THE ROLE OF MOTHER TONGUE AT PRIMARY LEVEL IN THE
PRESERVATION OF CULTURE

By

Shahida Habib Khan

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Education
In conformity with the requirements for the
Degree of Master of Education

Queen’s University

Kingston, Ontario, Canada

October 2013

Copyright ©Shahida Habib Khan, 2013
Abstract

The UN Charter recognizes the right to culture as a human right and UNESCO mandates the preservation and enhancement of indigenous cultures – reflecting how the international community values cultural diversity. Ignoring the acculturating effects of education in foreign languages in indigenous societies comes in conflict with these mandates. Current research in the instructional languages of primary school education usually revolves around the learning advantages. But the focus on learning advantages has diminished the impact of instructional language on culture to relative oblivion, despite the acculturating effects visibly found in indigenous, multilingual, and pluralist societies; effects that threaten the existence of many indigenous cultures in the wake of globalization. As remarked by Ngugi Wa Thion’o in his book titled The Future of African Literature, language is “a system of communication” and “the carrier of culture”, therefore, striking a balance between its role in education and culture is essential. Indigenous culture and language should not be sacrificed by education that seeks to educate for inclusion in a world viewed as a global; the latter representative of the western culture and English language. Therefore, a strategy is needed to use education systems both as carriers of indigenous cultures and participation in a global world. This topic requires continuous research.

The purpose of this study was to explore the role of mother tongue at the primary school level in the preservation of culture. For this purpose, the relationship of Pukhtunwali culture with Pukhtu language was investigated. This qualitative study consisted of interviews with six primary school teachers teaching grade five social studies curriculum in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The teachers were asked to share their perspectives
on the role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at the primary school level in the preservation of Pukhtun culture in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Data analysis identified five themes that showed variations in the perspectives of teachers regarding the role of Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali if used as a medium of instruction in schools.
Acknowledgement

The success of this master thesis depends largely on the encouragement and guidelines of many others. I take this opportunity to express my deepest appreciation to all those who supported me in the completion of this thesis. A special gratitude to my supervisor, Professor Ann Marie Hill, whose comments, suggestions, and encouragement helped me in the success of this master thesis. I would like to show my greatest appreciation to my committee member Professor Magda Lewis, for her tremendous support and help throughout the process of completing this thesis. I would like to thank my loved ones, Lalai Abbas, Changez Khan, Muhammad Abbas, and Majid Habib Khan who have supported me throughout the entire process by their continuous encouragement and emotional support. I will be grateful forever for your love. My special gratitude to Brenda Reed and my friends Michael McNealy and Nadya Al Mousa, who were always there to reply to my queries and provided the much needed reassurance. Lastly, I would like to thank my precious daughter and nieces who were so patient and helpful during the completion of this thesis.
Dedication

I dedicate my work to my dear mother who encouraged me to get education and supported me to study in Canada. She was always there for me whenever I lost hope and my faith. I will never forget all those sacrifices that my mother gave for me. I love my mother and always will.
# Table of Contents

Abstract...........................................................................................................................................i

Acknowledgement....................................................................................................................................iii

Dedications................................................................................................................................................iv

CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION......................................................................................................................1

  Context of the Study..........................................................................................................................4

  Purpose and Research Questions......................................................................................................6

  Overview of the Methodology and Methods..................................................................................6

  Significance of the Study...................................................................................................................8

  Definition of Terms............................................................................................................................9

  Autobiographical Signature...........................................................................................................11

  Outline of Thesis..............................................................................................................................12

CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW

  Definition of Culture.......................................................................................................................14

  Indigenous People and Cultures......................................................................................................16

  Globalization and its impacts of Indigenous Cultures....................................................................20

  Survival of Indigenous Societies through Education...................................................................23

  Relationship of Mother Tongue and Culture Preservation............................................................24

  Pukhtunwali (Pukhtun Culture).......................................................................................................26
Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu.................................................................34
The Education System in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa...............................35
Summary.....................................................................................40

CHAPTER 3: Methodology and Methods

Research Methodology...................................................................41
Research Method............................................................................42
Data Collection..............................................................................54
Data Analysis..................................................................................63
Summary.........................................................................................67

CHAPTER 4: RESULTS

Theme 1: Pukhtunwali and its Importance.......................................69
Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali.....................................................76
Theme 3: Factors responsible for the changes in Pukhtunwali.............86
Theme 4: Role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali.............................98
Theme 5: Role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at primary level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.............................................103
Summary.........................................................................................109

CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

Theme 1: Pukhtunwali and its Importance........................................111
Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali.....................................................111
Theme 3: Factors responsible for the changes in Pukhtunwali.............117
Theme 4: Role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali.............................119
Theme 5: Role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at primary level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.............................................103
CONCLUSIONS

CONTRIBUTION TO THE LITERATURE

SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

REFERENCES

APPENDICES

APPENDIX-A: A Sample Interview Guideline

APPENDIX-B: Clearance Letter

APPENDIX-C: TCPS 2: CORE

APPENDIX-D: Letter of Information

APPENDIX-E: Consent Form

APPENDIX-F: Example of a Coded English Interview Transcript

APPENDIX-G: Example of Coding of Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali

APPENDIX-H: Actual Hardboard Display of Themes and their Categories

APPENDIX-I: Example of Transcript in Pukhtu language

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION

I was brought up in a Pukhtun family where every relationship has its own special status and value. In a Pukhtun family parents, siblings, and cousins all live together and share each other’s happiness and grief; everything. I am the youngest of nine siblings and was always teased by my elders because I knew nothing about my culture or any of the languages that were taught to me in school or at home. I realized that I was teased because I did not know about my cultural language and I had great difficulty in learning the languages that were required of me in school. I felt that in trying too hard to learn both English and Urdu languages required at school, I had lost to some extent my own mother tongue, the Pukhtu language.

As a child, I was a quiet and shy student. My teachers always appreciated me for being quiet and disciplined in class. I was quiet not because I did not want to talk but because I was not confident enough to speak English. English was not my first language and as a Pukhtun I only knew the Pukhtu language, which we were not allowed to speak in the school. We had English and Urdu language courses where we learned not only the grammar and vocabulary of these languages but also the history of people speaking them. I still remember how I would memorize the English or Urdu text without understanding a word of it, and then reproduce it in exams.

I was a very confused child when I was in primary school. I did not realize that what I learned at school was actually the real experiences of people and that it could be
applicable in the real world. I lived among my Pukhtun family, where we spoke Pukhtu and lived with Pukhtun cultural norms. The English lifestyle that I learned about in school was completely different than that of my everyday life. I was never able to connect my learning to my surroundings because my learning and my surrounding were two different worlds with no connection between them. The English language and its cultural representations were somethings that I experienced only in school and practiced for the purpose of passing my exams. This is the reason that I was never satisfied with my studies.

I remember how teachers would write notes on the chalkboard without explaining them and would tell us to write them in our notebooks without allowing students to ask questions. In my undergraduate degree in education, I was determined that when I became a teacher I would allow my students to ask me as many questions as they wanted and would make the experience of learning less confusing and more enjoyable. I did not know then that when I became a teacher and taught about the content of culture, I would realize that I missed out on so much as a child. I missed out on my culture, which was lost somewhere in the confusion of the two worlds with which I was dealing simultaneously as I grew up.

My teaching experience opened the door for me to do something for my culture. When I began teaching the social studies curriculum to third grade in an English medium school in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, I became aware of a gap in the curriculum; knowledge and understanding of our own culture was omitted. At that time, I taught Pukhtun students in English and Urdu, telling them about these cultures and languages – but teaching them nothing about their own culture. I taught students the prescribed curricula
and rules of discipline followed in the school. I taught them how to become progressive by adopting the western lifestyle, a legacy left behind by the British colonizers of Pakistan. At the school where I taught, the medium of instruction was English and students were not allowed to speak their mother tongue, even if they did not understand a word of the English language. This language barrier meant that many of my students did not participate in classroom discussions. I understood this because I had been through the same dilemma in the school system. The students search for words and disengagement reminded me of myself as a child: robbed of all agencies due to lack of words. I did not want my students to experience the same helplessness and shame that I had lived. I wanted them to speak and express whatever was on their young minds.

During my time teaching at a primary school, I observed how school imposed foreign ways on its students and what happened to the students who rebelled. One of the most common issues was students arriving at school not wearing the proper uniform. This uniform included for all boys trousers, a shirt, a tie, a sweater, and a jacket, and for all girls kameez, partog, sash, a sweater, and a jacket and was required during all school hours. Students were also forced to speak in English even during lunch breaks and when playing in the yard. The students who resisted this foreign way of doing things experienced many disciplinary issues, while those who obeyed the school’s directives were slowly transformed into children who were Pukhtuns only in name.

As I watched how children reacted to the school rules, I realized that their education was taking them from their own culture. Further, they were taught a British curriculum in the English language, and these lessons had a visible impact on the personalities of the students.
As a student I did not know how important it was to learn about my own culture. When I became a teacher, I really wanted my students to understand their culture, to allow them to transmit it to the next generation. But I found it very difficult to communicate the elements of Pukhtun culture to the students. Later, I realized that it was the English language preventing me from communicating the practices of Pukhtun culture to the students.

My experience led me to believe that the use of English as a medium of instruction was negatively affecting Pukhtunwali. I wondered how other teachers perceived the factors affecting Pukhtunwali in an educational context. I was curious about whether using my own language in place of English would help preserve my culture in the face of foreign influence.

Therefore, I decided to investigate this situation; the relationship between the use of a mother tongue and cultural preservation. To do this, I applied to graduate school, in a Masters of Education program. The purpose of my research was to explore the perspectives of primary school teachers teaching fifth grade social studies in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Pakistan.

**Context of the Study**

The United Nations Charter recognises the right to culture as a human right and United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organisations mandates the preservation and enhancement of indigenous cultures, reflecting the value the international community places on cultural diversity (Convention on the Protection of the Diversity of Cultural Expression, 2005). However, the
irreversible phenomenon of globalization increasingly threatens indigenous cultures. Because only a few languages and cultures dominate globalization, such as the English language and Western culture, some countries perceive gainful benefits from the globalised world and adopt the language and cultures of the dominant countries. This subjects indigenous societies to an insistent exposure to foreign language and culture, which in turn may erode their indigenous languages and cultures to the point of extinction. However, not adopting the mediums of globalization would thrust them into a state in which expected progress may not be achieved in the face of globalization. Either way, the final result is in conflict with the desires and mandates of the international community. This dilemma, therefore, demands active intervention.

One way to prepare indigenous societies for globalization in a manner that preserves their native cultures is through their local education systems. As remarked by Ngugi Wa Thiong’o in his book titled, *The Future of African Literature* (1987), language is not only “a system of communication” but also “the carrier of culture” (p. 3); therefore, education in mother tongues can be the carrier of native cultures.

Current research on instructional languages, especially in primary education, mostly revolves around how young children learn and the advantage of learning English, regardless of country and culture. These foci minimize or even negate the importance of the impact of mother tongues on indigenous cultures — despite the visible acculturating effects of education in foreign languages in indigenous societies. This acculturating effect suggests a need to study the
relationship between early education in mother tongues and the persistence of indigenous cultures.

**Purpose and Research Questions**

The purpose of this study was to explore the relationship between early education in a mother tongue and cultural preservation. Specifically, I examined the role of the Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali (Pukhtun culture). Pukhtunwali is the indigenous culture of the people of Afghanistan and Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, a province of Pakistan. I conducted my research by interviewing primary school teachers who taught the social studies curriculum to fifth grade students in English medium schools. I chose to interview teachers because they are responsible for transmitting the knowledge of culture to their students, and they are well aware of the education system in which they are teaching.

The main research questions that guided my study were as follows:

- What is the role of the mother tongue at the primary level in the preservation of culture when used as a medium of instruction?

- What are the perspectives of primary school teachers about the role of the mother tongue in the preservation of culture when used as a medium of instruction at the primary level?

**Overview of the Methodology and Methods**

For the purpose of this study, I adopted a qualitative methodology with an
ethnographic exploratory approach. I collected data by conducting semi-structured, open-ended interviews. The interviews were conducted at a library in the city of Peshawar in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Six participants were interviewed from three schools: a girls’ school, a boys’ school, and a co-educational school. Two male teachers were selected from the all boys' school, two female teachers were selected from the all girls' school, and one male and one female teacher was selected from the co-education school. The participants were grade five social studies elementary school teachers. The participants (1) spoke Pukhtu, (2) belonged to Pukhtun culture, (3) were currently teaching the discipline, and (4) had five uninterrupted years of teaching experience prior to the study.

To investigate the role of the mother tongue in the preservation of culture, I prepared an interview guideline where I asked the primary school teachers three types of questions:

- Questions about their personal life
- Questions about their professional background
- Questions regarding the current educational system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and the role of the Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.

I asked questions about the background and profession of the participants in order to learn about the personal life of the participants and to ensure that they met the criteria for participating in the study. To investigate the role of the Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali, I asked questions about the present situation of the education system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and the importance of
the Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali (See Appendix A for the Interview Guide). While sharing their perspectives, teachers also provided insight into other matters that need attention in order to preserve Pukhtunwali.

Interviews were analysed using a coding-theme process in which data is coded in a way that results in the emergence of the main themes. The themes were not determined a priori, but were inducted from the raw data. To increase the reliability of the study, member checking was done. To improve the accuracy of the study, the interviews were transcribed verbatim and transcripts were checked with the participants.

**Significance of the Study**

There are studies on the importance of the Pukhtu language as an essential factor to convey the cultural code of Pukhtunwali (Rome, 2006) but there is little research done in the educational context; research that examines how the code of Pukhtunwali culture can be transmitted through education. Available knowledge about the transmission of Pukhtunwali through the Pukhtu language in education is mostly in the form of blogs (Freedom from the Forbidden, Gupshup, Simply, Hinoo etc.), and knowledge forums (Vallyswat, CSS Forum, and Military Photos. Net, Khyber.Org, Afghan Analyst. Net etc.) that is not considered reliable sources of information. Further, visiting the Pukhtu Academy in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, I was not able to find research on the importance of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali preservation. Neither have I found literature in the form of academic studies or journal articles. If there was such literature, it was not available online to retrieve electronically. Hence, this study, written in English, is accessible to
anyone who wants to know about the role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtun culture preservation.


In brief, there is a gap in the literature on the relationship of Pukhtu language to Pukhtunwali in an educational context. Hence, this study contributes to the literature on Pukhtunwali as well as on the importance of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali.

While this study is limited to exploring the role of mother tongue in the education system of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and each case within this study is unique, this study contributes to building a body of information about this particular topic. This study could provide a platform for other indigenous societies to inform the way education systems can be designed to preserve and enhance their culture.
Definition of Terms

The purpose of this study was to explore the relationship between the use of mother tongue in primary level education and the preservation of culture. I chose to investigate this relationship using the Pukhtunwali culture and the Pukhtu language. Below, I have provided simple definitions for some of the terms frequently used in this study.

**Culture.** The anthropologist E. Tylor (1871) defined culture as, “that complex whole which includes knowledge, belief, art, morals, law, custom, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by man (sic) as a member of society” (p. 1). His definition is broad and covers virtually every aspect of culture; hence, it is the definition I chose to use in this study.

**Indigenous culture.** For the definition of indigenous culture I used the definition detailed by the International Labour Organization:

> Peoples in independent countries who are regarded as indigenous on account of their descent from the populations which inhabited the country, or a geographical region to which the country belongs, at the time of conquest or colonisation or the establishment of present state boundaries and who, irrespective of their legal status, retain some or all of their own social, economic, cultural and political institutions. (International Labour Organization, 1989, article 1, p. 3)

**Pukhtunwali or Pukhtun culture.** Olaf Caro (1958) and Sultan-I-Rome (2006) defined Pukhtunwali as the unwritten and well-defined code of honour, norms, traditions, and customs followed by Pukhtun people.

**Globalization.** Bhagwati (2004) defined globalisation as the process of integration of regional economies, societies, and cultures through communication, transportation, and trade.
**Medium of instruction.** According to Burnaby (1982), “a medium of instruction, also called MOI, is a subject of instruction, and a means of communication which is used by a teacher to teach any subject matter (for example, mathematics, science, or language itself)” (p. 18).

**Mother tongue.** According to Tulasiewicz and Adams (2005), “the language spoken in a region, which enables the process of enculturation, the growing of an individual into a particular system of linguistic perception of the world and participation in the centuries old history of linguistic production." (p. 5).

**Pukhtu language.** Pukhtu (also spelled Pukhto, Pakhto, or Pashto) belongs to the Iranian branch of the Indo European language family and has more than 25 million native speakers. Of these 25 million, 16 to 17 million live in Pakistan and 8 to 9 million live in Afghanistan (Rahman, 1995). The Pukhtu language has two dialects: the soft dialect and the hard dialect. The soft dialect is used in southern areas of Afghanistan, whereas the hard dialect is used in northern areas of Pakistan. Olaf Caro (1958) pointed out the difference in the phonology of the two dialects. In the soft dialect, “sh” is used whereas in the hard dialect, "kh" is used (Caro, 1958).

**Pukhtun people.** Pukhtun people are those speaking the Pukhtu language and following Pukhtunwali.

**Modern.** In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the term “modern” refers to a people who use English language words in colloquial Pukhtu conversation and wear western clothes.

**Westernization.** Westernization in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa means the influence of western culture and the speaking of the English language.
**Primary school.** The primary school level in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Pakistan is from Grade 1 to Grade 5.

**Textbooks.** The content of Pukhtunwali culture at primary school level in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa is taught through the textbooks that are written by social studies subject experts selected by the Provincial Textbook Board (PTTB) of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The Provincial Textbook Board (PTTB) of each province in Pakistan is responsible for writing, publishing and distributing the textbooks (Mahmood, 2010).

**Autobiographical Signature**

Culture and one’s own mother tongue are a very significant part of one’s life. I am a sensitive person and have strong affiliations with my culture, language, and profession as a teacher. It was difficult for me to put my own personal feelings and experiences aside and allow my participants to elaborate on their views regarding Pukhtu language and culture in an educational context. As a researcher, I assumed my responsibilities with great care. I made every attempt to kept my biases from interfering with interviews and recorded them in my journal. In this way I keep them at bay in my data reporting and analysis in order for my research to be as rigorous as possible.

I introduced myself to the participants as a researcher and did not volunteer information regarding my background as a teacher. I did this to make sure that the participants gave their views and opinions without fear of being judged by someone in the same profession. This approach gave the interviewees the freedom to express themselves openly.
At times it was very hard for me not to jump in and endorse one or another of their views with my approval but I kept a neutral stance and used only neutral words. My questions were open-ended and designed in a manner that would not lead a participant to have a particular answer. I listened carefully to each and every answer and through member checking made sure that the answers recorded from the interview transcripts were exactly what the participants said.

**Overview of the Thesis**

There are five chapters in this thesis. This first chapter presents an introduction, and tells the story of how I arrived at my research questions. I also introduced the context and purpose of the study, gave an overview of my methodology, discussed the significance of the study, defined terminology used in the study, and provided an autobiographical signature. Chapter 2 presents a review of relevant literature. Chapter 3 provides a description of the research methodology and the methods used for data collection and analysis. Chapter 4 details the results that emerged from the analysis of data collected. Finally, Chapter 5 includes a discussion of the results, conclusions drawn from the study, and suggestions for future research on this topic.
CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

This chapter reviews the literature on the relationship between instruction in the mother tongue at the primary school level and the preservation of culture. The chapter begins by examining the varying definitions of culture provided by various scholars from different fields. The chapter then leads to the definition of indigenous people and cultures in general that are used in this study and the influence of British colonization on indigenous people of the Indian sub-continent. Next, the chapter concisely discusses the advantages and disadvantages of globalization for indigenous people and the global community. The next section presents work of various authors who examine the role of mother tongue in the preservation of culture. Next, this chapter discusses the specific culture involved in this study: the Pukhtunwali (culture), its few tenets, and the Pukhtu language. This chapter concludes with a description of the current education system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and issues posed by globalization.

Definitions of Culture

Scholars from a variety of fields defined culture in very diverse ways. Some analysts have described culture as a system of symbols and meanings. For example, Geertz (1973) defined culture as "a system of inherited conceptions expressed in symbolic forms by means of which men (sic) communicate, perpetuate, and develop their knowledge about and attitudes toward life" (p. 89). Similarly, Lechner and Boli (2005) characterized culture as “socially shared symbolic and meaning systems that become embedded in objects, organizations, and people” (p. 16).
Alternatively, some anthropologists have linked culture with practice and experience. Street (1993) defined culture as “an active process of meaning making and contest over definition, including its own definition” (p. 25), and Spradley (1979) described it as “acquired knowledge people use to interpret experience and generate behavior” (p. 5).

Peterson (2004) explored various ways in which culture has been defined and provided his own definition. According to Peterson (2004), “Culture is the relatively stable set of inner values and beliefs generally held by groups of people in countries or regions and the noticeable impact those values and beliefs have on peoples’ outward behavior and environment” (p. 17).

Since time immemorial, culture has been perceived as a “whole” and a “complex whole”. If we go back in time and reflect on anthropologist E. Tylor’s (1871) definition of culture, we reach the same conclusion. He stated that it is “that complex whole which includes knowledge, belief, art, morals, law, custom, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by man (sic) as a member of society” (p. 1). What can be added to Tylor’s definition is that it is not just a complex whole but also a dynamic whole that undergoes changes under various influences from outside and from within.

Hence, culture is something that has no single definition, cannot be narrowed down to only one definition, and various authors have defined it from their own perspective. These definitions suggest that culture can be attitudes, beliefs, symbols, patterns of behaviour; political and social structure; and dress, food and language shared by a group of people at any given time. Further, culture can be a process of meaning
making or knowledge that interprets peoples’ experiences and behaviour. However it is suggested that the different aspects of culture are transmitted from one generation to another within a cultural group, thus preserving the culture over time.

**Indigenous People and Cultures**

Indigenous people are specific groups of people who were marginalized and colonized by Europeans in different eras but who kept their cultural identity and are still striving to preserve it for their future generations. The following is a working definition of indigenous people given by Martínez Cobo in *Preliminary Report of the Special Rapporteur of the Commission on Human Right* in 1972:

Indigenous communities, peoples and nations are those which, having a historical continuity with pre-invasion and pre-colonial societies that developed on their territories, consider themselves distinct from other sectors of the societies now prevailing in those territories, or parts of them. They form at present non-dominant sectors of society and are determined to preserve, develop and transmit to future generations their ancestral territories, and their ethnic identity, as the basis of their continued existence as peoples, in accordance with their own cultural patterns, social institutions and legal systems. (p. 379)

**Indigenous people around the world.**

According to the United Nations Permanent Forum on Indigenous Issues (UNPFII, 2009) and the International Workgroup of Indigenous Affairs (IWGIA, n. d), there are more than 370 million indigenous people from at least 5000 cultural groups, spread across 70 countries worldwide, with the majority of them living in remote areas. Indigenous groups range from “the forest peoples of the Amazon to the tribal peoples of India and from the Inuit of the Arctic to the Aborigines in Australia” (UNPFII, 2009, p.1). The UNPFII (2009) list of Indigenous people includes the Lakota in the USA, the Mayas in Guatemala, the Aymaras in Bolivia, the Inuit and Aleutians of the circumpolar
region, the Saami of northern Europe, the Aborigines and Torres Strait Islanders of Australia, and the Maori of New Zealand.

**Indigenous People of Central Asia.**

America’s and other forementioned indigenous people are not the only indigenous people in the world. There are many examples of indigenous groups that have preserved their unique cultural characteristics, and clearly diverge from the dominant national culture. Central Asia is a vast region containing seven countries – Sri Lanka, Bhutan, India, Maldives, Nepal, Pakistan, and Bangladesh – and many indigenous people. The original people of this vast region are often called Tribals, Adivasis, or Dalits (Fact sheet of United Nations Permanent forum on Indigenous Issues (UNPFII, 2009). Among these indigenous people, the Pukhtun people (also spelled Pashtun, Pakhtun, and Pukhtoon) are spread over Pakistan and Afghanistan and have retained their unique cultural traits for centuries.

**Colonization and Indigenous Culture**

When a group of people seeks to take control of territories, regions or countries, they form a settlement or colony. However, between the 15th and 19th centuries, colonizers such as Spain, Portugal, France, the Netherlands, and Great Britain not only created colonies in Africa, the Americas, Asia, and Oceania but also ruled these territories.

The British Empire was the largest empire between late 16th and early 18th centuries in history (Ferguson, 2004). With enormous power of domination, Europeans decimated Indigenous cultures in their path. During the era of British colonialism, it was
common for British citizens to think of themselves as superior to other people. Various authors have described how the Europeans treated the native peoples from regions such as Africa, Asia, and the Americas during colonization. They called these native peoples primitives, savages (Shah, 2010), uncivilized, and inferior (Said, 1993). They regarded indigenous people as inferior to them. According to Smith and Ward (2000), “the colonizers brought and forced new language and text, religion and traditions including landscape and costume, education and science, disease and enslavement” (p. 90).

**Colonization in the Indian Sub-Continent.**

British colonization of the Indian sub-continent began in the 17th century with the trade of spices between the British East India Company and the countries now known as Pakistan and India. This spice trade allowed the British to enter the sub-continent. British people started taking interest in the culture, language, and lives of the people of the sub-continent. When the British were able to capture the Indian sub-continent in 1858, they began to dominate the culture, language, and the religion of the people living there (Viswanathan, 1989).

The British were particularly ruthless colonizers, as Burney (2012) pointed out in her recent book titled, *Pedagogy of the Other*: “the British played the colonizing game more ferociously, strategically, and cleverly than the other competing colonial powers, beating out the Portuguese, French, and Dutch for primacy in India” (p. 154).

Once established in India, the colonizers adopted the same strategy as that they had used on other indigenous groups. They privileged only those people who were willing to adopt British customs, leaving their identity behind and becoming essentially
British (Viswanathan, 1989). Those people who adopted the etiquette of British in eating, greeting, educating, and thinking, and who learned to speak their language, were respected and were given opportunities for advancement in the new social order (Viswanathan, 1989).

Before the arrival of British colonizers, the Hindus and Muslims lived peacefully together on the Indian sub-continent. There were no rivalries among them. Then British came with their strategy of “divide and conquer” (Goering, 1993), and ruled the Hindus and Muslims for almost 100 years. The British called on Lord Mount Batten (Kudaisya & Yong, 2000), who was the last viceroy of India (sub-continent), and later on became the first Governor General of India after independence in 1947, to solve the issues between Hindus and Muslims. Mount Batten held roundtable conferences with both parties to attempt to negotiate reconciliation; however, he was unsuccessful. The British Government authorized Mount Batten to transfer the power over the Indian sub-continent. Hence, the conflicts between Muslims and Hindus resulted in the separation of the sub-continent into two separate nations; India and Pakistan.

In 1947, the British left the sub-continent, which was divided into two states: India and Pakistan. However, even though today the British no longer rule over the sub-continent of India, the influence of colonialists can still be felt in both the states (Viswanathan, 1989). Pakistan still has a British school system for the elite class, the law system is still there to be followed, official language of the country remains English, and today’s threat felt by the people of Pakistan is the increasing influence of western culture followed in schools in the form of medium of instruction. English language is the
medium of instruction in the majority of semi-government and private schools in Pakistan. This has created a fear of losing the indigenous cultures.

The fear of losing cultural values and practices was embedded in the indigenous people of Pakistan at the time of colonization but it has increased with the passage of time by a new phenomenon called globalization. Smith and Ward (2000) identified that globalization is the extension of colonization. Globalization is not a new phenomenon but is the 20th century in which its rate has rapidly changed. These changes have impacted on the lives of people. Burney (2012) stated that on one hand, the factors of globalization such as “mass production, mass communication, and mass consumptions” (p.188-189) are facilitating the underdeveloped countries to gain an access of information and technology (Burney, 2012). On the other hand, “it has created greater inequalities between rich and poor, undermined local economies and rural lifestyles, devastated the ecological systems of countries, sustained militarism, fragmented communities, and created a cultural crises” (Burney, 2012, p. 189).

**Globalization and Its Impacts on Indigenous Cultures**

Globalization, or the promotion of “increased integration, connectivity, and interdependence in the economic, social, technological, cultural, political and environmental spheres among countries around the world” (Wheately, 2008, p. 2), is intended to make communication among nations and progress around the world faster and easier. Globalization has allowed access to many different countries and cultures through international travel, has increased job opportunities by allowing people to compete overseas for better positions, has allowed developed countries to help less
developed countries in their business and economics, and has provided a foundation for the easy and efficient trading of resources and goods from one country to another. Globalization has improved the economies of many countries where technology has played a key role.

However, despite its many advantages, there are also some serious disadvantages to globalization that have a direct impact on people’s psyche, whole communities, and societies. As Held (1999) indicated, globalization is “the big idea which encompasses everything from global financial market to the Internet, but delivers little substantive insight into the contemporary human condition” (p. 1).

The major negative impact of globalization is the destruction of indigenous societies and communities by the West. As a result of globalization, indigenous societies are either disappearing from the world or are becoming marginalized. Smith and Ward (2000) stated, “the process of globalization began in the West and has mainly fostered the expansion of Western ideas, values, lifestyle and technology” (p. 2). The main goal of globalization, that all people should be connected and share common cultural values, were never shared by indigenous people. Tikly (2001) condemned the idea of integration and states that “although globalization is resulting in greater integration in some areas of the economy, politics and culture, it is also resulting in greater fragmentation and stratification” (p. 154) Held (1999) supported Tikly’s views regarding stratification, and stated that “globalization is associated with new patterns of stratification in which some states, societies and communities are becoming increasingly enmeshed in the global order while others are becoming increasingly marginalized” (p. 8). There are several cultural traditions that have vanished with the passage of time or have been modernized by the
West for its own benefit. As indicated by Fishman (2001), “process of globalization of the economy, communication and entertainment media, not to mention modernization-based consumerism as a way of life have threatened to sweep away everything locally authentic and different that may stand in their way” (p. xiii).

Globalization encourages people to enter the global market where they face the integration of their cultures with the pre-existing larger entity, the West. Smith and Ward (2000) and Fishman (2001) supported the idea of the integration of cultures for the betterment of economics, politics, and technology. However, they also addressed certain real social issues associated with globalization, such as loss of identity, commodification of cultures, and inequality, which have often been ignored. McKinley (2005) emphasized that, “while each country has to attend to their own indigenous language(s) and culture(s), the issue of their survival is global” (p. 225). Smith and Ward (2000) argued that globalization opens new doors and new ways of “selling” Indigenous culture. For the indigenous people, it is a challenge to “fight harder on a variety of fronts to ensure their cultural survival and to find new means for asserting their rights and autonomy in the face of the new threats posed by globalization” (Smith & Ward, 2000, p. 3) Indigenous people perceive globalization as a threat to “extend the process of colonization begun 400 years ago, giving rise to the possibility of a new invasion” (Smith & Ward, 2000, p. 2).

Unification with or fusion into other cultures and adhering to others’ beliefs is something that indigenous people have never wanted. Most indigenous people object to the fusion of their culture with others because they are physically, emotionally, and spiritually involved with their beliefs, and feel strongly that these beliefs should not be changed or modified for the sake of globalization. However, resisting cultural fusion has
created a number of problems and difficulties for indigenous people around the world. Indigenous people around the world are struggling to regain the lands that have been taken from them and have their institutions recognized, as well as to gain equal citizen status and be included in society without facing cultural and legal discrimination. If indigenous people were ever interested in mixing their culture with the dominant Western culture, with which they have a history of colonization and oppression, this mixing would have happened long ago. Goehring (1993) stated, “Faced with conquest, diseases, expulsion from their traditional lands and territories, and ever-increasing marginalization at the very fringes of a dominant and dominating larger society, it is a wonder that many Indigenous Peoples have survived these onslaughts of the past, and more, to exist at all into the present” (p. 35).

**Survival of Indigenous Societies Through Education**

Indigenous societies are in danger because of globalization, and they need to survive. Education has the power to communicate the issues of indigenous people and societies to the world – and it also provides a possible solution to the issues posed by globalization, if it is used as a tool to help preserve culture. One possible way of using education to preserve culture is the adoption of mother tongues as the medium of instruction at the primary school level (Kangas, 2000). Thiongo (1987) claimed that language is both the “carrier of cultures” and a “system of communication”; as such, language may be an ideal tool in local education to transfer the values, traditions, and beliefs of an indigenous culture to the next generation. Fishman (2001) stated that culture and language “stand for each other” (p. 22). McKinley (2005) posited, “The essence of language is not only linguistic, it is also the very existence of people. Hence it becomes
an issue of identity for without it ‘difference’ will become manifested in the physical attributes of a person” (p. 234).

UNESCO (2002) has long advocated for the inclusion of local languages in formal education systems. However, UNESCO (2002) also pointed out that in the current climate of rapid globalization, with wider availability of new information technology and the spread of democratic ideals, students need to be proficient both in international and regional languages to gain access to wider society and to participate meaningfully in their world.

**Relationship of Mother Tongue and Culture Preservation**

Many authors have acknowledged that there is a relationship between the use of a mother tongue and the preservation of a culture. Shinwari (2010) argued, “being an identity marker, mother tongue brings out the original and natural characteristics of a nation by manifesting a culture, psyche, history, societal norms, beliefs and social fabric” (p. 1). Several studies on a variety of indigenous cultures provide evidence for Shinwari’s claim. Lee and McLaughlin (2001) studied the Navajo culture, Pye (1992) focused on the Chilcotin language, Hermes (2005) worked with the Ojibwe language, and Coluzzi (2012) analyzed the English language influence in Malaysia and Brunai Darussalam, and Phinney, Romero, Nava., and Huang (2001) studied the role of a language in ethnic identity among immigrant families. In the case of effects of a foreign language on the immigrants, Oh and Fuligni (2009) investigated the proficiency of heritage language and use of language on parent–adolescent relationships and ethnic identity from Latin American and Asian backgrounds immigrants, and Papatheodorou (2007) studied the
Greek language. The results of all of these studies support the idea that mother tongue helps in preserving identity and culture, even if it is a minority language.

Hermes (2005) argued that a foreign language could never replace an indigenous language when it comes to making meaning. Hermes (2005) stated, “Meaning is more important than words. When the elder says, “keep the language”, what they means is “keep the thought”, because language is the clearest representation of that way of thought.” (p. 51). Rahman (2003) agreed with Hermes’ argument and claimed that children understand communication in their mother tongue from birth onwards. If children are taught different concepts in their mother tongue, they will make better meanings of the concepts. Cummins (2001) supported the meaning making process through mother tongue by giving an example of understanding the concept of telling time. Cummins (2001) argued that if the children understand the concept of telling time in mother tongue, when asked to “tell time in the second language (e.g. the majority language), they do not need to re-learn the concept of telling time; they simply need to acquire new labels or ‘surface structures’ for an intellectual skill they have already learned”(p. 18). Cummins (2001) also affirmed that discouraging children to use their mother tongue weakens their base of conceptual and personal learning and hence results in less achievement. Hence, there is a role of mother tongue in the base formation of a child.

To explore the relationship of early education in the mother tongue and cultural preservation, I have chosen to examine the Pukhtunwali (Pukhtun culture) and the Pukhtu language (mother tongue). This is the culture of the indigenous people of Afghanistan and Khyber Pukhtunkhwa (a province in
Pakistan). The people who follow Pukhtunwali are called Pukhtun. I have chosen to study Pukhtunwali in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa rather than Afghanistan because of its accessibility and higher security.

**Pukhtunwali (Pukhtun culture)**

Like other indigenous cultures, Pukhtun culture is very ancient. The origins of the Pukhtun culture predate the conquests of Alexander the Great in 330 B.C. (Caroe, 1958; Spain, 1963). The culture we see today has formed over the course of many centuries and is well preserved. According to Gankovsky (1964), “the fundamentals of Pashtun (Pukhtun) original culture and peculiar psychological make-up of Pashtuns had evolved by the second millennium AD” (p.129). The culture is highly integrated with its language, Pukhtu. Pukhtu is a language that belongs to the “Iranian branch of the Indo European language family [and] has more than 25 million native speakers. Out of these, 16 to 17 million live in Pakistan and 8 to 9 million in Afghanistan” (Rahman, 1995, p. 2).

Caro (1958), Hawkins (2009), Rome (2006), Strickland (2007), and Spain (1963) defined Pukhtunwali as the unwritten and well-defined code of honour, norms, traditions, and customs followed by Pukhtun people. Rome (2006) claimed that Pukhtuns are the major ethnic group in the Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and Spain (1963) described Pukhtuns as “the largest tribal society in the world” (p. 71). There are 60 Pukhtun tribes that comprise 16 million people, including 6 million in Afghanistan and 10 million in Pakistan (Human Development Report, 2009; Shinwari, 2010).
Like other cultures, Pukhtunwali (the code of Pukhtun life) also has several important basic tenets. These elements form the fundamentals of the Pukhtun society and have been transmitted from generation to generation. Teaching these tenets to the school children requires deep understanding of these tenets. If any of these tenets are not explained properly, the meaning of the tenet changes, which in turn affects the personal and social life of the Pukhtun children.

The last few decades, has seen a decrease in the intensity with which Pukhtunwali is practiced. The reason may be the way in which Pukhtunwali is portrayed into the people’s minds by education, media, and literature. In the past, families taught Pukhtunwali to their children. Children spent most of their time with their families or friends from whom they would learn their cultural practices. Now, with the presence of a public education system, children spend more time at school where they learn more from their teachers and fellow students. They still learn from their families but because they spend less time with them, they miss out on certain basic cultural norms. Thus, their knowledge of Pukhtunwali depends more on how teachers convey the culture to their students. The tenets of Pukhtunwali are in the Pukhtu language; when these tenets are translated into other languages, their original meaning sometimes changes or gets lost. Hence, instead of learning the original tenets, children learn the meaning of the English translated version of the tenets. The description of some of the tenets of Pukhtunwali is briefly given below.
Tenets of Pukhtunwali

Pukhtunwali refers to a predominant tribal system that regulates nearly all aspects of Pukhtun life, ranging from societal to personal levels (Rome, 2006). The social behaviour of the Pukhtun is highly influenced by the various intricate tenets of Pukhtunwali. Spain (1963) stated, “Nonetheless, there are important traditional and social factors which guide community life and in many cases influence or even determine the actions of individuals” (p.47). There are many tenets of Pukhtunwali but the main tenets are Nang (honour); Namus (self-esteem, honour); Melmastiya (hospitality); Nanawatay (asylum or refuge); Badal (exchange of good or bad deeds); and Jirga (consultation/decision making) (Caroe, 1957; Hawkins, 2009; Rome, 2006; Rzehak, 2011; Spain, 1963; Strickland, 2007). In what follows I elaborate on each of these.

**Nang/Honor.** The most dominant and important tenet in Pukhtunwali is the concept of ‘nang’ (also called nanga). Nang means defending the rights of oneself and of the whole tribe (Rzehak, 2011). Defending honour on a personal level is dignity and trust in oneself. A person who has a dignity and self-confidence can uphold the honour of one’s family, friends, sub-tribes, and tribes. To defend tribes or family means to protect their self-esteem in any circumstance and occasion when they are at stake. Hence, honour of the individual and that of tribes to which one belongs are both interdependent.

The most significant role played by nang is in the preservation of national honour and independence. It is nang that has compelled the Pukhtuns to take up arms for the
protection of the homeland and national honour when the different invaders came to capture their homeland (Rome, 2006).

Lieutenant Colonel Johnathan Hawkins (2009) considered the tenet of nang as bravery and honour and stated, “The tenet of nang or bravery is central to Pashtunwali, as youthful Pashtun males (sic) have it reinforced in them that brave and honorable actions on the battle field define a man” (p. 16). Hence, a Pukhtun can only be called nangyaalay if they have the ability to not only protect the honour of themselves but to protect the honour of the whole nation.

Many authors (Hawkins, 2009; Rzehak, 2011; Strickland, 2007; Spain, 1963) have explained nang belonging to male persons only in Pukhtunwali. But Pukhtun children and women have the same nang and responsibilities as that of the male member of the society. The responsibilities of nang are equal for both sexes in Pukhtunwali. If a man is responsible to protect his tribe and the women, woman too, is responsible for the protection of her tribe and men too. Women in the past history of Pukhtunwali have fought for Pukhtunwali honour in the battlefields, for example, Malalai of Maiwand also known as Malala. Malalai was called Malalai Anaa, meaning Mother of the Nation. She rallied the Pukhtun army against the British troops at the Battle of Maiwand in 1880. During the Second Anglo-Afghan War, Malalai fought alongside Ayub Khan and was responsible for the Afghan victory at the Battle of Maiwand (Johnson & Leslie, 2004).

There are other women who have fought and protected the honour of their nations. Nazo Tokhi (Nazo Anaa) is a famous name in the history of Pukhtuns. Nazo Tokhi was from an educated family and was a poet of Pukhtu language. She was called the Mother of
Nationalism as she protected the Pukhtunwali code by uniting the Pukhtun tribes against Persian armies. Zarghuna Kakar, who also fought for the honour of Pukhtuns followed Nazo Tokhi in the 18th century.

**Namus (esteeem, conscious, honor, reputation).** Namus is another tenet of Pukhtunwali. The word namus can be translated as honour, reputation, esteem, conscience, and chasteness (Rzehak, 2011). Some writers have translated it to “face” (Hawkins, 2009) or “saving face” (Strickland, 2007). Many writers have linked namus exclusively with female members (Hawkins 2009; Rzehak, 2011; Strickland, 2007). These writers reason that women gossip more than men this damages men’s reputations in Pukhtun societies. As indicated by Hawkins (2009), “it is this area where the females’ power base emerges” (p. 20). Rzehak (2011) related namus to other tenets like melmastia (hospitality) and purdah (modesty) that are the tenets of protection of guests and females.

**Melmastia (hospitality).** One of the better-known tenets of Pukhtunwali is melmastia, which means hospitality. Melmastia is an obligation to provide guests with food and lodging if it is required. Guests can be friends, relatives, colleagues of the host, or even strangers – regardless, the obligations of the host are the same. Melmastia is reflected in the construction of “guest houses” in villages and towns in the Pukhtu area (Strickland, 2007). The extent to which a Pukhtun can fulfill the tenant of melmastia depends on individual’s financial status. However, whether poor or rich, Pukhtuns will always feed their guests the best food in the house, and offer them the best lodging in the house. Often, Pukhtuns will give their guest the most precious thing in their house as a gift, as part of melmastia. In discussing melmastia, Spain (1963) stated, “the lavishness of the hospitality varies according to the circumstances of the host. A poor villager will
offer tea and stew up a few pieces of goat meat. A wealthy chief will place their house and the retainers at the guest’s disposal and feast him with whole sheep” (p. 47).

Melmastia is also expected to be reciprocal. Rome (2006) explained, “It is expected of the guest of today to be a host of tomorrow for the host of today” (p. 3). Guests are expected to return the hospitality of their host when they visit as a guest. However, it may be difficult for guests to return melmastia. Spain (1963) pointed out that Pukhtuns treats their guests with such hospitality that the guests may be embarrassed. Tribe’s people will honour guests to such an extent that it will become mandatory for these guests to honour their hosts in the same way when their roles are reversed. Some guests, especially foreigners, may not be in a position to meet the host again, meaning that they will never be in a position to return the host’s hospitality. Similarly, poor people may lack the resources to reciprocate the host’s melmastia. To make foreigners and poorer people feel comfortable and not burdened with melmastia, they are treated as Khudai melmanah, meaning guests served for the Almighty’s sake (Rome, 2006), and are not obligated to return melmastia.

Melmastia is an important tenet of Pukhtunwali because it expands the social network of hosts, increasing the honour of the host (Kakar, 2003). This link to honor is the reason hospitality is always provided to the best of a host’s abilities. The more people who witness the hospitality and honour of the host, the more likely it is that word will spread about the host’s hospitality and honour, and thus strengthen the position of the host in society.

Nanawatay (refuge or asylum). Nanawatay means asylum or refuge. Nanawatay
is an extension of melmastia, in which guests can ask for sanctuary for themselves or their property. Griffits (1981) described nanwatay as, “The most important extension of this part of the code…is the obligation to protect, with your life if necessary, the person and property of your guest, and, if he specifically takes refuge with you, to take up his cause as well” (p. 107). The nanwatay ritual is based on the concepts of hospitality (melmastia) and asylum according to which asylum must not even be refused to one’s enemy (Rzehak, 2011). The host must provide asylum and protect the honour of their enemies if they request asylum, and even forgive enemies if they admit their guilt in front of the host. Caro (1958) stated that “the denial of sanctuary is impossible for one who would observe Pakhtu; it cannot be refused even to an enemy who makes an approach according to Nanawatai [nanawatey] (p. 351).

Scholars have identified melmastia and nanawatay as the two aspects of Pukhtunwali that have the most impact on the day-to-day life of Pukhtuns. Nanawatay is also used to end a dispute or bloodshed. The offender enters the house of the opposing party, accepts his or her fault in front of the aggrieved party, and seeks pardon; the dispute is ended (Strickland, 2007).

Strickland (2007) highlighted that nanawatay may also be used by women when it comes to resolving marriages issues. Females can also use nanawatay to end a feud when they enter a host’s home. Young women can use nanawatay if they wish to marry someone other than the person chosen by their parents. If a woman receives permission to enter the house of the person she wishes to marry as a guest and asks the person to marry her, it becomes mandatory for the host to do so in order to maintain honour in the society.
**Badal (exchange or return).** *Badal*, has been defined by many scholars as revenge (Hawkins, 2009; Spain, 1963; Strickland, 2007; Quddus, 1987). However, this is a simplification of this tenet, which has other meanings as well. Badal also means exchange (Rzehak, 2009), or to return someone else’s work(s), deed(s), and favor (Rome, 2006). It is said by Pukhtun authors that both good deeds and bad deeds require equivalent actions in return. Rzehak (2011) stated, “Hence, the concept of badal expresses not merely the call for revenge, but also the obligation to thank for the provision of the help and to provide compensation” (p. 14).

Most Western authors, however, have only focused on the return of bad deeds and have paid little attention to the return of good deeds. International authors have linked badal to revenge only and not to the exchange or return of good deeds, which has created the negative image of badal to western countries. According to badal, good deeds may be repaid in many ways, such as providing assistance, doing a favor, giving something, and so forth. With respect to the reciprocation of good deeds, badal serves to regulate and facilitate the lives of Pukhtuns, which in turn results in unity and cooperation (Rome, 2006). Returning badal is obligatory, and the manner of reciprocation depends on status. Those who do not practice badal are not honored or respected in the tribe (Rome, 2006).

**Jirga (assembly).** *Jirga* is a tenet of Pukhtunwali that allows for both civil and criminal disputes to be resolved through a council of elders, called the Jirga. The Jirga is composed of mostly male members of the community, who gather to resolve issues concerning the community. Minor cases are resolved within the village, but major cases, while they may be resolved within the village, must also be reported to the local administration after resolution for verification (Ghani, 2010). Wardak (2003) cited Jirga
in Afghanistan as “a time-honoured institution that not only resolve many local, tribal, and national conflicts efficiently and in cost-effective ways, but also acts as a powerful channel of communication among the people of Afghanistan” (p. 1). He emphasized that Jirga plays a central role in maintaining social order and solidifying Afghan society. In Jirga, people sit in a circle, emphasizing the equality of participants and avoiding hierarchies; here, different issues at the local, tribal, and national levels are discussed (Yousufzai and Gohar, 2005).

**Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu language**

The above-mentioned tenets of Pukhtunwali are transmitted through the Pukhtu language, which plays a key role in their transmission. In fact, the word Pukhtunwali may be considered synonymous with the Pukhtu language (Rome, 2006).

Rome (2006) stated, “Pukhtu is not only the language but it is the code of the lives of those who speak it” (p. 1). Two very famous Pukhtu sayings are used to identify Pukhtunwali: *da Pukhtu dah* (it is Pukhtu) and *da Pukhtu na dah* (it is not Pukhtu) (Rome, 2006). These sayings mean that those who follow the norms, customs, and traditions given in the code of Pukhtunwali are truly Pukhtun, while those who fail to follow the code are not considered Pukhtun and lose their identity.

The language and the culture are so interconnected that other languages are insufficient to express the values of Pukhtunwali. All codes and principles of Pukhtunwali are written in Pukhtu, and these concepts can only be described and taught properly in the Pukhtu language. However, currently, the education system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa does not appear to be taking the interconnectedness of Pukhtu and
The Education System in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa

In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the first impediment to student learning is the medium of instruction. According to Burnaby (1982), “a medium of instruction, also called MOI, is a subject of instruction, and a means of communication which is used by a teacher to teach any subject matter (for example, mathematics, science, or language itself” (p.18).

The education system of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa is divided into different sectors such as public, private, and religious schools. There are three mediums of instruction used in the education system at the primary level: English (the official language), Urdu (the national language), and Pukhtu (the mother tongue). English is the medium of instruction in private and many public schools, whereas Urdu is the medium of instruction in public schools. The Pukhtu language is the main medium of instruction in religious schools in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa (Ahmad, 2004, 2011; Chohan, 2011; Hussain, 2008; Kazmi & Quran, 2005; Mirza, 2003; Nasir, 2011; Rahman, 2003). In a recent report on the education system in Pakistan, Coleman (2010) argued, “children’s formation of fundamental concepts takes place more effectively in their mother tongue because there are no barriers to comprehension” (p. 24). He added that the three different mediums of instruction in Pakistan cause confusion and make it hard for young learners to not only develop their understanding of basic concepts but also to learn about their cultures. Hermes (2005), like Coleman, claimed that language has the potential to
bridge the gap between the academic and cultural curricula. He noted that using
the mother tongue for instruction “creates a cultural context—a filter through
which any content can be viewed” (p. 53).

Rahman (2003) pointed out that different mediums of instruction have
given rise to different social issues affecting culture, the most intimidating of
which is the influence of foreign culture. Chohan (2011) observed that different
mediums of instruction in Pakistan have created a gap between classes and
societies. Kazmi and Quran (2005) and Nasir (2011) both made the point that
different mediums of instruction in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa had created nations
with totally different personalities, mindsets, morals, and skills.

Private schools in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa have promoted the mindset
that children who are not educated in a foreign language will be left behind in a
rapidly globalizing world. Therefore, parents who can afford to, send their
children to English medium schools. Parents who cannot afford English medium
schools send their children to Pukhtu medium schools. In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa,
this usually means sending children to religious schools where the focus is only
on learning and memorizing verses of the Quran (Holy book of Muslims).

The multiple mediums of instruction used in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa
have emphasized the class difference between children using different languages.
Children from English schools are socially judged as more confident and
progressive than those from Pukhtu schools. This difference is due to the fact that
English medium schools have more resources and teach students not only about
religion but also about other subjects such as science, math, and computer science. People in rural areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa often withdraw their children from school when they are exposed to other mediums of instruction. Consequently, the dropout rate in rural areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa is 70 percent, while the rate in urban areas is 60 percent (UNESCO, 2010/2011).

However, removing children from school is not a good solution to the problem of acculturation of the Pukhtun children, and by doing this Pukhtuns are conveying the impression to the world that they are not progressive people.

Government can be faulted for the flaws in the education system of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. For the last few decades, the education sector has not been a governmental priority. Government frequently makes policies to better the education system but fails to implement these policies (Hussain, 2008; Mirza, 2003). The result is that the education sector is becoming progressively weaker, ultimately affecting the overall situation of the country. The literacy rate is decreasing, and there are currently no plans to improve the literacy rate. In 2011, the Provisional Government of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa announced that Pukhtu will be the medium of instruction in all public and private sectors, but there appears to be no visible work on implementing the policy. The government does not appear to understand that if they do not actively work to implement their policies in education, the private sector will expand and replace the public sector. Such trend of neoliberalism are rampant in the government policies and via them getting legitimacy in the society. Neoliberalism, according to McChesney (1999), stated in the introduction of the Noam Chomsky book titled Profit Over People: Neoliberalism and global order is
Neoliberalism is the defining political economic paradigm of our time - it refers to the policies and processes whereby a relative handful of private interests are permitted to control as much as possible of social life in order to maximize their personal profit. (p. 7)

The disadvantage of this neoliberal trend of expansion is that the private sector is influencing the transmission of the Pukhtun culture, and ultimately threatening it by producing more foreign-like citizens and fewer Pukhtuns (Rzehak, 2011).

According to Dastgoshadeh and Jalilzadeh (2011), “language is not only an instrument for communication but is also related to a set of behavioural norms and cultural values of which one's self-identity is constructed. After learning a new language, one's perception of his or her competence, communicative style, and value systems may undergo some changes” (p. 2). Rahman (2003) argued that if children are told that their culture is not worthy, this will bring disgrace to them, they will naturally develop a negative view of their culture, and begin thinking of it as inferior, thus developing feelings of personal inferiority. Rahman (2003) emphasized that these feelings of inferiority make children ashamed of their culture and detach them from their true identity.

Cummins (2001) highlighted the importance of the mother tongue in the identity of a child. He stated, “To reject a child’s language in the school is to reject the child”. He stressed that when children are asked to leave their language and culture at the school door, they also leave their self-identities. This results in feelings of “rejection” that make the children less confident and active in classroom activities. Hence, leaving Pukhtu at the school door means children are also leaving their identities, legacies, history, and culture.
In discussing why languages die and how this death affects culture, Pye (1992) stated, “minority languages undergo a lowering of social prestige leading to a loss of domains of usage which finally results in the preference of the speakers to use another language” (p.75). In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, children are under a lot of pressure to compete in the global market. They see and learn that English is the dominant language in the world, and Pukhtu is limited to family members and the community. Children learn in English, and speak almost entirely in English at school. Due to the prevalence of English medium schools and globalization, speaking English has become a symbol of modernism in Pukhtun society. The result is that children prefer English to Pukhtu, ultimately decreasing the number of the Pukhtu language speakers.

As a result of the adoption of a foreign language as a medium of instruction in schools, the new generation of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa may drift from their culture. The children are taught basic concepts of culture and these concepts can only be properly conveyed in Pukhtu. Pukhtun children are forced to speak English, wear shirts, ties, and trousers instead of Kamis (shirt), parthog (trouser), lupatta (scarf), and patkay (turban). They are also required to interact with each other the way foreigners do. Pukhtun children learn more about Shakespeare than about Khushal Khan Khattak and Rahman Baba. Instead of learning the Pukhtun life style, they learn about foreign lifestyles, and are influenced by them.

Losing a language means losing a culture too. A number of researchers have demonstrated the connection between language death and the eventual death of culture, traditions, and religion. Barman, Hebert, and McCaskill (1986) stated,
The key to the future of any society lies in the transmission of its culture and worldview to succeeding generations. The socialization of children through education shapes all aspects of identity, instilling knowledge of the group's language, history, traditions, behaviour, and spiritual beliefs. (p. 150)

Pukhtuns are very attached to their culture; they will sacrifice their lives before losing their Pukhtu (Caro, 1958).

Many of the studies conducted on the education system in Pakistan (Berrit et al, 2007; Haque, 1987; Jan, 2012; Rahman, 1996) have addressed issues such as biased curriculum, inappropriate content, and out-dated information—all of which affect young learners’ minds. Several other researchers (Ahmad, 2001; Aly, 2007; Nayyar & Salim, 2003) have addressed the importance of using the local medium of instruction in educating students in schools.

**Summary**

In this literature review, I examined culture and the importance of language to culture. I concluded by examining Pukhtunwali, the Pukhtu language, and the education system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. To investigate the importance of the Pukhtu language in early education for cultural preservation, in this study I explore the perspectives of teachers on the role of mother tongue when use as a medium of instruction in the preservation of culture. The next chapter, Chapter 3, presents the methodology and methods used in this study.
CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY AND METHODS

This chapter provides the details of how this study was designed and conducted for the purpose of exploring the relationship between the use of one’s mother tongue at primary school and the preservation of one’s culture. This chapter starts with a rationale for the methodology used in. I then present the research methods used to collect data, the steps I took to collect data, and data analysis.

Research Methodology

This study was conducted by adopting a qualitative methodology. According to Patton (2002), “a Qualitative method typically produces a wealth of detailed information about a much smaller number of people and cases. This increases the depth of the understanding of cases and situations studied” (p. 14). Hence, qualitative methodology was helpful in conducting this study by allowing me to obtain in-depth views from a small number of participants. Qualitative research aims to understand a research problem from the perspective of the people it involves (Babbie & Mouton, 1998). This study was conducted with the objective of exploring participants’ views on the role of the Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali when used as a medium of instruction in primary schools in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Hence, a qualitative research methodology was selected.

The approach for the study was exploratory and ethnographic. Spradely (1979) argued that ethnography means learning from people rather studying people. This study was not about observing people’s attitudes or behaviours;
rather it was about exploring participants’ perceptions to gain a deeper understanding of the issue. Hence, this study used exploration and ethnography to comprehend and represent participants from the standpoint of insiders who were teachers teaching the content of Pukhtunwali to the Pukhtun students in a foreign language in schools.

**Research Method**

To get into the mindset of an insider and explore their perspectives, I conducted open-ended semi-structured individual interviews. Patton (2002) stated, “we interview people to find out from them those things we cannot directly observe” (p. 278); therefore, individual face-to-face interviews were conducted. My first intention was to observe the teaching and learning process between the teachers and the students and then interview the participants, but due to the fact that observation requires an extensive period of time, and wanting to keep to the duration of degree completion, I conducted interviews only.

**Interviews**

The majority of the research conducted on the Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu language is in the form of content and document analysis. The articles and studies that describe the role of the Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali have mostly portrayed Pukhtu language as an element of Pukhtun culture; studies did not examine the role of Pukhtu as a medium of instruction used in educational institutions. Furthermore, I found no studies that present teachers’ views on pedagogy and educational practices despite the fact that teachers play a pivotal role in educating society. The teacher who teaches students and interacts with
them on a daily basis is an important person whose views play a significant role in shaping and predicting the future of their students. Teachers are the backbone of the education system. They are the people that teach the curriculum, hone the skills of their students, build their personalities, and prepare them for the future. Therefore, I conducted interviews with primary school teachers who taught social studies. The social studies curriculum was selected because it has the content of Pukhtunwali culture.

The teachers were interviewed individually, which provided the opportunity to speak and share their views in confidence without any anxiety of being judged by other people involved in the process. In my role as a researcher, I made the interviews informal so the teachers could open up and speak their minds. The interviews were semi-structured and open-ended. According to Macmillan and Schumacher (1989), “semi structured questions have no choices from which the respondent selects an answer. Rather, the question is phrased to allow for individual responses” (p. 267). The interviews were open-ended in such a way that allowed the participants to openly share their views on the subject. Teachers gave their views on the present situation of education system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the curriculum taught, the presence of inclusion or exclusion of Pukhtunwali, and the impacts of English-language schools on the Pukhtun students’ personalities. (See Appendix A for the interview Guideline).

**Sample Site Criteria and Selection**

An area of Pakistan where there was a large population of Pukhtun children and English-language schools was needed to answer interview questions.
In the Northwest region of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the capital city Peshawar met the required criteria and was selected. Peshawar City was selected because it has a predominantly Pukhtun population and has the majority of the elementary schools. People from other cities also come to this city to admit their children in the schools.

In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the majority of schools are segregated by gender. However, there are some co-educational schools. Out of these schools, three large elementary schools were chosen from a section of the city that has a large Pukhtun population. One was an all boys' school, one was an all girls' school, and the third was coeducational school. All the chosen schools were semi-government schools and were English medium schools.

The reason for choosing segregated and co-education schools was to gather a variety of perceptions and to acknowledge potential differences in experiences due to gender. Rahman (1996) argued that in Pakistan, people from institutions where English is the medium of instruction and who are proficient in English-language, have a higher status than those of other languages. Rahman (1996) further said that in employment selection, people with an English-language background are preferred over other language backgrounds. English is also the official language of the country. English medium schools were selected because English medium schools are the most influential schools in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

In this study, to keep the confidentiality of the schools, the schools were named as School A, School B, and School C. The all boys’ school was named as
School A, the all girls’ school was named as School B, and the co-education school was named as School C. All the three schools are briefly described.

Description of Schools

**School A (All boys’ school):** School A is situated in the Peshawar city of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. It is a segregated school for boys. The aim of the school is to provide quality education at an affordable cost, hence, the admission fee for the students is 8000 Rupees ($ 80.31) and monthly tuition fee is 1800 Rupees ($ 18.07) approximately. Established in 1979, it has 5 branches in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

In School A, the enrolment at present is 1497 students. Due to the large population of the School A, each class is further divided into sections such as grade 5 has sub sections Grade 5 A, B, C, D, and so on. For every subject, there is a separate teacher. There are presently 44 teachers in School A. In this school, National curriculum is followed. The subjects taught at primary level (from Grade 1 to Grade 5) include Math, English, Urdu, Islamiyat, Social studies, and physical education.

School A has different facilities to facilitate the students. School A has a transportation system, a dispensary for medical aid, and a cafeteria. School A has sports facilities for students that include volleyball, basketball, table tennis, and badminton courts. School A is equipped with a computer lab and a library. The library has a collection of books, literature and magazines for students and staff in English and Urdu. However, there are no books or literature in Pukhtu language.
School B (All girls’ school): School B is an all girls’ school. It is situated in the Peshawar city of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Established in 1994, the present student’s enrolment in School B is 3397. It has 2 other branches in the same city. It is crowded with students, which mostly belongs to the Peshawar city. School B has the classes divided into sub-sections because of the large population of students. For every subject there is a separate teacher. At present, there are approximately 160 teachers teaching classes from kindergarten to grade 10. The curriculum followed in School B is the National curriculum across Pakistan. At primary level, the courses taught to students are English, Urdu, Islamiyat, Math, Social studies, and physical education.

School B also provides facilities to their students. This school has a computer lab, cafeteria, and medical aid. In sports, they have basketball, volleyball, and squash courts. Besides textbooks, School B is equipped with a stock of books both local and imported books of fiction, literature and periodicals for both students and staff.

School C (Co-education): In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the schools are mostly segregated but there are also some co-education schools that are private schools. School C is a co-education that was established 1974. It is situated in the city of Peshawar, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. It has 174 branches all over Pakistan and overseas (Dubai, Jeddah, Dhaka, Kuala Lumpur, and Pullian).

School C follow British-oriented curriculum integrated with the National curriculum from the Nursery level to the Cambridge International Examinations level for
16 and 17 years age group. The school provides more than 120 courses each year across age ranges. The curriculum is designed in such a way to challenge and encourage the child to use the power of intelligence to optimum capacity.

School C provides practical classrooms available for art, science, music, design, and technology lessons for students. Visiting the school, I noticed some beautiful artwork done by the staff and the students on the walls of the school and inside the classrooms. Apart from practical classrooms, the school facilitates the students with a computer lab to provide Information and Communication Technology from primary level. However, there are no sports facilities. There is a small ground with a slide and a few swings. The library of School C is stocked with books that support the curriculum and the reading programs. There are English and Urdu books but no Pukhtu language books.

**Participant Selection**

**Criteria for Participation.** Cohen, Mansioin and Morrison (2003) identified that purposive sampling is done when a researcher has to choose a sample for a specific purpose, therefore, purposeful sampling was used for this study. Participants were selected according to the criteria listed below, which was determined before the data were collected. The reason for creating a criterion was to choose those people who were associated with both the education system and teaching and learning process. Participants who were chosen indicated that they were capable of observing the influences of the medium of instruction used in the school system on their students and could visualize the future of their students regarding the transmission of their culture to the next generation.
through medium of instruction. Further, the teachers selected for this study had to fulfill the following criteria:

- Belong to the Pukhtun culture,
- Live in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa,
- Possess a Masters in Education degree,
- Age range be between thirty and forty years old,
- Teach fifth-grade social studies, and
- Have at least five years of uninterrupted teaching experience.

Fifth-grade teachers were selected because in fifth-grade the entire primary level curriculum is summarized and revised. From sixth grade on, the curriculum changes from social studies to Pakistan studies that do not include content on Pukhtunwali. In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the educational backgrounds of teachers teaching primary school level vary from Bachelors to a Masters degree in Education. I chose teachers with a Masters degree and with at least five years of experience so that they would be familiar with the education system and its dilemmas. As such, it was expected that when they were asked questions regarding the role of various mediums of instruction in the preservation of culture and of ways to modify the education system for the betterment of the nation and the culture, they would be able to answer them based on their personal experiences.

**Recruiting Process.** I was required to go to another country (Pakistan) for the purpose of collecting my data. Before leaving for Pakistan, I completed the required course in the
Tri- Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans Course on Research Ethics (TCPS 2: Core) (See Appendix- B) mandatory for all graduate students. My study involved humans; therefore, I was required to apply for ethics. I received my ethical clearance from the Queen’s General Board of Ethics in January 2013 (See Appendix-C). After receiving ethical approval for my study, I went to Pakistan 3rd of February 2013 for the purpose of collecting my data.

When I reached Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the conditions were not ideal. I faced delays in my tasks because of the unstable situation of the province. I was stuck in traffic for hours because roads needed to be closed due to blasts in the specific area, often there were power outages, and other small issues served to delay my study. But against all odds, I was able to complete my data collection in the month of March 2013.

I went to the schools in the beginning of February 2013 to meet the Principals of the three largest elementary schools in the Peshawar city of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa to seek their approval to conduct research in their schools. I was fortunate enough to gain their approval. Following their approval, which was verbal, I asked them to organize a meeting of all grade five social studies teachers at their schools. The meetings were arranged each of School A, School B and School C at 10:30 a.m., which was the lunch break time in all chosen schools. These meetings took place in the beginning of February.

There was large student population of students in each selected school. To adjust the students, every class was further divided into sub-sections such as Grade 5 A, Grade 5 B, Grade 5 C, and so on. In every class there were approximately forty students,
therefore, there were additional teachers for each grade. In School A, there were four grade five teachers; School B and School C had three teachers each.

At each meeting, I introduced myself as a researcher and the purpose of my research. I outlined the criteria for participation and asked that they consider participating. I distributed the Letter of Information and Consent form (See Appendix D). I was asked a few questions regarding my study. It was surprising for them that I came all the way from Canada to interview teachers. Even though the security situation was not good in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, it was astonishing that none of the teachers in the meetings were worried about their confidentiality and almost every teacher said that if I needed to, I could quote their original names with their views directly into my thesis. I was already, at this early stage, building rapport and trustworthiness in my data.

After the meetings, I asked the teachers in all three schools if they could take their time to read the forms and then contact me directly using the information provided on the Letter of Information. On the next day, I was fortunate enough to start receiving the phone calls from the teachers willing to participate in my study. The first six teachers who responded to the call for participation and who met the criteria were chosen to participate in this study.

**Sample Size.** I selected my participants from three schools: a girls’ school, a boys’ school, and a co-educational school. Selecting participants from different types of schools allowed me to obtain a variety of perspectives. In total, I interviewed six teachers; two male teachers were selected from the all boys’ school, two female teachers were selected from the all girls’ school, and one male and one female teacher were
selected from the co-education school. Keeping my sample size small was because I wanted my data to be more descriptive, in-depth, properly conductive and accurate. Croach and Mckenzie (2006) stated that in qualitative interviews, “a small number of cases (less than 20 say) will facilitate the researcher’s close associations with the respondents, and enhance the validity of fine–grinned, in-depth inquiry in naturalistic settings” (p. 1). Fletcher and Plakoyiannaki (2011) also pointed out that if there are many case studies, the data becomes thinner and loses its depth. My small sample size provided the context for an in-depth understanding about the perceptions of my participants.

**Introduction of the Participants.** To conduct this study, I created criteria and used this criterion for selection. Below I provide a brief introduction of the participants that agreed to participate in the study and who met the criteria for the study. I have used pseudonyms to address the participants in order to keep participant confidentiality.

**School A:** Two male teachers from an all boys’ branch school were selected, (1) Fawad and (2) Imran.

**Fawad:** Fawad is a thirty-year-old teacher, teaching social studies curriculum to fifth-grade in an all boys’ school. He has taught for eleven years. He is married and has two children both of school age. He was born in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa to a Pukhtun family and also got his early education in the Pukhtu language. His extended family lives in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Fawad is determined to teach and has no desire to pursue a career in administration.

**Imran:** Imran calls himself a true Pukhtun, for whom this means keeping relationships and family members happy is his priority. Imran is a primary school teacher
teaching social studies curriculum to the fifth grade. He has taught for five years. He has done his Master’s degree in Education and now is working on his Ph.D. He was born in Mardan District, Peshawar, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa in a Pukhtun family. He got his early education in Pukhtu language and now is teaching in an English medium school. He is inspired to advance into administration in order to promote Pukhtu language in the curriculum.

**School B:** Two female teachers were selected from the all girls’ school, School B. (1) Ambar, and (2) Nazia.

*Ambar:* Ambar was born in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa in Khyber Agency. She belongs to Pukhtun community and has been married for the last two years. She got her Master’s degree in Education from Peshawar University. She studied in an English medium school. Ambar taught social studies curriculum in the girls’ school to second grade for two years, then she was promoted to teach fifth-grade social studies. She has done this for nine years. She wants to work in administration for the purpose of improving the teaching and learning process by making it more flexible. Due to her own personal experience, she believes that young children are very shy in the beginning of their schooling; therefore, teachers should be flexible with the children and helpful in developing their confidence levels. Most of Ambar’s family members are in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, but a few went outside of the country to get a better education. Ambar is very close to her culture and she believes that if her culture is taken away from her, she will not be able to survive in this world. She is fluent in the English, Urdu, and Pukhtu languages.
**Nazia:** Nazia is a primary school teacher teaching social studies curriculum to fifth grade. She has taught for the last six years. She got her early education in Urdu language. She did her Master’s degree in Education from Peshawar University. She can speak, read, and write in Urdu and English. She speaks and reads in Hindko and Pukhtu languages. Nazia is a Pukhtun and was born in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Nazia’s extended family lives in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Nazia is aspired to go to administration and give Pukhtu language its true status by promoting it in the curriculum. For Nazia, living in a joined family system (extended family in western terms) where all family members live together and share their grief and joy means a lot to her.

**School C:** School C was a co-education school; therefore, one male and one female teacher were selected for interviewing. The male teacher was given the pseudonym Nadeem and the female teacher was Fehmida.

**Nadeem:** Nadeem is a married man with two children living in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. He was born in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa into a Pukhtun family. He got his early education in English and now is teaching in the co-education school, which is also an English medium school. He can read, speak, and write in English and Urdu but can only speak in the Pukhtu language. He has taught fifth grade social studies for eleven years. Due to the workload in school, Nadeem has never thought about going into administration. Nadeem lives in an urban area where people practice different cultures; therefore, he pays special attention to his children practicing their culture.

**Fehmida:** Fehmida is a female teacher in co-education school who has taught for the last five years. She teaches social studies curriculum to the fifth grade. She was born
in Hango, Khyber Pukhtunkhwa in a Pukhtun community. She got her early education in English language in Hango and obtained her Master’s degree in education from Peshawar University. Fehmida is fluent in the English, Urdu, and Pukhtu languages. Fehmida aspires to promote female education, which she believes is given less importance in many areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

To summarize the participants in this study, Table 3.1 below displays the school, participant’s pseudonym, and years of teaching experience.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>School</th>
<th>Participant pseudonym</th>
<th>Years of teaching experience</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>Fawad</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Imran</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>Ambar</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Nazia</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>Nadeem</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fehmida</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Data Collection**

Data collection for this study started in February 13, 2013 and ended in the first week of March 5, 2013. It took approximately three weeks to complete the data collection.
process. Data was collected conducting six face-to-face individual interviews. Interviews were approximately one hour in duration.

**Interview Site**

Macmillan and Schumacher (2010) stated “choosing a site is a negotiation process to obtain freedom of access to a site that is suitable for the research problems and feasible for the researcher’s resources of time, mobility and skills” (p. 351). Therefore, keeping accessibility and feasibility of this study in my mind, I selected a site that was not out of my participants reach and was feasible in terms of a time and security. I conducted my interviews in a library of a very well known university, Peshawar University, which is situated in the center of Peshawar city of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and can be easily accessed. The reason of selecting the local library, as opposed to the schools themselves was to maintain the confidentiality of the participants. According to Macmillan and Schumacher “qualitative researchers believe that the behaviour is best understood as it occurs in without external constraints and control” (p. 322). Therefore, during my meeting, I mentioned the chosen site for conducting interviews to the teachers and gave them the freedom to a different site where they would be comfortable. All participants agreed to the site I had suggested and confirmed by phone that they would be comfortable to be interviewed in the local university library.

The University library is a local library that is open throughout the week. However, on Saturdays and Sundays, due to the weekend, there are mostly fewer people visiting the library. The library website (http://www.upesh.edu.pk/facilities/?q=library) indicates that the library is called the Central Library and was established in February
The library is a three-storied building with an area of about 15,000 square feet. A block was added to the library in 1972. The Library provides services and facilities to the staff and student of the University. In addition to the usual stock, it houses a good Oriental Collection of valuable and rare books and manuscripts. The humanitarians of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa have donated a number of collections on local history and tribal customs and traditions.

In the library, computers, Internet, and e-mail facilities are available. According to the library manager the Library is being completely refurbished and soon its operations will be digitalized.

According to the website of the Central Library, it has been declared as an official United Nations Library, which is one of the seven UN Depository Libraries. Publications and official United Nations texts are placed here, which according to the website of the Central library is for the purpose of providing current information about the activities of the United Nations to as many as possible within the country.

Like other libraries, this library has different facilitated areas where people can sit and do their research, read, or write in peace. I selected a separate room in the library for interviews, which was often used for conferences or meetings. I needed a site where nobody would disturb my participants or me during the interviews. This room was in the corner of the library on the third floor, which was usually vacant and undisturbed. I booked the room for all my interviews. The staff of the library was very helpful in making sure that we were not disturbed during the interviews.
Schedule for Interviewing

When participants called me to confirm their participation in the study, I asked each participant their availability for their interviews. All participants gave me their schedule. It was worth asking them because in this way, there were no conflicts in the timing and the days. All six interviews were conducted after 12:00 p.m. on weekends. The following is the schedule of the interviews.

Fawad was interviewed on Sunday, 10th February 2013 at 1:00 p.m. The duration of his interview was one hour, three minutes and twenty nine seconds. Nadeem was interviewed on Saturday, 16th February 2013 at 1:30 p.m. The duration of his interview was forty-five minutes and sixteen seconds. Nazia was interviewed on 17th of February 2013 at 1:30 p.m. Nazia was a quick speaker; therefore, her interview duration was thirty-seven minutes and forty-six seconds. Ambar was interviewed on Saturday, 5th March 2013 at 3:19 p.m. The duration of her interview was one hour, eleven minutes and forty seconds. Imran was interviewed on the Saturday February 23rd 2013 at 2:30 p.m. His interview was forty-four minutes and nineteen seconds long. Fehmida was interviewed on Sunday, February 24th 2013 at 1:00 p.m. Her interview was thirty-five minutes and twenty-two seconds.

Process of Interviewing

Participants were interviewed individually in order to maintain confidentiality. The interviews were conducted face-to-face. The duration of interviews given in my proposal was approximately one hour but when I started conducting the interviews, a few
interviews were little shorter than one hour and some were little longer. The reason was some participants were taking less time to share their views and some took more time.

All interviews were audiotaped. I followed the table of Patton (1990), which was used for ensuring the high quality tape recording. The table suggested that everything should be checked and ready before conducting an interview. Therefore, I recorded the data by using two audio devices with the permission of my participants, to ensure that everything was recorded properly.

Before starting the interviews, I prepared an interview guide (See Appendix A), which is an informal "grouping of topics and questions that the interviewer can ask in different ways for different participants" (Lindlof & Taylor, 2002). According to Patton (1987), interview guides provide the topics or subject areas about which the interviewer is free to explore, probe, and ask questions that will elucidate and illuminate that particular subject” (p. 111). Hence, the interview guide helped me to focus each interview on the topics at hand without constraining them to a particular format. This freedom allowed me to tailor questions to the interview context/situation, and to the people I was interviewing. Patton stated, “The advantage of the interview guide is that it makes sure that interviewer has carefully decided how best to use the limited time available in an interview situation” (p. 111). Therefore, to explore the perceptions of the teachers, I organized the questions in the interview guideline in three categories: personal background related questions, professional background related questions and lastly, questions related to the relationship of Pukhtu language and Pukhtunwali.

It was necessary to ask my participants questions about their personal and professional background because the answers to these questions provided me with an
opportunity to double-check that my participants met the criteria for my study. All participants were Pukhtuns, belonged to Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and Pukhtunwali. All the participants have done their Master’s degree, and had a teaching experience of at least five years teaching the grade five social studies course. This information guaranteed me that participants met the interview criteria.

I started my interviews by welcoming my participants. I provided some food items to the participants before the interviews began. I asked each of my participants to introduce themselves. After introduction, demographic questions were asked. Patton (1987) stated, “These questions concern the identifying characteristics of a person being interviewed. Answers to these questions help you locate the respondent in relation to other people” (p. 119).

Then professional questions were asked which included their teaching experience, what they are teaching, and whether they had any inspiration to go to administration. After personal and professional background questions, questions regarding their culture were asked, such as defining the term culture, what they like and dislike in their culture and family structure in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

The participants were then asked the questions regarding the cultural background of the students and the curriculum for fifth grade social studies. Here the main questions were:

- How do you see the role of medium of instruction in relation to the preservation of culture?
- Do you perceive changes in the Pukhtun culture over the last several decades? If
yes, to what do you attribute these changes? Please elaborate.

- Do you think it important to keep a sense of cultural identity through the major processes of change?
- What do you think is the relationship between language of instruction and cultural preservation? Please elaborate.

The interviews were semi-structured and open-ended; therefore, the questions asked were not always in the sequence given in the interview guide. Sometimes, I had to ask a question before its sequence in the interview guide. The reason was that the participant would mention something that would answer another question given in the interview guide.

My goal for conducting interviews with participants was to gather in-depth data on their point of views, which Patton (2002) called the “head stuff”; therefore, listening to participants’ perspectives and probing were essential methods in my interviews. For example, I asked Ambar what she perceived as changes in Pukhtunwali and what she attributed these changes to:

Of course, there is a change in Pukhtun culture. If I see my family and myself or I see my surroundings, the society, I can see so many things that have changed. My grandmother and mother tell the tales of their lives, I feel my life is different from their lives. In old times, there were so many things such as traditions that we cannot see today in our society. And there are some good changes and some negative changes, some small changes and some big changes. [AMB: MARCH 5: 137]

Researcher: Can you give me any example of these changes?

Ambar: I will give you an example of small and big changes and good and negative changes as well […] everyone is now busy in his own life and a beautiful tradition of our culture is lost at least in the urban areas. [AMB: MARCH 5: 147]
Q17: Okay. What do you think is the reason for this change?

Ambar: Every change has its own reasons. Change in [Pukhtu] language occurred, because the more you are exposed to education, the more you move away from Pukhtu language [...] There are good and bad customs in every culture and if a bad custom is changed, so I think it’s a good change in our culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 182]

Hence, I probed about the changes that have happened in the Pukhtunwali in Ambar’s interview by asking her to give me an example of changes when she mentioned the changes in Pukhtunwali. Further, I probed for the reason for the changes she mentioned. In this way, I tried to explore the views of Ambar regarding changes in Pukhtunwali and reasons for the changes.

I kept a reflex journal on the research data and experience. Macmillan and Schumacher (2010), stated, “A reflex journal traces the researcher’s ideas and personal reactions throughout the fieldwork” (p. 334). My journal helped me to keep my views separate from my participants’ views. This helped me identify my own biases. Sometimes, when my inner voices tried to distract me, I would write my thoughts in the journal so that I was not distracted and was more focused.

The main task in interviewing was to understand the meaning of what the interviewees say (Kvale, 1996), therefore, to get a better understanding of the meaning of my participants, I conducted interviews in the Pukhtu language. It was one of the strategies given by Macmillan and Schumacher (2010) to enhance validity of the data. According to Macmillan and Schumacher, “interviews are phrased in the informant’s language, not in an abstract social science terms” (p.
The interviews conducted in the Pukhtu language made the interviews flexible and without language barrier.

The interviews were later translated into the English-language and back translated to the Pukhtu language by back translation method. According to Roy (2009), “The back translation method is used for translating the same document or the questionnaire back from the target language to the original (source) language” (p. 100). Back translation was done to provide rigor to the study by translating the views of participants in both English and Pukhtu languages to ensure that every view was translated in the same way as meant by the participant.

**Trustworthiness**

Macmillan and Schumacher (2010) provided the strategies to enhancing the validity of the data. In the strategies, one strategy was member checking which according to Macmillan and Schumacher, is done to confirm participants’ meanings. Macmillan and Schumacher (2010) stated, “member checking can also be done within an interview as topics are rephrased and probed to obtain more complete and subtle meanings” (p. 331). Therefore, I also did a member check with my participants by repeating the answer given by the participant to ensure the meaning of the participant and to increase the validity of the data. In this way, any misconceptions were reduced and precise answers were obtained. For example, exploring Fehmida’s views on the changes in Pukhtunwali, she provided me information about why Pukhtun people do not know what is going on in other people’s lives. Fehmida stated that since people are busy in their lives, they do not have time for each other. To confirm that she thought this was the case and also
attributed the lack of concern for others as the reason for the changes in Pukhtunwali, I repeated her answer.

Researcher # Q20: Do you perceive changes in the Pukhtun culture over the last several decades? If yes, to what do you attribute these changes? Please elaborate.

Fehmida: In the past, people used to sit together, have communication with each other, now it doesn’t happen anymore. People used to stand for each other in grief and happiness. People would know what is going on in their neighbour hood and they would help each other. Now everyone is so busy in their lives that they don’t have time for each other. Now most of their time is spend at work place, on Internet, and on using cell phone. Now people are not aware of each other’s situation. [FEH: FEB 24:98]

Researcher # Q21: So you mean that since people have become busy that is why they don’t have time to spend with each other and that is why changes have occurred in Pukhtunwali?

Fehmida: Yes. [FEH: FEB 24: 107].

Hence, probing and repeating the answers of the participants increased the validity of my data. After listening to my participant views and recording them, the phase of my data collection ended and the next phase was to analyze the recorded data.

**Data Analysis**

According to Macmillan and Schumacher (2010), “Qualitative analysis is a relatively systematic process of coding, categorizing, and interpreting data to provide explanations of a single phenomenon of interest” (p. 367). This study was analyzed inductively where themes emerged from the raw data. Inductive analysis, according to Macmillan and Schumacher, “is the process by which researcher synthesize and make
meaning from the data, starting with specific data and ending with categories and patterns” (p. 367). Here themes that emerged from the raw data are not identified prior to the data collection (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010; Patton, 1987).

**Interview Data**

The interviews were audiotaped. According to Macmillan and Schumacher (2010), “tape or digital recording the interview ensures completeness of the verbal interaction and provides material for reliability checks” (p. 360). To “prepare the data for visual review” (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010, p. 370), transcription was done. Transcription is the process that converts the information given in the data into a format that facilitate analysis (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010). Hence, to facilitate analysis, interviews were transcribed verbatim by myself using Microsoft Word. The transcription consumed quite a time as Macmillan and Schumacher stated, “audiotaped transcription of typed notes requires considerable time and resources”(p. 370). In my research the back translation added to the length of the time. Transcribing the data into a Pukhtu language and then translating the Pukhtu transcribed data into English language and again back translating it into Pukhtu language was a time consuming process. During the transcription, the original names of the teachers were changed into pseudonyms to keep their confidentiality. After the necessary required editing, I duplicated the data to keep a copy of the raw data.

A dining room table method of analysis was adopted to analyze the data. According to Macmillan and Schumacher (2010), this is a process in which “coded piece of data written on cards, spread out, and then sorted into piles according to different
categories” (p. 377). Analyzing the data by hand and hard copy provides familiarity with the data and makes the researcher capable of controlling the sorting and rearranging of the data more efficiently (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010). Initially, in the analysis process, I printed out the English transcripts on the paper and read it again and again to identify the codes. I coded the data by looking for similar words and phrases mentioned by the interviewees. Then, I used coloured highlighters to highlight the similar codes (See Appendix F). Next, I put together the codes that were similar and formed the categories from these codes. I identified the categories by searching both the contrary and supporting evidence about the meaning of the category (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010). Then, I started searching for the relationship among the identified categories to find a theme (See Appendix G for an example of theme 2 as). The relationship among the categories is called a theme (Macmillan and Schumacher, 2010). At the end, all the categories were pasted on the white hard sheet under the themes identified (See Appendix H). All the themes were pasted on the top of the hard sheet, under which, categories were pasted in highlighted form. It gave me a visual representation of my data, which further assisted me in the analysis of the data.
Patton (2002) posits that reliability and validity are the two most important factors that every researcher must be mindful of while designing his study, analyzing the data and results and judging the overall quality of study. For the purpose of ensuring reliability and validity of my study, I digitally audio-recorded the interviews with the permission of the interviewees. I transcribed the interviews verbatim by myself to avoid the risk of wrong interpretation of the data by a third-party transcriber (Poland, 2002). I used the method of member checking (Macmillan & Schumacher, 2010) to confirm that the interviewees meant whatever I have recorded or transcribed. Therefore, in my stay in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, I finished the transcription of the interviews in Pukhtu language and asked the participants to check whether their words match the wording given in the

*Figure 3. Coding of the data categories and their theme.*

**Trustworthiness of data analysis**

Trustworthiness of data analysis...
transcription (See Appendix I). Checking the transcripts with the participants was helpful in enhancing the conformability and the objectivity of the data.

I then translated the interviews into English language and used the method of back translation to omit the possibility of error or misinterpretation. A transparent coding process and checking the interpretations against the raw data established dependability and credibility of the data. (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Whenever, there was a slight chance of becoming biased, I referred to the reflex journal and wrote my reactions or thoughts about the interpretation.

I kept a research journal specifically for data analysis process and it was other than my reflex journal. In my research journal all the dates and the activities taking place in the data analysis were recorded for each period of time. In the journal, the changes in the themes or names of codes, categories or any other information that I might need later were also recorded. These steps were particularly taken to confer validity and reliability on my data analysis.

**Summary**

This chapter presented research methodology, research methods, data collection, and data analysis. Chapter 4 presents the results of the study. Following Chapter 4, results will be discussed in Chapter 5.
CHAPTER 4

RESULTS OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study was to explore the views of six primary school teachers concerning the relationship between the use of mother tongue as a medium of instruction and the preservation of culture. The perceptions were of participants who were teachers with a Masters degree in Education. The teachers with any other qualification may have had different views. Therefore, the data represents responses from the teachers with a Masters degree in education. In this chapter, I report the responses of these teachers to the interview questions.

Data analysis revealed five broad themes in the responses of the participants. Many of the themes include arguments in support as well as against the inclusion of instruction in Pukhtu at the primary school level for the preservation of Pukhtunwali. I have arranged each of the five themes in the order of the interview guidelines and the responses given by the participants. I have also stated the questions that covered the responses from which the theme emerged. The five themes are listed below followed by the reporting of the data for each theme:

- Theme 1: Pukhtunwali and its importance,
- Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali,
- Theme 3: Factors responsible for the changes in Pukhtunwali,
- Theme 4: Role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali, and
- Theme 5: Role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at primary level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.
Theme 1: Pukhtunwali and its Importance

This study was about exploring the role of instruction in a mother tongue at the primary school level in the preservation of culture. Teachers teaching fifth grade social studies in English medium schools responded to the items listed below. From their answers, the first theme to emerge was the importance of Pukhtunwali.

After asking participants for their general definition of culture to start the interview session, I asked them about their perspectives of their own culture and how important they felt it is to keeping their culture intact. This section includes the responses of teachers when asked the following questions:

- What is your definition of culture?
- What culture do you consider yourself to be a part of and to what extent do you follow your culture?
- Describe family life in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?
- What do you consider to be the most remarkable thing about your culture?
- Are there things about the Pukhtun culture that you don’t like?

I asked these questions in order to investigate the importance of Pukhtunwali in their lives, as well as explore which aspects of the culture are most highly valued and which aspects are disliked.

Q. What is your definition of “culture?”

When participants were asked about the definition of culture during the interview, the majority defined it as a way of spending life and as a way of life that includes
language, dress, traditions, values, actions, and behaviour in a society. Imran said that culture is not something that can be observed in a single individual, but that it is a specific way that the majority of people spend their everyday lives.

It is a way of life…. the way people spend their lives. I am talking about simple everyday life. Culture is not how an individual spend her life but culture is how majority of the people spend their lives. If we take it in English language “it is a way of life” the way we spend our lives… how we spend our lives. But do we spend our lives the way our ancestors spent, a simple life with no spikes and jeans, but a simple life right? Culture is basically how majority of the people in an area spend their lives. [IMR: FEB 23: 54]

Nadeem added that culture is transmitted from generation to generation through the elders.

Culture is the traditions, values, dress, language that our elders transmitted to us…. The way in which people spend their lives, speak language, dress up, food all is culture. [NAD: FEB 16: 25]

Nadeem further added that his culture (Pukhtunwali) is unique. He said:

Our traditions, characteristics, our language, dress, food are different from other cultures. [NAD: FEB 16: 26]

Amber defined culture as “a specific way of life”. Ambar stated that culture is not only the name of a language but also how a person dresses, the language she speaks, how she socializes, and how she follows rituals. Amber further added that even a person’s thinking, how she perceives life and people’s actions, and how she herself acts in good and bad situations, all fall under the definition of culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 45]
Amber believed that culture is embedded in the routine of everyday life, from the time one wakes up in the morning to the time when one goes to sleep at night. She said people’s actions and behaviour represent their culture.

Aa… I think culture is not a name of one thing. Its a group of things for example, how a person wakes up in the morning, eats her food, goes to work, meets people and socializes with people. In short, a person takes every action under a specific culture, the way she meets and greets people, how a person behaves at work place, a person’s behaviour at home. Hence, a person performs every activity under a specific culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 51]

Nazia briefly defined culture and said that culture is how a person speaks and eats, what he or she wears, and how he or she behaves in a society. Fehmida also defined culture as “the way people spend their lives” [FEH: FEB 24: 46]. Fawad did not give a general definition of culture; instead he defined Pukhtun culture in response to this question, so his answers are addressed later in this chapter.

Q. What culture do you consider yourself to be a part of and to what extent do you follow your culture?

All six teachers identified themselves as Pukhtuns, which verified that they fulfilled one of the criteria for participants for my study. The teachers identified themselves as “true Pukhtuns”, and said that they loved and followed their culture in every aspect of their lives. Nazia identified the aspects of Pukhtunwali she felt most strongly about:

Our culture is about hospitality, respect of elders and love of youngsters. There is a unique status of each individual, such as parents have their own status, siblings have their own status, and elders and young people have their own status. Our culture is very beautiful and I love my culture and follow it as much as I can. [NAZ: FEB 17: 45]
Amber indicated the importance of maintaining relationships and proper social behaviour in Pukhtunwali. She said that she follows her culture in every aspect of her life and emphasized the importance of not forgetting one’s culture.

Aa... um... If it is about my life, there is a huge impact of Pukhtunwali on my life. I still follow the culture in every aspect of my life, the same culture that I was born in. Whether it is my behaviour with my husband or my in-laws or friends I follow my cultural values and ways. Even when I socialize and entertain guests, I follow it, hence my every action is based on my Pukhtunwali. Pukhtunwali is a code of conduct for me. I am a big supporter of my culture and always advise people not to forget their culture and cultural values. Our traditions and customs have prevailed for centuries and our Pukhtun way of thinking must prevail in future as well. The reason why our lives and everything around us is running smoothly and the reason why people take care of each other are because of our cultural values and what they teach us. [AMB: MARCH 5: 63]

Fawad identified himself as a true Pukhtun, meaning that he grew up in the Pukhtun culture and he continues to live by the rules of Pukhtunwali.

I am a true Pukhtun and I follow my Pukhtunwali properly. I was born here in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. From birth till now, I have seen hujra, melmastia, nang, namus and I have grown in them. [FAW: FEB 10: 67]

Imran emphasized the importance of keeping to his cultural practices. He indicated that he follows Pukhtunwali properly in every aspect of his life. His friends call him literate but uneducated because of his conservative nature. He said that he follows Pukhtunwali because he does not want to lose his culture. He expressed the fear that moving away from these practices would result in them being lost forever.

My friends say I am literate but uneducated. To be honest I love my Hujra system, relationships, getting together. If we divert from them, we are going to lose our cultural practices. The relationships described in Pukhtunwali would not stay as sweet as they are perceived and practiced in Pukhtunwali... the relationships of sister, mother would not be the same. [IMR: FEB 23: 46].

72
Nadeem mentioned that although he lives in an urban area and his children attend English medium schools, he is very attached to his Pukhtun culture and makes sure that his children practice their culture at home.

Although I live in the city, I am very attached to my Pukhtun culture. I want my children too, to know and practice their culture. They are studying in English medium schools; therefore, when they come back from school I make sure that they act like Pukhtuns. I try my best to teach them our traditions, values and how to behave in a Pukhtun society. When they are at home, they are encouraged to practice Pukhtu and Pukhtunwali. [NAD: FEB 16: 36]

Q. Describe family life in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?

When asked about family life in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, the majority of the teachers said that there is a joined family system (extended family system in western terms), meaning that siblings, their spouses, their children, their parents, and even their grandparents live in the same household and function as one family unit. Some teachers mentioned that this system is more common in rural areas than in urban areas, and that it is changing. Increasing numbers of people are living in separate family systems (nuclear family system in western terms), where a family unit consists of a couple and their children, but not other family members. Fehmida and Nadeem said that there is a joined family system in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. However, both Fehmida and Nadeem mentioned that due to different reasons, people are adopting a separate family system too.

Although all my participants were from urban areas, all of them preferred the joined family system to the separate family system for a number of reasons:

In KPK [Khyber Pukhtunkhwa], people mostly live in joined family system.
Elders and youngsters of all relations live together and share everything with each other. I also live in joined family system [NAD: FEB 16: 40]
Ambar said:

From grand parents to grand children every one lives in the same joined family system and it is very good. Um… every member helps other members of the family when they are in trouble. They share happiness and sorrow and stand for each other. Everyone is very happy that way. [AMB: MARCH 5:100]

Nazia stressed the benefits of living in a joined family system:

Whether it’s the parents, siblings or daughters in law, they all live together and share each other’s happiness and sorrow. If one member is sad, the whole family gets sad and if one member is happy, the whole family is happy. Family members face every problem in their lives together and try to have peace and happiness in their lives. [NAZ: FEB 17: 47]

Fawad agreed that family members help each other, share their problems, respect their elders, and love their young ones. He also emphasized that men and women have equal say in discussions of family issues: “every opinion matters, whether it is female or it is male”[FAW: FEB 10: 89]. When I questioned him about this, pointing out the common belief of Pukhtun people that Pukhtun people believe men’s opinions are more important than women’s, he condemned that view. He pointed out that he is Pukhtun and he values his wife’s opinion in every aspect of their life.

Q. What is the most remarkable thing about Pukhtunwali?

I asked this question in order to explore what elements of Pukhtunwali are most important to the teacher participants. Interestingly, they varied widely in their responses, and this variation gave me an insight into their adherence to Pukhtunwali and what aspects of the culture they valued most highly. For example, Nazia highlighted hospitality, respect for elders and love for young ones, and a separate status of each individual in a family as her favourite features of Pukhtunwali. She also mentioned that she favours the joined family system because in this way, everyone lives together and
shares each other’s joy and grief. Fehmida liked nang (honour) and respect for elders.

Nadeem also emphasized these two tenets, but in addition he mentioned ghairat (bravery) and melmastia (hospitality). Imran listed the same points as Nadeem, and added the practice of standing up for each other in every occasion and helping each other in grief and joy as one of his favourite aspects of Pukhtunwali. Ambar gave details of what she likes in Pukhtunwali in these words:

In our culture, respect for elders is very important. Even if it’s in the middle of the night and an elder tells her young she has a problem, the youngster will never refuse to help her elder, and make excuses. The youngsters obey every order of their elders. Women in our culture are very much respected and have a special status in our society. If we are standing in queue for our turn to go to a bank, men give way to us and tell us to move forward. I have never seen this in any other culture that men give their turn to women and treat them nicely just because they are women. And apart from this, our rituals are very interesting. We have our own way of socializing. Everyone gets together, helps each other, and is always there to stand for each other. If there is an occasion of mourning, it’s a part of our culture that the neighbours cook all the food for the people coming to the house of the mourning family. They help the suffering family and empathize with them in their time of distress. We spend a beautiful life by following Pukhtunwali. Pukhtuns love their guests and are very hospitable. Pukhtuns, living both within Pakistan and outside Pakistan, are famous for their hospitality. Pukhtuns help their guests irrespective of their socio-economic status. [AMB: MARCH 5: 75]

Q. Are there things about the Pukhtun culture that you don’t like?

I asked this question to determine whether the teachers were able to think critically about their own culture, and whether there were aspects of Pukhtunwali they thought should be changed. In response, the teachers mentioned male dominance as a problem within the culture, and particularly the disapproval of female education. Amber said that when she was young, she observed male dominance in her house and it was “disturbing” for her. Imran pointed out that when it comes to marriage, women are often
not allowed to take an active part in deciding whom they will marry, while men are allowed to make this choice themselves and are also free to choose whom to marry.

One way in which this dominance is manifest is a disapproval of education for women. Nadeem pointed out that disapproval of educating women is more common in rural areas than in urban areas. According to him, this is because in rural areas, people are less educated and they do not view education as a priority in their lives or those of their children.

Nazia identified another element of Pukhtunwali that she disliked, “Swara”, in which a girl of one family agrees to marry a man from an enemy family in order to resolve a blood feud. Nazia disliked this tradition and said:

I don’t like Swara custom in Pukhtunwali. Although it is followed rarely now… but it is utter ignorance that when there is a fight between two parties, somebody else does something wrong but a female is punished for his deed and her whole life is ruined. I want this trend to be ended forever. [NAZ: FEB 17: 72]

Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali

This theme is based on discussions about the many changes experienced by Pukhtunwali over the years. The teachers shared their perspectives about change with respect to the elements of Pukhtunwali that they considered valuable and worth cherishing, and some that they themselves described as less valuable and obsolete. The teachers identified these changes and whether they felt they were good or bad.

Q. Do you perceive changes in the Pukhtun culture over the last several decades?
All the teachers agreed that Pukhtunwali had undergone many changes in recent years.

Imran even termed these changes “dramatic”. Ambar stated:

Of course, there is a change in Pukhtun culture. If I see my family and myself or I see my surroundings, the society, I can see so many things that have changed. My grandmother and mother tell the tales of their lives, I feel my life is different from their lives. In old times, there were so many things such as traditions that we cannot see today in our society. And there are some good changes and some negative changes, some small changes and some big changes. (AMB: MARCH 5:138]

The teachers identified changes in the following aspects of Pukhtunwali:

- The Pukhtu language,
- The dress of the Pukhtu people,
- The overall mindset of the Pukhtu people,
- Family structure,
- The Hujra system, and
- The Jirga system

**Change in the Pukhtu Language.** The Pukhtu language is one of the most prominent features of Pukhtunwali, and according to the teachers, is one of the features that have changed, at least in terms of spoken language. None of the teachers mentioned changes in writing or reading Pukhtu. Several teachers mentioned the inclusion of foreign language terms, mainly English, in Pukhtu.

Imran stated that he often uses English words when he speaks Pukhtu because he does not know the Pukhtu term for what he is trying to say. Ambar also commented on the use of English words. She believes Pukhtuns are using English because there are no Pukhtu terms for recent inventions that have been named (in English) by the western
world. Ambar also blamed the inclusion of English words in the education system, where students are exposed to the use of English words in speech.

Every change has its own reasons. Change in [Pukhtu] language occurred, because the more you are exposed to education, the more you move away from Pukhtu language. The reason is books and educational content are not available in Pukhtu. There are many things that have no words in Pukhtu; such as Internet has no name in Pukhtu, as it is an invention of Western people. Internet is called as Internet, like telephone, mobile; there are no particular words in our Pukhtu language for these things. [AMB: MARCH 5:182]

Ambar highlighted that when students learn about computers or science, all the relevant textbooks and websites are in English. Ambar further stated that for a better future, Pukhtuns do need to be exposed to and learn the English language.

Unlike Ambar, Nadeem described English as a misfortune of Pukhtuns. He pointed out that the status of Pukhtu has changed as a result of English. Imran expressed similar beliefs, and stated that the government is responsible for not providing significant status to Pukhtu language in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Imran mentioned that the government makes policies and fails to implement them. Although the government did make it a policy to include Pukhtu in schools, this policy has not been effected in most schools because the school system lacks teachers sufficiently proficient in reading and writing Pukhtu to teach a Pukhtu language course. Imran said:

The actual reason for not including Pukhtu as a subject is because they look down upon it and believe that it’s a backward language, which if included in the curriculum of these institutions might affect their reputation. [IMR: FEB 23:157]

Imran also posited:
I don’t think that a nation perceiving their mother tongue not a worthy language can ever progress and such people are unfortunate who cannot value their mother tongue and can never preserve it for their next generations. (IMR: FEB 23:160]

When Fehmida was asked about her perspectives on any changes in the Pukhtu language she replied:

Pukhtu language has changed. I am a social studies teacher and I sometimes don’t even know words of Pukhtu language. The reason is that we communicate and teach in English language at the school. We speak English all the time and because of that sometimes I forget the words used in Pukhtu language. I am afraid that a time will come when people will speak much less Pukhtu and then it might die as a language. [FEH: FEB 24: 158]

**Change in Dress.** Almost all the teachers brought up the change in dress during interviews. In Pukhtunwali, there is a specific dress, which is considered a symbol of Pukhtunwali. Men and women in Pukhtunwali wear a Kameez (long shirt or tunic) and a parthog (trouser that has legs wide open at the top and skims at the ankle). Women also wear a lupatta (shawl or long scarf). The teachers indicated that the way their students and other members of their culture dress is highly influenced by the west. The uniform in schools is not Kameez-parthog but trousers, a shirt, and a tie. In the majority of the school and offices, the dress code is trousers and a shirt. Teachers also mentioned that wearing trousers and a shirt, or jeans and a tee shirt, is considered fashionable by the society. Wearing a kameez and parthog is becoming less popular among young people especially educated people.

Speaking about the changes in dress she has observed, Ambar stated:

People used to be identified as Pukhtuns by a certain way of dressing up… But now there are few Pukhtuns who wear their cultural dress. Nowadays you will find people who will be wearing trousers and shirts and will still be true
Pukhtuns. So now you cannot identify a Pukhtun by his/her dress. [AMB: MARCH 5: 193]

Fawad associated the change in dress with the introduction of private schools in the Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. He argued that by offering western education, private schools lured people into becoming more modern. According to Fawad, the true aim of these schools was to discourage people from going to public and Pukhtu medium schools. Fawad stated:

In public schools, there were black kameez and parthog (trouser and shirt). Then people saw the uniforms of private schools, which have a tie, shirt, trousers, and very neat uniform…. People started enrolling their children in these modern schools. In this way, private schools made a mafia whose aim was to discourage people to go to public schools and Pukhtu medium schools so that people learn about western culture and not Pukhtunwali. [FAW: FEB 10: 197]

Change in the overall mindset. During my interviews, the teachers mentioned that people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa have a certain mindset regarding those people who speak English language, wear western clothes, and follow western culture: they believe them to be “modern”, “fashionable”, “smart”, and educated. As Nazia cited:

They [Pukhtuns] want to be modern, to speak English, to dress modern. Now people have an opinion that if one is dressed up in a simple fashion wearing a lupatta (long scarf), people deem that person as backward. However, the same person although wearing her traditional dress might be highly educated and would know how to communicate in English. People not only communicate in English but they have also changed their dress up so that they look modern. But in reality they are going away from their culture. [NAZ: FEB 17:121]

Fawad held private schools accountable for changing the mindset of people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Fawad pointed out that private schools have a western curriculum and use English as a medium of instruction, both of which inculcate the values of western culture in the children of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The schools are changing the thinking of
these children by teaching them that they will be “progressive” if they know English and “backward” if they speak Pukhtu.

There are a lot of private institutions in which the curriculum is in accord with the western world. Medium of instruction is English in schools, which in our country is a symbol of being educated. If you can speak English, you will be considered intelligent and progressive. If there are two people talking to each other, one person is speaking a pure Pukhtu and the other person speaks two words of English, the one including English words is automatically considered smart. This is the mindset of our generation. The person who knows Pukhtu is regarded as backward and the one who speaks English is deemed as progressive [FAW: FEB 10: 133]

Imran mentioned the same issue, but he also discussed the mindset of children regarding teachers teaching in English and those teaching in Urdu or Pukhtu language. Imran said that children have a mindset now that teachers are smarter, and have more knowledge about the course material, if they know how to communicate in English.

A teacher, if teaches in English, is considered competent and knowledgeable by the staff and the students. If a teacher teaches in Urdu that is our national language, a teacher is considered less competent but if a teacher teaches in Pukhtu, a teacher is considered not competent and knowledgeable at all. [IMR: FEB 23:235].

Fehmida noted that because students speak English all the time in school, they speak less Pukhtu in their daily lives. She said sometimes even she forgets words in Pukhtu in conversation and uses English words.

Ambar pointed out that speaking in English in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa is a symbol of being educated and fashionable, and that it has been going on for a while. While answering one of the questions about her life as a student she stated:

But from secondary level, there was no fashion of Pukhtu language. Pukhtu was not in vogue or popular among students at secondary level. I will use the word ‘Fashion’ here because English is given a lot of importance and it is natural that
people gradually speak in English in their everyday lives to show other people that they are educated. [AMB: MARCH 5:133]

Nadeem stated that people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa feel proud of themselves when they speak in English and follow western culture, and he pointed out that this attitude itself is a result of westernization.

The majority of the teachers were of the view that private schools, where English language and western curriculum are taught, play a large role in changing the mindset of the people of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa regarding their own culture. These private schools teach children that speaking English language and adopting a western life style will make them modern, fashionable, and progressive, whereas the Pukhtu language and dress will make them backwards and regressive.

**Changes in the family structure.** Teachers elaborated on yet another change in Pukhtunwali in their responses to the following question:

*Describe the family structure in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?*

As stated in Theme 1, the teachers all agreed that the joined family system, where all members of a family live together, is most common in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. However, they also mentioned that an increasing number of people are beginning to prefer the separate family system, as cited by Fehmida and Imran:

In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, there is joined family system but now some people are adopting separate family system [FEH: FEB 24: 52].

The majority of people live in joined family system. Nowadays, some people are moving towards a separate family system…. Well, joined family system is considered more successful in Pukhtunwali to keep the relationships strong but
now everyone wants to have his own family living separately from others (uncles, cousins etc.) and including only his wife and kids. [IMR: FEB 23: 92]

Nazia pointed out that people living in urban areas tend to prefer a separate family system.

In urban area, mostly a son would separate from his family after his marriage and would lead a separate life…. I don’t like it when members of the family live separately. [NAZ: FEB 17: 54]

Fawad called it “selfishness” when people prefer the separate family system.

People are going away from joined family system to the private system where a person is exempted from providing help [to other members of extended family]. You can call it a selfishness but people have become selfish and they fear that if they live in a joined family, they will be asked to help other members of the family that need help. The person who is self-centered refuses to help and prefers a separate path from others. [FAW: FEB 10:129]

**Changes in Hujra system.** While discussing the elements of Pukhtunwali, many teachers also mentioned changes in the social systems that are an essential part of Pukhtunwali. The teachers identified changes in the Hujra system and the Jirga system.

In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, there are specified areas, called Hujras, where people gather to chat with each other, and sometimes do poetry or sing folk songs. The purpose of Hujra is to sit together, listen, and share each other’s problems. The teachers said that now the Hujra system is less observed, and they believe this is because people are very busy in their lives and do not have time to sit together for long hours and chat. As portrayed by Amber in her interview:

Like for example, we have a beautiful tradition in our culture in which at night, people get together in a Hujra, to know about each other’s lives, problems and discuss the ways in which to aid each other in tough times. To know about each other’s problems and offer help. This system is non-existent these days because
people don’t have time to socialize in Hujras. Everyone is now busy in his own life and a beautiful tradition of our culture is lost at least in the urban areas. [AMB: MARCH 5: 174]

Ambar explained the reason for the change as follows:

Nowadays, life has become very fast paced. Things are changing and progressing. The changes and progression have caused the Hujra system almost to vanish, where there used to be music, poetry and people of all ages would sit together. The Hujra system is very important for preserving our culture because every generation learns from their elders about their identity and it was a place to listen and learn from the wisdom of elders. [AMB: MARCH 5: 279]

Fawad agreed that it has become “rare” to sit together in Hujra and to share each other’s problems, and Fehmida and Nazia also said that the Hujra system is rarely observed.

Change in Jirga system. All the teachers also mentioned changes in the Jirga system, which is a very important aspect of Pukhtunwali. Jirga is a tribal assembly where two parties may present disputes and elders make a decision about the outcome. It is very common in tribal areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. However, Fawad said that Jirga is less observed these days and is not considered as authentic as it was before, because nowadays, the parties presenting the disputes trick innocent people and sometimes wrong decisions are made. Fawad also said that people do not have much time to sit in a circle for hours in Jirga and discuss issues in detail because they are busy with their own lives. Imran stated:

People don’t have time for hujra and jirga. They are more concerned about fulfilling their aims and moving with the world. [IMR: FEB 23:172]

Ambar pointed out an important change: “The students are familiar with the court system but not familiar with the Jirga system and its importance” [AMB: MARCH 5: 277]
According to the teachers, the Jirga system is now rarely observed in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

**Change in the concept of Badal.** Badal is a Pukhtu word and a very controversial subject these days. Badal means returning something, either a physical object or a deed (good or bad). Amber said that Badal now has a negative connotation and that it is taken to mean getting revenge against the one that wronged you.

There are things that nowadays people don’t have much awareness of. For example: if someone does something good to you, a Pukhtun is required to return the good deed. In Pukhtunwali, we call it badal. Now the problem is that people perceive the notion of badal in a very negative way. People believe that badal is taking revenge by killing wrong doers. I want to include this concept in the curriculum so that the students are aware of the concept of badal and understand that badal is not only the name of returning bad deeds. If you are a Pukhtun, if a person does well to you, you will also do good to the person and return his favour. There are so many concepts of Pukhtunwali that students have no knowledge of. They do not know how beautiful our culture is. [AMB: MARCH 5: 283]

**Positive changes.** A few changes to Pukhtunwali were considered positive by the primary school teachers I interviewed. For example, Ambar, Fawad, and Imran all expressed the view that men outrank women in the Pukhtun culture, especially when it comes to providing education and other resources. However, Ambar pointed out that recently, this discrimination against women has decreased significantly. She reasoned this was likely because the average level of education is increasing, as is the cost of living. Now women as well as men must often work to support their families, which require them to get the same level of education.

Another positive change noted by the teachers was the decreasing use of the swara system. Nazia did not like the swara system and was glad that this system has almost vanished. Fehmida and Ambar also pointed out that the swara system was a bad
practice and were happy that now it is only observed in some of the rural areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

**Theme 3: Factors responsible for the changes in Pukhtunwali**

After exploring the teachers’ views on changes in Pukhtunwali, I asked them to suggest what factors might be responsible for these changes. They identified a number of different factors, which are explored in detail below.

**Q. To what do you attribute these changes? Please elaborate.**

The teachers identified different factors that have caused the changes in Pukhtunwali discussed in theme 2.

- The English language
- The Education system,
- Electronic Media,
- Technology, and
- Lack of government initiative

**The English language.** English is one of the official languages of Pakistan (along with Urdu), and has been used in the country since the days of British colonization of the sub-continent. Currently, English has a higher status than any other language in Pakistan (Rahman, 2003). The participants in this study believe that the use of English is affecting the status of Pukhtu Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. According to Nadeem, it is unfortunate for Pukhtuns that Pukhtu does not have the same status as English. During the interview,
Nadeem said that people in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa are given fewer opportunities if they have been educated in Pukhtu.

Those who study in Pukhtu medium schools are limited to a master’s degree in Pukhtu language and such students are very few in number because they cannot get a better job by this qualification. [NAD: FEB 16: 79]

Nazia and Nadeem were of the view that using the English language as a medium of instruction is a barrier to the promotion of Pukhtu in schools, and Fehmida agreed that when English is used as a medium of instruction, it is more promoted than Pukhtu. She also said that now it is impossible to bridge the gap between statuses of Pukhtu language in education that has occurred due to the English language in the promotion of Pukhtu language.

The teachers also pointed out that the English language has an overall influence on the people of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, even those that are not educated at English medium schools. Amber stated that people use English words while having a conversation in Pukhtu. The mindset of people is such that it is considered “modern”, “smart”, “fashionable”, “progressive”, and “being educated” if one can speak English fluently and include it in everyday conversation even when speaking in colloquial Pukhtu.

The teachers also discussed that people are now of the mindset that it is backwards to speak Pukhtu and progressive to speak English. I will repeat the quote of Fawad here as it reflects on the current mindset of the Pukhtun people and also expands
on the influence of English language on Pukhtun people. Fawad gave an example of this mindset:

If you can speak English, you will be considered intelligent and progressive. If there are two people talking to each other, one person is speaking a pure Pukhtu and the other person speaks two words of English, the one including English words is automatically considered smart. This is the mindset of our generation. The person who knows Pukhtu is regarded as backward and the one who speaks English is deemed as progressive. [FAW: FEB 10:136]

The word “modern” in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa is used for people who speak English fluently and adopt the lifestyle of the west, such as using English words and sentences while talking in Pukhtu, wearing western clothes, and behaving like western people. Teachers even used English terms to refer to modernism in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. For example, Nazia and Imran used the word “modern” (in English) to refer to people who speak English. According to Nazia, it is “modernization” [in English] when people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa speak English to be considered modern. Amber used the word “fashion” [in English] in her conversation, and said she was using it because it has become a symbol of being educated if you use English words in your daily life.

I will use the word ‘Fashion’ here because English is given a lot of importance and it is natural that people gradually speak in English in their everyday lives to show other people that they are educated. [AMB: MARCH 5:113]

Imran said that a person is considered “intelligent” if he or she knows how to communicate fluently in English. He explained that both students and school staff consider a teacher teaching in English more competent than one teaching in Urdu or Pukhtu.
A person will know nothing about the world but is considered intelligent if a person is able to communicate in English language. A teacher, if he or she teaches in English, is considered competent and knowledgeable by the staff and the students. If a teacher teaches in Urdu that is our national language, a teacher is considered less competent but if a teacher teaches in Pukhtu, a teacher is considered not competent and knowledgeable at all. It is a common belief that if a content is taught in English language, the student will tell her parents that her teacher is very smart and intelligent because she teaches in English all the time no matter how little the student understands the content and score in that particular subject. [IMR: FEB 23:235]

**Education system.** In Pakistan, the education system is divided into the public, private, and madrassa sectors. In the public sector, Pakistani curriculum is followed and the medium of instruction is either Urdu or English. However, depending upon the region and province, there are public schools where the medium of instruction is the mother tongue spoken in that territory. In the private sector, British curriculum is followed and the medium of instruction used is English. In the madrassa sector, a religious curriculum is followed and the medium of instruction is the mother tongue. To speak about the education system, teachers were asked the following question.

**Q. Please elaborate your view of the grade five social studies curriculum with regard to cultural elements you consider to be important in relation to the preservation of culture in general; in particular to the Pukhtun culture?**

The teachers pointed out that the education system and curriculum taught in English medium schools have an impact on the students. The teachers said that the use of English as a medium of instruction and the British curriculum give the students more information about the western world than their own country. Because they speak in English at school, they are practicing English more than their mother tongue. They speak
English to communicate with their teachers and fellows, learn their texts, and perform activities that are taught in English language.

Nadeem stated:

In our country our whole education system is in the English language, and mostly our curriculum is about western culture and lifestyle [NAD: FEB 16:77]

Fawad said that private schools follow a curriculum according to the new world [western culture], with English as the medium of instruction.

There are a lot of private institutions in which curriculum is in accord with the western world. The medium of instruction is English in schools, which in our country is a symbol of being educated. If you can speak English, you will be considered intelligent and progressive. [FAW: FEB 10:134]

Ambar explained:

For example, in every country’s curriculum, there is content about famous people and stories about their history. But our students would know the story of Romeo and Juliet of western culture but wouldn’t know about the story of Adam Khan and Durkhanay of their own culture because it is not included in the content. If such stories are included in the content, the students would come to know that Adam Khan and Durkhanay was a very famous love story in Pukhtun culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 266]

Nazia felt so strongly about the use of English and the British curriculum that she wants to go into administration to change it. She replied that being an administrator would afford her better chance of introducing changes she feels should be made in curricula, especially in the social studies curriculum. She argued that the social studies curriculum is not up to date and it lacks much needed information about Pukhtun culture and the Pukhtu language.
I want to work as an administrator to bring change. I believe that social studies curriculum needs to be revised and updated. There is more preference given to English language and culture over Pukhtu and Pukhtunwali. [NAZ: FEB 17:41]

Nazia also mentioned that in the social studies curriculum, languages such as English, Urdu, and Arabic are taught in the form of courses, but the Pukhtu language is excluded.

I want to give Pukhtu its due status. In the curriculum, there is English, Urdu, Arabic but no Pukhtu. Students are taught these languages so that they can communicate in these languages and understand these languages, but when it comes to Pukhtu and understanding it, the issue is ignored. If a student is a Pukhtun and a Punjabi boy asks him about his culture, he doesn’t have any knowledge about it and he is speechless. The reason is we are not giving him enough information to know about his culture and his mother tongue. [NAZ: FEB 17:43]

All the teachers felt that there was very little information about the Pukhtun culture in the social studies curriculum, and the information that is present is scarce and lacks detail. Teachers particularly mentioned that the elements of Pukhtunwali are not described properly. Fehmida pointed out that the poets, history, and geography of the Pukhtuns are not included in the curriculum at all.

There is little information about Pukhtun poets in one of the chapters where information about all the poets of Pakistan is given. There is no such information about history of Pukhtuns; how brave they were and how bravely they fought the battles with Sikhs etc. is not mentioned anywhere. There is information about Hitler but they don’t know about their own cultural heroes. There is no information about history and geography of the Pukhtuns. It is very sad. [FEH: FEB 24:135]

Imran highlighted that there is even less information about customs and traditions of Pukhtunwali.
There is no such information about Pukhtunwali norms and traditions. There is no information about how to get married, customs and traditions followed in Pukhtunwali. [IMR: FEB 23:198]

When I asked him about any information given about the basic elements of Pukhtunwali, he replied, “No, there is no such information about them”. [IMR: FEB 23:204].

He pointed out that the curriculum contained information about South East Asian civilizations and the Mughal civilization, but nothing about the Pukhtun civilization. The name of the first poet of the Pukhtu language is briefly mentioned but other than that there is no information on Pukhtun history given in the curriculum.

Nazia on the other hand, said that information regarding the traditions, food, dress, and hospitality of Pukhtunwali is included in the curriculum but not in detail, and Nadeem echoed this view.

In one course, the elements of Pukhtunwali, Pukhtun culture, there is a chapter in which there is a paragraph about Khyber Pukhtunkhwa culture but it is very short. It is required that there should be a full chapter on Pukhtunwali. If the chapter is in detail we can educate our students about Pukhtunwali through it. Whatever content is available is not enough for students to better understand their culture. [NAD: FEB 16:177]

Ambar stated that information about the importance of the Pukhtu language is given in the curriculum, which at least alerts the students to the role it plays in Pukhtunwali.

In our textbook, there is no specific chapter about Pukhtunwali but there is a chapter that is about different cultures of Pakistan. This chapter contains content about the famous things in different cultures. It has many things about our culture. For example, there is information about the importance of language in this culture. Even if a student is not a Pukhtun, still the student gets to know that this culture has the Pukhtu language, which has a great importance for the people living in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. [AMB: MARCH 5:239]
The teachers agreed that the information given about Pukhtunwali is limited to dress, language, and food, and there is little information regarding the elements of Pukhtunwali.

**Electronic Media.** Media, the plural medium, is the “means of communication, as radio and television, newspapers and magazines, that reach or influence people widely”([dictionary.com](http://dictionary.com)). Electronic media includes forms such as television and the Internet. Nowadays television is considered an influential medium and is watched all over the world. Televised programs are widely watched and followed in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, Pakistan. The teachers mentioned “media” as a strong influence on the mindset of people of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Teachers were of the view that children are influenced by watching televised programs that are mostly in English, and often depict western culture. The teachers pointed out that language, dress, and mindset are being influenced the most by the electronic media. When asked why Pukhtuns are moving away from their culture, Fehmida stated:

> It is because of globalization and media. Media presents more western culture than Pukhtun culture. Media telecasts most of the programs in English language. For example, children watch National Geographic channel and I also encourage them to watch it and it is in English language. Pukhtuns don’t have many resources to create and run programs in Pukhtu language. It is obvious that students are exposed more to English words than Pukhtu words and they learn more English language than Pukhtu language. [FEH: FEB 24:188]

Similarly, Nadeem identified media and technology as encouraging westernization. By westernization, Nadeem meant adopting western culture and language.

> Media and technology are playing their role in promoting westernization and discouraging people to follow Pukhtunwali. [NAD: FEB 16: 68]
Nazia also believes the media promotes foreign culture; however, unlike Nadeem, she observed that Indian culture is promoted by media. When Nazia was asked whether she thinks the media has influenced Pukhtuns, she stated:

> Media also plays a role. People have stopped watching Pakistani channels. If you watch TV, there are Indian channels, which run programs that show Indian fashion shows, festivals and dramas that have an influence on children, and these media play a major role in influencing the children. [NAZ: FEB 17:128]

Fawad shared his perspectives on some of the traditions that have been completely lost in Pukhtunwali because of the media. Fawad said that news channels and programs that are televised nationwide do not promote Pukhtun culture and the Pukhtu language. He stated:

> Every program is in English language. If you watch a news channel, that is running news in Pukhtu language, people ignore it and think that it may not be reliable; instead they prefer news in English running on BBC or CNN. There are news channels in Pakistan that are in English language such as Express news, ARY news but there is no Pukhtu news. The Pukhtu news channel is regarded as non-reliable because Pukhtu is not given any importance and that is why it has never progressed and attained its true status. [FAW: FEB 10: 157]

Fawad observed that the content on the Internet is also in English or Urdu and there is no forum or website that provides information in Pukhtu.

> Every person in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa uses the Internet; I have never come across any Pukhtu website or forum. And if there is any website, the content is in English, I will be required to read it in English language. There is no source of information from where we can learn anything in Pukhtu language. Nowadays, a person mostly spends his time in front of the computer. He watches and learns content in either English or Urdu but not in Pukhtu language. [FAW: FEB 10:165]

Ambar suggested, “the media should stress the importance of their own [Pukhtun] culture and show programs and documentaries about their own culture” [AMB: MARCH 5: 385]
Technology. Technology such as Internet, cell phones, computers and other digital devices have advanced immensely in past few decades. There was a time when people would travel long distances to seek knowledge, now the click of a button on the computer takes you to there. Communication via social networking and Internet has advanced as well and now one can reach any place, person and content by using the technological conveniences. But this technology has some adverse effects on the lives of the Pukhtun people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The teachers highlighted that at present, technology in the form of Internet and cell phones is used by the children and the people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The teachers during their interviews indicated that Pukhtun children are using the Internet and cell phones that are affecting their cultural practices. The teachers said that using cell phones and the Internet keep the children busy all the time and they don’t socialize much. As cited by Fawad:

The introduction of technology, Internet, mobile phones, cable all these technologies have taken over people’s lives. People when wanted to call, they would use their landline and an old telephone set, now they have mobile phones that work everywhere. There is no need to meet somebody in person but you just call the person. Things have become very fast with technology. It is a good development and change but it has adversely affected Pukhtunwali’s social practices in such a way that now people don’t socialize with each other in person. The trend that people going to houses of relatives and friends to invite people for wedding is finished, now people call and say you are invited on that date for the wedding. The time when they used to go to houses for invitation, sitting and chatting with each other is almost finished due to technology. [FAWAD: FEB 10: 147]

Fehmida cited:

In the past, people used to sit together, have communication with each other, now it doesn’t happen anymore. People used to stand by each other in sorrow and happiness. People would know what is going on in their neighbourhood and they would help each other. Now everyone is so busy in their lives that they don’t have time for each other. Now most of their time is spent at work place, on the Internet or on the cell phone. Now people are not aware of each other’s situation. [FEH: FEB 24:98]
Imran pointed out due to technological conveniences the traditional games played by the children are disappearing. He mentioned that there are about 24 traditional games that are vanishing because children are not playing their traditional games and spend more time on either using computers or watching television. Imran cited:

Chindro (hop scotch) is finished, pata gitay(capture the flag) is finished. The reason is that now there is cable TV and Internet and children are not playing these games anymore. Like 24 games are withering away. We should do something about them to stop them from disappearing. [IMR: FEB 23: 68]

**Lack of government initiative.** The teachers of primary level highlighted that it is a fact that government in Pakistan pay less attention to the education sector and that they make policies for the betterment of education sector but does not implement them.

In Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, teachers regarding the promotion of Pukhtu language and Pukhtun culture said that one of the main reasons that there is no attention given to the Pukhtu language and Pukhtunwali is the lack of initiatives taken by the government. The teachers in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa pointed out that although the provincial government have changed the name of the province from North West Frontier Province to Khyber Pukhtunkhwa in order to give identity to the Pukhtun people but are not succeeding in giving any security to the Pukhtun culture and Pukhtu language. The teachers were of the view that the government should pay attention to the education sector particularly promoting the Pukhtu language for endorsing Pukhtun culture through education.

Nadeem stated that Pukhtun culture is observed more in rural areas than in urban areas. He gave different reasons for not following the traditions of Pukhtunwali properly in urban areas. One reason was that the government is not implementing policies that they make for the betterment of Pukhtunwali. Nadeem stated:
Government makes policies to preserve Pukhtunwali identity and promoting Pukhtu language in education system but they have never succeeded in implementing their policies properly. [NAD: FEB 16: 90]

Fehmida pointed out that there was a Pukhtu subject in the curriculum but now government has abandoned it. Fawad was very disappointed by the actions of the government. He criticized the government and said that the government makes promises but does not fulfill them. Fawad goes on and said that changing the name of the province and the name of the airport is not enough for preserving Pukhtunwali. He said that the government should make changes in the education system such as provide the information in Pukhtu language by promoting the Pukhtu language in the form of medium of instruction. Fawad also posited that government should release funds to make Pukhtu channels for the promotion of Pukhtu language. He mentioned that the politicians are not interested in promoting Pukhtu language. He further went and stated that the politicians of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa address their people on television during talk shows in Urdu or English language. The politicians send their children to foreign countries to get an education.

Fawad further said that the children in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa either learn English or Urdu language properly in school. There is no forum that can teach them Pukhtu language and give information about Pukhtun culture.

Nazia and Imran indicated that if the government implements their policies properly, the children would be able to know about their culture and their mother tongue.
Theme 4: Role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali

This theme focuses on the responses given by the primary school teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa regarding the role of the Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali. In discussing the recent changes to Pukhtunwali, the teachers all expressed the belief that the influence of the English language was one of the most important factors causing these changes. English is Pakistan’s official language and is the medium of instruction in many schools, especially in the private sector. The ability to speak English is considered synonymous with progress and modernism in Pukhtun society. English has had such an impact on society in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa that the Television and radio channels that broadcast in English are automatically seen as accurate and reliable. Furthermore, there are no websites written in Pukhtu available on the Internet, likely due to the fact that English websites are considered more reliable and valuable by the Pukhtun people. Similarly, the field of education has been strongly influenced by the English language, and being proficient in English language is considered synonymous with being intelligent and competent. Most workplaces also prefer to hire employees who are fluent in English.

Given the ubiquitous and influential nature of the English language in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa, I was interested in investigating the participants’ perceptions of its effect on the Pukhtun cultural identity, and their perspectives on the best way to protect this identity in the face of major changes. In particular, I was interested in discovering whether they thought the Pukhtu language had a role to play in preserving Pukhtunwali. To explore these issues, I asked the six primary school teachers the following questions:
Q. Do you think it is important to keep a sense of cultural identity through the processes of change? If yes, please elaborate.

Q. How do you see the connection between the use of the Pukhtun language and maintaining the Pukhtun culture?

First, I asked them to define the Pukhtun cultural identity. According to Nadeem, Pukhtun cultural identity is the distinctiveness of Pukhtun people from the people of other cultures. The unique characteristics of Pukhtunwali have been transmitted from parents to children for generations. The way these characteristics are practiced and revered is the treasure of Pukhtun people. The Pukhtuns are recognized by the elements of Pukhtunwali and the way they practice these elements of Pukhtunwali; this is what defines them as a group. This was discussed in more detail in Theme 1.

In light of the major changes that have been experienced – and continue to be experienced – by the people of Khyber Punktunkhwa, I asked the teachers how important they felt it was for Pukhtuns to keep a sense of cultural identity throughout these changes. They unanimously agreed that keeping their cultural identity intact was of enormous importance. Despite the changes in Pukhtunwali they had observed, the teachers felt that Pukhtuns did not desire these changes and wanted to preserve their identity. The teachers believed that keeping their culture alive was of utmost importance for the survival of Pukhtuns as a people.

Fawad called Pukhtunwali his strength and his spirituality. He stated that he cannot ignore the voice of Pukhtunwali inside him and he considers his culture a sacred trust from his ancestors that he has to preserve.
For me, Pukhtunwali is like a strength that is felt from inside, like a state of mind, something spiritual that even if I want to ignore, I can’t, because it is engraved in me and I can’t leave it for anything. It is like a token given to me by my ancestors to preserve and I cannot betray my elders. [FAW: FEB 10: 211]

Fawad told the story of a parent who came to his school to enrol his child. The man told the school that he was living in Germany and his children were getting influenced by German culture. He said that he brought his children back to Pakistan because he did not want them to lose their identity. Fawad told this story to illustrate that even when Pukhtuns leave their homeland for another part of the world, they are proud of their identity and want to preserve it. They respect their cultural practices and want their children to be in touch with their culture.

A Pukhtun anywhere in the world has a love for his culture, he will keep its identity alive and will never want to go to a place where there is no respect for his culture or his family is influenced by western culture. [FAW: FEB 10: 218]

Fehmida argued that people do not realize the importance of their cultural identity when they are living at home, but when they go to a foreign country, they find they need their identity to survive.

It is very important to keep our cultural identity in the face of globalization. We don’t realize its importance because we are living in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa right now. But if we go out of our province, and we don’t find our culture and language there, we don’t hear the words of our language, it will become very difficult for us to survive. When we go abroad, we are identified as Pakistani and in Pakistan, as Pukhtuns. It is very important for us to keep our identity alive and preserved. [FEH: FEB 24: 112]

Imran stated that if the Pukhtuns change their identity with the changing circumstances, the Pukhtun nation would be relegated to the history books.

It is very important to have a cultural identity. If we, with the changing circumstances, change ourselves and adopt new things, our identity as Pukhtuns will vanish and we will become history as a nation called Pukhtun. We will lose everything. [IMR: FEB 23: 178]
Ambar perceives cultural identity as a tool that guides her in how to live her life wherever she lives. She stressed the importance of her culture in her life:

“If somebody takes my culture from me, it is like forgetting how to live my life”

[AMB: MARCH 5:219].

Ambar further said that “cultural identity is important for my identity, if it's taken away, it will be like I wont be able to survive in any society.” [AMB: MARCH 5: 225]

Nazia identified cultural identity as a person’s self-identity, meaning that adopting the practices of other cultures changes an individual’s identity. For example, she argued that those who change their dress and speak the language of another culture in order to fit in with other people have lost their identities. Nadeem pointed out that people in developed countries never change their identities for the sake of progress, rather they stick to their cultures with determination. Conversely, underdeveloped countries tend to adopt other cultures and feel proud of it, because the people of these countries feel their culture is a disadvantage. But by giving up their cultures, people lose their identities, Nadeem argued:

If you see around the world, people don’t give up their culture for the sake of change. Developed countries stick to their cultures, while underdeveloped countries, for the sake of success, leave their identities and feel proud of adopting other cultures. Adopting other cultures destroys people’s identity. [NAD: FEB 16: 102]

The teachers mentioned that they are Pukhtuns and they will never leave their identity, regardless of any changes faced by the people of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. They said change does not have to mean changing everything, including cultural identity. Ambar observed that it is unfortunate there are fewer educational opportunities in Khyber
Pukhtunkhwa than in some other places; therefore, it is common for Pukhtun people to leave their country in search of better opportunities. However, she also observed that leaving the country does not have to mean they leave their cultural identity as well. She offered examples of people who went to foreign countries but still observed their culture and love their identity. The second question that provided data under Theme 4 was:

Q. How do you see the connection between the use of the Pukhtun language and maintaining the Pukhtun culture?

After investigating the teachers’ perspectives on the importance of keeping a sense of cultural identity, I asked them a question regarding the connection between the Pukhtu language (particularly when used as a medium of instruction) and maintaining Pukhtunwali. Fehmida stated that knowing Pukhtu means knowing about Pukhtun culture and Pukhtun identity. She said Pukhtu language is one of the major elements of Pukhtunwali and it is as important as traditional dress and food for the identification of Pukhtuns. Similarly, Nadeem stated:

See, language and culture are interconnected and culture is communicated through a language. [NAD: FEB 16: 60].

Nazia stated that there is a “strong” connection between Pukhtu and maintaining Pukhtunwali, and that Pukhtu is very important for practicing Pukhtunwali. Nazia further said preventing children from speaking Pukhtu is the same as prohibiting them from practicing Pukhtunwali.
Imran called himself a true Pukhtun who follows his culture to the utmost. He is doing a doctoral degree in philosophy and that is why most of the time he stays in a hostel. He told me that his roommates are his group. He said:

I try my best to follow it [Pukhtunwali] properly. For example, I stay in hostel because I am doing M. Phil, my group and I don’t call a room, “room” or “kamra” but a “kota”. We don’t say cap or waistcoat but “topay” and “waskat”, not shoes but “saplay”. We call them these names [English names] maybe because we are influenced by western culture, but we follow our culture and we want people to follow it too because there should be somebody to maintain the culture right? For example, we don’t say throw the dinner day, but “ma doday oka” by saying only this at least one is contributing something to maintain one’s culture. [IMR: FEB 23: 71]

Imran’s examples demonstrate that he implicitly sees the connection between language and culture, and feels that by continuing to use the Pukhtu language, he is contributing to the preservation of the culture, because they are so interconnected. Imran also said that people in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa speak Pukhtu language at home, but when they are outside their houses, they speak English to show others they are “modern”. However, he argues that speaking in a language other than Pukhtu does not identify you as a Pukhtu.

**Theme 5: Role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at primary level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali**

After all of the previously detailed discussion about culture in general, the Pukhtun culture specifically, and the link between Pukhtunwali and the Pukhtu language, I reached the main question of my study. I asked the teachers if the Pukhtu language could be used as a medium of instruction at the primary school level, and whether that would be helpful in preserving Pukhtunwali. The majority of the six primary school teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa were of the view that although Pukhtu language plays
an important role in the Pukhtunwali, using it as a medium of instruction for the preservation of culture is not necessary. Few of the teacher participants (Imran, Nazia) stated that Pukhtu should be a medium of instruction in schools at the primary school level to transmit the tenets of Pukhtunwali properly, but the majority stated that to preserve Pukhtunwali, Pukhtu as a subject or as a chapter, should be included in the curriculum. These teachers mentioned that the Pukhtunwali content in the fifth grade social studies textbooks is limited, therefore, the content about the Pukhtunwali should be increased.

Imran said if he were allowed to choose the right medium of instruction to preserve Pukhtunwali, he would choose Pukhtu because the main priority in early education is the clarification of concepts for the child. Most children in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa speak Pukhtu with their family and friends. If the elements of Pukhtunwali were taught in Pukhtu as part of the primary curriculum, it would help children to learn about the elements of their culture, and would develop a strong cultural foundation in children.

Well, If it’s the instruction and then its in schools, I would prefer mother tongue [Pukhtu] to be the medium of instruction because a child speaks with its father, mother, brother, sister, and fellows in Pukhtu language. I think the main priority is the concept clarity of a child. At young age, the base of their learning is formed; if we use the mother tongue for learning, it will help a child to better learn about the different concepts of Pukhtunwali and develop the foundations of her culture. [IMR: FEB 23: 133]

Nazia also mentioned that the most important thing in giving students instruction about the content is concept clarity. Nazia indicated that in English medium schools, the teachers and the students are not allowed to speak a word of Pukhtu at school. She said if a child does not understand anything about Pukhtunwali in English, the teachers should
be allowed to use Pukhtu to answer his or her queries and clarify concepts. She emphasized that expressing concepts clearly to children should be more important than the language in which they expressed their learning. On this point, Fawad stated:

> Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction plays a role in preserving Pukhtunwali in such a way that a student learns about a concept of Pukhtunwali and understands it fully when he or she is taught about it at the primary level. It becomes clearer when the student observes whatever she is learning in her school about her culture and when it is reinforced by practice actually happening in her surroundings. [FAW: FEB 10: 110]

Fawad also said that it is wrong that only students from English medium schools are considered progressive and students from Pukhtu medium schools are considered backward. Fawad said that there are very successful people who hold high posts in bureaucracy and management who were Pukhtuns educated at Pukhtu medium schools.

Nadeem said that students could better express themselves if they are given the choice to express their feelings and views in Pukhtu.

> See, students cannot express their feeling and views in other languages such as English because they speak Pukhtu and they observe it in their surroundings, at home, so when they are asked to express their feelings or views in Pukhtu, it is easy for them to do so as compared to expressing it in English. [NAD: FEB 16: 63]

Fehmida was of the view that the medium of instruction definitely plays a role in preserving a culture, but that it is simply not possible for Khyber Pukhtunkhwa to change the medium of instruction in schools from English to Pukhtu. She argued that globalization has changed everything, including the education system, and indicated that English medium schools are currently in a better position than any other schools in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Her solution to this problem was the introduction of a Pukhtu language course at the primary school level to keep the students in touch with the Pukhtu language and Pukhtunwali. Fehmida pointed out that the courses such as geography,
mathematics, and science are all in English. If the medium of instruction were changed to Pukhtu, it would be a colossal job to translate everything into Pukhtu. Therefore, she was of the view that changing the medium of instruction is not a viable solution to the problem of cultural preservation.

Ambar clearly stated that the medium of instruction plays no role in the preservation of culture, and denied that keeping a language means keeping a culture.

If anyone says that if we keep our language, we can keep our culture and if we change the language, we will lose our culture, I disagree. I don’t think that changing a language can change a culture. And it is because culture is not the name of only a language and that is why in schools, teaching in English cannot affect Pukhtun culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 130]

Ambar further said that other measures should be taken in order to preserve Pukhtun culture, such as adding a course about the elements of Pukhtunwali to the curriculum. Ambar felt that it is the responsibility of the parents to teach their children about the practice and observation of Pukhtunwali, which is why she did not feel there is a link between the medium of instruction and the preservation of Pukhtun culture.

As I have demonstrated in this data reporting, despite their strong support of their culture, these teachers had mixed views about the role of Pukhtu used as a medium of instruction at the primary school level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.

To investigate this issue further, I asked the teachers another more general question about this topic:

Q. What is your understanding of the relationship between cultural preservation and medium of instruction?
Again, teachers’ responses were mixed. Some teachers indicated that there is a “strong” relationship between the medium of instruction and cultural preservation, while some said there is no relationship between them. There were others that posited that even if a relationship exists between the medium of instruction and the preservation of culture, major changes in the world and the education system make it impossible to revert from English to mother tongue as a medium of instruction.

Fawad stated that the Pukhtu language is the best language for teaching the children about the elements of Pukhtunwali.

There is definitely a strong relationship between language and keeping culture. I will give an example of this. Let’s say there is a child and you want to teach him a concept of Pukhtunwali such as nang, namus, melmastia, Jirga etc. what language will be best to teach him these concepts, English, Urdu or Pukhtu? Obviously Pukhtu because he sees all these concepts around him in his daily life, he sees Hujra, Jirga, Melmastia, his understanding of these concepts becomes crystal clear when he is taught all these concepts in his mother tongue, Pukhtu. [FAW: FEB 10: 104]

Nadeem explained that when he teaches his class in Pukhtu, the students listen with much more interest than when he teaches them in English.

It is very important to communicate culture through a mother tongue. When I teach my class and I use Pukhtu language to teach them something, the children not only understand it but also keenly listen to it and then become capable of expressing their views in English language too. The reason is the whole concept becomes clear to them when they are taught in their mother tongue. [NAD: FEB 16: 159]

Imran stated that it is very important that the child develops a foundation regarding the elements of Pukhtunwali in Pukhtu before learning other languages.

It is very important to make a child’s concepts clear about Pukhtunwali in his or her mother tongue and then expose him or her to other languages. The child will face difficulties in switching to Urdu or English but he or she can learn these languages later on in secondary and at higher level of education. What is
important is the developing of a foundation in a child’s mind about Pukhtunwali, which can be formed only by using Pukhtu, the mother tongue of the child, when used as a medium of instruction at primary level. [IMR: FEB 23: 139]

Nazia indicated that when students are given instruction in Pukhtu, it has a “good impact” on them. She argued that prohibiting students from using Pukhtu at school wrongly gives them the impression that Pukhtu is not an important language.

Definitely there is a strong connection between them [mother tongue and culture preservation]. If we give them instruction in mother tongue, it will have a good impact on them. If we tell them don’t speak Pukhtu and compel them to speak English because the school in which they are studying is English medium, the students will start thinking that Pukhtu language is not important enough. [NAZ: FEB 17: 93]

Fehmida was of the view that, although there is a “strong relationship” between the medium of instruction and cultural preservation, it is simply not possible to consider using Pukhtu as a medium of instruction in the preservation of Pukhtunwali.

There is a strong relationship between the medium of instruction and cultural preservation. Language and culture are very important for each other. There is a strong impact of language on culture. Now there are English medium schools where English language is promoted more than Pukhtu. At the present, there is a gap that cannot be bridged by promoting Pukhtu language in schools as a language or subject. It is not possible now. [FEH: FEB 24: 89]

Ambar stated that there are a few schools of thought about the relationship between the medium of instruction and culture preservation, but she herself does not believe they are related.

I think that a language used as a medium of instruction for cultural preservation demands the understanding of the underlying relationship between them. Some people think that mother tongue is useless if used as a medium of instruction in preserving their culture. And students taught in other languages such as Urdu and English get negativity affected in terms of culture. One school of thought is that if the children are taught in any language, whether it’s Urdu or English, it has no effect on their culture and children do not leave their culture. If the children have the potential to leave their culture, they will forget about it even if they are taught
in Pukhtu language. I personally believe that teaching in a mother tongue has no relationship with the preservation of culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 348]

Ambar argued that cultural preservation is achieved by the dedication of the family and society in practicing their culture, because in this way children are provided with an environment to practice Pukhtunwali.

Be the medium of instruction Pukhtu or English language, cultural preservation is only possible if all the people in a society practice their culture properly irrespective of language […] if mother tongue is the medium of instruction at the primary level, it will not help in preserving a culture. Rather, to preserve a culture, it is necessary for the parents to keep the environment in such a way that children are able to practice their culture. [AMB: MARCH 5: 356]

Summary

This chapter reported on the results from the data analysis of this study. The results were organized around five themes that emerged from the data analysis:

Pukhtunwali and its importance, changes in Pukhtunwali, factors affecting Pukhtunwali, role of Pukhtu language in Pukhtunwali, role of Pukhtu language used as a medium of instruction at primary level in the preservation of Pukhtunwali. Next, Chapter 5 discusses the results, by theme, and presents conclusions, contribution to the literature, and the suggestions for future research.
CHAPTER 5
DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSIONS

In Chapter 4, the responses of the primary school teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa were organized and presented as themes that emerged from the data; similarities and differences were discussed. In this chapter, I examine the responses of the interviewees in relation to the themes and the literature that I reviewed for this study. This chapter also discusses conclusions drawn from the study, its contribution to the literature, and suggestions for future research.

This study was conducted to explore the relationship of mother tongue used as a medium of instruction at the primary school level in the preservation of culture.

To conduct the study, Pukhtunwali was selected and the role of Pukhtu language in the preservation of Pukhtunwali was explored by investigating the perspectives of the six primary school teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.

The results revealed that participants believed that the Pukhtu language is important for Pukhtunwali but teachers’ views on the use of the Pukhtu language, as a medium of instruction at the primary school level to preserve Pukhtunwali, varied. Participants discussed the present state of Pukhtunwali and suggested strategies that, if implemented in the education system, could be helpful in preserving the Pukhtunwali. The discussion that follows, organized by themes, provides more detail.
**Theme 1: Pukhtunwali and Its Importance**

The teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa generally defined culture as how people spend their lives, including language, dress, traditions, rituals, social relations, and cuisine. The teachers then defined their own culture, that is, Pukhtunwali. All the teachers mentioned that they love their culture and follow it in almost every aspect of their lives. They described the family structure in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa as mainly a joined family system, which they approved of unanimously. However, some of the teacher participants said that some people (especially those in urban areas) are beginning to adopt a separate family system, and many of them (Nadeem, Nazia, Fawad, Imran) disapproved of the trend. With respect to their culture, teachers had distinct likes and dislikes. Teachers highlighted hospitality (Caroe, 1958; Hawkins, 2009; Rome 2006; Rzehak, 2011; Spain, 1963; Strickland, 2007), respect for elders, sharing and helping each other in joy and sorrow (Rome, 2006), and standing up for each other against all odds as the elements of Pukhtunwali they found most remarkable and loved the most. The elements that the teachers disliked and wanted removed from the culture were male dominance (Hawkins, 2009), a disapproval of female education (Hawkins, 2009), influence of other cultures in the form of adopting separate family system and the custom of swara (Rome, 2006).

**Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali**

The teachers were asked, *Do they perceive changes in Pukhtun culture over the last several decades?* The teachers identified a variety of changes in the Pukhtun culture, such as changes in Pukhtu language, dress, the overall mindset of the Pukhtun people,
family structure, the Hujra system, and the Jirga system. With respect to change in the Pukhtu language, the teachers gave various examples of changes that have occurred in colloquial Pukhtu. The changes were mostly the use of English words whilst speaking the Pukhtu language. One teacher (Ambar, School B) reasoned that the use of English words used in spoken Pukhtu is due to the fact that there are no terms for them (such as Internet, mobile) in the Pukhtu language. The teachers, however, did not mention changes in the writing and reading of the Pukhtu language. Fehmida (School C) argued that changes in the spoken Pukhtu language are due to the extensive use of English language in the education system of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. She gave an example by stating that in school, because she teaches and communicates only in English, she sometimes forgets words of the Pukhtu language. Imran (School A) viewed the use of English language in Pukhtu conversation as a fault in the schools; school should promote the Pukhtu language as a subject or as a language. Imran (School A) also pointed out that the government and private institutions look down upon the Pukhtu language. While government makes policies to promote the Pukhtu language in public schools, it fails to implement or enforce the policies (Hussain, 2008; Mirza, 2003), and the private institutions exclude the Pukhtu language from their schools because they do not hire teachers proficient in Pukhtu language. Not promoting the Pukhtu language in schools results in less use of the Pukhtu language. Furthermore, encouraging students to speak in English and not in the Pukhtu language in schools gives the impression that Pukhtu language is what Imran (School A) called a “backward” and not “worthy language”. Cummins (2001) argued that when children are asked to leave their mother tongue at the school door, it also means to
leave their self-identities. For Pukhtun children, leaving the Pukhtu language at the door of their school means leaving their ancestral culture, history, legacy, and identities.

Change in the Pukhtun dress has also occurred. The teachers underlined the change in dress up of the Pukhtun people were due to the western influences. The teachers (Ambar & Nazia, School B) emphasized that western clothes (trouser, shirt, tie, jeans, tee shirt) are popular among young educated people. They explained that western clothes are used as a uniform in schools and in work places, and has become a symbol of “fashionable”, “modern” and “educated people”. Hence, people wear their traditional dresses less often, preferring western clothes.

Another change described by the teachers was change in the overall mindset of the Pukhtun people due to English medium schools. Rahman (2003) indicated that different media of instruction used in schools has created different social issues that have effects on the culture. Rahman (2003) also pointed out the influence of western culture on the people of Pakistan. Participants in this study were of the view that there is a significant difference between children from English medium schools and those from Pukhtu medium schools. Children who can communicate in English are considered more confident than those who communicate in Pukhtu. The teachers mentioned that people of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa have a mindset that speaking in the English language and wearing western clothes makes one educated, modern and fashionable. For example, Imran (School A) argued that not only children are considered confidant and educated if they are proficient in English, but also teachers. The administration, the students, and their parents considered teachers who have the capability of teaching and communicating in English to be well-informed and better teachers than those teaching and communicating
in Pukhtu. Chohan (2011) has written about this phenomenon in Pakistan. She found that
different medium of instruction have created a gap between social classes and societies in
Pakistan. Kazmi and Quran (2005) and Nasir (2011) also conducted research on the
medium of instruction. Their results showed that different medium of instruction in
school effects the personalities, mindsets, morals, and skills of a nation’s people. In this
study, speaking the English language, wearing western clothes, and adopting a western
lifestyle has created a different class in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa that Rahman (2004) called
the “elite class.” The mindset of an “elite class” existed at the time of colonialism in the
sub-continent. However, today’s notion of an “elite class” has its foundations in exposure
to English medium schools. As a result, there is a class gap between people who adopt
the English language and a western life style and those who remains true to their local
language and culture.

The teachers also pointed out changes in the traditional systems followed in
Pukhtunwali. One of the systems that they discussed was the family structure. The
teachers stated that there is a joined family system followed in Pukhtunwali. In this
system, all members of the family live together and share each other’s joy and grief.
Now, if people move to urban areas for educational and/or work purposes, these
members adopt a separate family system. Fawad (School A) and Nazia (School B)
mentioned that since the political circumstances of the country are not stable, one
member of the joined family cannot support the entire family, and hence, a separate
family system is adopted. Other teachers such as Fehmida and Nadeem (School C), and
Ambar (School B) argued that due to the unstable situation of the country, male members
alone cannot support the whole family therefore, the females also help their male
members to support their family. In addition, they said that members opt to separate from the family due to different expenses, and hence the joined family system has become less popular in the urban areas.

Another system that has experienced change is the Hujra system. The Hujra system is a very old tradition of Pukhtunwali. Hujra is a place where people sit together and chat. In rural areas, people, mostly Khans (Pukhtun people with a high socio-economic status and respect in the society), have an area outside their houses where people chat, eat, and drink green tea. This area is called a Hujra. The teachers were disappointed that this system is vanishing. They mentioned that people have become so busy in their own lives that they do not have time for sitting in Hujra to know about each other’s situations.

In Pukhtunwali, there is a tradition of Jirga where people, mostly elders, sit together in a circle and solve the disputes between the two parties. According to the teachers, today this tradition is less observed in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. The reason given by the teachers is the hectic lives of the people and also that the decisions made during the Jirga are sometimes not considered authentic. Ambar (School B) pointed out that education also plays a role in diminishing the regard to and revered status of the Jirga system. Ambar (School B) said that today a child knows more about the court system than the Jirga system.

Badal in Pukhtunwali means returning a deed. This deed can be a good or a bad deed. The teachers highlighted a change in the concept of badal. Ambar (School B) argued that the notion of badal is taken negatively by associating it with only returning
bad deeds. Rome (2006) also pointed out that people who do not belong to Pukhtunwali mostly associate badal with taking revenge only. There is a lot of controversy about badal’s meaning. Rome (2006) specified that foreign authors are mostly unclear about the notion of badal and refer to it as taking revenge in the form of bloodshed. But badal is not only about returning bad deeds. It is about returning good deeds as well (Rome, 2006).

Authors such as Hawkins (2009), Spain (1963), Strickland (2007), and Quddus (1987) have defined badal as taking revenge; revenge which leads to bloodshed and blood feuds. These authors did not mention that badal is also returned when somebody does a good deed. Rzehak (2011) stated, “Hence, the concept of badal expresses not merely the call for revenge, but also the obligation to thank for the provision of help and to provide compensation” (p. 14).

There were also positive changes in Pukhtunwali described by the teachers. These were the decrease in male dominance, the encouragement of females to get education, and the vanishing of the swara system. Due to these cultural changes, females who once were not allowed to walk on the streets without a male member (Strickland, 2007) now support their families for a better quality of life. The discrimination against women in the Pukhtunwali and in the education system has decreased significantly (Ambar, School B). The tradition of swara is no longer observed in urban areas. It is only observed in some parts of the rural areas of the Khyber Pukhtunkhwa (Nazia & Ambar, School B; Fehmida, School C).
Theme3: Factors Responsible for Changes in Pukhtunwali

When the primary school teachers of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa highlighted various changes in the Pukhtunwali, I asked them, *To what do they attribute these changes?* The teachers identified a variety of factors that have caused changes in Pukhtunwali. The first factor was the English language used as an official language and as a medium of instruction in schools. Gulzar and Farooq (2009) claimed that the English language is given a “high status,” unlike Urdu and other regional languages in Pakistan. An official language from the time of British colonialism to the present day, English language is considered an “elite” (Rahman, 2004), “prestigious”, and “de facto language” (Hassan, 2012) in Pakistan. Fu (1987) explained, “English is the passport, it is the prestige, it is the profession and parents wants their children to get on the boat and to stay there.” (p. 29). From the time of British colonization, the mindset of the Pakistani people is set in such a way that proficiency in the English language opens the door to prosperity (Nadeem, School C). English speakers are considered educated and have more opportunities in the workplace than speakers of Urdu or other regional languages (Hassan, 2012).

The second factor that influenced changes in Pukhtunwali was the education system. All teachers in this study identified the influencing factors was an education system that promotes English language and western culture in schools. The teachers claimed that students know more about western culture and history than their own culture and history (Ambar, School B; Fehmida, School C). They highlighted that very little information about Pukhtunwali is taught in the curriculum, which contains a great deal of information about other cultures. All the teachers suggested that more Pukhtun content
should be included in the social studies curriculum in order to facilitate student learning about their culture.

The third factor that influenced change in the Pukhtun culture was electronic media such as television and the Internet. All teachers were of the view that electronic media such as television and the Internet encourage people to adopt western culture and language. Fawad (School A) stated that the news channels that are in the Pukhtu language are considered less reliable than English news channels (BBC, CNN). The teachers also suggested that electronic media should telecast more programs that can promote Pukhtunwali and the Pukhtu language.

All the teachers highlighted technological conveniences that provide information only in English as a part of electronic media influence. Fehmida and Nadeem (School C) and Fawad (School A) argued that technological conveniences such as the mobile and use of the Internet has affected the system of socialization in Pukhtunwali. Fawad (School A) regretted how the use of mobiles and telephones have diminished the custom of going to relatives houses for wedding invitations and spending hours with the family members. The tradition of the Hujra system has been affected by the use of computers and mobile phones. Now people spend more time in front of the computer than with their families (Fehmida, School C). Moreover, information available through technological conveniences is in English. These teachers claimed that children are exposed more to the English language when they use the Internet for learning about science, math, and geography subjects. For example, there is significantly less information given in the Pukhtu language on the Internet regarding scientific and technological fields. During the research for my study, I came across many Pukhtu websites and blogs. They did not
usually provide correct information and sources and as such were not reliable. Fawad (School A) also mentioned this point; if there were any websites or knowledge forums in the Pukhtu language, because of their non-reliability, people preferred to use English-based forums and websites.

A fourth factor responsible for changes in Pukhtunwali was the government itself. Fawad (School A) criticized the government for the lack of initiatives to promote Pukhtunwali and the Pukhtu language in schools. The teachers pointed out that government is not paying any attention to the education sector regarding the promotion of Pukhtunwali and the Pukhtu language. Imran and Fawad (School A), and Nadeem (School C) argued that the government makes policies to promote Pukhtunwali but fails to implement and monitor the policies (Hussain, 2008; Mirza, 2003). Nadeem and Fehmida (School C) indicated that if the government does not take initiatives to promote Pukhtu and the Pukhtun culture, the private sector would expand. This expansion of private sector would result further promotion of the English language and western culture, and relegate Pukhtunwali into obscurity and oblivion. (Rzehak, 2011).

**Theme 4: Role of the Pukhtu Language in the Pukhtunwali**

It was evident from the perspectives of the primary school teachers that changes have occurred in Pukhtunwali in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Caroe (1958) claimed that Pukhtuns can sacrifice their lives but cannot leave Pukhtunwali. I asked the teachers, *How important it is to keep a sense of cultural identity in the major processes of change?* The teachers shared their views about the importance of keeping their cultural identity. They said teachers that no matter what the circumstances are or how much the world
changes, a true Pukhtun never loses his or her sense of Pukhtun identity (Fawad, School A; Ambar, School B). As Olesen (1995), said for the identity of the Pukhtun, there is no distinction between practicing Pukhtunwali and being Pukhtun.

Nadeem (School C) called Pukhtun a “unique culture” that distinguishes Pukhtun culture from other cultures. Fawad (School A) called Pukhtunwali a sacred trust from his ancestors that he has to preserve. Fawad (School A) told me a story of a man who came from Germany to enrol his child in the school where Fawad worked. The man told Fawad that he brought his children back to Pakistan because he did not want his children to be influenced by German culture and forget their Pukhtun identity. Fawad also said that Pukhtuns anywhere in the world are proud of their culture and identity and want their children to be in touch with their culture too. Nadeem (School C), in his interview, told me that he lives in an urban area of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa where Pukhtunwali is less observed than in rural areas of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa. Nadeem said that even though he is living in an urban area, he still teaches his children about Pukhtunwali, and at home he makes sure that his children follow Pukhtunwali in every aspect of their lives.

Many of the teachers (Fawad, School A; Nazia and Ambar, School B; Fehmida, School C) also indicated that they are proud of their culture and identity, and they want to preserve it for the next generations. The teachers also identified the significance of Pukhtunwali for their survival and said that without their cultural identity, they would not be able to survive in the world (Fawad and Imran, School A; Ambar and Nazia, School B; Nadeem, School C). Ambar (School B) claimed that cultural identity is her tool that guides her in how to live her life; if her identity were to be taken away, she would not be able to survive in any society. She clarified that even when Pukhtun people leave their
country for the sake of better opportunities, it does not mean that they forget their cultural identity.

After a discussion about cultural identity, I asked the teachers about the connection between the Pukhtu language and maintaining Pukhtunwali. They all agreed that this connection existed and was important. Some of them stated Pukhtu is an identity marker for Pukhtuns, and is an essential component of the practice of Pukhtunwali. For example, Nadeem (School C) stated that Pukhtu and Pukhtunwali are interconnected and Pukhtunwali is communicated through Pukhtu (Rome, 2006). Imran (School A) pointed out that Pukhtun people, because of use of English language often use English words in Pukhtu conversation. He said he does not like it and he tries his best to speak the Pukhtu language during a conversation with his friends and family. Imran was of the view that using the Pukhtu language will contribute to the preservation of Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu.

**Theme 5: Role of Pukhtu Language Used as a Medium of Instruction at Primary Level in the Preservation of Pukhtunwali**

At the end of the interviews, I asked my participants, *What is the relationship of Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu? And If Pukhtu language is used as a medium of instruction would that be helpful in preserving Pukhtunwali?* Some of the teachers (Fawad and Imran, School A; Nazia, School B) believed that there is a “strong” connection between the use of Pukhtu as a medium of instruction and the preservation of Pukhtunwali. A few of these teachers mentioned that Pukhtu is particularly important in the clarification of the concepts of Pukhtunwali. However, some teachers (Ambar, School B; Fehmida, School C) argued that it is simply not feasible for Pukhtu to be used as a medium of
instruction at the primary school level. Ambar (School B) did not believe there was any relationship between the use Pukhtu as a medium of instruction and the preservation of Pukhtunwali. She believed that preservation of the Pukhtunwali is the obligation of parents and society. She stated that it is not the responsibility for the school to provide an environment where children practice and learn about Pukhtunwali to preserve the culture. Fehmida and Nadeem (School C) said that they want Pukhtu language to be medium of instruction at schools, but since the English language has been used from the time of British colonialism, it is not possible to remove English and implement Pukhtu as a medium of instruction in schools now. Imran (School A) on the other hand, argued that at primary level, the foundation of the children’s learning is developed, therefore, to preserve Pukhtunwali, children should be taught about their culture at primary level. Nazia’s (School B) position was that there is a positive impact on students when they are taught in the Pukhtu language. She said that prohibiting students from speaking Pukhtu in schools encultures them to think that Pukhtu language is not an important language. As stated by Pye (1992), when a language is not used, it “undergo a lowering of social prestige leading to a loss of domains of usage which finally results in the preference of the speakers to use another language” (p. 75). Cummins (2001) argued that when children are asked to leave their culture and language at the school door, they also leave their self-identities, which results in feelings of rejection that affects their personalities. Rahman (2003) claimed that when children are prohibited to practice their culture and language, they develop a negative view about their culture, thus developing feelings of inferiority.
When I asked the teachers who did not support using the Pukhtu language in schools, why they have the opinion that Pukhtu cannot be medium of instruction at the primary school level, the teachers mentioned challenges. These challenges were the changes in the education system, the lack of Pukhtu versions of textbooks and resources, and the low social status of Pukhtu. The teachers said that due to globalization and rapid changes in the world, to compete in this world, the Pukhtun people have no choice but to adopt the English language but that this does not mean they have to ignore their cultural identity. Teachers suggested that Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu can be preserved through education by increasing the content of the Pukhtunwali in the text books, introducing Pukhtu language as a subject, and allotting a period to the teaching of Pukhtunwali through Pukhtu language once a week in schools.

**Conclusion**

This study explored the relationship of mother tongue and cultural preservation from the point of view of primary school teachers. Pukhtunwali culture and Pukhtu language were chosen for this study. The study was conducted by interviewing six primary school Pukhtun teachers who taught social studies course to the fifth grade at the primary school level. The data revealed the perspectives of teachers regarding the role of the Pukhtu language when used as a medium of instruction at the primary school level for the preservation of the Pukhtun culture. All teachers believed that the Pukhtu language is the carrier of Pukhtunwali but there were different views about implementing it as a medium of instruction at the primary school level to help preserve Pukhtunwali in the present circumstances of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa.
Clarity of concepts is the most important element in education. It is believed that at primary school level, the basic foundation of a child develops (Coleman, 2010). The basic foundation is developed when a child understands a concept. Once a concept is built, a child can translate it into other languages as well. Cummins (2001) has given an example of understanding the concept of telling time. He indicated that if a child understands a concept of telling time in his or her mother tongue, he or she could explain it in a second language too. The teachers also highlighted this point in their interviews and said that it is very important for Pukhtun children to understand the concepts of Pukhtunwali. The teachers such as Fawad and Imran supported the Coleman’s and Cummins’s claim and said that once a basic educational concept of a child in Pukhtu language is built, a child can later on translate the concept in English language as well.

The teachers such as Nazia and Nadeem shared their experiences of occasionally using Pukhtu language in classroom for explaining a concept. Both the teachers believed that the students were able to understand the concept better in Pukhtu language than in English language. Nadeem also said that the students were more focused when he was explaining the concept to them in Pukhtu language. However, according to primary school teachers, it is not allowed in English medium schools to use Pukhtu language in classrooms.

The teachers confirmed the assumption that the English language used in schools affects Pukhtunwali. The teachers shared their views regarding the influence of English language on the Pukhtun people in the form of changes that have occurred in Pukhtunwali such as the use of English words during the conversation in the colloquial Pukhtu, adopting western clothes and life style, change in the overall mindset of the
Pukhtun people, and in the traditional systems of the Pukhtunwali culture. They also identified additional factors affecting Pukhtunwali such as electronic media, technological conveniences, and lack of government initiatives in promoting Pukhtunwali and Pukhtu language. The teachers suggested that Pukhtu language for the sake of preserving Pukhtunwali can be implemented in the schools in the form of a subject or course but not as a medium of instruction. The teachers were of the view that present political situation of their country is not stable; therefore, to compete in this world, they need English language in their education.

Parents and community members equally share the responsibility of promoting and preserving a culture. It is not the sole responsibility of schools to teach the children how to practice their culture. One of the teachers (Ambar) pointed out that teachers can teach and guide the children to some extent about the tenets of Pukhtunwali but they cannot provide an environment in which children practice Pukhtunwali culture in schools. She said that it is the responsibility of parents and community to provide such environment to their children in which, children can practice Pukhtunwali at home and in society.

The teachers mentioned a few problems in the education system such as little information about the Pukhtun culture in the social studies curriculum, outdated curriculum, and lack of government initiatives in promoting Pukhtu language and Pukhtunwali and stressed that the government and policy makers should acknowledge these problems. By conducting this study, the government and policy makers would have an informed view of the problems in the education system of Khyber Pukhtunkhwa and how these problems need to be addressed.
Contributions to the Literature

Studies done on the Pukhtunwali culture are very few in number and are mostly in the form of forums that are not considered academic or reliable. This study provides a vast list of readings, including this study itself, that can be helpful in future research on the relationship of Pukhtu and Pukhtunwali culture.

Teachers play a vital role in the teaching-learning process. This study examined the perceptions of primary school teachers who are teaching Pukhtunwali culture to the present generation of the Pukhtuns. The perspectives of the teachers have never been explored before in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa regarding the role of Pukhtu language in preserving Pukhtunwali.

Like Pukhtunwali, there are other indigenous cultures facing the same issues as faced by Pukhtunwali. The suggestions given by the teachers in this study could be considered by other indigenous societies to preserve their cultures.

Suggestions for Future Research

This study considered only one culture, Pukhtunwali. Future research could examine different cultures to explore the relationship of mother tongue and cultural preservation.

A deeper understanding of the context of this study is also needed. Data was collected from primary school teachers only. Additional studies using the same methodology could be conducted at the secondary school level. Also, a better understanding of the topic would be gained if students could also be observed and
interviewed, thus providing another perspective for the study. Further, this study focused on English medium schools only. For future research, Urdu medium and Pukhtu medium schools could be considered to understand the perspectives of the teachers in these schools.

Consideration of the above suggestions into the relationship of mother tongue in the preservation of culture could provide a more comprehensive understanding of this topic, both generally and specifically in Pakistan. If an expanded knowledge base existed on this topic, scholars and practitioners could draw on the information to make informed policy and decisions to improve the education system in Pakistan.
References


doi:10.1177/0539018406069584

CSS Forums (forum). Retrieved from


Vallyswat (forum). Retrieved from http://www.swatvalley.com/swat/?PHPSESSID=726c96c8b2f2e2f983d028964d816eb3


Appendix-A
Interview Guideline

Sample of General Background questions:

• Where were you born?

• How old are you?

• What is your ethnic/cultural heritage?

• What is the primary language spoken in your family? Any foreign language speakers?

• What languages do you read, speak or write fluently?

• What was the medium of instruction in your school when you were at the primary level?

• Does your extended family live in this same region?

• Have you always lived in this region of Pakistan? If not, in what other regions/countries have you lived?

• Are you married? Do you have children? If yes, how many and how old are they?

• What does your husband/wife do?

• What is the best thing about living in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?

• What is the worst thing about living in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?

• Can you talk about the status of Pukhtun language and culture in your community today? Please elaborate.
Sample of questions regarding professional preparation:

- As a student, did you study in the Pukhtun language or in some other language (eg. English)?
- How long have you been a teacher?
- Where did you study to be a teacher?
- How long have you been teaching?
- How long have you been teaching the grade five social studies course?
- Do you have aspirations to be a school administrator? If no, why not?

Sample of Trigger questions for discussion:

- What is your definition of “culture?”
- Of what culture do you consider yourself to be a part?
- Describe family life in Khyber Pukhtunkhwa?
- What do you consider to be the most remarkable thing about your culture?
- Are there things about the Pukhtun culture that you don’t like?
- How do you see the connection between the use of the Pukhtun language and maintaining the Pukhtun culture?
- How do you see the role of medium of instruction in relation to the preservation of culture?
- Do you perceive changes in the Pukhtun culture over the last several decades? If yes, to what do you attribute these changes? Please elaborate.
- Do you think it important to keep a sense of cultural identity through the major processes of change?
• What do you think is the relationship between language of instruction and cultural preservation? Please elaborate.

• Can you describe the cultural background/heritage of most of your students in the grade five social studies classroom?

• Please elaborate your view of the grade five social studies curriculum with regard to cultural elements you consider to be important in relation to the preservation of culture in general; in particular to the Pukhtun culture.

• What would you like to see changed, added or removed from the grade five social studies curriculum in order to meet your views on cultural preservation?

• What is your understanding of the relationship between cultural preservation and language of instruction?
Appendix-B

Certificate of Completion

This document certifies that

Shahida Khan

has completed the Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans
Course on Research Ethics (TCPS 2: CORE)

Date of Issue: 5 June, 2012
January 11, 2013

Ms. Shahida Khan
Master’s Student
Faculty of Education
Duncan McArthur Hall
511 Union Street
Kingston, ON K7M 5R7

GREB Ref #: GEDUC-653-12; Rome # 6007643
Title: "GEDUC-653-12 The Role of Mother Tongue at Primary Level in the Preservation of Culture"

Dear Ms. Khan:

The General Research Ethics Board (GREB), by means of a delegated board review, has cleared your proposal entitled "GEDUC-653-12 The Role of Mother Tongue at Primary Level in the Preservation of Culture" for ethical compliance with the Tri-Council Guidelines (TCPS) and Queen's ethics policies. In accordance with the Tri-Council Guidelines (article D.1.6) and Senate Terms of Reference (article G), your project has been cleared for one year. At the end of each year, the GREB will ask if your project has been completed and if not, what changes have occurred or will occur in the next year.

You are reminded of your obligation to advise the GREB, with a copy to your unit REB, of any adverse event(s) that occur during this one year period (access this form at https://eservices.queensu.ca/romeo_researcher/ and click Events - GREB Adverse Event Report). An adverse event includes, but is not limited to, a complaint, a change or unexpected event that alters the level of risk for the researcher or participants or situation that requires a substantial change in approach to a participant(s). You are also advised that all adverse events must be reported to the GREB within 48 hours.

You are also reminded that all changes that might affect human participants must be cleared by the GREB. For example, you must report changes to the level of risk, applicant characteristics, and implementation of new procedures. To make an amendment, access the application at https://eservices.queensu.ca/romeo_researcher/ and click Events - GREB Amendment to Approved Study Form. These changes will automatically be sent to the Ethics Coordinator, Gail Irving, at the Office of Research Services or irvingg@queensu.ca for further review and clearance by the GREB or GREB Chair.

On behalf of the General Research Ethics Board, I wish you continued success in your research.

Yours sincerely,

John S. Freeman, Ph.D.
Professor and Acting Chair
General Research Ethics Board

cc: Dr. Magda Lewis, Faculty Supervisor
    Dr. Don Klinger, Chair, Unit REB
    Erin Wickham, c/o Graduate Studies and Bureau of Research
Appendix-D

Letter of Information

“THE ROLE OF MOTHER TONGUE AT PRIMARY LEVEL IN THE PRESERVATION OF CULTURE”

Principal Investigator: Name: Shahida Habib Khan

Faculty of Education
Queen’s University
Kingston, Ontario, Canada
(613) 544-4764
E-mail: 11shk5@queensu.ca

Co-Investigator(s): Faculty Supervisor: Dr. Magda Lewis
(613) 533-6000 x 77277
Email: magda.lewis@queensu.ca

Shahida Habib Khan is conducting this research under the supervision of Dr. Magda Lewis in the Faculty of Education at Queen’s University in Kingston, Ontario.

What is this study about?

The purpose of this research is to better understand the relationship between mother tongue used as a medium of instruction at primary level and native culture preservation. My research question is: What is the role of mother tongue when used as a medium of instruction on primary level in the preservation of culture? To get this goal, you will be asked to participate in semi-structured, open-ended interview. The interview will be recorded through an audiotape. It will require one visit of approximately one hour in length but there may be follow-up studies if necessary. If
there will be a follow-up interview, the approximate length of time will be forty minutes. While the interview process will be open ended, following some general questions for the purpose of collecting relevant personal date, the interview will proceed with trigger questions aimed at generating open-ended discussion.

**Is my participation voluntary?**

Yes. Your participation in this study is voluntary and you are free to withdraw at any time. You can send an email to the Shahida Habib Khan in which you should write that you wish to withdraw from the study. You are free to withdraw with no effect on (a) her standing if a student, (b) any contractual or other relationship with the investigator if a client, or (c) her future cares if a patient. If you wish to withdraw, you may request to remove all or parts of your data. You should not feel obliged to answer any question that you find objectionable or which makes you uncomfortable.

**What will happen to my responses?**

Your responses will stay confidential. Only the faculty supervisor, Dr. Magda Lewis, the translator, and I will have access to this information. The data may also be published in professional journals or presented at conferences, but any such presentations will be of general findings and will never breach individual confidentiality. The researcher will maintain the confidentiality to the extent possible. The data will be retained indefinitely. If the data is used for secondary analysis it will contain no identifying information. Should you be interested, you are entitled to a copy of the findings. Your signature below indicates that you understand these provisions around confidentiality and anonymity.
What if I have concerns?

Any questions about study participation may be directed to Shahida Habib Khan at 11shk5@queensu.ca or at (613) 770-3211; or my supervisor Dr. Magda Lewis at magda.lewis@queensu.ca or by phone at 613-533-6000 x77277. Any ethical concerns about the study may be directed to the Chair of the General Research Ethics Board at chair.GREB@queensu.ca or at (613) 533-6081.

This study has been granted clearance according to the recommended principles of Canadian ethics guidelines, and Queen's policies.

Your signature below indicates that you have read this Letter of Information and have had any questions answered to your satisfaction. Please keep a copy of this letter for your records.

Name: ___________________________

Date: ____________________________

Signature: ________________________

If you may wish to request for a copy of the results of the study, please provide your email/postal address below

________________________________________

________________________________________
Appendix-E

Consent Form

“THE ROLE OF MOTHER TONGUE AT PRIMARY LEVEL IN THE
PRESERVATION OF CULTURE”

Name (please print clearly): _______________________________________

Please sign one copy of this Consent Form and return to Shahida Habib Khan. Retain the second copy for your records.

1. I have read the Letter of Information and have had any questions answered to my satisfaction.

I understand that I will be participating in the study called “The Role of Mother Tongues at Primary Level in the Preservation of Culture”. I understand that this means that I will be asked to participate in semi-structured, open-ended interview. The interview will be recorded through an audiotape. The interview will be approximately one hour. There may be a follow-up interview that will be approximately forty minutes.

2. I understand that my participation in this study is voluntary and I may withdraw at any time. If I wish to withdraw, I will be required to send an email to Shahida Habib Khan to let her know that I wish to withdraw from her study. I understand that my participation is voluntary, I am free to withdraw with no effect on (a) her standing if a student, (b) any contractual or other relationship with the investigator if a client, or (c) her future care if a patient. If I withdraw, I may request to remove all or parts of my data.
I understand that every effort will be made to maintain the confidentiality of the data now and in the future. Only the principal investigator, Shahida Habib Khan, the translator, and the faculty supervisor, Dr. Magda Lewis will have access to the data. The data may also be published in professional journals or presented at conferences, but any such presentations will be of general findings and will never breach individual confidentiality. Should I be interested, I may request a copy of the findings.

Any questions about study participation may be directed to Grad Student, Shahida Habib Khan; 11shk5@queensu.ca; project supervisor, Dr. Magda Lewis at (613) 533-6000 x 77277; Email: magda.lewis@queensu.ca. Any ethical concerns about the study may be directed to the Chair of the General Research Ethics Board at (613) 533-6081 or chair. GREB@queensu.ca.

I have read the above statements and freely consent to participate in this research:

Signature: __________________________________ Date: ________________

To request a copy of the results of the study, my email/ postal address is:

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

150
Appendix-F

Example of Coded English Interview Transcript

should change the medium of instruction in schools to give your people information about their identity too. You should make more changes. Just changing the name of the province and an airport is not enough. Release funds to change the system, to capture a portion in media in which all the discussions, political arguments, programs everything will be in Pukhtu. Give finances to Pukhtu channel and make it reliable. Saying that we did this we did that, show the nation something very important for the sake of Pukhtu.
The whole time of a Pukhtun is spend in either learning in English and Urdu. There is not even a single talk show on media in which politicians address their people in Pukhtu. And the politicians are not even interested in promoting Pukhtu, if they were, they wouldn’t be sending their children abroad for studies. If politicians say that we did this and that then bring your children to KPK and send them to Pukhtu medium schools if you want to promote Pukhtu.
The truth is our government of Pakistan where majority of the politicians are not Pukhtuns, they don’t want to promote Pukhtu as a medium of instruction in education.

Researcher Q24: You mentioned that it is a psyche of today’s generation that they think that a successful person is one who is fluent in English, why people’s psyche is this in a such a place where Pukhtunwali is followed and that the name of the province is also Khyber Pukhtunhwa?

Fawad A: If you see, all the people on the higher posts such as beuricats, management people all were from Pukhtu medium schools and they are very successful people of their time. Now things have changed, private schools are introduced, they formed an industry, which shows than people that private schools are better than public schools. In public schools, there were black kamis parthog (trouser and shirt) then people saw the uniforms of private schools which has a tie, shirt, trouser, very neat uniform, people wanted to put their children in these schools. In this way, private schools made a mafia which aim is to discourage people to go public schools and Pukhtu medium schools so that people learn about western culture than Pukhtunwali.

Researcher Q25: Do you think it important to keep a sense of cultural identity through the major processes of change?

Fawad A: For me Pukhtunwali is like a power that’s fell from insight, like something mindset, spiritual that if I want to ignore, I can’t, because it is inherited to me and I can’t leave it for anything. It is like a token given to me by my ancestors to preserve it and I cannot betray my elders. Pukhtuns, anywhere in the world are proud of their identity. There once came a father who was very worried his children. He told us he wanted to enroll his children in KPK school because he spent time in Germany and since his children were influenced by their culture, he wanted them to be in touch with Pukhtunwali. A Pukhtun anywhere in the world if spirit for his culture, he will keep its identity alive and never want to go to a place where there is no respect for his culture or his family is influenced by western culture.

Researcher Q26: Can you describe the cultural background/heritage of most of your students in the grade five social studies classroom?
Appendix G

Coding of Theme 2: Changes in Pukhtunwali

Changes in Pukhtunwali

152
Appendix-H

Actual Hardboard Display of Themes and their Categories
Appendix-I

Transcript of Pukhtu

سوال: د ٹولو نہ اول ماته خیل تعارف اوکرئ?
جواب: زما نامه فرهاد ده او زما عمر ۵۵ کاله دی او زه د
پیشور پم
سوال: سئاسو تعلق کوم کلتور سره دی?
جواب: زما تعلق پشتون کلتور او ثقافت سره دی.
سوال: سئاسو پہ کورنی کسی کومه زه وئیلی کیپی?
جواب: زمونی د تولی کورنی زه پشتون ده.
سوال: د پشتتو نه علاوه بله زه سئاسو کورنی کشی وئیلی کیپی?
جواب: نه چي جي! صرف او صرف پشتتو
سوال: ناسو پخیلہ خومره زبی وئیلی او لیکلی چن؟
جواب: دی اردو زبی داسی دی چی زبی وئیلی او لیکلی چن: پشتتو
سؤول: ناسو چی کله پخیلہ سبق وئیلی نو ناسو ته بے پی چی کومه زه کسی سبق ٹولو؟
جواب پیمانہ خو یہ اردو او انگریزی وہ خو ما چونکه پی سرکاری سکول کسی سبق وئیلی دی نو سلته بے پشتتو لازم وہ۔