship to the other stages of the cycle. (p. 198)

In particular, Howlett et al. (2009) argue that using the cycle model as a methodological heuristic allows for flexibility in approach of the integration of empirical materials derived from individual cases, comparative studies of more than one case, and the review of one or more stages of a case alongside policy theories and analyses. The use of the policy cycle model thus highlights the dynamic nature of policy-making and offers a framework within which to organize the actors, ideas, instruments and
institutions that make up these dynamics. Howlett et al. outlined five stages in their policy cycle model and their relationship to applied problem solving. These five stages are shown in Table 1.

Table 1. Five stages of the policy cycle and their relationship to applied problem solving

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applied problem solving</th>
<th>Stages in policy cycle</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Problem recognition</td>
<td>1. Agenda setting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Proposal of solution</td>
<td>2. Policy formulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Choice of solution</td>
<td>3. Decision making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Putting solution into effect</td>
<td>4. Policy implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Monitoring results</td>
<td>5. Policy evaluation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Throughout the policy cycle and applied problem solving process there are a number of people involved. Howlett et al. (2009) refer to these as policy actors and suggest that they interact to determine the content and process of policy making. Howlett et al. also identify that all policy actors must work within institutions and structures that serve to constrain and influence these actors’ efforts. At two stages of the policy cycle model all possible policy actors may be involved. In the first stage, agenda setting where they may decry problems and demand government action, and in the final stage of the policy cycle model, policy evaluation, where not only will a government assess how a policy is working, but also various other members of policy subsystems and general public will assess the policy. The encompassing actors are known as “policy universe” (Howlett et al., p. 12). There are two stages in the policy cycle model where the key actors involved are the policy subsystem, the second stage policy formulation, and the fourth stage policy implementation. Howlett et al. identify policy subsystem as being;
Composed of only those actors with sufficient knowledge of a problem area, or a resource at stake, to allow them to participate in the process of developing possible alternative courses of action to address the issues raised at the agenda setting stage…once implementation begins, however, the number of actors increases again to the relevant subsystem. (pp. 12-13).

A master’s thesis imposes restrictions on the scope and size of this study; therefore, I have chosen to be selective in the use of the policy cycle model utilizing the flexibility of the model as described by Howlett et al (2009). It is not the intention of this study to examine the compulsory career studies program in its entirety as a form of policy. Instead, document analysis was used in this study to describe stages of the policy cycle model; however, document analysis does not offer extensive examination of each of the policy universe and subsystem sets of actors. Nevertheless, using the policy cycle model as a framework for document analysis has value; documents were searched for evidence of origins, development, and implementation of the current career studies curriculum.

The policy cycle model also guides identification of where differing actors involved in the career studies program are experienced by the participant teacher. Howlett et al.’s (2009) use of the policy cycle-actor hourglass to categorize actors is identified in the following table.
Table 2. The policy cycle-actor hour glass applied to a teacher of career studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stages in policy cycle</th>
<th>Key actors involved</th>
<th>Key actors applicable to career studies program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Agenda setting</td>
<td>1. Policy universe</td>
<td>1. Variety of actors, to include Canadian federal government, Ontario provincial government, Canadian businesses, voluntary organizations, universities and colleges and not-for-profit organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Policy formation</td>
<td>2. Policy subsystem</td>
<td>2. Only those from the list above with sufficient knowledge of the current economic situation or a resource at stake participate in the process of developing a course of action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Decision-making</td>
<td>3. Government decision-makers</td>
<td>3. Decision making is undertaken by authoritative government decision makers, whether elected officials, judges or bureaucrats – includes Ontario Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Policy implementation</td>
<td>4. Policy subsystem</td>
<td>4. Number of actors expands to the subsystem of policy formation stage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Policy evaluation</td>
<td>5. Policy universe</td>
<td>5. Evaluation of the results of implementation expands to encompass the policy universe</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examination of the context of career studies as policy is not the only aim of this study. There are other factors that have the potential to influence how a career studies
program is taught by an individual teacher, and an appropriate lens for identifying and examining these factors is ecological systems theory (Bronfenbrenner, 1979). Ecological systems theory provides a clear framework within which to examine influences on the career studies teacher beyond policy, with a focus on implementation, on practice, on looking at how something happens (Patton, 2002). Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems theory holds that development reflects the influence of several environmental systems, and he classified these as microsystem, mesosystem, exosystem, and macrosystem. Preliminary reviews of literature and documentation, and my own experience, have resulted in the stages of ecological systems theory being applied to the study of a teacher of compulsory career studies as illustrated in Table 3.

Table 3. Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) Ecological Systems Theory applied to a teacher of career studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ecological Systems Theory stage</th>
<th>Possible areas of application to the teacher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| **Microsystem:** The setting in which the teacher lives. Could include a person’s family, friends, peers, colleagues, school, and neighbourhood. Where the most direct social interactions take place. | • Employment experiences of her family members  
• Experiences with colleagues in school – both with regard to their teaching and or perspective on career studies and their own outside of school experiences (for example local unemployment)  
• Teacher’s neighbours’ employment status and experience  
• Friends that have been affected by changing economy |
| **Mesosystem:** A set of interrelations between two or more settings in which the teacher is an active participant. Bronfenbrenner describes four general types of interrelations; 1) Multisetting | Multisetting participation  
• Any other site where the teacher conducts activities related to her teaching, including the responsibilities in Cooperative (co-op) education |
participation, which occurs when the same person is engaged in more than one setting. 2) Indirect linkage, when the same person does not actively participate in both settings but a connection is established through a third party. 3) Intersetting communications, messages that are transmitted from one setting to another. 4) Intersetting knowledge, information or experience that exists in one setting about another

Indirect linkage
- Connections that are established through careers studies and co-op teaching practice
- How much co-op practice influences career studies practice
- Resources

Intersetting communications
- With employers (work experience, co-op placements)
- What form of communication?

Intersetting knowledge
- From resources in school (guidance counsellors)
- From relationships with employers
- From local press
- From where else?

**Exosystem:** Consisting of one or more settings that do not involve the teacher as an active participant but in which events occur that affect or are affected by what happens in that setting. To demonstrate the operation of the exosystem as a context influencing the teacher it is necessary to establish a causal sequence of at least two steps. First those events in the external system directly connect to processes in the teacher’s Microsystem, and secondly linking the Microsystems processes to the teacher’s developmental changes within that setting.

- Changes to employers – business closures
- Local economic climate changes
- New business start-ups in local area
- District School Board initiatives
- Local demographics

**Macrosystem:** The culture in which the teacher lives and works including cultural contexts such as socioeconomic status, poverty, ethnicity, government type and influence

- Canada as a developed nation
- Canada’s response to global economic downturn – federal strategies and initiatives
- Ontario’s response to economic downturn – provincial strategies and initiatives
- Ontario Ministry of Education – strategies, policies and curriculum
Definition of Key Terms

The Ontario Ministry of Education defined a career as “The sum of one’s experiences in a variety of roles throughout life. Every person has a career, which includes all of the individual’s work, learning, community, and family roles” (2006, p. 46). There has been a provincial requirement in Ontario for high school students to complete a compulsory half credit course in career studies, and within the Ontario secondary curriculum the compulsory career studies course has been completed in Grade 10 (ages 15 to 16). The underlying intent is to help prepare students for entering the workplace upon completion of their studies. The Ontario Ministry of Education defined a compulsory course as “a course that meets the requirements of a compulsory credit and that, as directed by the Minister, must be included in a student’s program towards the earning of a diploma” (1999, p. 79).

Balcombe (1995) suggested that career education be defined “in terms of the way we help students develop the knowledge, skills, and attitudes necessary to attain meaningful careers” (p. 8). In accordance with this definition, the focus of this study was on how the compulsory career studies teacher helps students plan their careers in a challenging economic climate through the compulsory career studies program. The careers studies program course expectations included self-assessment, development of personal and interpersonal skills, and career planning. Students were expected to develop learning and interpersonal skills that would enable them to explore careers and the pathways that led to them.
Boundary of this Case Study

Yin (1984) suggested that defining a unit of analysis or case is related to the way the initial research questions are defined. Simons (2009) agreed that the bounding of what constitutes a case is essential, but acknowledges that opinions differ on when it is desirable to define the boundary of the case, as the boundary may well change once the researcher enters the field and has a better sense of drawing the boundary over the topic being explored. Miles and Hubermann (1984) suggested that focusing and bounding data collection can be seen as a form of pre-analysis, where certain variables and relationships are chosen to be the focus of the study. With an acceptance that the defined boundary of my chosen case may evolve and change during the duration of this study, the preliminary boundary of this case is shown in Figure 1.

Overview of Thesis

This thesis is presented in six chapters. The first chapter introduces the thesis with an outline of the context, purpose, theoretical framework and boundary. The chapter also describes how my experiences have helped to shape the thesis and the theoretical framework I have chosen to underpin this study. The second chapter describes previously completed research and literature that is related to the study and lays out a context for my research questions. The third chapter offers a rationale for choosing to undertake a qualitative study and describes and provides a rationale for my choice of case study design and describes the methods used for data collection and analysis. The fourth chapter reports the findings from the document analysis completed for this study, in
emerging themes. The fifth chapter reports the findings from the interviews with the participant teacher. The sixth chapter relates the findings of the thesis to the existing literature and discusses the implications for future research and practice.

Figure 1. Boundary of the Case

The preliminary boundary of the case commenced with the economic context of the career studies program, extended to include the participant teacher, and concluded with the outcomes of the case, the findings.
CHAPTER 2
REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Teachers’ experiences of teaching compulsory career studies programs in times of significant contextual economic challenge are rarely examined in empirical literature. However, much literature exists on career education, particularly in international, national, and regional contexts. This chapter reviews key findings from this broader area of research on career education in addition to key findings from a smaller selection of studies that examined career education in Ontario.

I begin with a review of international, federal (national), and provincial (regional) contexts of career education. This is followed by consideration of career education and its interconnection with the labour market and how this may be influenced by federal and provincial policies. The third area to be reviewed is the structure and outcomes of career education as part of the school-to-work transition process. I conclude this chapter with a review of studies that specifically describe the guidance and career education program in Ontario where the current study was conducted.

International, National, and Provincial Contexts of Career Education

A cross-national focus on school-to-work transition using an analytical framework was undertaken by Hannan, Raffe, and Smythe (1996). Commissioned by the OECD Secretariat to provide background for the Transition Thematic Review, the study sought to review the main comparative research undertaken by European researchers in recent years. The paper drew on research from predominantly European sources;
however, research published in other contexts was also included. The objectives of the study were first to identify dimensions of variation among education/training (ET) systems and their national contexts which could be hypothesized to influence the success of transitions. Second the study sought to develop a conceptual framework which would adequately represent inter-country variations in the school-to-work transition process. Third the study set out to analyze the conceptualization and measurement of success in school-to-work transitions and to summarize the main conclusions on factors affecting success, with a focus toward variations according to ET and the national context. The study also set out to hypothesize the main commonalities and to identify the main conceptual, methodological, and data issues raised by undertaking cross-national studies.

Hannan et al., (1996) outlined four general dimensions of a conceptual framework that need to be taken into account in cross-national studies;

The national context; the nature of the education/training system in each country and its interconnection with the labour market, as well as state policies influencing these processes; the structure of the school-to-work transition process itself; and the outcomes of the process—‘success’ and ‘failure’ in transitions, and variations among groups of young people in the outcomes achieved. (p. 2)

The authors found that contexts varied significantly from each other in their economic, socio-demographic, and institutional characteristics, and they identified the main dimensions of national context as; demographic factors, the production system, labour market structures, wage-setting mechanisms, the economic cycle, and policy-
making frameworks. In their examination of ET systems and policies and their relationship to the labour markets, Hannan et al. reported dimensions for consideration as: the extent and nature of standardization of curricula, assessment and certification; the degree of differentiation and associated stratification between academic and vocational tracks; the degree of flexibility in the system; the extent to which the delivery of education is school or work-based; the nature of governance of the ET system; curriculum design and content; curriculum delivery; the nature of training schemes; the nature of qualifications and certification; and educational output—what employers are buying from the educational system.

Consideration of the transition process itself led Hannan et al. (1996) to identify how the transition process differed along a number of dimensions and they identified these as the extent and nature of regulation, the structuring of the transition process (for example, length, number and type of stages involved), the extent to which pathways were individualized or highly structured, and the relationship between school-to-work transitions and other transitions such as leaving the parental home, marriage, parenthood, new household formation, and migration.

Hannan et al. (1996) concluded with a number of working hypotheses concerning the way in which determinants of transition outcomes could vary across countries with different education systems and ET and labour market linkages:

- Class inequalities in post-compulsory educational participation tended to be greater in countries with differentiated systems
• The degree of matching between ET received and job entry requirements tended to be far greater in countries with highly differentiated ET systems.

• In countries with undifferentiated ET systems, employers paid more attention to the level of qualification acquired.

• In standardized systems the higher the proportion of completion “of upper second level of education” (p. 19), and the greater the importance of grades to labour market success, the greater the barriers to success for early school leavers and low achievers.

• State training schemes that were not work-based were highly unlikely to have a positive impact upon employment chances unless their outputs were standardized and recognized by employers.

• Informal networks (family and friends) played a greater role in employment chances in less standardized systems.

• At the policy level, enhanced vocational guidance and placement systems would likely have most effect when there was less direct linkage and weaker market signals between the ET system and the labour market.

• The importance of ET qualifications for labour market success varied depending on whether young people entered local, regional, national, or international labour markets.
Successful entry to national and international labour markets was highly dependent upon the level of education achieved and the portability of qualifications into different national contexts.

Watts and Sultana (2003) synthesized the main findings from an overview of three reports; (1) a review conducted by OECD (2004) of 14 countries, Australia, Austria, Canada, Czech Republic, Denmark, Finland, Germany, Ireland, Korea, Luxembourg, Netherlands, Norway, Spain, and the UK; (2) a World Bank review of career guidance policies in seven middle income countries, Chile, Poland, Romania, the Philippines, Russia, South Africa, Turkey; and, (3) a European Commission report that also used the OECD questionnaire for all member states, overlapping 13 countries with the OECD report. The stimulus for coordination of the three reviews came from two international symposia on career development and public policy held in Canada in 1999 and 2001.

The international symposia had highlighted that the dynamics of globalization had led to inter-country convergence in the practice of career guidance, accepting that many countries faced a similar set of broad challenges for education, labour market, and social polices related to career guidance. From the resulting three reviews, Watts and Sultana (2003) aimed to identify common issues and conclusions that could be drawn. Firstly they presented evidence that career guidance in many nations was viewed as the public good and was therefore strongly linked to policy goals related to learning, the labour market, and social equity. Secondly, they identified a growing recognition of the importance of career education and guidance in schools. Thirdly, they identified the
importance of governments providing strategic leadership in association with other stakeholders; education and training providers, employers, trade unions, community agencies, students, parents, other consumers, and career guidance practitioners.

Watts and Sultana (2003) concluded that career guidance services had often been viewed as marginal services in terms of public policy. They suggested that the three reviews affirmed that this is no longer adequate. Watts and Sultana also suggested that career guidance services needed to be brought into mainstream policy formation, while remembering that “all guidance services reflect the economic, political, social, cultural, educational and labour market context—as well as the professional and organizational structures-in which they operate” (Watts, 1996, p. 107).

Quintini, Martin, and Martin (2007) examined the changing nature of the school to work transition process in OECD countries. Quintini et al. used a selection of OECD statistical indicators to examine trends over the previous ten years to create a scoreboard of the position of youth in the labour market. Quintini et al. described the main purpose of the paper as an examination of “how OECD countries compare with respect to school-to-work transitions” and an analysis of “the extent to which the situation of youth in the labour market has changed over the past decade or so” (p. 4). Quintini et al. found that despite the fact that many cohorts in high schools were smaller than ever before and better educated, high youth unemployment remained a serious problem. The authors suggested that this reflected a number of factors including the relatively high proportion of young people leaving school without any formal qualifications and that the skills
acquired in formal education were not necessarily well adapted to the needs of the labour market. Quintini et al. concluded that the overall picture with regard to developments in the youth labour market was a mixed one, but that the youth labour market was characterized by much turnover between the states of employment, unemployment, and inactivity. They also suggested that although individual countries use a variety of instruments to improve the labour market situation of youth, in order to improve youth job prospects, it was essential to combat school failure.

**Canadian Context**

In her contribution to a series of studies for the Canadian document, *Pathways for Youth to the Labour Market*, Taylor (2007) analyzed, through existing documentation and data, the institutional and policy structures that affected the ability of high school students to find learning and career pathways that led to success in the labour market. Taylor’s study examined national policy structure focusing on four Canadian provinces, British Columbia, Alberta, Ontario, and Newfoundland and Labrador, and she made useful comparisons to the State of Queensland, Australia. Taylor identified trends across the four provinces in their provincial policies that included the emphasis all four provinces had placed upon career planning as part of the secondary school program, and the need for local partnerships between schools, post-secondary institutions, and employers.

Taylor also found that all provinces were interested in increasing the career pathways for students, in particular enhancing the flexibility and mobility in learning systems. However, she concluded that all four provinces were struggling with the need to
constantly update technology curriculum and facilities and to hire technology teachers. These findings suggested that availability of resources could have a significant impact upon the program a career educator is able to offer.

In a report prepared for the Culture, Tourism and the Centre for Education Statistics Division, Hango and de Broucker (2007) examined the education-to-labour market pathways of Canadian youth. The authors used data from the Youth in Transition Survey (Statistics Canada, 2004) to look at different paths that young people in Canada took from high school through to regular participation in the labour market, based on a national sample which could be generalised to all young Canadian adults.

The authors identified that a goal of the Canadian educational system was to provide young people with the skills and knowledge they need to succeed in the labour market and that young Canadians were looking for more choice in learning options, before and during their careers. Hango and de Broucker recognized that a great deal of research in social science literature on the transition from school-to-work has been carried out, and that, from past literature, we know that events such as “leaving the parental household, completing education, acquiring a stable job and family formation” (2007, p. 14) are complex and may impact upon the transition process. Though Hango and de Broucker reviewed extensive literature on the school to work transition process, little attention was given to the role of the compulsory career studies course and teacher within the process.
Frenette (2007) carried out a study that assessed the extent to which students were aware of the educational requirements for their intended careers, and any relationship between this awareness to students’ future outcomes. Using the Youth in Transition Survey, Frenette compared high school students’ perceptions of the level of education they would require for the job they intended to hold at age 30, with the level required according to professional job analysts at Human Resources and Skills Development Canada (HRSDC). Frenette found that educational requirement knowledge is linked to academic performance and socio-economic background, and that youth aspirations were often different from the actual distribution of occupations in the economy.

In a review of the state of career planning services in Canada, Bell and Bezanson (2006) offered an analysis of needed improvements. The report provided a Canada-wide view of the scope of career development services for youth, offering summaries of evidence of effectiveness and impact of career education programs together with a description of promising approaches. Bell and Bezanson invited participants to review the career-development picture for youth by reviewing a synopsis of the career-development services for youth in their province or territory. Participants were identified from a list of attendees at the pan-Canadian Symposium on Career Development, Lifelong-Learning, and Workforce Development (2003). For the initial synthesis document, 23 out of 44 contacts participated, and all but two provinces and territories (Yukon and Prince Edward Island) had at least one reviewer. The report was developed using select resources that
were validated for content by career development practitioners involved with youth career services at the K-12, post secondary education, and government levels across Canada. The report’s findings were organized based upon what the sources knew of the following;

1. The scope of career-development information, programs and resources (services) available to in-school and out-of-school youth and young adults;
2. Who accesses career development services;
3. Who provides career development services, their numbers and qualifications;
4. The prevailing attitudes to different post-secondary pathways to the labour market;
5. The evidence for career development with respect to learning goals, labour market goals, and social equity goals; and,
6. A select number of promising approaches within Canada and internationally.

The authors found that though there were pockets of excellent and promising practice with regard to career education programs, a system of coherent and comprehensive services, available consistently throughout Canada, did not exist.

Canada’s government’s response to the global recession is its Global Economic Plan (Government of Canada, 2010). Frequently updated, the plan outlined a number of strategies and policies the government was implementing to ensure Canada’s economy
recovers and Canada maintains a strong economic position. Within the plan were a number of initiatives that could affect Canadian youth planning their working lives. For example, in the sixth and most recent edition of a series of reports to Canadians, the government outlined how Canada’s Economic Action Plan had helped Canadians through the worst global recession since the 1930’s and was now contributing to a solid economic recovery. The plan added that global economic growth remains fragile and, at home, too many Canadians remain out of work. The report stressed that:

The continued implementation and completion of the Economic Action Plan will help ensure the strength of the recovery in Canada…Our priority remains creating jobs for Canadians and we are delivering. Nearly 430,000 jobs have been created in Canada since July 2009, more than were lost as a result of the global recession. We will continue with this focus on jobs and growth as we complete implementation of the Economic Action Plan. (Government of Canada, 2010, p. 9)

Ontario’s government reiterated how for the past two years the global economy had been affected by the recession. In the 2010 Ontario Budget Speech the Honourable Dwight Duncan, Minister of Finance, outlined the government’s strategic plan Open Ontario (Dwight, 2010). The plan referred to jobs and growth, education, a strategy for the northern part of the province, federal partnership, and fiscal responsibility and accountability. For youth in Ontario, the plan had many noteworthy aspects; for example,
the minister described industries where the government was working to attract new investment and where significant future employment opportunities were expected.

**Career Education and its Interconnection with the Labour Market: Influence of Federal (National) and Provincial Policies**

In this section of chapter two, literature that examined the influence of federal (national) and provincial policy on career education, and its interconnection to the labour market was reviewed. All of the studies examined in this section were either internationally comparative research, or had international or global contexts.

An analysis of the potential roles of public policy in relation to career development services was undertaken by Watts (2000), together with an exploration of the ways in which career development services can influence the policy making process. For this article, Watts drew on the discussions from an international symposium on “Career Development and Public Policy: International Collaboration for National Action,” held in Ottawa in 1999.

Watts (2000) reported that the key rationale for policy interest in career development services was that “[these services] represent a public as well as private good” (p. 302). Watts cited the argument that career services are “an important mechanism for linking learners to education programs” (p. 302) and, if the education programs meet learners’ needs, motivation is increased, learning performance is increased, and dropping out of education is less likely. Watts also described how career development services linked education and training to the labour market, and how access
to educational and vocational opportunities acquired through access to career development services increased social equity. The author also acknowledged that policy reflects, through a commitment of funding, an expression of public values and intentions, and he highlighted how this varies in democratic societies according to the political nature of the government in power. However, he stated that, at the Ottawa symposium, there was consensus that the trend toward more flexible, self-managed careers is a trend common in advanced economies.

Watts (2000) identified that one of the major difficulties with policy in career development was that it crosses administrative boundaries. Education policy tends to operate within a social tradition and labour market policy tends to operate within an economic tradition. Watts suggested that if career development services were to be given stronger recognition by policy makers there needed to be more evidence on the economic and social benefits of such services. He also stated that, in Canada, a series of leadership forums convened by the Canadian Guidance and Counselling Foundation agreed that a leadership council was needed to facilitate connections between career development practitioners and public policy makers.

Herr (2003) examined the public policy context that generally supports and often shapes the substance and the implementation of career counselling. Herr identified that public policy and legislation related to career counselling have often defined who has access to career counselling, its purpose, content and intentions, and the nature of training career development practitioners should have. Herr added that, almost since its birth, the
iterations of career counselling have been the subject of public policy as one of many interventions intended to address particular national or regional economic, political, and workforce issues. Herr described a growing international consensus that;

In a global economy, a nation’s major asset is a workforce that is literate; functional in mathematics, communications, and computer skills; teachable; flexible; and with general employability skills that allow its members to prepare for, choose, and adjust to work and to apply the technical skills they possess productively and purposefully and in effective interaction with other workers. (p. 9)

In his article, Herr (2003) presented arguments for and against career counselling, and suggested that these benefits and shortcomings (embedded in public policy and legislation) presented several possible strategic issues for career counselling. Herr concluded that where public policy and legislation supported career counselling, resources should be used to build tailored, effective, and evidence-based responses to the career needs that were identified. Herr also suggested that where there were gaps in legislation that affected particular sub-populations, career counselling professionals should “advocate for amended policies and legislation” (p. 15).

Reflections upon comparative studies of career guidance were considered in a paper by Sweet (2004), he acknowledged that, though the comparative studies provided a rich set of data for researchers on comparative career guidance systems, they left questions unanswered about the reasons there were differences between national career
guidance systems. Sweet stated that compared to other related fields such as school-to-work transition, comparative studies in career guidance were rare. The author referred to a review of career guidance policies undertaken by the OECD in 2001 which coincided with a major data gathering exercise by the European Commission. These studies also coincided with a review conducted by the World Bank in 2003 of career guidance policies in seven developing nations and Watts’ and Sultana’s (2004) list all of the countries that took part in the three studies. The findings of the three studies were presented at a conference on career guidance and public policy held in Toronto in October 2003.

Taken together, the three studies provide a comprehensive primary resource for researchers and policy analysts (Sweet, 2004), but Sweet asserted that there are many questions left unanswered, and that a major gap is that the studies do little to increase understanding of why national career guidance systems differ. As an example, Sweet describes how Australia and the United Kingdom share labour markets and tertiary education systems that are very similar but career guidance systems that are markedly different. Sweet concluded that the three studies offered information as to what the current drivers of change to career guidance policies and programs were. However, there appeared to be no systematic additional explanations of how the nature and timing of career interventions related to factors such as a country’s stage of economic development, its present labour market state, or the natures of pathways through educational systems. Sweet ended his paper by considering that, as the gap between career guidance and public
policy is “quite large compared to other fields that have been the subject of comparative analysis, there is no clear relationship in most countries” (p. 102).

Watts (2005) produced an article based upon a synthesis of the three reports produced by the OECD, European Commission, and World Bank that addressed findings in these reports related to five key policy issues for career guidance. Watts identified the five issues as rationale, evidence, delivery, resources, and leadership. The report repeated assertions that policy makers regard career guidance services as being of value not only to individuals but also to the public at large (Watts, 2000; Watts & Sultana, 2004).

Watts (2005) described how, in the industrial era, “the dominant concept of career was progression up the hierarchy within an organization or profession” (p. 67), but that the emphasis had changed as that concept became fragmented due to the pace of change driven by technology and globalization. Watts asserted that security for individuals in 2005 lies not in employment but in employability. Bezanson (2003) defined this transformation as “the lifelong process of managing learning and work in order to live and work with purpose and create a quality of life” (p. 9). Watts identified that accordingly, countries are recognizing that career services should not only be available to selected groups such as school age students, but to everyone throughout their lives.

Watts (2005) therefore argued that the philosophical case for career services was a powerful one, and was attracting much advocacy. However, Watts also acknowledged that demands on public expenditure were extensive, and policy makers wished to see
benefits from investment. This suggests that though concrete outcomes from career
guidance may not be sufficient to solve career related challenges, they were necessary to
add support to the case. Watts also highlighted how the review of the three reports
examined the delivery of career guidance services in relation to the changing rationale.
Watts summarized that “no country had yet developed an adequate lifelong learning
guidance system. But all countries have examples of good practice” (p. 69). Watts drew
attention to key points including the growing recognition of the importance of career
education in schools, not only in helping students to make choices, but also to introduce
students to the concept of lifelong learning, saying “this is evident, for example, in the
inclusion in many countries of career education in the curriculum” (p. 69).

**Structure and Outcomes of Career Education as a School-to-work Transition

Process**

Herr (1999) considered theoretical perspectives on school-to-work transition
suggesting that it might be useful to examine why career theories had not been developed
to account for the school-to-work transition process, and to ask whether career theories
are complete in their explanation of the school-to-work process. He argued for using
these two important questions to stimulate “further deliberation about elements of a
future theoretical and research agenda related to school-to-work transition” (p. 359).

Herr (1999) agreed that for many people who have or are seeking a job and do not
have a sense of a career, career theories tend to be largely silent and perhaps irrelevant.
He suggested that often these people have not been proactive or systematic in their
planning of employment but rather they have been swept into available jobs with little planning or conscious decision making. Herr described how current career theories largely ignore the work experiences of persons for whom a job is cast in economic and not psychological terms, and from such a perspective the question arises “why are career theories not developed to account for the school-to-work process?” (p. 361). Herr suggested that to answer this question one must conceptualize the school-to-work transition process itself, and then compare this with the content of career theories.

School-to-work transition is commonly accepted as the bridge between school and work. However, human resource development is a continuum of career development that includes the lives of children throughout their time in compulsory education, a transition that progresses either seamlessly or jaggedly into employment, concluding with induction and adjustment into the workplace. It is clear that the phase of school-to-work transition is just a component of this process. Herr concluded that “given the complexity of the interaction of the three components—schooling, transition services, and induction and adjustment to the workplace—extent theories are not yet comprehensive, although they have proposed concepts that may be relevant in each of these phases” (p. 363).

The Canadian Council for Learning (CCL), through the Work and Learning Knowledge Centre (WLKC) produced *Making Bridges Visible: An Inventory of Innovative, Effective or Promising Canadian School-to-work Transition Practices, Programs and Policies* (2008). The WLKC wanted to know what measures were in place for supporting youth with the transition from school to work. The foundation for the
report was built from an inventory created after consultation with access and transition working groups, whose membership included education, business, non-profit, labour, and community based institutions. The inventory revealed an evolution in school-to-work programming. Initiatives had initially focused on at-risk youth and youth who would move directly into the workforce, as a result of the increased length in transition times, but programs had expanded to include the whole of youth.

Bell and O’Reilly (2008), the authors of the report, indicated that there were a number of factors that accounted for the increase in time it takes for Canadian youth to make the transition from school to work. Included in these factors was that, in a knowledge economy, increasing requirements both in technical and employability skills for most occupations require youth to stay in education longer. The report found that school to work transition takes an average of 8 years for Canadian youth and that an increasing number of students in Canada are deviating from the traditional linear pathways of school, on through post-secondary education, and subsequently to work. The authors also found that in some instances careers services are inconsistent, not known, or rarely used and that the decentralized approach to school-to-work programming in Canada is less successful when compared to other OECD countries.

Research by Bell and Bezanson (2006) concentrated on how career development can contribute to students’ navigating successful pathways to the labour market. Their research was part of a large project of the Canadian Policy Research Networks (CPRN) *Pathways for Youth to the Labour Market*. The research aimed firstly to establish the
paths being taken by youth from secondary school to the labour market and the outcomes associated with the differing paths (employment, earnings, and job satisfaction).

Secondly, the research aimed to identify institutional and policy structures that appear to support or hinder the ability to find successful pathways.

The authors found that, although there were pockets of excellent and promising practice, many students reported being frustrated with the lack of connection between courses of study and career paths. In addition, the authors reported that some youth were in low skilled jobs despite their education credentials exceeding job requirements and that some youth were in jobs unrelated to their fields of study previously completed.

Concluding with an acknowledgement of the impact of services upon youth, Bell and Bezanson suggest that career development programs and interventions could;

- Increase motivation to continue learning after high school;
- Reduce the number of early school leavers in either high school or post-secondary;
- Increase career certainty and academic success;
- Build work readiness;
- Support the integration of labour market information;
- Change attitudes that decrease career choice (for example, support young women’s entry to science, technology, and engineering careers);
- Reduce poverty and unemployment by getting youth to stay in school longer; and,
• Increase focus on a career path when work experience is attached to some form of career-development reflection.

Given the potential that these authors claim for career and guidance services to contribute to youth’s transition from school to work, the next section of this chapter focuses on career and guidance education in Ontario. The current study was contextualised in a small community in a rural part of eastern Ontario, making a review of career education curriculum of Ontario relevant to the research conducted.

**Guidance and Career Education in Ontario**

Many small communities have been hit hard by the economic recession, a factor which complicates job opportunities for youth. Examination of the economic and social situation of a small town in eastern Ontario was undertaken by Jinha (2009), who also considered the impact of globalization upon the town. The author reported job losses during 2007 and 2008, declaring that by the end of 2008, the town had lost 1700 jobs, which equated to almost 40% of its active labour force (Jinha). The author also reported that income levels had declined since 1996 suggesting that the town had struggled economically for some time prior to the global recession that began in 2008. With no public transportation, and many new sources of employment being part-time, non-unionized service jobs (Jinha), career opportunities for local youth could be limited, complex, and difficult to navigate.

Career studies are a compulsory course within the curriculum for students in Ontario during Grade 10. Although the curriculum is subject to regulation within Ontario,
there is currently no national career development strategy to provide standards for service quality or provision across Canada (Bell & Bezanson, 2006) due to the British North America Act of 1867 where it is mandated that education is a provincial responsibility.

Hyslop-Margison and McKerracher (2008) applied a democratic learning conceptual framework to an analysis of the Ontario guidance and career education program, to determine whether the curriculum, at the level of policy formation, respects a student’s ability to make rational authentic choices. The authors also sought to explore alternative perspectives on work-related issues and social organization.

Hyslop-Margison and McKerracher (2008) discussed at length the tension between citizenship and career education, highlighting how “the leaders of industry and many public policy developers call for increased occupational relevance from education while stakeholders focussed on civic learning expect schools to promote democratic learning and foster student agency to encourage active citizenship” (p. 134). Hyslop-Margison and McKerracher acknowledged that multiple ways of learning and various teaching strategies are arguably “progressive and diverse” (p. 137) within the Ontario guidance and career education curriculum. The authors also highlighted how the Ontario guidance and career education program “seeks to provide preparation for what it openly calls post-secondary destinations” (p. 137) and that it does not prescribe fixed career paths for students.

Hyslop-Margison and McKerracher (2008) referred to how the Ontario guidance and career education curriculum emphasizes student involvement in life out of school,
highlighting how the curriculum insists that students need opportunities to learn about the
world of work through experiences in the workplace, and by interacting with employers
and employees. The authors emphasized the curriculum statement that students “can also
learn about active and responsible citizenship through opportunities to make
contributions to their communities and schools” (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2006, p.
20). Nevertheless, the authors highlighted that this constitutes the only mention of
citizenship and that it “fails to underscore the democratic importance of students critically
reflecting on their workplace and job placements as sites of potential contestation and
transformation” (p. 138). Hyslop-Margison and Kerracher concluded their study with the
recommendation that by including public spaces and opportunities for student discussion
of vocational experience within neo-liberal democratic societies, the program could
accommodate students’ rights to explore and understand their ability to affect change.
“Ontario could provide learners with an opportunity to bridge the troubling and growing
chasm between instrumental career education and authentic democratic citizenship” (p.
141).

**Conclusion of Literature Review**

This chapter has reviewed a selection from an ample choice of research on
guidance and career education, including international, national, and provincial contexts,
and studies with Canadian context. This chapter also considered career education and its
interconnection with the labour market, and the influence of federal and provincial
policies. In addition, this chapter examined studies that have addressed the structure and
outcomes of career education as school-to-work transition process, and guidance and career education in Ontario. Though there is significant research on career education, my searches of educational databases have found limited research that focuses exclusively on the role of compulsory career studies courses. To my knowledge, a teacher’s perspective on teaching compulsory career studies within times of significant economic challenge has remained unexplored.

The value of career education and career services in supporting youth with the transition from school-to-work is widely supported, although the literature acknowledges that some programs seem to be more effective than others (Bell & O’Reilly, 2008). Many small rural communities have been hit particularly hard by the global economic downturn, the impact being significant for some small towns in eastern Ontario (Jinha, 2009). Qualitative studies that report on how career studies teachers navigate career studies teaching in times of global and local economic challenge can help us to understand how the teacher implements the career studies curriculum, and bridges the gap between policy and practice. The next chapter, Chapter 3, outlines the method used to answer the five research questions posed by this study.
CHAPTER 3

METHOD

This chapter describes the methods used to collect and analyse data. The chapter includes the rationale for a qualitative design, an account of document collection, selection, and analysis, selection of a participant, and data collection and analysis methods. The chapter concludes with a statement about the steps taken to enhance the reliability of the study.

Rationale for Qualitative Methods

The research employs qualitative methodology using one richly described case study. Case study involves choice and selection of what is to be studied, and Stake (2000) suggests that even though we could study it either holistically or analytically, by repeated measures or hermeneutically, culturally or organically, and by mixed methods, we concentrate on the case. Yin (1984) explains that, as a research endeavour, “the case study contributes uniquely to our knowledge of individual, organizational, social, and political phenomena” (p. 14).

The case study approach to qualitative study comprises a specific way of collecting, classifying, and analyzing data (Patton, 2002) and the purpose is to gather and interpret comprehensive and in-depth information about the case of interest. Three sources of data were used in this study: (a) document analysis, (b) interviews, and (c) field notes. To give the study credibility, the case study sought to answer scholarly research questions (Stake, 2005) and to triangulate the descriptions and interpretations.

**Document Collection, Selection, and Analysis**

Many documents have emerged in recent years that have reflected legislative change and government initiatives to improve students’ preparation for post-secondary education, for training, or for entering the workplace. Previous research has identified many purposes for undertaking document analysis, including examination of how science curriculum documents make links with the world of work (Chin et al., 2007), and analyzing policy documents to track intentions of work-based education using co-operative education as the case in point (Hutchinson et al., 2001). I used document analysis for three broad reasons. Firstly, I wanted to deepen my understanding of the nature of documents produced by both Canadian and Ontario governments, as this would help to define the context of the case. Kutsyuruba (2008) identified that, usually, in times of wide system changes (for example, global economic challenge), documents and polices change, reflecting the impact of macro level change upon society.

Secondly, document analysis may reveal links between the teaching practices exhibited by the participant teacher and the macro level environment featured in the document analysis (Simons, 2009). Finally, document analysis is often a useful precursor to observation and interviewing, allowing for some identification of contextual issues in the case that can act as a guide for interview and observation criteria (Simons).
Although often ignored in most conventional research method texts, Berg (2007) argues that low profile measures (of which document analysis is an example), offer a “particularly interesting and unobtrusive strategy for collecting and assessing data” (p. 239). Hodder (2000) states that usually the “interpreter of material culture works between past and present or between different examples of the material culture, making analogies between them” (p. 710). An important aspect of this process is that the interpreter of material culture makes assumptions that the beliefs, and ideas contained within the documents are important to action and practice (Kutsyuruba, 2008). Hodder (2000) expands on the role of interpreter, explaining that at all stages the interpreter has to deal with three levels of interpretation and evaluation; identification of the context within which things have similar meanings; recognition of any likenesses and variations; and relevance of the documents’ general and historic theories to the data being collected.

Document collection, selection, and analysis were conducted to examine a sample of Ontario and Canadian legislative, strategy, and curriculum documents from four strands. Firstly, collection was undertaken of key documents that outlined federal and provincial government responses to the global economic downturn. Focus was given to documents produced since the start of 2008, the year defined by the OECD (2009) as the start of the global economic downturn. Secondly, curriculum documents that were most frequently referred to by the participant teacher delivering the compulsory career studies program were collected. Thirdly, the document search was broadened to include policy and curriculum documents produced by the Ontario Ministry of Education for career
studies, guidance, and career education. For the curriculum and policy document search the time frame was extended to documentation produced since 1998 because the *Choices in Action Detailed Discussion Document* remained a policy for guidance and career education consulted by the participant teacher at the time of the study. Finally, a search was undertaken to identify Ministry of Education strategy documents produced since the start of 2008.

There are some limitations and disadvantages with document analysis. The reading of a document results in an interpretation being made by the reader. Different readers of the same document may make different interpretations. However, document analysis remains a low cost method of data collection and analysis, documents endure, give historical insight, and can be used alongside other evidence to enable the particular biases of each to be compared and understood.

**Definition of Document Types**

For the purposes of this study the following definitions were used.

*Policy document.* Sergiovanni, Burlingame, Coombes, and Thurston (1999) describe policy as “any authoritative communication about how individuals in certain positions should behave under specified conditions” (p. 230). Therefore for the purposes of this study, *policy document* is taken to be the written authoritative communication that outlines how actors involved in the compulsory careers studies policy should behave in order to meet the required conditions of the policy.

“What students are taught in Ontario public schools. They detail the knowledge and skills that students are expected to develop in each subject at each grade level. By developing and publishing curriculum documents for use by all Ontario teachers, the Ministry of Education sets standards for the entire province” (Frequently Asked Questions, 2nd Ques.).

Strategy document. A document that outlines strategic goals and outcomes presented by Canadian federal or provincial governments or ministerial departments for example the Ontario Ministry of Education produced Reach Every Student: Energizing Ontario Education, which is considered a strategy document in this study. The document may be in print or electronic format.

Information document. Designed to provide the reader with information about defined topics or subjects, an information document is neither a legal document nor is it a policy document. It is to be used for informative purposes only, for example the Canadian Government document Canada’s Global Economic Leadership: A Report to Canadians, is considered an information document in this study.

Search and Selection Strategies for Documents

Documents were selected through an internet search of the Ontario Ministry of Education, Ontario provincial government, and Canadian federal government websites and through discussion with the participant teacher. The document search was restricted
to what was available through the World Wide Web as I wanted to focus on documents that the participant teacher may also have had easy access to. The first strand consisted of federal and provincial government documents that outlined responses to the global economic downturn. It was important to identify the types of economic stimulus strategies that were implemented by the Canadian federal government and the Ontario provincial government during the period of global economic downturn identified by the OECD. Knowledge of these strategies could then be used firstly to inform my interviews with the participant teacher, and secondly to outline the wider and local economic context within which the compulsory career studies course was being taught. Search parameters that were used were Canadian government, Ontario government, economic stimulus, economic initiatives, and response to global recession.

The second strand consisted of Ontario Ministry of Education curriculum documents. I examined Ministry of Education documents that were identified by the participant teacher as crucial to her teaching practice for the compulsory career studies course. For the third strand, other Ontario Ministry of Education curriculum and policy documents, the search was extended to include other Ministry of Education documents that were relevant to the compulsory career studies program. A search of the Ministry of Education website was conducted using search parameters of career studies and Grade 10 (chosen because this is the grade when the compulsory career studies program is taught). Any documents that had either gone offline or those directed at Grades 9, 11, or 12 were excluded from further analysis. The fourth strand search was for educational strategy
documents produced by both the Ontario Ministry of Education and Ontario federal government. Documents were selected based upon their currency within the period of global economic downturn defined by the OECD. A total of 13 documents were selected for analysis, these are listed in Appendix A.

**Analytical Framework for Analysis of Selected Documents**

Differing methods of document analyses can be observed within published research. For example, some studies adopt a deductive approach, using classifications based upon previously undertaken document analyses (e.g., Robitaille et al., 1993). Others use inductive methods, allowing coding categories to emerge from the content of the examined documents (e.g. Hutchinson et al., 2001). In this study, a combination of deductive and inductive methods was used. Firstly, a framework was developed for the analysis of documents produced by the Canadian government, Ontario Government, and Ministry of Education which were obtained from electronic sources. The framework began with the explicit theoretical lens of Howlett et al.’s (2009) five stage policy cycle model: agenda setting, policy formulation, decision making, policy implementation, and policy evaluation. Documents were read and re-read to identify representation of the five stages in each document. A deductive approach was used to create a chart for each document outlining the findings within the five stages. A total of 13 charts were produced from the 13 documents examined. Subsequently, an inductive method was used for further analysis of each of the charts allowing for coding categories within each of the five stages of policy cycle model to emerge from the documents.
Goodlad, Klein, and Tye (1979) suggested that “One gets closer to what is intended for the schools by examining what is to be studied by students than by examining statements of aims or objectives” (p. 61). In alignment with this viewpoint, focus was also given to how the documents explicitly outlined the importance of students developing an understanding of the economy, and of students being able to connect this understanding with their learning of other school curricula.

**Interviews with a Teacher of Compulsory Career Studies**

**Participant School**

Using purposeful sampling, a school was selected for this study. The school was located in an area of eastern Ontario that has been affected by the global recession with the closure of many local businesses. The school included two teachers who taught career studies, one of whom had taught career studies for a period that pre-dates the global recession, taught cooperative education, and therefore had links with, and knowledge of, local workplaces. This teacher was articulate and willing to share her experience. McMillan and Schumacher (2009) suggested that purposeful sampling allows the researcher to select particular elements from the population that will be representative or informative of the topic of interest.

At the time of the study, the school had a population of approximately 800 students, many of whom were bussed from outlying villages and small towns in eastern Ontario. Initial contact was established with the school and preliminary agreement for
this study was provided by the principal and the career studies teacher who was invited to participate.

**Ethics clearance.** Prior to the collection of data, ethics clearance was obtained from the General Research Ethics Board of Queen’s University in December 2010. A letter of information (LOI) and consent form was distributed to the participant teacher for her to read and sign prior to interviews being conducted. A copy of the ethics clearance letter, LOI, and consent form can be seen in Appendices B, C, and D.

**Interviews with the Teacher**

This study sought to understand how the teacher of the compulsory Grade 10 half-credit career studies program translated knowledge about the global and local economic community into her teaching practice. It was therefore essential to learn how this teacher made sense of the economic community and reached decisions about its relevance to her teaching practice in her own words. Herr (1996) stated that “the ecological contexts, in which individuals develop as people, citizens, and workers, significantly influence their possibilities for choice, the knowledge available about opportunities open to them, and the reinforcement of their behaviours” (p. 7).

Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) ecological systems theory holds that the interaction between the teacher’s immediate family, community, and work environment, and her wider societal landscape, influences and directs her career studies program development. Qualitative interviewing, according to Charmaz (2002), provides an “open-ended, in-depth exploration of an aspect of life about which the interviewee has substantial experience,
often combined with considerable insight” (p. 676). Therefore, framing interviews with Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems theory enabled identification of what the teacher knew about policies and strategies formulated by the Canadian and Ontario governments’ in response to the global economic downturn, and from where she obtained this knowledge.

**Conducting Interviews with the Teacher.** Four 45 minute interviews with the teacher were undertaken over a five week period based upon an interview instrument with scope for additional interview questions in the final interview. This time-frame allowed the teacher to reflect upon previous interviews in order that she could add to her comments during subsequent interviews. The interview instrument was developed from the themes identified in the document analysis. The intention was to establish in the teacher’s own words a rich account of her perceptions of (a) the impact of global economic downturn and (b) the impact of changes in the economy, society, and job market, and (c) how these changes were reflected in her teaching practice. A copy of the interview instrument is located in Appendix E.

Interviews were conducted in a quiet room and digitally recorded and transcribed verbatim immediately after the interviews ended. A copy was made available for the participant teacher to verify that a valid account had been collected after the final interview had been conducted. Throughout all interviews, written notes of interviewee responses and non-verbal communication were recorded. During the data collection period I also kept notes of my reflections on the process, recording my observations and
any emerging, tentative interpretations immediately after each interview. These notes were available for critique by my supervisor and committee to add reliability to the study.

Data Analysis

Administration of the Data

McMillan and Schumacher (2009) suggested that “an essential early step in analysis is to organize the large amount of data so that coding is facilitated (p. 369), and Patton (2002) proposed that getting organized for data analysis begins with an inventory of what data you have. Therefore data analysis commenced with some administrative steps with a two-fold purpose, (a) to arrange the data in an organized manner to facilitate analysis, and (b) to allow for data to be organized for secure storage.

Data were organized into four folders, one for each of the interviews conducted. Each folder contained the interview instrument, the audio recording of the interview, the typed transcription of the audio recording, and the field notes that pertained to that interview. Field notes were checked and updated; Patton (2002) suggested that field notes should be checked for completion, ensuring incomplete notes were finished and ready for analysis. Master copies of each transcription and set of field notes were stored as read only files. Patton also recommends that a master copy of the data be preserved given the nature of extensive cutting and pasting of data that is a natural part of the analysis of qualitative research. Patton warns that “under no circumstances should one yield to the temptation to begin cutting and pasting the master copy” (p. 442).
Multiple back-ups of the electronic data were made, on electronic computer files, an audio recording device, and an external computer hard-drive. Electronic files were password protected, and the audio recording device and external hard drive were stored in a locked filing cabinet. Hard copies of data were also stored in the locked filing cabinet.

Before commencing analysis I read and re-read the data. This was important to allow me to gain a sense of the whole of the data and to check for gaps. I felt that I had sufficient data to begin to the next step, the analysis.

**Coding and Interpreting the Data**

A verbatim transcript was produced from each interview. All identifying features of the respondent were removed. Four transcripts were then sent to the participant teacher electronically for her to read and confirm accuracy, the first two interviews were sent five weeks after completion of the interviews, and the final two interviews was sent seven weeks after completion of the interviews. The teacher was invited to comment upon the transcriptions and verify their accuracy; the teacher had given no feedback about any changes to be made.

Following the suggestion that “developing some manageable classification or coding scheme is the first step of analysis” (Patton, 2002, p. 463), data were considered against the four classifications of Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems theory as the first stage of analysis, facilitating the search for areas of significance in the raw data. The first cut of this stage of the data analysis was to insert comments into the margins of the transcript, following a deductive approach by referring constantly to Bronfenbrenner’s
classifications. Data were examined and re-examined until I was confident that each of Bronfenbrenner’s four classifications had been applied extensively.

In order to deepen my understanding I then undertook an inductive analysis, to create a set of systematic, sensible, and complete categories that would portray the whole picture (Patton, 2002). Simons (2009) warns that if one is generating codes from immersion in the data, one needs to be aware that however much one aspires to present data that is grounded in participant’s constructs, what the analyst thinks and values will inevitably affect what is selected as significant. In summary, the findings that emerged from the data were through my interactions with the data. Therefore, with the purpose of increasing the validity of the study, I consulted with my thesis supervisor and together we considered the emerging codes within the four Bronfenbrenner classifications. Table 4 lists the four Bronfenbrenner classifications together with the emerging codes, notes at the bottom of the table describe the key used for each theme.

**Enhancing reliability.** McMillan and Schumacher (2009) use the terms *validity, reflexivity, and extension of findings* as the most common criteria for evidence-based enquiry in qualitative research. A number of strategies can be used to enhance validity; I chose the combination of using multi-method data collection strategies including interviews, document analysis, and field notes to permit triangulation of data across inquiry techniques (McMillan & Schumacher, 2009). Checking interviews against written evidence (documents and field notes) can corroborate what the participant reports, though it may not necessarily lead to a single, consistent picture. The different types of data may
Table 4. Second stage coding – interview data analysis

Microsystem
- Family (SE)
- Colleagues (SE)
- Own experience (from previous employment, interaction with media, personal shopping) (SE)
- Own expertise (teaching practice, qualifications and training) (SE)
- Community (own, immediate) (MC)
- Former students (MC and RN)

Mesosystem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multisetting participation</th>
<th>Indirect linkage</th>
<th>Intersetting communication</th>
<th>Intersetting knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Co-op education practice (SE)</td>
<td>Networking (making new connections through existing links) (MC)</td>
<td>Employers (RN and MC)</td>
<td>In-school resources (SRT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest speakers (through existing connections) (SE and MC)</td>
<td>Technology (SRT)</td>
<td>Wider community (where there is professional relationship) (RN)</td>
<td>Local media (SRT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Resources (tools) (SRT)</td>
<td>Post secondary institution relationships (RN)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exosystem
- Local demographics (MC)
- Local economy (includes business start-ups and closures (MC)
- District school board (RN)
- Networking (making connections through new links) (RN)

Macrosystem
- Global or international (MC)
- Federal (MC)
- Provincial (MC)
- Global or National media (MC)

Note. SE = Sharing Experience and Expertise; MC = Making Connections; SR = Sourcing Resources/Tools; and, RN = Relationships and Networking

have captured different things. However understanding can be sought to establish the reasons for the differences, and either consistency or divergence can then contribute significantly to the overall credibility of the findings (Patton, 2002). In addition, I ensured
that interviews were digitally recorded and transcribed as a verbatim account, and the transcriptions were sent to the participant for her to verify accuracy.

The primary strategy chosen to increase reflexivity was the keeping of field notes and a research journal. It was essential that I acknowledge in my writing of this research that I have my own stance that has shaped my writing (Cresswell, 2007). By recording my thoughts, and reactions throughout the study, to the triangulation of sources of data, I was able to add to the rigor of this research. The extension of findings can be facilitated with a clear description of the following; my research role, the criteria I have used to select my participant teacher and documents for analysis, a description of the social context of my research, the data collection and analysis strategies, ensuring that my narrative is rich and full of my participant’s own words, recording the typicality of this study, explaining my choice of analytical premises, and offering alternative explanations where negative and discrepant data challenge emerging patterns (McMillan & Schumacher, 2009).

**Chapter Summary**

In this chapter I have reviewed the rationale to use qualitative research methods to meet the purpose of this study, described the process used for document analysis, and detailed the stages of recruitment and participation of a teacher in semi–structured interviews. The methods used to collect and analyze data are also reported. The next chapter, Chapter 4 reports on the findings from the document analysis stage of data.
collection. Chapter 5 reports on the findings from the interviews conducted with the participant teacher.
CHAPTER 4

DOCUMENT ANALYSIS FINDINGS

This chapter presents the findings from the document analysis section of my investigation. Documents were analyzed though the heuristic lens of the policy cycle model in to describe the policies and strategies that make up the Canadian and Ontario governments’ responses to the global economic downturn. The document analysis also informed the interviews with the participating teacher through examination of the career studies curriculum documents produced by the Ontario Ministry of Education.

The Context for Document Analysis

First Stage Coding using Policy Cycle Model

Using a deductive approach, the five stages of the policy cycle model were applied to analyze the selected documents. The analysis process began with documents being given a code and colour based upon whether they were Canadian (federal) government documents [CAN], Ontario (provincial) government documents [ONT], or Ontario Ministry of Education documents [MOE]. Notes were made of the general features of each document including the title, type of document (policy, curriculum, strategy, or information), the year of publication, and total number of pages. Reasons for inclusion or exclusion from the document analysis were also recorded. Each document was then read and re-read using a deductive approach to identify codes for each strand of documents. Codes were listed under each document strand (that is CAN, ONT and MOE documents) using different font styles with this process being repeated for each of the
five policy cycle model stages, agenda setting, policy formulation, decision making, policy implementation, and evaluation. An example of agenda setting stage is shown in Appendix F.

Overview of the Documents

Canadian federal government documents. The three Canadian government documents comprised one strategy document and two information documents, and all three Canadian government documents were produced during 2010. The three Canadian government documents varied in length between 19 and 34 pages and were selected from an electronic search which identified 27 Canadian government documents produced within the selected time frame of 2008 to 2010. The final selection of Canadian government documents for analysis represented the most current documents produced at the time of the search. Documents produced in 2008 or 2009 and documents which did not explicitly refer to the Canadian economy were excluded from analysis.

Ontario provincial government documents. The Ontario government documents included two strategy documents and one information document, and were produced in 2008 and 2010. The electronic search for Ontario government documents also produced 22 documents. Focus was placed on documents that explicitly referred to the Ontario economy and final selection was made following the same criteria as for the Canadian government produced documents. The final two documents selected for analysis were 13 and 19 pages in length.
**Ontario Ministry of Education documents.** The Ontario Ministry of Education documents included three policy documents, three curriculum documents, one resource document, and one strategy document. The eight Ontario Ministry of Education documents were produced between 1998 and 2010 and ranged between 18 and 80 pages in length. An electronic search for Ontario Ministry of Education documents produced 17 documents. The time frame criteria for document analysis was expanded in this strand to include documents produced during 1998, as some of these documents remain current policy for implementation of the compulsory career studies program. A total of eight documents were eventually selected for analysis, with any document that did not either explicitly refer to the compulsory career studies program, or include the compulsory career studies program as curriculum (for example the *Ontario Secondary Schools Grades 9 to 12: Program and Diploma Requirements*) being excluded. Three documents identified by the participant teacher as most frequently consulted by her were included in the eight Ministry of Education documents chosen for final analysis. The list of documents analyzed can be seen in Appendix A.

**Second Stage Coding using Policy Cycle Model**

An inductive method was used for further analysis of each of the charts allowing for clusters of coding categories for each of the five stages of policy cycle model to emerge from the documents. The clustering process resulted in six codes being identified in the agenda setting stage, seven codes identified in the policy formulation stage, four codes and three sub-codes in the decision making stage, four codes and two sub-codes in
the policy implementation stage, and three codes and two sub-codes in the evaluation stage. After the clusters of second stage codes were identified, the 13 initial coding charts were reviewed to ensure consistency in the data. A summary was then produced to show how the second stage codes were applied within each document, the summary is shown in Appendix G.

**Findings from the Document Analysis**

**Agenda Setting Stage**

The agenda setting stage of policy making has been suggested to be “the first and perhaps most critical stage of the policy cycle model” (Howlett, et al. 2009, p. 92). The agenda setting stage is concerned with the way problems emerge, or do not emerge, to become contenders for government attention, and what happens at this early stage has important ramifications for the subsequent development of policy and its outcomes. Early work in the social sciences often assumed that “problems” were objective in stance and were merely waiting to be “discovered” by governments in order to be addressed and “solved” (Howlett et al.). However, later works in the post-positivist tradition, acknowledged that problem recognition is much more of a sociological process where a framework of normality or recognized socially acceptable norms influence the sphere within which governments make decisions (Howlett et al.). In searching for evidence for the agenda setting stage in the documents examined, six themes were identified: society, economy, leadership, stimulus, skills, and lifelong learning. These emergent themes represent the kinds of themes that are shaped by and decided upon by people in authority.
Society. Although seven documents mentioned society, only two referred to societal needs and aspirations (CAN1 and ONT4); the other five documents (MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4 and MOE8) referred instead to the preparation of students to meet societal needs. Two documents (CAN1 and ONT4) discussed the impact of the global recession and emphasized government response. There was reference in both documents to the role of Canadians in the global recession; in particular, ONT4 highlighted the role of public servants “all of us who are paid with public tax dollars have a role to play here. We are all in this together” (p. 14). On the other hand, CAN1 makes reference to all Canadians with a positive statement “Canadians have confronted the challenges of the past year in the same way they have always met adversity— with pragmatism, resourcefulness and the spirit of partnership” (p. 3).

The changing world is presented as the context for guidance and career education in the introductory section of MOE1. Clarification of the fast pace of the changing world was offered as a rationale for students to prepare, to “live in a society which is less constant,” to be able to develop skills and understanding, and to “connect their learning” as “the pace of change in the labour market accelerates” (section 2.1). Descriptions were offered of what students needed to undertake and realize in order to “assume their roles as responsible citizens” with focus given to acquisition of “educational, social, and career success in the twenty first century” (MOE2, p. 5). MOE3 and MOE4 followed in a similar vein, MOE3 outlined the curriculum intention of preparing students “for further education and work,” helping them to become “independent, productive, and responsible
members of society” (p. 6). MOE4 added that graduates of Ontario’s secondary schools were “well prepared to lead satisfying and productive lives as both citizens and individuals, and to compete successfully in a global economy and a rapidly changing world” (p. 3). The school’s role in preparing students to become skilled, knowledgeable citizens who contribute to a “strong economy and a cohesive society” was reiterated, (MOE8, p. 2).

Pal (2006) described how policymaking was primarily about trying to solve problems, and how the way in which problems are defined sets the tone for successive stages in the policymaking process. Pal also said that in a democracy [like Canada] it always means “shaping arguments in ways that capture public attention and support” (p. 97). The Canadian and Ontario government documents present rallying cries to the Canadian people to support government in their effort to combat the effects of the global economic downturn. This may be due to the proposed response strategies requiring significant financial investment. The Canadian and Ontario governments appeared to be capitalizing on a publicized position of relative fiscal strength that Canada enjoyed going into the global economic downturn, acknowledging Canada’s world–leading practices (CAN1, 2010, p. 21), and presenting this as a rationale for Canada to take up global leadership in fiscal responsibility.

Howlett, et al. (2009) stated that in the process of agenda setting an issue was “raised from its status as a subject of concern to that of a private or social problem and finally to that of a public issue” (p. 93). The Ontario Ministry of Education reported that
“public opinion, workplace realities, and educational research in Ontario and elsewhere all emphasize the need for young people to be well–informed, skilled, and confident” (MOE1, 1998, section 2.1), presenting the rationale of guidance and career education as a response to public issue.

**Economy.** Five documents (CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3, and MOE2) talked extensively about economic contexts, including the global or world economy, the Ontario and Canadian economies, and both of these national and provincial economies within a global context. Canada’s Economic Plan was described within the context of the global recession (CAN1). Canada’s position of relative fiscal strength was explained, as was its citizen’s resilience, acknowledging that “from the forest floor to the factory floor, Canadians have rallied in the face of the global recession” (p. 3). Canada’s response to the global recession was a focus in CAN2 and CAN3, where detailed strengths of the economy and future plans to build upon that strength were outlined. However, both documents also acknowledged the fragility of the economy, using this as an argument for continued efforts to further strengthen the Canadian economy. CAN3 proposed that “the global economic recovery remains uncertain, and at home, too many Canadians remain out of work” (p. 5). The document ONT3 had a different focus to the example of economy, being concerned with an overall action plan for children and youth. One of the priority strategies was for youth to be “economically secure” (2008, p. 3). MOE2 described how the guidance and career education policy provided students with an understanding of the concepts of three areas of learning, (a) student development, (b)
interpersonal development, and (c) career development, providing an environment for students to develop skills to achieve economic security. In the career development strand, the document stated that career development was to include focus on “employability” and on “describing how changes taking place in the economy…and society…and affect the job market” (p. 10). In doing this, the curriculum encouraged students to pay attention to how the dynamic macro level environment may impact upon them, individually, in particular career and job prospects they hold.

**Leadership.** The analysis framework clusters prompted me to look for examples of leadership within a global and national context, in addition to examples of leadership frameworks, and statements of inspiring collective hope and vision through leadership. Five documents (CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT4, and MOE6) referred to elements of leadership. For example, CAN1 emphasized Canada’s leadership in a global context stating “Through our leadership this year of the North American, G8 and G20 summits, our Government will advocate…stronger financial market regulation, modelled after Canada’s world-leading practices” (2010, p. 21). Leadership was also promoted as a form of high profile Canadian selling point (CAN2), a “Canadian brand…based on competitive taxes, renewed infrastructure and skills, a strong head start in clean energy…a more prominent voice as a global financial leader” (2010, p. 3). Reference to Canada’s global leadership was expressed, with a statement of how “powered by one of the strongest economies in the industrialized world…Canada is leading the world,” (CAN3, 2010, p. 3). The Ontario government also promoted its leadership, identifying in document ONT4
that Ontario was a region that is “a beacon of the new economy, with leading-edge universities, colleges and businesses” (2010, p. 2). The creation of a program designed to help laid-off workers train for a new career “the first of its kind in Canada” (ONT4, 2010, p. 3), illustrated how provincial leadership within a national context was also highlighted.

Language that reinforced the exemplar role of the resource document, through words such as “represent”, “show”, “promote”, “provide”, “exemplify”, and so on was used throughout MOE6. The Ministry of Education gave the purpose of the document as a desire to provide teachers with a variety of materials to assist them to improve their teaching and assessment practice. This was an example of the leadership role taken by the Ministry as it implemented the new curriculum for guidance and career education during 1999 to 2000.

**Stimulus.** Four documents mentioned stimulus (CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT4). All were either Canadian or Ontario government produced documents. Stimulus packages produced by the Canadian government in response to the global recession were outlined in three documents (CAN1, CAN2, and CAN3), with the global recession being offered as the agenda. ONT4 followed the same theme, outlining the Ontario government’s response to the global recession, citing the International Monetary Fund (IMF) recommendations that “governments around the world spend up to two per cent of their GDP to fund job-creating stimulus plans”…and identifying that “like most western governments, Ontario responded…” (2010, p. 11).
Skills. Six documents made explicit reference to skills for agenda setting (CAN1, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, and MOE6). CAN1 identified that “the success of Canada’s recovery depends upon a skilled and educated workforce” (2010, p. 6). The remaining five Ministry documents set skills within a context of what is needed by students if they are to make successful transitions from compulsory education to further education, training, and the workplace. In its rationale for guidance and career education in a changing world, MOE1 outlined how:

As the pace of change in the labour market accelerates, it is increasingly important for schools to help students develop basic and transferable skills and connect their learning in school to conditions in the wider world, including the world of work. (1998, section 2.1)

Documents MOE3 and MOE4 outlined much broader skills that students would develop and achieve through following the Ontario curriculum. MOE3 described how the “combination of compulsory and optional courses is designed to provide students with all the essential skills they need” (p. 8) and claimed that they would be given an opportunity to “acquire the specialized knowledge and skills they will need to succeed in their chosen post-secondary endeavours” (1999, p. 8).

Lifelong learning. Though ONT4 did not explicitly mention lifelong learning, the document acknowledged that the concept of continuous learning and development was essential if Ontario was to recover from the global recession and achieve future economic growth. The document outlined an “aggressive training plan…” stating that “many
Ontarians need to retrain and learn new skill sets in order to find work and get back on their feet” (p. 2). In a similar way (MOE1), reminded us that the guidance and career education curriculum was intended to be developmental and cumulative in content, with students gaining the “ability to make wise decisions” through the ongoing “exposure and practice in age-appropriate activities” (section 3.2).

Reference to lifelong learning was more unequivocal (MOE2), with a statement that guidance and career education would help students to “make transitions throughout their lives–from family to school, from school to school, from school to work, and from school to lifelong learning” (p. 5). MOE5 was also specific in regard to lifelong learning, expressing one of the goals of the guidance and career education curriculum as enabling students to “understand concepts related to lifelong learning” (p. 43). The document added that “the program helps prepare students for a changing world by demonstrating that a career is not just an occupational destination but also a journey that involves lifelong learning” (p. 4). The importance of students being engaged in their learning and social environment so they are “better able to develop the skills and knowledge…reach their full potential, pursue lifelong learning” (p. 12) was recognized, with students’ engagement being a priority (MOE8).

**Policy Formulation Stage**

Once a government has acknowledged the existence of a public issue and has decided there is a need to do something about it, policy makers are expected to decide upon a course of action. Before they make this decision, they need to consider what all
the possible courses of action (including non-action) may be. Howlett, et al. (2009) referred to policy formulation as “the process of generating opinions on what to do about a public problem” (p. 110). In finalizing potential courses of action, governments need to identify technical and political constraints that may influence or restrict choices available to them. The nature of the political party and electoral system also typically influences choice (Howlett, et al.). Knowing the type of government regime that exists can be significant to understanding the dynamics of policy formulation.

Democratically elected, the current Canadian government identified the following as priorities; supporting families and communities, stimulating the economy, returning to balance, and staying the course on long-term priority (S. Harper, 2011, “Government Priorities,” para. 1-5). Accepting that these priorities had influenced government choices during the policy formulation stage, the documents were inductively searched for themes that aligned with these given priorities. The Ontario Ministry of Education (2011) listed three core priorities for education in Ontario: (a) high levels of student achievement; (b) reduced gaps in student achievement; and (c) increased public confidence in publically funded education. In order to achieve these priorities, the Ministry outlined a variety of supporting conditions including: early childhood learning, arts education, character development, student engagement, safe and healthy schools, parent engagement, peace and progress, school buildings, small class sizes, professional learning, and leadership.
Therefore, evidence was sought for the following seven inductive themes; economic stability, development opportunities, good practice, coordination and collaboration, types of learning, conditions for learning, and outcomes.

**Economic stability.** Referring to an agenda setting from the previous year that is still largely in place, Canada’s federal government described its main response to the global recession, Canada’s Economic Action Plan (CAN1, 2010). The document explained how the Government would complete a second year of this plan “guided by extensive consultations with leaders in business, industry, and everyday working people and their families—and make refinements where necessary” (p. 2). The description of Canada’s Economic Action Plan was built upon in CAN2, which married the plan with the objectives of a long-term economic plan, called Advantage Canada (CAN2, p. 5). The document also “introduces a limited number of new and targeted actions to protect Canadians from the global recession” explaining the need to create new jobs to secure the “economy of tomorrow” (p. 5). Targeted actions were described as: jobs protection and youth employment measures, creation of economic growth and jobs through innovation, encouraging investment and trade to create jobs and growth, green jobs and growth, modernizing Canada’s infrastructure, strengthening the financial sector, supporting families and communities and standing up for those who helped build Canada, honouring Canada’s international commitments, and the Three-Point Plan to return to budget balance (pp. 5-8).
In document CAN3, the Canadian government brought the economic focus back to the global stage. Describing the G-20 countries’ efforts to respond to the global recession at Washington, London, and Pittsburgh summits, the Government reminded us that the global economy had entered a recovery with G-20 nations “fully committed to their stimulus plan through to the end of this year to secure the global recovery” (p. 30). In addition, the document highlighted Canada’s leadership role in the process, saying “Canada will exercise its leadership position to promote the cooperation needed to ensure the recovery and prevent future crisis” (p. 30). The Ontario government described how it too was responding to the global recession, describing the establishment of a five-year plan to ‘Open Ontario’ to new jobs and economic growth (ONT4). The government outlined a “$32 billion in job-creating stimulus” citing the Conference Board of Canada’s opinion that this investment was “supporting over 220,000 jobs a year” (p. 2).

**Development opportunities.** Only three documents referred specifically to development opportunities, CAN1, CAN3, and ONT3. Developmental opportunities were used in a persuasive way, warning against complacency toward Canada’s recovery from the global recession (CAN1). Reminding us that “Canada is poised to emerge from the recession…” but that “attention must also encompass new measures Canada needs for success in the modern economy” (CAN1, p. 2). The Government used both IMF and OECD statistics to support its suggestion that Canada would have the strongest economic growth in the G-7 in the period 2010 to 2012 (CAN3, p. 19).
Strategic goals that defined an “agenda for continuous improvement” were expressed (ONT3, p. 3), and the document outlined how these strategic goals encompassed the entire children and youth service and required strengthening partnerships, greater leadership in fostering collaboration, and additional capacity building. Development of all services connected to children and youth appears intrinsically embedded at the policy formulation stage.

**Good practice.** Five documents (CAN3, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, and MOE4) demonstrated examples of good practice, with some documents describing subtle strategies to encourage good practice and some documents referring to good or best practice in a much more explicit manner. Job creation, economic growth, stability of financial sector, and relatively low public debt, were cited as “key measures” (CAN3, p. 3) and positive ways in which Canada was leading the world. Though not explicitly labelled best practice, these factors were used as an illustration of “Canada performing better than the United States and other G-7 countries” (p. 3).

The Ontario government also refrained from explicitly using best or good practice terminology in document ONT3. However the Government explained how, since 2003, it had moved away from an output focused approach to child and youth services towards an outcome driven approach, and stated that “maximizing resources to support outcomes…will place children and youth on pathways for lifelong success” (p. 4). The Ministry of Education referred explicitly to examples of good and best practice (MOE1, MOE2 and MOE4), and how they could be used as part of a continuous drive to raise
standards. Each document included significant reference to examples of best and good practice that should drive curriculum implementation.

**Coordination and collaboration.** The framework for analysis generated the following examples from four documents (CAN1, ONT3, MOE1, and MOE2).

Collaboration in the form of trade negotiation and agreement between the Canadian government and Peru, the European Free Trade Association, Columbia, Jordan, Panama, India, Republic of Korea, the Caribbean community, and other countries of the Americas was described (CAN1). Collaboration in the sense of supporting capacity building and strengthening partnerships was also depicted (ONT3), and in order to achieve the goals of the strategies outlined in the document, the Ontario government outlined the necessity of “strengthening service connectivity” (p. 9) and fostering “open and informed dialogue” (p. 10) as priority reforms.

Cooperation and collaboration were described as being essential for successful implementation of the Choices into Action Guidance and Career Education Policy (MOE1 and MOE2). Collaborative program planning was portrayed (MOE1) through the necessity for personnel from both inside and outside of the school community to plan together when formulating programs for guidance and career education. The necessity for collaboration and cooperation with regard to formulating the implementation of the policy was also recognized (MOE2). In addition, the document also recognized the necessity of collaboration with program evaluation.
**Types of learning.** Though many of the documents referred to learning in a broad sense, the framework for analysis sought explicit descriptions of how types of learning were considered as part of policy formulation. This could only be clearly seen in two documents, MOE1 and MOE2. Document MOE1 focused on how guidance and career education should be integrated into the curriculum, with attention given to students being able to make links between the classroom and the world beyond. Describing how workshops, seminars, small group work, integration of information technology, and community based learning should be used to facilitate this; the document stated that students should be able to “relate their learning to real-life situations” (section 3.3.1).

The types of learning described in MOE1 were repeated in MOE2, but were extended to include that students should be learning about options and choices, and about the impact that decisions they make may have upon their future choices. The document reiterates the necessity for students to make connections between knowledge and skills that they acquire and the requirements of post–secondary destinations, and acknowledged the importance of students having learning experiences beyond the classroom.

**Conditions for learning.** Providing conditions for learning was a theme in eight of the thirteen documents examined (ONT3, ONT4, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, and MOE8). Ontario government document ONT3 emphasized the advantage of how “quality early learning and child development services provide children with the skills, capabilities, and knowledge required for success in school” (p. 12). The other Ontario government document (ONT4) described strategies that have been put in place
since 2003 by the government of Ontario to provide conditions for learning, including reduced class sizes, raised test scores, an increased high school graduation rate, and being the first North American government to introduce full day learning programs for four to five year olds. In describing conditions for learning, the Ministry of Education documents (MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, and MOE8) all shared a focus toward what would be provided for students to facilitate learning. For example, MOE2 stated that schools “must offer a range of career exploration activities and regularly invite partners from the community to design, participate in, and deliver these activities” (p. 19). MOE3 added that “courses are offered in new ways intended to ensure that education is relevant to both student’s needs and interests, and to the requirements of post-secondary institutions and employers” (p. 6). All documents outlined the requirement for flexibility, for involvement of community partners, and for students to make connections between their learning and the community outside of school.

**Outcomes.** The main themes from the government documents (CAN3, ONT3, and ONT4) in this cluster described how the achievement of stated outcomes was beneficial to societal stakeholders. The Canadian government outlined how, “one of the key lessons of the global recession and financial crisis was that policies matter” (CAN3, p. 34), and the government reminded the reader of its relative fiscal policy strength in comparison to other G8 nations, in the period going into the global recession. The Ontario government (ONT3) stated that it is “guided by the commitment that every young person should be better off as a result of the services we provide” (p. 4), and that
“since 2003, we have worked to shift the focus away from outputs and towards the achievement of outcomes” (p. 4). The Ontario government explained that implications of meeting this [shift of focus] objective are extending “beyond frontline service interactions to the ways that services are designed, implemented, and delivered” (p. 4).

The government documents (CAN3, ONT3, and ONT4) were focused towards outcomes that suggested a positive slant. In two documents (ONT3 and ONT4) the emphasis was on how stakeholders would benefit from the outcomes of the strategies outlined in the documents. The message that by following the Ontario curriculum, students would achieve defined academic outcomes which would, in turn, enable students to meet their individual goals and aspirations was reiterated (MOE2, MOE3, and MOE5). In these four documents, the focus was strongly directed at student outcomes.

Vergari (2010) stated that public education “has numerous consequences for economic development, social cohesion, democracy, and the well-being of individuals and communities” (p. 534). The Ontario Ministry of Education documents (MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, and MOE8) provided evidence of Ontario guidance and career education curriculum being considered against economic, social cohesion, and democratic consequences in addition to consideration of students’ individual well-being. The Canadian and Ontario government documents (CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3 and ONT4) provided evidence of similar considerations to the Ministry of Education documents, economic development through growth and new jobs, social cohesion
through collaboration, and placing individuals [children and youth] on pathways to success.

**Decision Making Stage**

Howlett, et al. (2009) described the decision making stage as “where one or more, or none, of the many options that have been debated and examined during the previous two stages of the policy cycle model is approved as an official course of action” (p. 139). Pal (2006) identified that from the many options a government could consider, “the sense of what is legitimate rests on several ethical foundations, and in a country like Canada, principally on a cluster of ideas such as equality, equity, liberty, and rights” (p. 139). The ethical foundations identified by Pal were used a starting point for inductive analysis, acknowledging that what decision is ultimately made by governments is affected by the structural and institutional context of the decision making situation (Howlett, et al. 2009).

Ultimately, four themes within the decision making stage were inductively recognized; society and community, investment, legislative, and economy (which also included sub-themes of employment, education, and support).

**Society and community.** Six documents provided examples of this theme, CAN1, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, and MOE4. The Canadian government discussed how Canada was a country whose citizens “do not turn back when confronted by obstacles” and “never shrink from lending a helping hand to the most disadvantaged” (p. 1). The government stated that it has confidence in its citizens, that it was confident they would continue to care, and that the “spirit of solidarity will redefine their [citizens’]
sense of sharing as efforts are made to support the economic recovery” (p. 1). The theme of society and community was identified as one based upon collaborative relationships in ONT3. The document talked about a “shared purpose” and a “common understanding of roles and responsibilities” (p. 10). This theme was used to explain the desirability of achieving “lifelong success” and aligned relationships that would help to provide the best outcomes for young people.

Linking society and community with collaboration and shared responsibility was a strong theme throughout the Ministry of Education documents MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, and MOE4. A rationale was offered that in order to adequately prepare young people for the challenges of life beyond compulsory education, the involvement of community members outside of the secondary education environment was needed. MOE3 also described how students were to develop awareness of “civic responsibility” as they strive to become “independent, productive, and responsible members of society” (p. 6). MOE4 further underpinned this theme, describing how the Ontario curriculum would ensure that students were “well prepared to lead satisfying and productive lives as both citizens and individuals, and to compete successfully in a global economy and a rapidly changing world” (p. 3).

**Investment.** CAN1 talked about investment in nonspecific terms describing Canada investment in terms of the “Economic Action Plan” (p. 2) and how this plan was designed to “protect incomes, create jobs, ease credit markets, and help workers and communities get back to their feet” (p. 2). The document alluded to the investment
needed to achieve this but stopped short of outlining explicitly what this investment actually was, preferring to talk in more general terms. In contrast, CAN2 was much more specific when describing investment, outlining the amount spent and describing targeted initiatives. A link was made between the described fiscal package and the “resilience and ingenuity of Canadians” (p. 3).

Similar to the federal government documents, one of the Ontario government documents (ONT3) referred to investment in generic terms whilst the other document (ONT4) was much more specific. ONT3 described key commitments that the Ontario government had made since 2003 through the Ontario Ministry of Children and Youth Service, but it did not explicitly outline the financial cost of this investment. ONT4 referred to $32 billion spent on a job-creating stimulus, part of the “Open Ontario plan” (p. 2).

**Legislative.** Only four documents referred specifically to legislative topics, CAN1, MOE3, MOE5, and MOE7. The Canadian government discussed use of legislation to show it was “leading by example” (CAN 1, p. 5) with regard to Canada’s recovery from the global recession, highlighting legislation to freeze the salaries of the Prime Minister, Ministers, Members of Parliament, and Senators. Additional legislation intended to expand free trade agreements was also described, together with refinements to the youth justice system, and gender inequality under the Indian Act was proposed to be addressed (CAN1).
The Ontario Ministry of Education documents MOE3, MOE5, and MOE7 centered their legislative theme on mandatory provision of elements of the curriculum. In each document there were sections that explained to stakeholders how to meet the mandatory components, and the documents explicitly described different stakeholder’s responsibilities. MOE3 outlined the Ministry of Education’s role, particularly with regard to assessment, testing, and funding and policy direction. A similar format, but with concentration on the curriculum for guidance and career education was provided in MOE5. MOE7 provided legislative updates to the curriculum, including guidance and career education.

**Economy (employment, education, and support).** All 13 documents sampled made references to the economy, but from three different perspectives—employment, education, and support. The three Canadian government documents sampled (CAN1, CAN2, and CAN3) included all three perspectives as did the Ontario government documents (ONT3 and ONT4). CAN1 described firstly how the Economic Action Plan was helping to create and protect jobs, and secondly the strategies within the plan that were designed to support Canadians in getting back to work. CAN1 often linked all three themes, for example “workers have shared their jobs to spare colleagues from layoff. Many Canadians, out of work for the first time in their lives, have begun training for a new career…Tax cuts and enhanced Employment Insurance benefits are providing direct support…” (p. 3). CAN2 also linked the three themes, for example describing precise stimulus initiatives and saying how these would support specific communities by
providing job opportunities through innovation that would require training and education. CAN3 outlined how the Canadian government has paid attention to the bigger picture in its response to the global recession. The document described how the government has “put in place massive policy actions in response to the global financial crisis and recession, using all the tools at its disposal to support Canadians” (p. 20). The document continued by describing some of the policy actions, and focused on those designed to grow and protect jobs for Canadians (p. 20), and on how education and training would help to “create the economy of tomorrow” (p. 20).

ONT3 talked in generic terms about the economy, and the term economy was infrequently mentioned, nevertheless it was there in the document as an outcome as part of the overall vision of the Realizing Potential: Our Children, Our Youth, Our Future strategy (p. 3). The focus upon the economy theme is directed at support, and the document went into some detail about how support for young people is embedded into the overall strategy. ONT4 is another document within which the three economy themes are linked. A description of the Ontario government’s response to the global recession provided the backdrop to illustrations of job creating strategies and re-employment training, in particular a first of its kind program in Canada, “Second Career” (p. 3). The document described strategies such as tax modernization and clean energy programs (p. 3) that were supporting the jobs creation and protection initiatives.

All eight Ontario Ministry of Education documents included the theme of support. Principle modes of support that were described included explanations of roles and
responsibilities, detailed provision for students with exceptionalities or students identified as being at-risk. The resource document MOE6 had a slightly different focus, though designed to be a support resource for teachers, reference to employment and education and training were embedded into the resource activities for students. So, although this document did not explicitly describe employment and education and training initiatives, they were acknowledged within the resource pack designed to support the teaching of guidance and career education.

Documents MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, and MOE8 all made explicit links between the needs of the economy and how the curriculum is designed to respond to those needs. Documents MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, and MOE5 all contained references to the employment theme, connecting 21st century societal economic needs, with what students need in order to successfully integrate into working life after they have completed secondary education. Levin (1998) found that in comparing education policy across Canada, the United States, and Britain, the need for change in education was largely cast in economic terms, particularly in relation to the preparation of a workforce. All 13 documents examined were linked to economic issues.

Policy Implementation Stage

Howlett, et al. (2009) described policy implementation this way, “the effort, knowledge, and resources devoted to translating policy decisions into action comprise the policy cycle’s implementation stage” (p. 160). It is important to realize that a well-designed policy can be poorly implemented, while a poorly designed policy can be well
implemented (Pal, 2006). The policy implementation stage is shaped by both state
capacity, and state ability to deal with specific issues and complexities of the subsystems
with which it must transact (Howlett, et al. 2009). Evidence was sought for descriptions
of actions that were outlined in the documents, including descriptions of how identified
actions were to be implemented. Four themes were induced from the analysis of
documents for policy implementation stage; initiatives—including industry specific and
non-industry specific, leadership, desirable outcomes, and actor involvement.

Initiatives. Five documents referred to this theme (CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3,
and ONT4) with initiatives being either industry specific or non-industry specific. CAN1
introduced legislative and financial initiatives that responded to the global economic
downturn, including legislation to support responsible development of Canada’s energy
and mineral resources. The Canadian government promised it would “tackle the maze of
regulations that needlessly complicates project approvals” (p. 9) thereby rejuvenating this
industry and contributing to jobs protection and growth. The initiatives presented in
CAN1 are all part of Canada’s Economic Action Plan. CAN2 also described the
Economic Action Plan, but focused on more specific details, in particular year two of the
plan and the amount of financial investment. CAN3 provided even more specific detail,
with graphs and charts comparing Canada’s economic situation to that of other G7
nations, and providing predictions of future strategies and policy direction.

ONT3 described a strategy framework presented by the Ontario government. As
part of this framework a number of initiatives were discussed, including reducing
administrative burdens on partnership services, linking and sharing data across multiple sources, and introducing new measures to improve client services (p. 13). However, the document talked in quite generic terms, unlike ONT4 that was much more precise in its description of Ontario government initiatives. Like CAN1, the initiatives presented in ONT4 were focused towards economic growth and jobs protection and expansion, with spending being highlighted: “we are investing $32 billion in job-creating stimulus” (p. 2).

**Leadership roles.** Four documents considered this theme and its role in the career studies program (MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, and MOE5). The document MOE1 provided detailed description of the implementation stage of guidance and career education and discussed the leadership role of the secondary school principal, stating that he or she should practice “informed and active leadership” (section 5.1.1). The document also explained how the principal’s role should be one of supervision, administration, coordination, and organization, with an emphasis on the coordination of input from community partners. MOE2 built on the description offered in MOE1, adding that the principal “needs to understand the program’s goals and structure, as well as what an exemplary program is like” (p. 26). The document re-iterated the principal’s overall leadership role of the guidance and career education program.

MOE3 looked at the leadership role of both the Ontario Ministry of Education and local district school boards. The document explained that the ministry “provides leadership in establishing policy for the development of partnerships between the education community and representatives of employing organizations, at the provincial
and local levels” (p. 60). The document also stated that “school boards will develop policies and procedures, in accordance with provincial policies, for involving community partners in the planning and delivery of guidance and career education programs…” (p. 60).

MOE5 also discussed the role of the principal in leading the guidance and career education programs; however, the discussion was centered on how the leadership role was much more of a shared leadership role, “the principal works in partnership with teachers and parents to ensure that each student has access to the best possible educational experience” (p. 6).

**Desirable outcomes.** Ten documents considered this theme (CAN2, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, MOE6, MOE7, and MOE8). The desirable outcomes outlined in CAN2 focused on the Canadian government’s aspirations for economic recovery. The document described how the 2010 budget would “bring Canada’s finances back to balance over the medium term and well before any other Group of Seven (G7) country” (p. 3) and that the government predicted that Canada “will emerge from the recession with a stronger economic advantage than before” (p. 3).

ONT3 expressed desirable outcomes as a “shared commitment to an Ontario where all children and youth have the best opportunity to succeed and reach their full potential” (p. 3). The document summarized its desirable outcomes for children and youth as being “ready to learn at all ages, healthy and active, economically secure, safe from harm, and valued, involved and responsible” (p. 3). ONT3 also identified Ontario
government outcomes as being “success for students, jobs and prosperity, and better health” (p. 3).

Documents MOE1, MOE2, and MOE3 expressed desirable outcomes as expectations of students. For example, MOE1 expected students to “make informed and appropriate choices and implement successful transitions from school to educational, work, and life roles” (section 3.1). MOE2 expected students to work cooperatively and productively with a wide range of people (p. 5), and MOE3 expected students to “learn about career opportunities, make informed decisions, and set and adhere to appropriate goals (p. 7). The focus of outcomes in documents MOE4 and MOE5 was on what the curriculum was able to offer students.

The outcomes in MOE6 were directed at teachers of career studies, illustrating expectations that could be achieved with the use of the resources contained in the document. MO7 also had outcomes written as expectations for teachers, principals, and district school boards, with little emphasis given to outcomes for students in this document. MOE8 had its outcomes directed towards all stakeholders, therefore the outcomes were articulated in more generic terms, for example, the ministry had three core principles, “high levels of student achievement, reduced gaps in student achievement, and increased public confidence in publically funded education” (p. 4).

Actor involvement. Only four documents referred explicitly to actor involvement, MOE1, MOE2, MOE4, and MOE7. MOE1 discussed the role of actors directly involved in program delivery in section 3.3 of the document, and identified those
actors as teachers, teacher-counsellors, employers, community agencies, and private sector organizations. The document also discussed how actors involved directly in program planning “should identify personnel inside and outside of school” (section 4.3).

Document MOE2 had actors listed in the roles and responsibilities section and identified these as being principals, guidance counsellors, teachers, students, parents, and community partners (pp. 26-27). MOE4 discussed actors with regard to their roles and responsibilities, describing district school board and committee’s responsibilities for Identification, Placement, and Review Committees (IPRC) for exceptional students. The document also outlined reporting procedures that schools and parents must follow and the role of district school boards, communities, teachers, principals in assessment and evaluation.

MOE7 concentrated on highlighting relevant legislation for different groups of actors. Throughout the document, different ministers were linked with specific legislation and school boards and school authorities were referred to as the target audience. Teachers, school leader’s parents, students, adult education, and administrative teams were implicitly identified as actors, through description of legislative areas of focus and actors to whom this is relevant. Howlett, et al. (2009) commented that:

The central assumption of most contemporary approaches to policy implementation is that this stage of the policy process is shaped by political factors related to the state capacity to deal with specific issues and the complexity of the subsystem with which it must deal. (p. 175)
The Canadian and Ontario government documents all presented evidence of legislative and economic responses to the global economic downturn, linking these with government aspirations for recovery, and an outline of what the federal and provincial governments believed would happen in response to their interventions. In a similar way, the Ontario Ministry of Education presented detailed descriptions of implementation of the curriculum and aligned roles and responsibilities of actors involved in the implementation with the expected outcomes of the policy.

**Policy Evaluation Stage**

Once the need to address a public issues has been acknowledged, alternative responses and actions have been considered and a course of action has been decided upon and implemented, a government often will assess and evaluate how and if the policy is working (Howlett et al., 2009). Evidence was sought in the documents of evaluation of the policies described. Themes identified in the evaluation stage were; the type of evaluation, frequency of evaluation, and responsibility which included two sub–clusters, who does the evaluation and who is the evaluation for.

**Type of evaluation.** Five documents referred to how policy would be evaluated, with each document differing in detail of description. ONT3 made a brief reference to evaluation in its description of the document being “a living document that will evolve based on research, our experiences and discussions with partners” (p. 13). MOE1 has a section of the document devoted to program planning and accountability. The section described how the guidance and career education program was to be “monitored and
continuously improved through; communication with parents/guardians, a school-wide program survey, and collaborative program planning with partners” (section 4). Evaluation would be primarily sought through the school-wide program survey, to be conducted by schools every three years “to determine the effectiveness of the school’s guidance and career education program” (section 4.2). MOE5 included evaluation in a section on assessment and evaluation of student achievement, referring to how students themselves were evaluated as part of the guidance and career education program. The rationale for this was “[a] primary purpose of assessment and evaluation [is] to improve student learning” (p. 12). MOE5 provided a detailed description of how evaluation of student achievement should take place, outlining the basic considerations, and an achievement chart that includes categories of knowledge and skills, criteria, descriptors, and qualifiers (pp. 14-15).

The exemplar material outlined in MOE6 explained how evaluation took place during the development of the exemplars, and described the involvement of Ministry personnel, district school board staff, and teachers from across the province in the process. Limited information was given about the exemplar resources that were evaluated, with MOE6 concentrating on presenting finished exemplar examples. Document MOE6 made two references to evaluation, firstly that there was “an ongoing cycle of curriculum review” (p. 9), and secondly, explaining that the Ministry would “continue using data and results to assess our work, monitor progress, and address situations where additional guidance may be necessary” (p. 15).
**Frequency of evaluation.** This was first mentioned in MOE1 in section 2.2 *Key Features of the Policy*, where the document stated that “a program-effectiveness survey based on a sample of students, parents and teachers would be conducted every three years to evaluate the program” (item 10). Section 4.2 of the document explained that the evaluation survey must use a “statistically valid sample of students, teachers, and parents.” Appendix 1 also outlined a timeframe whereby “at the end of school year 2001/02 all schools must have conducted their first school-wide survey to be conducted on a 3 year cycle” and that “schools may begin their surveys earlier if they wish.” The introductory section of MOE3 includes an outline of the requirement for principals to conduct a three year survey to determine the effectiveness of the guidance and career education program.

**Responsibilities of evaluators and purpose of evaluation.** Document MOE1 details how evaluation of the guidance and career education program is overseen and undertaken by principals with contributions from students, parents and teachers. Results of the evaluation are reported to staff that directly influence the collaborative planning and future delivery of the program (section 4.2). Any revisions to the program are communicated to parents and guardians, staff and students. MOE2 identifies the principal’s responsibility for undertaking the program effectiveness survey for the guidance and career education program. Contributions to the evaluation should be sought from teachers with regard to student achievement, and from observations by parents and other teachers to provide information and or suggestions that may be useful when
modifying the program. Results should be reviewed by the “school’s guidance and career education program advisory team” (p. 25).

MOE3 has a section in the document devoted to explaining the roles and responsibilities of the ministry and district school boards with regard to the Ontario curriculum. The emphasis on evaluation is placed with the ministry, which has responsibility for developing policy on assessment, evaluation, reporting and remediation. Included in this is the requirement of the ministry to develop and or revise (in consultation with the broader educational community), guidance and career education, co-operative education, work experience, school-to-work transition, and apprenticeship programs. There was no mention of evaluation responsibilities for the district school boards.

Ministry staff was also given responsibility for evaluation in document MOE6, which took the form of evaluation of materials produced by teachers from across Ontario to provide a set of exemplar resources for the guidance and career education program. The document explained how during the construction of the resources, feedback was obtained from classroom teachers, students and district school board contacts, however student effort was not evaluated. “Rubrics were the primary tools used to evaluate student work at both the school board level and the provincial level” (p. 8). A brief mention of evaluation is included in MOE8, with the ministry holding responsibility for its undertaking, with a target audience of all stakeholders. The purpose of this evaluation
was explained as assessment of data and results to monitor progress and address situations.

Reference to evaluation of policy within the documents was not really seen in the federal government documents. Limited evidence of evaluation was seen in the document ONT3; however, evidence predominantly came from the Ministry of Education documents, and evidence was focused on program evaluation, and the responsibilities of actors involved in this evaluation process.

**Chapter Summary**

In Chapter 4, documents were analyzed through the heuristic lens of the policy cycle model (Howlett et al., 2009). The analysis described the policies and strategies that make up the Canadian and Ontario governments’ responses to the global economic downturn. The findings of Chapter 4 indicated that the Canadian and Ontario governments had responded to the global economic downturn with similar strategies. Understanding that policy implementation is shaped by the state’s ability and capacity to deal with the specific issues and by complexity of the subsystems within which it must deal, helps to explain why these patterns of government choices share similarities.

Howlett et al. clarified that patterns of government choices often exhibit surprising amounts of similarity and continuity within and across policy sectors, and often over periods of time. The findings from data analyzed in this chapter supported Howlett et al.’s claim. Documents from the Canadian government, and Ontario government and Ministry of Education, used similar terminology and described
comparable initiatives as responses to the global economic downturn. For example, the Canadian government had developed *Canada’s Economic Action Plan* (2010), and the Ontario government had developed the *Open Ontario Plan for Jobs and Growth* (2010).

The next chapter, Chapter 5 presents the findings from the interviews undertaken with the participant teacher of career studies.
CHAPTER 5

PARTICIPANT TEACHER: INTERVIEW FINDINGS

This section of the investigation intends to answer what the teacher knows about the policies and strategies identified in the previous chapter, Chapter 4. This chapter also outlines whether the teacher perceives that the policies and strategies highlighted in Chapter 4 have impacted upon her local and wider community, and what challenges they might have presented to her students who are seeking employment. This chapter attempts to identify the teacher’s perceptions of how any changes in the economy, society, and the job market have translated into her teaching practice.

Data Analysis: First Stage Coding from Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Systems Theory Classifications

Using a deductive approach, the classifications of Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) ecological systems theory were applied to the data collected during four interviews with the participant teacher. Four main classifications were identified by Bronfenbrenner—macrosystem, exosystem, mesosystem and microsystem—with mesosystem being further sub-classified into multisetting participation, indirect linkage, intersetting communications, and intersetting knowledge. It is useful to remind ourselves of Bronfenbrenner’s ecological systems theory classifications with a brief explanation of each.

The microsystem consists of individual and interpersonal features and aspects of groups that comprise the social identity. This system may include the roles that a person
plays (for example mother, sister, and employee), characteristics one has in common with others, qualities and characteristics that can be learned from membership in a group, and that can be ingrained (for example ethnicity or gender). The individual in his or her microsystems is constantly shaped by both the environment and encounters with other individuals.

Mesosystem refers to organizational or institutional factors that shape or structure the environment within which the individual and interpersonal relations occur (Gregson, 2001). These aspects can include policies, procedures, and more informal rules of “how things are done around here.” The four sub-classifications of mesosystem are; Multisetting Participation which occurs when the same person is engaged in more than one setting; Indirect Linkage, when the same person does not actively work in both settings but there is an established connection through a third party; Intersetting Communications where messages are transmitted from one setting to another; and, Intesetting Knowledge, when information or experience exists in one setting about another setting.

Exosystem consists of community level influence, including fairly established norms, standards, and social networks (Gregson, 2001). There will likely be many organizations and interpersonal relationships that comprise this community, and the exosystem is any setting that affects the individual, although the individual is not required to be an active participant.
The influences of the macrosystem can often be seen more easily, than the influences of the other of Bronfenbrenner’s classifications, due to the magnitude of impact (Gregson, 2001). The macrosystem includes cultural contexts such as socioeconomic status, poverty, ethnicity, and government type and influence.

During analysis, a chart was created with these classifications as headers and data were selected and placed under each heading.

**Interview Data Analysis: Second Stage Coding from Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Systems Theory (Classifications)**

The completed charts were then further analyzed using an inductive approach which allowed for clusters of coding categories under each of Bronfenbrenner’s classifications to emerge. Possible areas of application to the teacher were previously considered and are shown in Table 3 in the first chapter of this thesis. They provided the starting point for identification of emerging clusters. Data were read and re-read to clarify clusters and to identify any additional clusters not represented in Table 3. The clustering process resulted in seven clusters being identified in the microsystem classification, ten clusters in the mesosystem classification (two for multisetting participation, four for indirect linkage, two for intersetting communication, and two for intersetting knowledge). Four clusters were identified in each of the exosystem and macrosystem classifications.

The clusters were then re-examined and arranged according to four overarching themes of (1) sharing experience and expertise, (2) making connections (between different areas of her teaching practice, and using her knowledge to help students make
connections through career studies), (3) sourcing resources and tools, and (4) networking and relationships. The findings of the interview data analysis were organized into these four themes, with explicit linkages to Bronfenbrenner’s classifications applied across the themes. The list of clusters and linkages with Bronfenbrenner’s classifications, together with the four overarching themes are shown in Appendix H. To further clarify how Bronfenbrenner’s classifications related to the four overarching themes and to ease presentation of the findings, I re-organized the data by theme. These themes are shown in Table 5.

Table 5. Four Themes with Linkages to Bronfenbrenner’s Classifications

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sharing Experience</th>
<th>Making Connections</th>
<th>Sourcing Resources and Tools</th>
<th>Relationships and Networking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Family (MI)</td>
<td>Own Community (MI)</td>
<td>Technology (MIL)</td>
<td>Former Students (MI)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues (MI)</td>
<td>Former Students (MI)</td>
<td>Resources (MIL)</td>
<td>Post-Secondary Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Experience (MI)</td>
<td>Guest Speakers (MMP)</td>
<td>In-school Resources (MIK)</td>
<td>Relationships (MIL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Own Expertise (MI)</td>
<td>Networking (MIL)</td>
<td>Local Media (MIK)</td>
<td>Wider Community (MIC)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-op Education</td>
<td>Employers (MIC)</td>
<td></td>
<td>District School Board (EX)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice (MMP)</td>
<td>Local Demographics</td>
<td></td>
<td>Networking (EX)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest Speakers (MMP)</td>
<td>(EX)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employers (MIK &amp;</td>
<td>Local Economy (EX)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIC)</td>
<td>Global or International (MA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Federal (MA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Provincial (MA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Global or National Media (MA)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note. Microsystem = MI; Mesosystem Multisetting Participation = MMP; Mesosystem Indirect Linkage = MIL; Mesosystem Interstetten Communication = MIC; Mesosystem Interstetten Knowledge = MIK; Exosystem = EX; Macrosystem = MA;*

**Introducing Julia**

Julia is a teacher at Beaver Creek high school, a school consisting of approximately 650 students located in a town in eastern Ontario. Julia has been a co-
operative (co-op) education, business, and guidance teacher for over 30 years, and has taught the compulsory half-credit career studies course for over five years. Julia has completed the Guidance (part one and part two) Additional Qualifications courses for the province of Ontario, Canada. Julia describes herself as having “done a number of other things” apart from teaching, such as working in retail and manufacturing environments, and working part time as a waitress whilst waiting for her teaching qualifications to be recognized in another jurisdiction. Julia has also experienced living and working in another country.

Sharing Experience and Expertise, Making Connections, Sourcing Resources and Tools, and Networking and Relationships

Sharing her Experience and Expertise

This theme emerged from Julia’s frequent descriptions of how she used her experience and expertise, together with her immediate family’s and colleagues’ experience and expertise, to inform her career studies teaching practice. For Julia, sharing her own and others experience with students was her way of showing them empathy. Julia described feeling that students were faced with difficult choices about their career and post-secondary destinations, and she felt that sharing her “stories” with students helped to show them that challenges can be overcome. Julia believed that sharing the experiences of others (immediate family and colleagues) also helped her to achieve greater efficiency in the career studies program. Julia talked frequently about the constraints of delivering
the career studies program over half a semester, and about how using experience and
discipline from others helped Julia to cover a wider range of topics within the curriculum.

Sharing her experience: Microsystem classification. The concept of sharing experience and
discipline was a dominant theme through the microsystem classification. Julia used her own
experience and discipline, shared some of her family’s experiences,
and drew on her colleague’s experience and discipline as a resource. Julia talked
extensively about how she used experience and discipline within the career studies
program, making frequent links between her teaching of career studies and her teaching
of cooperative (co–op) education and business marketing.

Julia described to me how she had first begun to teach career studies, recalling
how “it was just assigned to me by my principal.” Julia could not remember whether she
was taking her Guidance (part one and part two) Additional Qualifications courses for the
province of Ontario, Canada at that time, or whether she took the qualifications after she
had been assigned to teach career studies. Prior to this she had been teaching co-op
education and was working towards becoming a guidance counsellor. Julia remarked that
the guidance course did not for facilitate her teaching of career studies, saying she did not
find that, “those university AQ [Additional Qualifications] [Guidance] courses prepared
me for teaching this course at all…it was terrible in terms of that.” Julia talked about how
it was her experience as a co-op teacher instead that prepared her to teach career studies;
“I think I mentioned it’s a really good extension… of my co-op and what I do with
that…I’ve added things [to the career studies program] because of my co-op experience.”
Julia thought that the AQ courses had been much more valuable to her in her role in guidance “those guidance courses…prepared me well to be a counsellor.”

Julia also identified how her previous (unrelated to teaching) work experience had supported her career studies teaching practice. When asked about what she felt made an effective teacher of career studies, Julia hesitantly explained how she had to resist saying “being a mom” and “raising kids,” and she was very keen to make clear that she felt “there are some amazing wonderful teachers out there who don’t have children, and wonderful career studies teachers out there who don’t have children.” Nevertheless, Julia linked her role as a mother to her teaching practice, suggesting that she perceived that for her, it had impacted upon her teaching in the career studies program.

Julia expanded on how previous work experience had influenced her teaching
I’ve worked with a lot of people, you know, I’ve worked in shops, I’ve worked in manufacturing, I’ve worked in warehouses, I’ve worked as an EA [Educational Assistant] whilst upgrading my qualifications from …out of county, and, you know, you keep your eyes open and ears open and, and all of that has I think, helped me share some stories.

Julia felt that having some expertise in differentiated learning was essential and that the expertise should be underpinned with the right attitude. She talked about “embracing it” and, as part of that attitude;

Seeing the intelligences and the extension, what does it mean for half the students or a third of the students to know that they learn in a certain way, they can show
you what they know in a certain way, and they can be very productive in certain types of settings and work environments.

Julia felt that it was important to be “open to that, and understanding…having a bit of that knowledge.” Julia summarized by saying that she believed “most teachers would have…the skills [to teach career studies].”

The concept of attitude also influenced her teaching practice, Julia described how she had “little sayings that I put on the board each day…building that attitude…that you are growing and learning all the time.” Julia placed importance on sharing this with students and she described how she encouraged them to build upon the “richness of who you are.” However, she acknowledged that “they can’t see what’s coming…that’s why we have to give them…kind of that…general openness, attitude of general openness” and she felt that by doing this the students became more aware of future prospects, Julia described how students were “blown away by the opportunities.”

When I asked Julia how she gained knowledge of global issues, in particular issues from the global economic downturn, she told me how she watches nightly “an hour of public broadcasting news, to get a world perspective” and “listens to CBC radio.” Julia described how she didn’t feel confident that she had extensive, deep knowledge of global issues especially “in terms of my depth [of] analysis and being able to translate and turn that into…labour market information.” However she described how she felt comfortable with this, “OK, I know it’s OK…because I’m aware that it’s huge and it’s changing all the time.”
Drawing on the experiences of her family, Julia described how her own children had ended up “all over the world” since finishing their post secondary-education. Julia talked to me about how her daughter had recently gone through the “whole employment process” when she had completed university. Julia realized that sharing her daughter’s experience helped to update her own knowledge of the employment process, acknowledging that, as she was already in employment herself, Julia was “out of the loop” when it came to applying for jobs. Julia found that through her daughter’s experience she was also directed to other sources of updating her knowledge, highlighting “it’s good to be in touch with…the employment groups and agencies.”

Sharing the experiences and expertise of colleagues was useful to Julia when she first taught career studies. Julia described how the person who had taught the career studies course prior to Julia had “taught it for five or six years…did it well and developed it” and had “handed me the binder.” Julia explained that she had reviewed the binder saying “I’m fussy and I like to change things up” but that in spite of this the binder had been an invaluable source and that sharing this experience and resource was now “what we do for a new colleague coming in.”

The sharing of experience and expertise with colleagues is something that Julia participated in continuously. Julia described how within her school there are “people here on staff that have special knowledge and expertise… [that] as the students move through high school they can tap into.” Julia talked about how within her career studies classes “we go around and speak with teachers…in the tech class for instance.” Describing
informal interaction with a colleague, Julia highlighted how the Math-Ways teacher/presenter recently said to her “Oh there’s this mom who does financial planning and, you know, I had her come to my class, you should have her come in to talk to your Grade 10’s.”

The data provided evidence that the level of microsystem classification was an important source for Julia in her career studies teaching practice. Julia provided extensive examples of drawing upon her own experience and expertise and that of her immediate family and colleagues as resources for the career studies program. The next section describes how Julia shared experience and expertise at the mesosystem classification level.

Sharing experience and expertise: Mesosystem classification. In the mesosystem classification, the sources of sharing and expertise came from guest speakers and Julia’s co-op education teaching practice (multisetting participation). The sources of sharing of experience and expertise came from making new connections through existing links (intersetting knowledge), and the sources of the sharing of experience and expertise were from employers local to Julia (intersetting communication).

Julia illustrated how she relied on the experience and expertise of guest speakers within the career studies program to help to ensure she covered the curriculum requirements explaining, “There are certain individuals or organizations I bring in because it covers aspects of the curriculum that I don’t feel I can adequately cover.” Julia gave an example of how she used a guest speaker: “I had one year quite a few students who were interested in working in…medical fields…I have a connection…at one of the
senior centres, so I had…their volunteer co-ordinator come in and speak with the students.” Julia reiterates the importance of guest speakers as a source of information for the students, telling me, “I bring in a lot of guests that I hope are specialists and will…bring the students up to speed…because they know what’s going on right now.”

Julia explained how she went about acquiring guest speakers for the career studies program saying “I just pick up the phone and call, I’m used to doing that…I’m different because I’m a co-op teacher and I know who I would ask and who I wouldn’t ask.”

Julia described how she translated valuable skills from her co-op education teaching across to her career studies teaching, “Picking up brochures and information and seeing what’s going on…I do that because I am a co-op teacher…I am looking for opportunities for placements for my students.” Though the initial purpose of the activity for Julia is clearly part of her co-op education teaching, the activity also informs her career studies teaching.

Opportunities to share information from new connections through existing links came to Julia from different sources. Identifying some of these sources, Julia described how “back in the day when curriculum changes were first happening, there was a lot of…in-servicing, and that was great, because you would get together with all the career studies teachers.” Julia acknowledged that after the curriculum had become established, this information sharing opportunity had ceased and that this had caused Julia to seek other ways in which to share information and expertise. Julia explained how, by working
with a guest speaker, she was able to bring two new informants for the students into career studies;

   He also [guest speaker] had a student, a college student who…had a placement.
   So wow that was great, he brought the college student…so I said this is fantastic,
   so we’ve got the next step, as well as the next step. The professional who has been
   doing things for 10 years,…plus somebody who is in the program right now.
   Looking for new opportunities to share fresh information through existing links
was also part of Julia’s co-op teaching, and she talked about how as a co-op teacher she
was always “looking for new businesses and small business in eastern Ontario is huge.”
Julia reported how working with the Summer Company [Federal government initiative
for 15 to 19 year olds] in her co-op and career studies teaching allowed her to begin to
use this as a source of sharing expertise. Julia outlined that “the Summer Company is
where I get some of these stats [about eastern Ontario]”.

   Julia talked about the importance of sharing her new sources of expertise to
support her colleagues teaching career studies: “
   We pass information…we’re a small school…if somebody else is teaching career
   studies, you know, here’s my list, here’s who I bring in, why and what they do…I
   think sitting together and putting heads together about those things are important,
   especially for somebody new.
   Julia detailed how many of the guest speakers that she brought into the career
   studies program came from the local employers she already had links with through her

106
co-op education teaching. Julia explained how it was important that she organized how she used guest speakers, especially any that had not come into school previously. Julia said,

I have to prepare for that, a new speaker; they need to know what the course is about, because…they don’t understand what the course is about. Who are the kids, how old are they…what kind of things can I? What kind of thing can’t I…shouldn’t I say to them? So I give them a bit of an overview…the course outline…and…who the kids are.

The data provided evidence that the mesosystem classification was another important source for Julia. Three sub-classifications were used by Julia within the mesosystem, and these were guest speakers (multisetting participation) and employers (intersetting knowledge and intersetting communication). The next section presents evidence from the data of Julia sharing experience and expertise at the exosystem classification source level.

**Sharing experience and expertise: Exosystem classification.** In the exosystem classification, the sharing of experience and expertise came from sources achieved through sharing experience and expertise through new links, and Julia described some of the organizations she worked with in order to source information for the career studies program. Julia highlighted local Business Improvement Associations and Chambers of Commerce that she used, “those are the people I talk to…and they will come into your class as well…to give discussions…also for me, just going in there and picking up

107
brochures and information and seeing what’s going on.” Julia also reported using Passport to Prosperity “a new program that puts me in touch as a co-op teacher but again I find out more about new businesses, and businesses that are interested in youth and bringing youth along.” Julia also identified having regular contact with Job Connect [Ontario Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities initiative to help people prepare for and look for employment], another organization that “comes in and talks to students.”

The data provided evidence that Julia used exosystem classification source level of expertise from organizations that were at community level. Even though Julia was not an active participant, the activities of these community level organizations had the potential to impact upon her teaching practice within the career studies program.

The next section of chapter 5 presents evidence to support the second of the four themes, making connections.

**Making Connections**

Julia’s teaching responsibilities covered three broad topic areas, as a teacher of career studies, cooperative (co-op) education, and business marketing. Through these three topic areas, Julia frequently described how she utilized her experience across the topic areas by making connections using the three curricula guides. Making connections had become important for Julia because she felt it allowed her to access the right information, from the right people in order to meet her students’ needs. Julia also described how it was important for her students to make connections. Julia referred to the necessity of students being able to “connect the dots” between their learning, the
requirements of the career studies course, and students’ future learning, training, or work aspirations.

**Making connections: Microsystem classification.** The concept of making connections was a theme that threaded through each of the four interviews with Julia. Sources of making connections came from Julia’s interactions in her local community, from Julia’s own experience and expertise, and from her colleague’s experiences (microsystem).

When asked about what she knew of how the global economic downturn had impacted upon the local and wider communities, Julia described how the experience of “living in the community” was a source of her knowledge, “just driving around and looking around in my…community…it’s very small business, it’s what it’s all about…very few large organizations out here.” Julia talked about how her visits to the local Business Improvement Association and Chamber of Commerce helped her to keep up to date with what was happening with local businesses: “I am looking for opportunities for placements for my students but it also keeps me abreast of …the new…emerging…it is all about small business here.” Recognizing an impact upon one business in her community, Julia told me;

I went into the hardware store the other day on highway # [in my local town] and I thought this is a big parking lot, and there, this is a big store, and there were two cars in the lot and I thought, ew, this isn’t good.
Julia described how this experience had made her think about her own shopping habits, saying that she thought to herself, “when was the last time you shopped in here?” Julia also reported “I know of a local gift shop in town here that…sold, but part of the reason that she sold the shop was that she…just didn’t feel like it was going anywhere.”

Julia was not able to explicitly describe how any federal initiatives might impact upon the teaching of career studies; however, she did state that she believed that there would be some level of connection, “I am sure there is, it’s connecting, it’s making the connections…and I’m certain that there is.” Julia did see connections at the microsystem classification level between some of her students and the economy. Acknowledging “I don’t see a lot of post-secondary students in fields that would take them directly into…[but] small business, those that have gone to work or apprenticeship, and that’s probably…half our graduates…they’re building our economy right from…now.”

Julia used her experience from her non-teaching working life to influence her students to make connections for themselves. She described how as a co-op teacher she saw some of the students she had taught career studies to in Grade 10 again when they were in Grade 11 or Grade 12.

I try as a co-op teacher seeing several of them again in Grade 11 or 12 or 12X…one of the questions that I give them…on a practice log before they head out to work, is think back to your Grade 10 career studies course, tell me one or two things that you remember from that course that were very important…to you.
As you think back…they always say, I learned how to write a proper resume, got me my first job or something pretty practical like that.

Julia described how her experience as a business marketing teacher gave her knowledge of changes to the structure and size of business, articulating “because I also teach marketing, and I’m kinda aware [of] the move towards big box shopping for different things…and people driving, my goodness people drive to Ottawa to go shopping.” Julia also exclaimed her surprise that “in our particular school, we have not had a very vibrant business studies…interest from our students.” Julia was unsure of the reasons for this, highlighting how other local schools differed, “because I know, even as close as [nearby town], their courses are jam packed full…many sections that we do not have at this school.”

The data provided evidence not only of Julia recognizing where there are connections between her different teaching roles, but also of Julia making connections between her role as a member of a community and her role as a teacher. Julia described how she often made connections between what was happening in her community to her career studies teaching, which she then linked to the expectations of the career studies curriculum. The next section outlines the evidence of making connections at the mesosystem classification source level.

**Making connections : Mesosystem classification.** Julia frequently mentioned the importance of connections as a thread throughout the four interviews. Julia sourced information about connections (multisetting participation) by drawing on her experience
as a teacher of other subjects and through her guest speakers. Julia also drew on making 
new connections through existing links, usually through her co-op teaching, and through 
post-secondary institution relationships (indirect linkage). Drawing on knowledge within 
the wider community was also a source of making connections for Julia (interseting 
communications), enabling her to make connections between what was happening in the 
wider community and the expectations of the career studies curriculum. In addition, Julia 
used the students’ parents as a source of making connections (interseting knowledge).

Julia described how attending graduation ceremonies at her school provided her 
with an opportunity to learn about the post-secondary destinations of her former students 
“because our grad’ at this school is in the fall…all the kids come back…as they walk 
across the stage, our guidance people say what the student is doing at the present 
time…so I hear what they are doing.” Julia highlighted how, since the global economic 
downturn, she felt that the attendance at breakfast club in school had risen. “All it takes is 
going in and looking at the breakfast program downstairs and see how much food we 
feed the kids here…at breakfast and lunchtime and…those kids are hungry.” Julia 
reported feeling that many teachers “don’t hear enough about…our specific kids…I 
do…because I am a co-op teacher…I really get…inside the lives of those kids.”

Julia highlighted that, as a guest speaker, the Ontario Summer Company was a 
great source of expertise that informed her teaching, and that as an organization the 
Summer Company was “a huge part of our economy in Eastern Ontario…encouraging 
youth who want to start a business, and supporting them through a summer program.”
Julia added that the program was popular because it gave students a grant at the start and the end and that the “program is…usually ready to introduce in December so that’s in time for most students in career studies.” Julia also highlighted the work of Passport to Prosperity [Ontario Ministry of Education campaign to support educators and employers in developing experiential learning opportunities for high school students] stating that “they have the mandate to kind of beat the bushes and make the connection between co-op placements and new businesses.” In these examples, Julia’s opportunity to make connections initially came through working with Summer Company and Passport to Prosperity as part of her co-op education teaching role.

When asked about the aspects of the career studies program she would promote to parents, Julia explained how she felt that parents needed to know more about what the career studies program could do for their kids. “I would give them a bit more information of where we’re going…I would perhaps tell the parents a little of what the students are going to get in the course.” Julia believed that parents can be more informed than their kids are when they are Grade 10, especially about apprenticeships, “the parents know…what apprenticeship is, a lot of the students don’t even know what that is yet…I can presume more knowledge on the parents’ part.” However Julia also described how she felt that parents needed to be shown how to make connections between the courses being taken by students and post–secondary planning “the key [is]…that they [parents] understand the best maths, for programs and career directions and destinations, whether it’s college, or apprenticeship…university.”
Julia explained how knowing about local university and colleges (intersetting knowledge) facilitated her development of relationships with post–secondary destinations, including accessing their websites as a resource for information. Julia highlighted Algonquin College, which she believed had “a great site for them [students] to connect the next step after high school.”

Julia’s descriptions of how she made connections in settings other than her career studies teaching in her school provided evidence of how she used multi-setting participation classification sources to support her career studies teaching practice. In addition, the data provided evidence of Julia drawing from the expertise and experience of employers in her community that she identified through her co-op teaching practice. The next section of this chapter examines the exosystem classification source.

**Making connections: Exosystem classification.** In the exosystem classification Julia drew on sources from the local economy and local businesses, making connections through new links and local demographics.

Julia responded to being asked about the impact of the global economic downturn on businesses in her local community saying “I know that the pressure’s on everybody…they have less time to do what they need to do…every organization is cutting staff and so forth…I see everybody trying to do what they’ve always done…with less.” Julia was also able to highlight a direct impact this had upon the career studies program: “I’ve heard that that one of the universities cut the Grade 10 career studies program [no longer making visits to her school to discuss post-secondary options with
Grade 10 students].” She also described how she had lost a valued guest speaker “there’s one business that no longer exists…there was somebody from that organization that used to come in and speak…and that business is not here.” Julia explained how the person who came in had, “retired from another field and gone into this field…those are the valuable ones, when they can talk about a couple of different things…he was valuable…and the business is gone, he’s gone.”

Knowledge of local demographics informed Julia’s teaching of career studies in two main ways. Firstly, she took note of how “businesses come and go,” though Julia acknowledged that her local community had areas that were better off then others, citing that the nearest town to the school “is a little better off probably than some others…we have a large retirement community…that has…more of a stable income.” Julia used local demographic information in the career studies program to highlight to the students the connection between local demographics and the local economy. Julia described how she had noticed developments in the towns that appeared to be catering for seniors, and she described using this knowledge to bring local demographics to the students’ attention “trying to help them connect the dots…you know if you want to stay in this area maybe looking at fields in gerontology or pharmacy or look at the kinds of businesses your grandparents like to go to.”

The data provided evidence of Julia making connections at exosystem classification level with both direct and indirect impact upon the career studies program. The exosystem classification level that had direct impact upon the career studies program
included the loss of a university speaker and of a local employer, both of whom had previously contributed directly to the career studies program. The indirect impact had been felt by Julia from her knowledge of local demographics. She used this connection to highlight demographic issues to her students, helping them to see the connections between demographics and the potential impact upon employment opportunities. The next section of this chapter presents evidence of making connections at the macrosystem classification level.

**Making connections: Macrosystem classification.** When asked about what she knew of federal and provincial government responses to the global economic downturn, Julia used knowledge and experience of prior government actions and historical knowledge to make assumptions about current government responses. Julia also made connections between provincial initiatives and action she had witnessed being implemented in her local community.

Julia felt that there had perhaps been tax benefits for businesses as part of the federal response to the global economic downturn, explaining that “we have…a conservative government which is known to favour businesses…in favour of lowering taxes…to encourage business start ups.” Julia did not know a great deal about the Canadian Economic Action Plan and told me “I don’t know the specifics of it…it’s in the budget.” Julia raised the idea of being able to use the recent Canadian census in her career studies program “I was realizing that we had…a census…which will get results
within the next year, probably next summer, spring and that’ll be really interesting to look at some of those statistics.”

Responding to being asked about provincial responses to the global economic downturn, Julia described how one nearby town in the catchment area of her school had been hit hard: “two huge employers who have shut down.” Julia did not feel that there had been a specific provincial level response to situations like the one in her local town; she did know that “there was some re-training.” Julia described the stress this had placed upon the area saying “in terms of manufacturing positions…I don’t know where these people are working or what they are doing…I think it must be difficult…a lot of our kids, that’s our catchment area.” Julia did know about two provincial initiatives, one that she connected to being part of the Ontario government response to the global economic downturn, “all the public works projects that have been happening…well our town was torn up and that’s all good.” The second initiative Julia discussed “around in the local area, that a lot of people got excited about, was the rural…wind turbine project.” Julia did not know if this was specifically implemented as a response to the global economic downturn but she knew that it was an Ontario government project.

The data provides evidence of Julia using her knowledge of what governments have done in the past to influence what she perceived to be their response to the global economic downturn. Though she considers this macrosystem level environment and has knowledge of it, her knowledge of macrosystem classification issues had not been gained from macrosystem level sources; it had instead, been gained at microsystem and
mesosytem classification level sources. Julia made connections between what she saw happening in her community and what she assumed would be a typical government response based upon her knowledge of different political parties. The next section of this chapter provides evidence for the third theme, sourcing resources and tools.

**Sourcing resources and tools.**

Julia explained how locating the right resources were important to her career studies teaching, in particular her use of internet resources. Resource availability was often an issue, and Julia discussed how the loss of government produced literature had impacted upon her teaching. Julia explained the necessity of resources being available in electronic format allowing for her to adapt resources easily to meet her students’ needs. Constraints of delivering the career studies course over half a semester caused Julia to be selective in using tools and resources, and encouraged her to re-use resources that she felt had worked well previously.

**Sourcing resources and tools: Microsystem classification.** Using an example of how she drew upon her own expertise, Julia described to me an activity she used with the students where she had them interview their own parents. She described this activity as being introduced early in the career studies program, “you know, mom and dad if you were to choose again, what would you like about your job…your career…if you were able to choose again, what would you do now, now that you know what you do.” Julia explained that she believed we do not necessarily talk about these things with our children “it is very interesting to read these, and see what parents [say]…you see a lot of
dreams.” Julia believed that this activity helped to begin a dialogue between parents and students about careers and post-secondary destinations “you hope that they look that over with their parents.”

Julia made frequent use of her own experience and expertise, and that of her immediate family and colleagues. Her experience and expertise often influenced activities and guest speakers she selected for the career studies program. The next section of this chapter focuses on the evidence found for the mesosystem classification level of sourcing resources and tools.

**Sourcing resources and tools: Mesosystem classification.** Julia referred to obtaining resources for the career studies program from existing links, resources, and technology (indirect linkage). Julia also drew from in-school resources and local community (intersetting knowledge). Julia described how she valued using websites to allow students to “start to explore some…careers that are of interest…through some of those survey activities…Career Cruising is a website I really like to use…it is very user friendly for students…has great activities…some of those self-assessment tools.” Julia explained how “Career Cruising will suggest some occupations or career pathways that the student might be interested in.”

Identifying in-school resources Julia described books she used, “I’ve got a class set…with authentic work place…numeracy and…text pieces from different careers…so they’re authentic…work place documents that a person might [be] running across if you were…a shop clerk for instance.” Julia explained how it was valuable for the students to
“take a look” and for the students to find examples they can use to “try to find information.” Julia described how the students often need guidance and support with this, and how she encouraged them to think about “[what] would you be looking for…if you were looking for pharmacist’s aide…and…the technical language and things like that.” Julia added that she felt it important that students were given these types of activities, “again it’s exposure to connect the dots.”

Julia described how for some activities “I tone them down…sometimes these activities are a little bit too…academic maybe for them.” Julia explained that electronic resources made it easier for her to do this, adapting resources for use in an open level course. Julia explained the necessity for resources and tools to be available in electronic format so that she could adapt them to meet the needs of a diverse range of students. Resources and tools were most useful to Julia when she was able to use them to help her activities “come to life” making the career studies program more realistic for her students. The next section of this chapter outlines the evidence found in the data that was at macrosystem classification level.

**Sourcing resources and tools: Macrosystem classification.** Julia used a mixture of provincial, federal, and media sources to access resources for the career studies program (macrosystem classification). Julia described with sadness how a resource she had previously found invaluable for the career studies program had now been discontinued. As a resource for teachers Julia felt it was very effective, “There was a newspaper that used to come out…there were two…one was a provincial newspaper and
one was a federal publication…it was geared towards high school students…on careers. They stopped publishing…about two years ago.” Julia explained some of the content of the publications “[had] templates and samples, of correct resumes, [one] had different focuses on provinces and what the…labour market current opportunities are…it featured youth, it was all about and for youth.” Julia described how it was “a teaching tool…a teacher’s guide…came with it and was really great…you could order a class set.”

When asked about global issues, Julia expressed feeling that students “need to stay on top of this…depending on where they’re intending to go…I mean our kids will move all over the world.” Asking her to identify where she gained this knowledge, Julia described using “HRSDC [Human Resources and Skills Development Canada], other organizations in the community like that too, where I wouldn’t necessarily know the person but I would trust that they have the information that I need.” Julia also identified using “several websites…that’s the world the kids live in…Career Cruising…because it’s not Toronto-centric…they keep it current…the Ontario Skills Passport…we’ve got a…web quest activity that they do.” Julia also highlighted using the Conference Board of Canada as a resource, in particular “the old employability skills chart, which is also on the wall, because it’s a good foundation.”

Julia reported picking up knowledge as a resource from the news “CBC is great, sometimes CBS…and local news as well.” Julia said that “I know from listening to the radio that…our job statistics aren’t great, and in eastern Ontario they’re not great…particularly for youth.” Julia added “I can’t quote the numbers but I know last
week there was a lot of discussion…around an article that came out about suicide and depression in children, or youth.” Julia explained that the article had the “link being made to job prospects…and so forth and kids feeling trapped…without a lot of opportunities.”

Drawing on a recent conversation with her daughter, who was living and working in Australia, Julia spoke wistfully about the idea of using “smartboards and internet access [opening up new geographical sources of information through Skype]”, and she added “we should just Skype, you know we should have a session with you talking to the students about marketing in travel and tourism in…Australia, and the wonderful opportunities and gee that would be so cool.” Julia felt that this possibility was ‘right there at our fingertips” however, she acknowledged “[only] when the technology is working,” describing how in the past she had been timetabled to teach career studies in a portable classroom “where there is no technology at all.”

Though the data shows that Julia was incorporating macrosystem level classification issues into her teaching, she was not sourcing her knowledge from macrosystem level sources. Instead, Julia used micro and mesosystem classification level sources to inform her teaching practice. The next section of this chapter reports on data found that provides evidence of the final of the four overarching themes, relationship and networking.

**Relationships and Networking**

Julia spent considerable time networking to support her career studies teaching. Recognizing, creating, and acting upon opportunities to obtain guest speakers was a large
part of her preparation for teaching; she spoke of the need to constantly attend to this area because she recognized that guest speakers “come and go.” When discussing the use of guest speakers within the career studies program, Julia described how important it was that she could “trust” the guest speaker, and the content they would present to the students. Julia explained how she had to be confident that the guest speakers would give the students the “right information.” Julia also detailed how guest speakers volunteered their time, and that they were much more willing to come and speak to the students if they had built a relationship with her first. Often these relationships were established through her co-op teaching.

**Relationships and networking: Mesosystem classification.** Julia described using new connections with existing links (indirect linkage) when she had students, occasionally, take a sample résumé to employers for their inspection. “Sometimes I’ll take one [résumé], I’ll have a student take one out to an employer.” Julia reported that this sometimes resulted in an employer saying “there’s not enough information on it…they want more,” and that this would contradict what she was telling the students, “I [had] just told them to get away from that.” For Julia, such experiences highlighted how much things needed to be flexible and she was eager to explain how she tells the students “that it is really difficult…to put yourself out there…time and time again…so why don’t you have the best tool…it’s full time work to look for full time work.”

The biggest challenge for Julia came from using such a variety of guest speakers in the career studies program. Julia needed to ensure that the guest speakers were
imparting relevant information to her students. Building her network of guest speakers and, subsequently, building trusting relationships with her guest speakers allowed Julia to increase confidence that she was meeting this goal. At microsystem classification level, this had become a significant role within her teaching practice. The next part of this chapter reports evidence that fell into Bronfenbrenner classifications that overlapped.

**Overlaps Between Bronfenbrenner’s Classifications**

Julia illustrated a situation where she had used former students as guest speakers in the career studies program, and the example overlapped between the former students (microsystem classification) and new connections through existing links (mesosystem classification). Julia explained;

I have a former student who is a fireman now and he comes in and does…his first responder thing with the kids…we usually do this at the end because he brings in all the bells and whistles…he has a number of the students suit up…they get very excited, they love that.

Julia explained that though this exercise was a fun activity for the students, the guest speaker was able to discuss some important issues like working in environments where safety clothing is a necessity and the experience of undertaking the training for such occupations. “He’s young, and has recently been through the college program.” Julia drew on her own experience to describe how she uses this visit to talk about the difficulties of students getting jobs in particular trades and professions. “We say the
reality is you may be a volunteer firefighter and do this on the side for a very long time before you get a position as a full time firefighter.”

In another example of the use of guest speakers, Julia described how she chose “one example of somebody I sought out…I just thought OK this would be a good one…a police officer.” Julia once again drew on her own experience from the microsystem level but she also realised through making connections at the mesosystem classification that this guest speaker could speak to some much larger issues that might affect students in the future.

I had a student or two…maybe interested in policing…but that probably wouldn’t have been enough to bring him in. I realized if I asked him to also talk about…ways the young person…can…adversely or otherwise …affect their future career choices by getting into trouble with the law…that would be a really good things for the kids to hear…I kind of just put these strands together.

When discussing using résumés in the career studies program, Julia sourced information from her own individual and family experience (microsystem level) and by making new connections with employers as guest speakers (mesosystem classification). Julia was able to incorporate new knowledge into the career studies program “If I find out that there’s a little advantage like that [a new format for electronic résumés] that all came to me as knowledge along the way.” However, using guest speakers was not always a positive experience. Julia recalled a guest speaker who “did a presentation on
résumés…who I think had been accustomed to working with adults…and they just didn’t get to the kids’ level, or have an activity that was interesting for the students.”

The data presented in this overlap section shows that some of the evidence clearly overlapped the four overarching themes. Upon reflection I believe that much of the data presented in this chapter could be seen to overlap in some areas. Because Julia relied extensively on microsystem and mesosystem classification level sources to inform her teaching practice, they could be seen as subtle threads extending into almost all aspects of the data.

Use of subsequent inductive analysis of the data (after the initial deductive data analysis) allowed for the four overarching themes to emerge, aiding understanding of the participant teacher’s practice through her own words. The inductive analysis also enabled other unexpected findings to emerge from the data. The final part of this chapter presents these findings as emergent themes.

**Emergent Themes from the Data Analysis**

The emergent themes from the data analysis fell into three areas within an overall theme, complications in and challenges to the teacher’s career studies curriculum. The next section of this chapter presents evidence for this theme, and discusses how these three areas impacted upon the teacher’s career studies teaching.

**Complications in and Challenges to the Teacher’s Career Studies Curriculum**

**Time constraints.** Julia explained the restrictions upon her teaching time due to the careers studies course being a half credit course and illustrated this with descriptions
of some of the challenges she felt affected the career studies program. “There’s the reality of the…time of what you want to deliver or at least just twice as much as you…have time for.” Julia also described how she always needed to be mindful of meeting the expectations of the course, “there’s the curriculum…overall expectations that you work with.” She described the necessity of achieving this within tight time constraints, and how she found herself “picking and choosing…focussing on different areas.” Julia also explained the importance of “taking a look at who the kids are…how much time I might devote to…apprenticeships and OYAP and expand it by two or three university presentations or go to some that the Grade 12’s go to or whatever.” Julia stated;

I try to stay up to date with that stuff [changing contexts]…am I current enough for the kids and shooting for these, they’re Grade 10 kids, am I shooting for two to four years down the line?…I want…to meet their needs or try to meet their future needs…and it was only a little half credit course but I take this course so seriously.

**Meeting individual student’s needs.** The career studies program is an open level course resulting in a broad range of academic ability in the students undertaking the course. Julia described the necessity to meet individual student needs (especially in the most pressing cases of poor decision making about careers). Julia explained the difficulty of achieving this when there were many challenges for students trying to transition from school to further education, training or work.
Julia described to me that she felt distressed about a student who Julia felt had been influenced into making poor decisions about her future career;

I had a young lady…and it’s heartbreaking…she had a very appropriate career path chosen for herself…she had applied for this college program, it was appropriate, it was correct, it met her talents, not only her skills and…academic abilities…she was talented and very artistic.

Julia felt that the student initially had made appropriate choices for her post-secondary destination. Julia then described how “somebody got her ear and suggested she do something else that’s very math intensive. She’s not a math student at all…I was shocked when she told me.” Julia then described her response to this situation;

I went to her math [teacher], she happens to be in math this semester…and said we need to talk to her…I think she’s gonna spend a lot of money and become really discouraged and quite likely not succeed based on what I’m seeing.

Julia then outlined how after their discussion about the student the “math teacher spoke to [the student], sent her to guidance…and she freaked out.” Julia explained that the student wanted to make her own choices and expressed unhappiness at what she saw as interference from her teachers. Julia added that at that point the teachers had to “give it up” and allow the student to make her own decision.

Julia also described the challenge of supporting students in choosing career paths that were at odds with what the students’ parents were advising. She explained how this was sometimes an issue when students were planning courses for Grades 11 and 12;
They [the parents] don’t know what the courses are or what they are preparing them for. They don’t know that they don’t need certain things or their parents have said [to their children] take the hardest math; you’ve got to take the hardest math.

Julia added that for some students this results in them making inappropriate choices “it’s not the appropriate math for what they are going to be doing…college English…and some of the college math are exactly what they need…not engineering math.” Julia outlined how, in the career studies course and also in guidance services within the school, they try to support students making choices. “We try…once they have had a look at…careers and high school programs, and post-secondary…try and put all that together.”

Julia explained that this impact upon the order of how she delivers the career studies program “that’s one of those things that comes up for me and I toss it around and back and forth…what’ll we have them study first?” Julia described how she wrestles internally with the order of presentation of the career studies program, “do we tackle the high school program and courses…do we look at colleges and universities and the differences there and what the programs are…[or] do we start with looking at careers?”

**Challenges of using technology within the career studies program.** When asked about incorporating the use of information technology in the career studies program, Julia described how she faced difficulties at times due to limited technological resources. “In the past I have always taught in a classroom where there is no technology...
at all…so we had to move to the school, portable labs, we’re sitting out, we’re crowded here.” Julia considered the possibilities for the career studies program if she had access to Skype “it’s unbelievable, you…know [we] could…get all kinds of wonderful live streaming programs…all over the place…the world is so small and we know that our kids are going all over the place.” Julia described how she could create an activity for the students where “within our own group [I could ask students’] who do you know?” She could subsequently use the student’s knowledge to “actually do a map on the wall…where you [students’] know people, and where you’ve been.” Julia was excited by this possibility, describing it as an opportunity to get students to look beyond their immediate community. Julia added that she would also ask the students “if you have a relative who would talk to us from somewhere else from their career, [could you] bring them in without having to bring them in? [using Skype]”. Julia explained that “even in Ontario it’s a huge province with lots of variety and differences [there could be] somebody working in mining…or somebody you know…a former student who is working in Alberta oil fields.” Julia was certain that this could be possible, stating “I have those kids…I know I have those kids.”

Julia felt that using technology in this way was important “boy, we really need to get there…for the kids and to keep their interest.” Julia also described how she felt that; We’re in a different world and generation, I mean…I’m really old, and the young teachers coming in are a little more familiar with the technology and how to use it, but I think we need more in-services in appropriate use and embrace it.
Julia described the possibilities of using cellular phones, and stated that “the kids all have way more sophisticated [phones].” Julia also wondered how new technology would impact upon the future teaching of career studies, saying, “and I don’t know how we are gonna…when do we start to embed this technology…who are having to deal with that as…educators, I haven’t that figured.”

Summary of Challenges

The three emerging themes clearly present significant challenges to Julia. The guidance and career education curriculum in Ontario outlines expectations that information technology has a role in career studies programs (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2006, p. 25) and that the needs of individual students should be met (Ontario Ministry of Education, 2006, p. 20). Achieving these expectations within the boundary of a half credit course has encouraged Julia to develop her program in ways to circumnavigate these challenges. To incorporate the use of information technology, Julia has to plan ahead and book rooms where computers are available so that her students are able to complete activities from web based resources. Julia also made use of electronically available resources that could be easily adapted to meet individual students’ needs, making it possible for her to differentiate within the program. Julia often expressed that if the career studies program was full credit, this would offer the time and scope “to do more.”
Chapter Summary

This chapter provided an account from a teacher of career studies describing the teacher’s perceptions of the impact of the global economic downturn, and changes taking place in the economy, society, and job market. Also considered in this chapter was how these changes were reflected in the teachers teaching practice. The chapter reported unexpected themes that emerged during interview data analysis.

In the final chapter of this thesis, Chapter 6, the research questions are answered and the significant findings are discussed. The chapter also reflects upon the scope and the limitations of the study. Implications for future research are discussed.
CHAPTER 6
DISCUSSION AND IMPLICATIONS

This thesis has described and sought to understand how one teacher of compulsory career studies perceived (a) the impact of global economic downturn and (b) the impact of changes in the economy, society, and job market, and (c) how these changes were reflected in her teaching practice. The assumption was made that the global economic downturn had presented significant contextual challenge to the teaching of career studies. An additional assumption was that examination of one teacher’s experience within such context would shed light on the role a teacher has in bridging the gap between context and theory, and between policy and practice.

In Chapter 4, documents were analyzed through the heuristic lens of the policy cycle model (Howlett et al., 2009). The analysis described the policies and strategies that make up the Canadian and Ontario governments’ responses to the global economic downturn. The findings of Chapter 4 indicate that both the Canadian and Ontario governments had responded to the global economic downturn with similar strategies; for example, the Canadian government had developed Canada's Economic Action Plan (2010), and the Ontario government had developed the Open Ontario Plan for Jobs and Growth (2010). The Ministry of Education curriculum documents for guidance and career education included economy which was linked with students’ learning and the expectations of the curriculum.
In Chapter 5, the participant interview data were analyzed through the lens of Bronfenbrenner’s (1979) ecological systems theory. The analysis identified what the participant teacher knew about the policies and strategies described in Chapter 4, and how and from where she gained this knowledge. The analysis also described the teacher’s perceptions of the challenges faced by her career studies students’ seeking employment. In addition, the analysis documented what this knowledge (of current economic situation and any challenges it presented to the teacher’s local and wider community), contributed to her teaching of the compulsory career studies program.

The research findings start to address a gap in the literature of how a teacher’s perspective on teaching compulsory career studies within times of significant economic challenge has remained, to the best of my knowledge, unexplored. This final chapter begins to address that gap with discussion of the analyzed data through the lenses of policy cycle model and ecological systems theory. This chapter summarizes the data that responds to five research questions that were posed in Chapter 1: (a) what policies and strategies have been formulated and documented by Canada’s federal government and Ontario’s provincial government and Ministry of Education, which respond to the current global economic downturn; (b) what does the teacher know about these policies and strategies and their impact upon the teacher’s local and wider community; (c) how and from where has the teacher gained this knowledge; (d) what does the teacher perceive are the particular challenges in the local and wider economy for her students who are seeking employment; (e) what the knowledge of current economic situation and any challenges
presents to local and wider community contribute to the compulsory career studies program.

This chapter aims to meet the original purpose of this study: To contribute to both theory and practice in the field of career education, and to contribute to teacher professional development.

**Answering the First Research Question**

**What Policies and Strategies had been Formulated and Documented by Canada’s Federal Government and Ontario’s Provincial Government and Ministry of Education, in Response to the Current Economic Downturn?**

Policy cycle model asserts that it is an applied problem-solving model of the policy process (Howlett, Ramesh & Perl, 2009). In the *agenda setting* stage problems come to the attention of governments; in the *policy formulation* stage policy options are articulated; in the *decision making* stage a course of action is decided upon; in the *policy implementation* stage, polices are acted upon and put into effect; and, in the *evaluation* stage, the results of the polices are monitored and acted upon by both governments and other actors involved in the implementation process.

Documents were searched for evidence of origins of development, implementation, and evaluation of the career studies program. Documents were also searched for evidence of the response strategies made by Canadian and Ontario governments in response to the global economic downturn. The next section of this chapter discusses what the data revealed within the five stages of the policy cycle model.
**Agenda Setting Stage**

The data showed that responses to the global economic downturn by the federal and provincial governments were alike, with strong similarities in descriptions of agenda themes in all documents examined. The fragile state of global economic recovery was frequently referred to, and this was used to both highlight Canada’s relatively strong economic position, and to provide a rationale for ongoing stimulus initiatives by both Canadian and Ontario governments. Both governments linked the necessity of a skilled workforce for recovery from the global economic downturn, using terminology like continuous learning and the subsequent achievement of economic growth (CAN3 and ONT4). All of the guidance and career education policy and curriculum documents examined emphasized students’ developing essential, basic and transferable skills (MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE5, MOE8). The rationale presented for this was the necessity to prepare students for a changing world suggesting that as the “pace of change accelerates” (MOE1, section 2.1) acquisition of these skills is necessary for educational, societal, and career success in the twenty first century (MOE2). The guidance and career education documents also proposed that students’ should be prepared to meet societal needs, linking acquisitions of desirable skills with successful transitions into post-secondary destinations and beyond.

**Policy Formulation**

Consideration of home policy within the global arena was seen in the Canadian government documents; for example, Canada’s position of relative economic strength
was emphasized in comparison to the weaker positions of other G-7 nations. When future development opportunities were presented by Canadian and Ontario governments’, they were linked with ongoing fragility of global and national economies. The advantages of coordination and collaboration were represented in all three strands of documents. In the government documents, cooperation and collaboration were seen as essential for the future economic success of the nation. In the Ministry of Education documents, cooperation and collaboration were seen as necessary for successful implementation of the career studies program. The Canadian government stated that a key lesson of the global financial crisis was that policies matter, however limited evidence was provided of the range of policies that might have been considered at the policy formulation stage.

The necessity for students to be prepared for living in a fast paced society driven by continual change was seen throughout the curriculum documents, and may have influenced how policy was formulated. This theme was also revealed in the government documents, which frequently referred to the global economy’s uncertainty and fluidity. The data showed a strong association between the career studies program expectations and the economic, political, social, cultural, educational, and labour market contexts revealed in the government documents. This reflection was put forward by Watts and Sultana (2000) as being expected in many nations where career education is seen as a “public good.”
Decision Making

Links between the government documents and the ministry curriculum documents were seen to some extent in the three themes society and community, investment, and legislative. However, the strongest theme was economy, which was prominent throughout all sample documents. The strength of economy as a theme reveals its influence within the decision making stage. The economy theme had three areas of focus, employment, education, and support, and the three areas frequently overlapped in the government documents. One document for example, connected job sharing, re-training, and legislation to implement tax cuts. In the Ministry documents, the emphasis was directed towards education, with some attention also given to support.

Often education and support were linked, in particular when curriculum for special education was defined. In research undertaken in 2000, Watts described how career development services usually linked education and training to the labour market. Descriptions seen in the documents where learning outcomes were linked with future workforce needs supported Watt’s claim. The data showed that within the decision making stage, the policy contexts of all documents examined shared similar priorities, employment, education, and support. Their role in supporting the economy supported Herr’s (2003) assertion that in a global economy, a nation’s major asset is a workforce that it skilled, employable, and productive.
Policy Implementation

The Canadian and Ontario government documents presented initiatives implemented as responses to the global economic downturn of 2008. However, initiatives were often described as ongoing, and were at differing stages of implementation. Leadership was often referred to in the Ontario Ministry of Education documents, and the role of leadership as a facilitator of successful implementation of the guidance and career education curriculum was clearly defined. Much less was said about the role of leadership in the government documents. The government documents contained generic descriptions of the governments’ response to the global economic downturn, seemingly preferring to present the government as a whole being responsible for implementation, rather than identifying individual leadership roles within government.

Desirable outcomes were a strong theme in the Ministry curriculum documents, but they were less explicit in the documents describing government initiatives. Instead, the language used in the government documents implied a positive outcome, like “Canada will emerge from the recession with a stronger economic advantage than before.”

The Canadian and Ontario government documents did not provide specifics of actor involvement; however the Ontario Ministry of Education documents provided clearer data defining actors’ roles and responsibilities for implementation of the career studies program.
Policy Evaluation

Policy evaluation was not mentioned in either the Canadian or Ontario government documents. A clearly defined procedure for evaluation of the career studies curriculum was outlined in five of the eight Ontario Ministry of Education documents. In particular, the policy document (*Choices into Action: Guidance and Career Education Policy: Grades 1 to 12, Detailed discussion document, 1998*), detailed the program evaluation requirements including roles and responsibilities of specific actors responsible for policy implementation.

Limitations of Document Analysis

Completion of the document analysis enabled identification of strategies and initiatives implemented by the Canadian and Ontario governments as responses to the global economic downturn. The findings were a useful precursor to the interviews with the participant teacher, as the teacher could be asked about her knowledge of specific initiatives. The document analysis also revealed the current economic context together with its factors of influence, within which the career studies program is being taught. However, searches for documents uncovered a plethora of information that could have been part of the document analysis, and the 13 documents analyzed represent a limited perspective.
Limitations of Policy Cycle Model

A disadvantage of using the policy cycle model is that policy-making can be misunderstood as a cyclical, systematic process (Howard, 2005). In reality, the awareness of problems, decisions made to respond to those problems, and subsequent implementation of responses, is often an ad-hoc process which is rarely smooth and systematic (Howlett, et al. 2009). In addition, the use of policy cycle model as a theoretical framework for document analysis had other limitations. The documents presented a limited lens on the policy making cycle, documents are representative of policy once it has reached implementation stage, and the preceding stages of the policy cycle model for the policy described in the documents analyzed remains largely unexplored. The documents also offered a limited lens on the policy actors involved in the policy cycle model. Some identification of actor involvement could be concluded where documents detailed roles and responsibilities, however these were for the policy implementation and evaluation stages, and conclusions were not possible for the preceding stages of the policy cycle model. Nevertheless, the documents contained data that could be indicative of the preceding stages, and conclusions were made about the agenda, policy formulation, and decision making phases of the policy cycle model.

Defining a “Changing World”

Many of the documents examined contained reference to a “changing world.” Statements about students’ preparation for successful integration into “fast paced and fast changing world” were common themes throughout the curriculum documents, which
were dated from 1998 on. The “changing world” theme was also seen in the Canadian and Ontario government documents, four of which were dated 2010. The “changing world” as a rationale has not differed within the 12 year time span of the documents that were analyzed. None of the documents analyzed defined what they perceived “changing world” to mean.

**Ecological Systems Theory**

The use of ecological systems theory was intended to provide a clear framework within which to examine influences on the career studies teacher beyond policy. It was hoped that this examination would reveal the source of the teacher’s knowledge, with a focus on looking at how something happens (Patton, 2002). This section of the final chapter discusses and analyzes the findings from Chapter 5, the interview data with the participant teacher. The discussion and analysis in this section is presented as responses to the original research questions of this study.

**Answering the Second and Third Research Questions**

**What Does the Teacher Know About the Policies and Strategies Outlined in Chapter 4 and their Impact Upon her Local and Wider Community?**

The interview data showed that Julia saw a connection between macro level policies and strategies and an impact in her local community. Even though she was unable to name specific government policy and strategies, Julia talked about initiatives she had seen in her local community and recognized these as part of government response to economic downturn. Julia emphasized the importance of her students’ also being able
to make these connections and relied on the up to date knowledge of guest speakers in the career studies program to help her achieve this. Julia showed awareness of the limits of her own knowledge but this was reconciled with her feeling that this was “OK…because I’m aware that it’s huge and it’s changing all the time.” Julia reflected on how it had been easier to keep her knowledge of macro level issues up to date when the government publications targeted at providing career information for youth were still in publication. Julia shared her feeling that responses by federal and provincial governments to the global economic downturn were influenced by the political nature of the party in power. She felt that as Canada currently had a Conservative government in power, tax advantages would be part of government response to the global economic downturn stating that conservatives were “in favour of lowering taxes.” Julia had limited knowledge of federal and provincial policies and strategies, though she acknowledged their existence and saw that they were connected to the career studies curriculum. The demands of her teaching roles meant that Julia had limited opportunity to extend her knowledge of these topics.

**Sources of Julia’s knowledge.** The data showed that Julia’s knowledge came almost entirely from microsystem and mesosystem levels. At the microsystem level, Julia relied upon her own experience and expertise, the experience and expertise of colleagues, and her own knowledge of the local community. At the mesosystem level, the data revealed that Julia used guest speakers, networking with post-secondary providers, her other teaching roles, and her role within her local community to source information about
the macro level policies and strategies described in Chapter 4. These sources were available to Julia within her normal teaching roles and within her normal daily routines; however, Julia did not seek additional sources outside of these sources.

**Answering the Fourth Research Question**

**What Challenges are there in the Teacher’s Local and Wider Community for Students that are Seeking Employment?**

The data showed that Julia felt students were susceptible to conflicting advice from school and parents when it came to making choices that would impact upon their future career paths. Julia described situations in which she felt parents did not understand either the requirements of the curriculum, or which programs would be most suitable for their children’s academic capability. Julia knew the local economy had been affected by the global economic downturn and described local business closures. Julia understood the consequent impact upon the students at her school. She described increased use of her school’s breakfast club, saying “Those kids are hungry”. Julia linked this with high unemployment in a nearby town, explaining how the location of the affected town was in her school’s catchment. The data showed Julia’s awareness of local demographics, and subsequent influence upon local businesses and services. Julia explained feeling how important it was that students understood these types of connections. Julia discussed the students’ challenges in general terms, but she did not make links to specific challenges in the labour market.
**Sources of Julia’s knowledge.** The data showed that for Julia, residing in her school’s local community, together with her role as a co-operative (co-op) education teacher in this community, were the primary microsystem and mesosystem sources of knowledge and information that informed her work in the career studies program. The data also highlighted how Julia frequently shared experience and expertise (at mircosystem level) with colleagues about local and wider community issues, and Julia described the importance of being “open to this.” The local media was a further mesosystem level source for Julia, sometimes through her direct interaction, and sometimes through listening to colleagues’ descriptions of local community issues reported. Julia rarely sourced information at macrosystem level about future employment challenges faced by her students. Again, she encountered her sources of information in her daily activities as a citizen, and as an educator interacting with those around her.

**Answering the Fifth Research Question**

**What does Knowledge of the Current Economic Situation and any Challenges it Presents to Local and Wider Community Contribute to the Career Studies Program?**

Julia’s knowledge of the economic situation and related challenges presented to her local and wider community influenced her teaching of the career studies program in a number of ways. Julia reflected on how her experience and expertise affected her attitude towards teaching the program. She felt that the career studies program had the potential to support students’ in making future choices about their careers, and had the potential to
help the students see the connections between what was happening in the local and wider communities and the consequences this could have upon their career aspirations. Julia used local demographics to illustrate this, and described an activity with her students that required them to consider local demographics and their impact upon local businesses and services. Julia described how she used examples like this to highlight to students the types of employment opportunities that might be open to them if they wished to continue to live and work locally. Julia suggested that developing students’ skills to help them with strategies to secure future employment was an important part of the career studies program. She explained that the challenging environment had made this even more vital. Her knowledge of the current context and its challenges informed Julia’s discussions with students about local career opportunities.

Sources of Julia’s knowledge. Julia used knowledge of macrosystem level issues to inform her teaching practice but she did not source knowledge from macrosystem level sources. Instead, she relied on microsystem level through utilization of her own experience and expertise and that of her colleagues. She also used mesosystem and exosystem level sources, depending on the use of guest speakers and networking with post-secondary institutions. Consistent with the findings already discussed, Julia relied on her daily encounters to inform her work in career studies.
Emergent Themes from Data Analysis

Complications in and Challenges to the Teacher’s Career Studies Curriculum

Three themes emerged from the data: time constraints, meeting individual student’s needs, and the challenges of using technology within the career studies program.

Time constraints. Julia explained how she felt the half-credit course forced her to be selective in course content, and juggle the necessity to meet the expectations of the course with the needs of her cohort of students, within a very tight time frame. Coburn (2004) reported how “regulative pressures place technical limits on decision making, creating pressures and priorities that teachers feel they must respond to in some fashion” (p. 235). For Julia, this constraint resulted in a constant struggle “I toss it around and back and forth,” as she sought to fit new ideas and methods into the career studies program.

Meeting individual student’s needs. The open course stature of the career studies program resulted in students of all levels of academic ability taking the course at any one time. Julia explained the unique challenges this presented for the teaching of career studies as she attempted to meet the individual needs of her students. Julia described how she had to make sense of what her students needed, align this with the expectations of the career studies curriculum, incorporate relevant contextual knowledge, and deliver the most appropriate course. As she managed this, Julia adopted a role of sense maker each time she taught the career studies program. Spillane and Miele (2007)
define sense-making as “a set of cognitive processes that encompass interpretation” (p. 49). From a sense-making perspective, stimuli must be selected from the environment before they can be interpreted (Weick, 1995). Sense-making has been described as being fraught with ambiguity and difficulties. Thus there is the potential for numerous opportunities, (aside from any deliberate intention to manipulate or revise policy to fit with individual or local agendas), for Julia to follow a unique process of interpretation based upon her rich knowledge base of already developed understandings, beliefs and attitudes (Spillane, Reiser & Reimer, 2002).

**Challenges of using technology within the career studies program.** Julia reported how she faced difficulties at times to incorporate the use of information technology (IT) into her teaching of career studies. Julia explained that she usually taught career studies in a classroom where there was no access to IT, and that she was required to book rooms ahead of time if IT resources were needed. Julia’s situation concurs with research undertaken by Taylor (2007) who concluded that four provinces of Canada (British Columbia, Alberta, Ontario, and Newfoundland and Labrador) were struggling with the need to constantly update the technology curriculum and facilities, suggesting availability of technology resources were likely to impact upon the program that could be offered in career studies.

**Julia’s Particular Teaching Role**

Julia’s shared teaching responsibilities as a co-op education, business and marketing, and career studies teacher placed her in a unique position to share relevant
knowledge and expertise across her teaching duties, using one teaching role to inform another. Julia explained how she felt this gave her an advantage over two of her colleagues who also taught career studies in school, describing how they taught subjects unrelated to career studies as their main teaching subject. Julia felt that often, the teaching of career studies was allocated to teachers as a fill-in course, the half-credit status lending itself to this. Julia gave many examples of how she had utilized her co-op education teaching for the career studies course, identifying that the experience and expertise she used for teaching both courses complemented each other.

**Informal leadership.** Scrutiny of the data that described Julia’s teaching role revealed that Julia exhibited a number of characteristics that suggested she had adopted an informal leadership role through her career studies teaching practice. Larsson, Segersteen, and Svensson (2011), suggest that characteristics of an informal leadership role are: knowledge brokering (Larsson et al., 2011); communication and information management (Pielstick, 2000); sense-making (Weick, 1995); and being part of a community of practice (Wenger, 1998). The data support that Julia was acting as a knowledge broker when she pieced together knowledge from a variety of sources for the career studies program. The constraints of the career studies program influenced Julia’s “picking and choosing” of the program content, causing her to select and manage information, making sense of individual student needs and the expectations of the curriculum along the way. The relationships and networking, undertaken by Julia to
support her career studies teaching, had resulted in Julia becoming part of a community of practice consisting of her colleagues, guest speakers, and post-secondary institutions.

**Limitations of Ecological Systems Theory in this Study**

Bronfenbrenner (2001) proposed that human development was influenced by multiple interdependent interactions between an individual and his or her environment at different ecological levels (i.e., family, community, school, work, society, culture, and legislative). In applying Bronfenbrenner’s theory to the data, I found that often there was overlap resulting in data being placed in more than one classification. In addition, there were data that did not clearly fit into any of Bronfenbrenner’s classifications, and as a result classifying the data according to this theory felt somewhat forced or artificial.

**Extending Findings of Reviewed Literature**

Much of the research reviewed for this study argued that guidance and career education could be seen as serving a “public good” and the value of career education and services in supporting youth with school-to-work transition was widely accepted. By making career studies a compulsory element of the Ontario curriculum, the Ministry of Education has concurred with this argument. However, as Herr (2003) claims, where public policy and legislation support career counselling, “resources should be used to build tailored, effective, and evidence-based responses to the career needs that are represented.” The findings of this study show that by making the careers studies program a half-credit course, with the constraints a half-credit course imposes, it is difficult for a teacher to incorporate tailored responses that meet the individual needs of all students. In
addition, the participant teacher reported that some teachers and students saw the course as having less importance than other courses in the curriculum due to its half-credit status.

The literature reviewed in Chapter 2 presented a strong argument that career education cannot be separated from economic, social, cultural, educational, and labour market contexts (Hannan, Raffe & Smythe, 1996; Watts, 1996; Watts & Sultana, 2003). The findings in this study show that the global economic downturn had impacted on the local economic situation in the geographic area of this study. In addition, the global economic downturn had added complexity to the labour market context of career studies. Acknowledging that these environments cannot be separated from the teaching of career studies, the onus is on the teacher to find ways to keep updated on such issues.

In his reflections on undertaking comparative studies of career education across different nations, Sweet (2004) reported that there appeared to be little explanation of how the nature and timing of career interventions (i.e., career education) are related to a nation’s stage of economic development or its present labour market state. It is difficult to conclude that the current Ontario career studies curriculum (which was most recently revised in 2006), is directly related to the labour market state that has existed in Canada and Ontario since the start of the global economic downturn which began in 2008 (OECD, 2010). In what appears to be an effort to be all encompassing, the career studies curriculum relies on loose, generic language to describe the economy and labour market, leaving interpretation to the teacher.
Possible variances in teacher interpretation of the curriculum could contribute to Taylor’s (2007) argument that institutional and policy structures affect the ability of high school students to find learning and career pathways that lead to success in the labour market. Quintini, Martin and Martin (2007) report finding that skills acquired by students are not necessarily well adapted to the needs of the labour market. The open level structure of the career studies program causes a mixed cohort of students with differentiated academic abilities, and a variety of goals for post-secondary destinations. How well the career studies teacher understands demographics, the distribution of occupations in the economy, and current labour market status can impact upon how well he or she can facilitate the connection between skills and labour market needs for the students. The findings of this study also suggest that parents influence student choices (although parents may not be current in their knowledge of labour market needs) and could also contribute to students’ adaptation of their skills to labour market needs.

Implications

Implications of the Context of this Study

This study was conducted in a small rural town in eastern Ontario. The results of this study may have looked very different if conducted in another area within Ontario. A teacher located in a dense urban area (for example, Toronto) would be exposed to a greater diversity of cultural backgrounds and experiences within their student cohort, colleagues, peer groups, and local business demographics.
Implications for Methodology

Chapter 3 of this study, on methodology, described the approach used for the collection and analysis of documents to answer the first research question, and to inform the interviews with the participant teacher. The body of literature used to inform Chapter 3 illustrated how both deductive and inductive approaches could be used for document analysis. However, as noted by Segeren (2011), methodological sources about document analysis and papers that have used document analysis often fail to provide detailed descriptions all the steps required to analyze policy and strategy documents. Without detailed guidance from the literature, and in order to meet the purpose of document analysis in this study, an adaptive approach was necessary, which combined deductive and inductive analysis.

Initial searches for documents revealed a plethora of material that had potential relevance for this study, and it was necessary to be highly selective of documents at this early stage of analysis. Setting a search boundary was imperative as it helped to reduce the number of documents analyzed. The use of the policy cycle model as a framework for initial deductive analysis began to answer the first research question, developing an understanding of the policy cycle of the documents produced by Canadian and Ontario governments, and Ontario Ministry of Education. However, the findings from deductive analysis were broad and lacked the detail needed to fully respond to the research question.
Undertaking further inductive analysis allowed for deeper scrutiny of the documents and for more meaningful themes to emerge. Combining deductive and inductive methods proved to be a lengthy, time consuming process however, and it was difficult to find literature to guide the textural interpretation and analysis. I would concur with Segeren (2011) in that broadly speaking, document analysis is a somewhat neglected area of qualitative research, and is in need of greater exploration. This would help to provide direction for those undertaking document analyses, and might enhance the legitimacy of its use within qualitative research.

**Implications for Policy**

Julia’s role as sense maker of the career studies program has implications for the career studies curriculum as a form of policy. Coburn (2001) noted a promising new strand of research in the mid 1990’s that pointed to teacher’s professional communities as important sites for making meaning, highlighting the ways in which local teacher communities can form powerful micro cultures. The data in this study demonstrated how Julia had networked and formed relationships with colleagues and guest speakers, which she used to source experience and expertise, and to begin to form her own micro culture. Coburn suggested that the teacher could have an important role outside of the formal organizational structures, interacting with others to make sense of messages from the environment, and shaping how the teacher constructs meanings into classroom practice. Policy could be used to extend the ways career studies teachers are able to participate in these types of collaborative micro cultures, and provide greater access to knowledge.
resources. This would be particularly useful for career studies teachers who do not have complementary teaching subjects like co-op education that lend themselves to creation of micro cultures.

A further consideration for compulsory career studies programs that comprise half-credit courses is to consider extending the program to become a full-credit course. Teachers would then have far greater flexibility to follow Herr’s (2003) recommendations that “resources should be used to build tailored, effective, and evidence-based responses to the career needs that are represented” (p. 15).

Finally, deliberation should be given to policy dissemination. Delaney (2002) argued that policy dissemination was a vital aspect of the policy process, because it was imperative that those involved in policy implementation know the various intricacies of the policy. Teaching to the career studies curriculum presents particular challenges for policy dissemination, as expectations require that teachers help students to see connections between their learning and the wider economy (which is constantly changing). The ability of teachers to stay current in this type of knowledge depends upon the timely availability of appropriate knowledge and expertise. This can easily be overlooked in the educational environment, where time is an especially rare and precious commodity for career studies teachers that are required to teach the course alongside their other subject specialism.
Implications for Practice

Julia felt the loss of the federal and provincial government-produced resources in her career studies teaching. Julia spoke highly of these resources, explaining how they had helped her to help her students. That the global economic downturn coincided with the withdrawal of the resources meant Julia lost easily accessed information that supported her teaching at a time when the complexity of the local and wider economic community increased. It was clear that Julia had not conducted research to locate current documents to replace these government-produced resources. Replacement of these resources could provide teachers of career studies with a straightforward method of providing students with up to date macrosystem level knowledge.

In-service training was described by Julia as an invaluable support when there were changes to the curriculum. She reported feeling sad that this type of support was only available for career studies teachers when a new curriculum or substantial change to the curriculum was introduced. Ongoing in-service training could be used to scaffold teachers’ knowledge of changes in the economy and labour market, and to provide an opportunity for teachers to engage in communities of practice with fellow career studies teachers. This might ensure robust, current, and evidence based responses to students’ career needs.

Implications for Further Research

This study has limitations. It is not possible to generalize the findings of this single case to all career studies teachers (Cohen, Manion & Morrison, 2007). It would
therefore, be advantageous to undertake additional case studies with other career studies teachers located in Ontario and in other jurisdictions to establish whether it is possible to further substantiate the findings of this study.

It would also be useful to undertake additional case studies with career studies teachers that teach co-op education. This would help to create a clearer picture of how the two teaching roles can complement and support each other. Case studies of career studies teachers with a teaching subject other than co-op education could be used to explore whether adopting an informal leadership role is a unique phenomenon facilitated through being a teacher of career studies and co-op education. Case study examination of informal leadership roles adopted by career studies teachers would respond to Larsson, Segersteen and Svensson’s (2011) call for further exploration of other potential functions of informal leadership through more fieldwork and case studies.

Research that examines the definition of “changing world” within the context of career studies teaching would allow for better understanding of what this means within the expectations of the career studies curriculum. Improved understanding could be used to shape professional development activities and resources and to support career studies teachers’ roles as sense makers and policy disseminators. The notion of sense-making has been linked with leadership rather than with a formal management role (Pye, 2005); therefore, more research on informal leadership roles could enrich the field of leadership generally (Larsson, Segersteen & Svensson, 2011).
References


Toronto, ON: Thomson Nelson


Employment, Labour and Social Affairs employment, Labour and Social Affairs Committee


165


# Appendix A

## List of Documents Examined

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Document code</th>
<th>Title of document</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAN1</td>
<td>Speech from the Throne: A Stronger Canada, A Stronger Economy: Now and for the Future</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAN2</td>
<td>Canada’s Economic Action Plan Year 2: The Budget in Brief 2010: Leading the Way on Jobs and Growth</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAN3</td>
<td>Canada’s Global Economic Leadership: A Report to Canadians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONT3</td>
<td>Realizing Potential Our Children, Our Youth, Our Future: Ontario Ministry of Children and Youth Service Strategic Framework 2008-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ONT4</td>
<td>Open Ontario Ontario’s Plan for Jobs and Growth: 2010 Ontario Budget – Budget Speech</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE1</td>
<td>Choices into Action: Guidance and Career Education Policy Grades 1 to 12: Detailed Discussion Document</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE2</td>
<td>Choices into Action: Guidance and Career Education: Program Policy for Ontario Elementary and Secondary Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE3</td>
<td>Ontario Secondary Schools Grades 9 to 12: Program and Diploma Requirements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE4</td>
<td>The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 and 10: Program Planning and Assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE5</td>
<td>The Ontario Curriculum Grades 9 and 10: Guidance and Career Education (Revised 2006)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE6</td>
<td>The Ontario Curriculum Exemplars Grade 10: Guidance and Career Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE7</td>
<td>Education Policy and Program Update to April 30th 2010: A Guide to Changes and Additions to Ontario Secondary Schools, Grades 9 to 12: Program and Diploma Requirements, 1999</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE8</td>
<td>Reach Every Student: Energizing Ontario Education</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B

Ethics Clearance Letter

December 16, 2010

Ms. Lorraine Godden
Master’s Student
Faculty of Education
Duncan McArthur Hall
Queen’s University

Dear Ms. Godden:

GREB Ref #: GEDUC-535-10
Title: “Navigating Compulsory Career Studies in Times of Local and Global Economic Challenge: A Teacher’s Experience in Eastern Ontario”

The General Research Ethics Board (GREB), by means of a delegated board review, has cleared your proposal entitled “Navigating Compulsory Career Studies in Times of Local and Global Economic Challenge: A Teacher’s Experience in Eastern Ontario” for ethical compliance with the Tri-Council Guidelines (TCPS) and Queen’s ethics policies. In accordance with the Tri-Council Guidelines (article D.1.6) and Senate Terms of Reference (article G), your project has been cleared for one year. At the end of each year, the GREB will ask if your project has been completed and if not, what changes have occurred or will occur in the next year.

You are reminded of your obligation to advise the GREB, with a copy to your unit REB, if applicable, of any adverse event(s) that occur during this one year period (details available on webpage http://www.queensu.ca/ors/researchethics/GeneralREB/forms.html – Adverse Event Report Form). An adverse event includes, but is not limited to, a complaint, a change or unexpected event that alters the level of risk for the researcher or participants or situation that requires a substantial change in approach to a participant(s). You are also advised that all adverse events must be reported to the GREB within 48 hours.

You are also reminded that all changes that might affect human participants must be cleared by the GREB. For example you must report changes in study procedures or implementations of new aspects into the study procedures on the Ethics Change Form that can be found at http://www.queensu.ca/ors/researchethics/GeneralREB/forms.html - Research Ethics Change Form. These changes must be sent to the Ethics Coordinator, Gail Irving, at the Office of Research Services or irvinge@queensu.ca prior to implementation. Mrs. Irving will forward your request for protocol changes to the appropriate GREB reviewers and / or the GREB Chair.

On behalf of the General Research Ethics Board, I wish you continued success in your research.

Yours sincerely,

Joan Stevenson, PhD
Professor and Chair
General Research Ethics Board

c.c.: Dr. Nancy Hutchinson, Faculty Supervisor
Dr. Lesly Wade-Woolley, Chair, Unit REB
E-REB: c/o Graduate Studies & Bureau of Research, Attn.: Celina Caswell

JS/gi

168
LETTER OF INFORMATION

Date:

Dear:

Navigating compulsory career studies in times of local and global economic challenge:

A teacher’s experience in Eastern Ontario, Canada

My name is Lorraine Godden and I am inviting you to participate in research for my thesis. This thesis is part of my Master of Education program at Queen’s University and focuses on compulsory careers studies programs for high school students. The research requires me to conduct interviews with a teacher of compulsory career studies and observations of his or her teaching practice. This study has been granted clearance according to the recommended principles of Canadian ethics guidelines, and Queen’s policies.

The overall goals of this research are to understand and describe how a teacher uses the compulsory half credit career studies course to help young people prepare and navigate towards working life in times of global and local economic challenge. The first goal of the study is to describe the response to the current global recession by the Canadian federal government and Ontario provincial government through analysis of key documents. The second goal of the study is to ascertain the local community and global economic awareness of a high school career studies teacher. The third goal is to gain insight on how the teacher gains local and global economic awareness and how this translates into his or her teaching practice. Through your participation in this study I intend to describe how you use knowledge and understanding of the economic environment to inform your teaching practice, and to support your students with their school to work transition.

If you agree to participate, I will interview you four times and each interview will be approximately 45 to 60 minutes in length each and will be audio-recorded. The total time you will be required for interview will not exceed four hours. The interviews will take place over a four week period. Two observations of classes that you teach will be observed and field notes will be taken. No student will be identified from the field notes. Interviews and observations will take place in the school where you work. I will be observing how you impart information to the students with regard to local and global economic contexts. I will prepare a verbatim transcription of the interview, concealing your identity and the identity of people that you might
mention through the course of the interview by using fictitious names. I will use the same fictitious name in place of your real name in my final thesis as I do on the transcript. To the extent possible we will keep your responses confidential. Only my thesis supervisor, committee, and I will have access to this information. The data may also be published in professional journals or presented at scientific conferences, but any such presentations will be of general findings and will not breach individual confidentiality.

Through e-mail I will provide you with a copy of the transcripts for you to review and respond to if there are corrections to be made to my transcript. The paper documents will be filed securely in a locked filing cabinet, the audio-recordings erased, and the computer files will be stored with encrypted protection. As is customary in Queen’s Faculty of Education, data will be retained for a minimum of five years, after which it will be destroyed. You may choose not to answer any question that you find objectionable or that makes you uncomfortable in any way. There are no foreseeable risks, and your participation is entirely voluntary. I will benefit from your participation in this interview but you should not feel compelled to participate if you do not wish to participate. Also, you may withdraw at any time, with no effect on (a) your standing in school if a student, (b) any contractual or other relationships with the investigator if he or she is a client, or (c) his or her future care if a patient, and you may request that all your data be removed and destroyed.

Any questions about study participation may be directed to Lorraine Godden at (613 272 3056 or lorraine.godden@queensu.ca), or my thesis supervisor, Dr. Nancy Hutchinson at (613-533-3025 or hutchinn@queensu.ca). Any ethical concerns about the study may be directed to the Chair of the General Research Ethics Board at 613-533-6081 or chair.GREB@queensu.ca.

If you agree to participate in this research, please sign the accompanying consent forms, returning one copy to me and retaining the second copy for your records.

Lorraine Godden
CONSENT FORM

Dear

Navigating compulsory career studies in times of local and global economic challenge:
A teacher's experience in Eastern Ontario, Canada

If you are willing to participate in this thesis research, please sign one copy of this Consent Form and return it to Lorraine Godden. Retain the second copy for your records.

I have read the description of the research exercise as contained on the Letter of Information and I understand that the purpose of the study is to understand and describe how a teacher uses the compulsory half credit career studies course to help young people prepare and navigate towards working life in times of global and local economic challenge.

I understand that my participation in the research interview is voluntary, that I may withdraw at any time, that the information I provide will be treated as confidential, and that my identity will be protected to the extent possible. I also understand that the 45-60 minute interviews will be audio-recorded in order that a transcription can be prepared, and that the audio-recording will be erased, notes will be filed securely in locked filing cabinets, and computer files will be stored under password protection. I understand that I will be required to be available for interview for no more than four hours and that two of my teaching sessions may be observed. In accordance with Queen’s policy, data will be retained for a minimum of five years after which it will be destroyed. Should data be used for secondary analysis, it will contain no identifying information. I understand that my identity will be protected to the extent possible by the use of a fictitious name, and all identifying features (e.g., name of workplace) will be removed. I also understand that a draft copy of the student researcher’s transcripts will be provided for me to check for accuracy.

I understand that I will not be expected to answer any questions that might make me feel uncomfortable or that I find objectionable. I understand that I may withdraw from the interview at any time, without pressure or consequence of any kind, and that I may request that all or part of my data be removed and destroyed.
I understand my participation is voluntary, and I am free to withdraw with no effect on (a) my standing in school if a student, (b) any contractual or other relationships with the investigator if a client, or (c) his or her future care if a patient.

Any questions about study participation may be directed to Lorraine Godden, 613-272-3056 or lorraine.godden@queensu.ca; thesis supervisor, Dr. Nancy Hutchinson 613-533-3025 or hutchin@queensu.ca. Any ethical concerns about the study may be directed to Chair of the Queen’s University General Research Ethics Board 613-533-6081 or chair.GREB@queensu.ca

Participant’s name: ____________________________________

Signature: __________________________________________

Please provide an e-mail address for you to review the transcription and the interpretation:

__________________________________

Date ________________________________

Please sign one copy of this Consent Form and return to Lorraine Godden.
Retain the second copy for your records
Appendix D
Interview Instrument

Interview questions: These were split over four interviews with time allowed at the end of each interview for researcher to clarify answers and ask additional questions to clarify/expand answers

I began by introducing myself and giving brief reminder of purpose of research; I reminded participant she could choose not to answer any question

1. If you had to create a publicity brochure for the career studies program, what aspects would you highlight in order to sell it to the students? What aspects would you highlight to their parents? What are you most proud of?

2. How did you come to teach the career studies program?

3. Did you have to undertake any special training and development before you began teaching the program? What did this consist of?

4. What are some of the things you like about teaching the program? And what are the aspects that you do not like?

5. What aspects of the program particularly meet the needs of Grade 10 students?
   a. Can you give examples of types of students that have particular success with the program?
   b. Why do you think that is?

6. Can you describe what the program entails for students?

7. How much flexibility do you have when planning the content of the program?
   a. Can you give me an example of how you have used that flexibility?

8. What type of assistance do you have with the planning and teaching of the program?

9. What do you feel in the main objective of career studies?

10. You said Monday you were not sure about whether you started teaching career studies during or after your first guidance training, and that in you feel that the training did not really help to prepare you for teaching career studies.

   Do you think training is necessary?
   What do you think that training should consist of?
11. In your opinion what skills and experience do you need to be successful at teaching career studies?

12. I know that you include people from outside of school in the career studies program, could you tell me a bit more about what their involvement is? For example, could you talk me through what you would do to get them to come into school, from when you first make contact with them?

13. How do you identify the specialists that you bring in? Do you use the same contacts each year? Do they need to meet specific criteria? If so, who decides the criteria?

14. How do you take advantages of the links the school has with local employers in your career studies program?

15. How are such links/partnerships formed? Who has responsibility for this?

16. In your opinion, has the school lost employer links/partnerships as a direct or indirect result of the global economic downturn?
   a. Has the school lost any partnerships that you are aware of? How have you gained this knowledge?
   b. Has the school gained new employer/partnerships? How has this happened?

17. On Monday you mentioned that Ontario is made up of many small businesses and that entrepreneurship is very prevalent. How do you use this knowledge in the career studies program? Where do you get this knowledge from?

18. How do you think that the recent global economic downturn has impacted upon Eastern Ontario, in particular the small businesses and entrepreneurs? From where do you get this knowledge?

19. What can you tell me about how the Canadian government has been trying to combat the effects of the recent global economic downturn?
   a. Can you name any of the strategies and initiatives they have taken?
   b. Have you heard of Canada’s Economic Plan?
   c. How did you learn about this?
   d. Do you think that federal programs like the Economic Plan have any relevance to the career studies program, and if so in what way?
   e. What do you think the impact has been in Ontario of the global economic downturn?
20. How has the Ontario government reacted to the global economic downturn?

21. What initiatives has the Ontario government undertaken to combat the economic downturn that you are aware of?
   a. How did you gain this knowledge?

22. How has the global economic downturn affected the local area in which you teach?
   a. Do you know of business that has been directly affected? How did you find out?
   b. Have any of your family or friends been affected? How were they affected?
   c. Has knowledge of affected family, friends and or businesses impacted upon your teaching of the career studies program? And if so, how?

23. Are you aware of any initiatives that have had impact in the local area? How did you get to know about this?

24. When guest speakers come into school for the career studies program, do they ever mention the global economic downturn and if so in what way?

25. Has the impact of the global economic downturn over the past 3 years or so caused you to make any adjustments or changes to the career studies program? If so, in what way?

If I could please revisit a few topics I have discussed with you in the previous interviews…

26. You said that your teaching experience as a co-op ed teacher and your own work prepared you well for teaching career studies – why do you think that was? Can you expand on that a little for me please?

27. We discussed how the bigger issues – the world context, world economies and the like affect kids choices and career paths and you gave me an example of how you stay up to date with some of those issues when you talked about the students needing to produce their resumes in a current format, and from what you have said this is important to a lot of the students. Could you tell me how you keep up to date with that kind of thing? How do you know what the current resume should look like? If you were not sure of you were up to date, what would you do?

28. When I asked you about how much flexibility you have in planning the career studies program you mentioned that you ‘self oppose’ – could you explain to me how you do this?
29. What possible things would act as a trigger for you to make changes to the career studies program?

30. Do you do any evaluation of the program and if so how does this work?

If I could please revisit a few topics I have discussed with you in the previous interviews…

(From Choices into Action, 1999)

The document states that students will develop an understanding of 3 concepts, a) student development, b) interpersonal development, and c) career development.

31. On page 8 under ‘areas of learning – lifelong learning’ is states that students will apply lifelong learning skills, eg. Communication, research, and employability skills to their personal education and career plans. Is this done as part of the compulsory career studies program, and if so how?

32. Page 7 says that students as part of career development will create and evaluate plans for the future. Could you please describe to me how this happens in the career studies program?

33. Under career development on page 10 it says that students will learn to describe how changes taking place in the economy, the environment, and society affect the job market. Is this part of the compulsory career studies course, and if so how is it assessed?

34. Do you make use of the Ontario Skills Passport and if so how?

35. You mentioned to me in a previous interview how you incorporate health and safety into the compulsory career studies program. Can you give me an example of how ICT is incorporated?

From MOE5

36. In the revised curriculum (2006) for guidance and career education it lists specific expectations. One of these is for students to be able to identify the essential skills they have developed through school, extracurricular, and/or community experiences, and explain how these skills relate to career development. Can you tell me how this is done within the compulsory career studies program?

37. Another expectation is that students will create a portfolio that documents personal information (e.g. interest, skills, talents, achievements, credentials) and career related information. Can you tell me how this is undertaken in the compulsory career studies course?
What would be the typical content of a student portfolio?

How much would this vary depending upon the student’s ability and academic level?

38. A third expectation is that students will be able to identify economic and social trends, and be able to explain how they influence available job opportunities and work environments.
   How would this be undertaken and assessed in the compulsory career studies course?

39. One of the outcomes for the career studies course is that students are able to demonstrate an understanding of career development as a lifelong process that includes transition, changes and lifelong learning.
   Could you tell me how this is incorporated into the career studies course?

Can you give me an example?

How is this assessed?

Do you have much flexibility in assessment?

How do you use this flexibility?

Can you give me an example?
Appendix E

Example of Agenda Setting Stage per Document Coding Clusters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Canadian federal government documents</th>
<th>Ontario provincial government documents</th>
<th>Ontario Ministry of Education documents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CAN1 Emergence from recession</td>
<td>ONT3 Global recession</td>
<td>MOE1 Nature and pace of change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic recovery</td>
<td>Signs of recovery</td>
<td>Preparation of students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs and growth</td>
<td>Fragility</td>
<td>Tools (skills) needed by students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stimulus</td>
<td>Jobs and growth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada as a global leader</td>
<td>Economic stimulus</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergence from recession</td>
<td>Opening doors – trade, students,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic recovery</td>
<td>opportunities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs and growth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stimulus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada as a global leader</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAN2 Fragility</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resilience and ingenuity of</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadians</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economic advantage</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fiscal health</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global leadership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAN3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial and economic planning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry and ingenuity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jobs and growth</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Success of economy dependent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>upon skilled workforce</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada’s position globally</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global leadership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix F
Summary of Second Stage Coding from the Policy Cycle Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agenda stage</th>
<th>Document reference number that refers to cluster code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Leadership</td>
<td>1. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT4, MOE6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Economy</td>
<td>2. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3, MOE2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Stimulus</td>
<td>3. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Skills</td>
<td>4. CAN1, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Lifelong Learning</td>
<td>5. ONT4, MOE1, MOE2, MOE5, MOE8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Society</td>
<td>6. CAN1, ONT4, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy formulation stage</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Economic stability</td>
<td>1. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Development opportunities</td>
<td>2. CAN1, CAN3, ONT3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Good practice</td>
<td>3. CAN3, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, MOE4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Coordination and collaboration</td>
<td>4. CAN1, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Types of learning</td>
<td>5. MOE1, MOE2.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Conditions for learning</td>
<td>6. ONT3, ONT4, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, MOE8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Outcomes</td>
<td>7. CAN3, ONT3, ONT4, MOE2, MOE3, MOE5, MOE8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Decision making stage</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Society and community</td>
<td>1. CAN1, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Investment</td>
<td>2. CAN1, CAN2, ONT3, ONT4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Legislative</td>
<td>3. CAN1, MOE3, MOE5, MOE7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Economy</td>
<td>4. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MOE3, MOE4, MOE5, MOE6, MOE7, MOE8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy implementation stage</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Initiatives</td>
<td>1. CAN1, CAN2, CAN3, ONT3, ONT4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Industry specific</td>
<td>2. MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Non-specific</td>
<td>3. CAN2, ONT3, MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE4,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Leadership roles</td>
<td>MOE5, MOE6, MOE7, MOE8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Desirable outcomes</td>
<td>4. MOE1, MOE2, MOE4, MOE7,</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Actor involvement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy evaluation stage</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Type of evaluation</td>
<td>1. ONT3, MOE1, MOE5, MOE6, MOE8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Frequency of evaluation</td>
<td>2. MOE1, MOE3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Responsibility of evaluation and purpose of evaluation</td>
<td>3. MOE1, MOE2, MOE3, MOE6, MOE8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix G

Interview Data Analysis: 2nd Stage Clusters, Bronfenbrenner (1979)
Classifications and Four Overarching Themes

Microsystem
- Family (SE)
- Colleagues (SE)
- Own experience (from previous employment, interaction with media, personal shopping) (SE)
- Own expertise (teaching practice, qualifications and training) (SE)
- Community (own, immediate) (MC)
- Former students (MC and RN)

Mesosystem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Multisettting participation</th>
<th>Indirect linkage</th>
<th>Intersetting communication</th>
<th>Intersetting knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Co-op education practice (SE)</td>
<td>Networking (making new connections through existing links) (MC)</td>
<td>Employers (RN and MC)</td>
<td>In-school resources (SRT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guest speakers (through existing connections) (SE and MC)</td>
<td>Technology (SRT)</td>
<td>Wider community (where there is professional relationship) (RN)</td>
<td>Local media (SRT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Resources (tools) (SRT)</td>
<td>Post secondary institution relationships (RN)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post secondary institution relationships (RN)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Exosystem
- Local demographics (MC)
- Local economy (includes business start-ups and closures (MC)
- District school board (RN)
- Networking (making connections through new links) (RN)

Macrosystem
- Global or international (MC)
- Federal (MC)
- Provincial (MC)
- Global or National media (MC)

Themes Key

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SE - Sharing experience &amp; expertise</th>
<th>MC – Making connections</th>
<th>SR – Sourcing resources/Tools</th>
<th>RN – Relationships and networking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

180