Manitoba Schooling in the Canadian Context and the Building of a Polity: 1919 - 1971

Rosa Bruno-Jofre
The University of Manitoba

Abstract

This paper addresses the movement from Anglo-conformity as the principle articulating the notion of citizenship education to multiculturalism. It is a historical analysis that focuses on Manitoba education in relation to English speaking Canada. It calls attention to and attempts to explain the gap between educational aims and policies and actual classroom life. Given the intersubjective and relational character of identity formation, citizenship education often contributed to the development of forms of proto-multiculturalism that later gained political space. Furthermore, minorities often became Canadians in their own terms. The boundaries between private and public tended to become diffused in the school experience.

The paper also refers to internal and external socio-economic, political, ideological, and educational developments that led to a redefinition of the public good by making multiculturalism an articulating principle in the pursuit of a common polity.

Abstract

Cet article aborde le mouvement de l'anglo-conformisme comme principe
articulant la notion de l’Mucation sur la citoyennete au multiculturalisme. C’est une analyse historique qui se concentre sur l’Mucation au Manitoba par rapport au Canada anglophone. L’article fait remarquer la lagune entre les buts et les politiques educatifs et la vie reelle dans la salle de classe et l’explique. Etant donne le caractere intersubjectif et relationnel de la formation d’une identity. L’education sur la citoyennete contribue souvent au developpement de fammes de proto-multiculturalisme qui ont gagne plus tard de l’espace politique. En plus, des minorites sont devenus Canadiens selon leurs propres points de vue. Les frontieres entre le prive et le public tendait d se nepandre dans l’experience scolaire. L’article fait reference aussi aux developpements socio-economiques, politiques, ideologiques et educatifs internes et externes qui ont abouti a une redefinition du bon public en rendant le multiculturalisme un principe articulant dans la poursuite d’une politie commune.

Introduction

This paper traces the movement from Anglo-conformity as the central principle articulating the notion of citizenship in the official educational discourse in English speaking Canada to multiculturalism and multicultural education. It is a historical analysis that focuses on Manitoba education in relation to English speaking Canada and the overall Canadian scene.

The period being discussed runs from 1919, immediately after World War I ends, and 1971, when multiculturalism became official policy. By 1919 the impact of immigration had already been felt and significant urban workers’ and farmers’ movements were growing in political importance. Education, character formation, and citizenship were both local and national concerns. Anglo-conformity was at the centre of the notion of the public good, and hence the central principle articulating the notion of citizenship. The term ”Anglo-conformity” describes the ideal of assimilation by which immigrants were expected to renounce their culture and traditions in favour of the behaviour and values of Anglo-Canadians, that is Canadians of British origins (Palmer, 1984, p. 21).

The end of World War II (1945) is used here as a referent for change because the impact of the war generated conditions which along with internal developments in time rendered Anglo-conformity an inadequate principle. Those internal developments included a kind of proto-multiculturalism that grew out of resistance to assimilation, and the intersubjective process that grew out of social practices inside and outside of schools. Some of them were embedded in institutions like churches, ethnic organizations, and unions, but were most solidly entrenched in family life.

The paper ends the discussion with the declaration by Parliament in 1971 that Canada was officially bilingual and multicultural. This made diversity a central component of the public good. It was a way to accommodate the diversity of multiple identities, more complex after changes in immigration, and an attempt to accommodate Quebecois nationalism within a federalist framework. In fact, the Quebec issue remained unresolved and Aboriginal nationalism, not addressed in 1971, soon challenged the dualistic national vision of Pierre Trudeau and his government.

Historically there has always been a gap between educational aims and policies in the form of statements, documents of various sorts, curricula, and what actually happened in schools. An attempt is made in this paper to explain this inconsistency and the resultant unexpected outcomes with reference to citizenship formation and identity and the definition of the common good. An attempt is also made to relate the various political, social, economic, and educational developments that led to multiculturalism. This historical dimension should help Canadians to understand the current discussions of the limitations of the multicultural experience and of the process of identity formation.

Anglo-conformity at the Core of the Notion of Public Good: 1919-1945

Before the end of the 19th century immigration into Canada was not high, but by the 1890’s, Wilfrid Laurier’s Liberal government deliberately set out to attract large numbers of immigrants, particularly to Western Canada. Immigration policies gave preference to farmers, most of them not British, but some immigrants ended up working in mines, factories, and on the railways, thus becoming part of the urban working class, and nourishing the ranks of the labour movement. Between 1896 and 1914 three million immigrants, including large numbers of British labourers, American farmers, and eastern European peasants came to Canada (Palmer, 1984, pp. 22-23).
In the late 19th century, the non Aboriginal population of the western interior had been overwhelmingly Canadian by birth and British by national origin, but within one generation the cultural composition changed dramatically (Friesen, 1987, p. 244). As Friesen has observed: "Almost half of all prairie residents at the start of the First World War had been born in another country, and the proportion was still one in three as late as 1931" (p. 244). As a result, and not surprisingly, by the middle and late 1910's, educational and political leaders identified the large presence of non-British newcomers to Manitoba as a major public issue. In 1918, the Minister of Education, R. S. Thornton, in his address to the Manitoba Educational Association emphasized the need to bring newcomers more quickly into Canadian national life and into the life of the province, as he defined it. He quoted the 1916 census, stating that 42% of the population of the province represented 38 different nationalities. He then went on to say that "while there are other factors at work, our aim is to plant Canadian schools with Canadian teachers setting forth Canadian ideals and teaching the language of the country" (Address of the Minister, 1918, p. 185).

Schooling was identified as the main agency to develop unity of thought, teach English to the new immigrants, educate them in Canadian ways, and generally to make them proper members of the national polity. The First Nations were excluded from civic life and their schooling was a federal responsibility. From the 1890s on there was a concern with "the alien." This concern increased during World War I, known as the Great War, due to war time patriotism and a realization that some immigrants came from "enemy" countries (See Osborne, 1996). Although education was and still remains under provincial jurisdiction retaining a regional flavour, there was, after the War, in most English speaking provinces an urgent concern with "education and the national spirit." This concern was motivated by the massive presence of "aliens," the depression, and the growth of the Canadian labour movement including 428 strikes across the country and the Winnipeg General Strike in 1919. Business leaders, political leaders, and most educational leaders of the time thought of developing through schooling "a national spirit" based on Anglo-conformity as well as on duties and responsibilities. This approach did not encourage a language of substantive rights of citizenship and social entitlements.

The end of World War I brought a social crisis. Ill feelings toward foreigners were widespread and crossed all social classes. Wellington Bridgeman's book, The Burning Question of Today: Shall the Alien Go?, with its forceful advocacy of deportation of all "enemy" aliens including women and children, was a best seller in 1920 (Thompson, 1991, p.9). Tom Mitchell (1996-1997) has argued that the Great War evoked a sense of national identity among members of Canada's English speaking middle class, while Canada as a country in 1919 was fragmented along ethnic, social class, and regional lines. In his view, the middle class sought to address the post war crisis "by casting the post-war order in a particular idiom of nationalism informed by a common Canadianism rooted in Anglo-conformity, and a citizenship framed in notions of service, obedience, obligation and fidelity to the state" (1996-1997, p. 21). The National Conference on Character Education in Relation to Canadian Citizenship that took place in Winnipeg in 1919, mostly funded by the Canadian business elite, was a good example of efforts to advance this idiom of citizenship after the war (Mitchell, 1996-1997; Report of Proceedings, 1919). Francophone delegates from Quebec tried, with little success, to make participants aware that there was another view of Canada. Most participants perceived teachers as playing a powerful role in transmitting an ideology of Anglo-conformity, service, and social stability. The Manitoba Teachers' Federation, founded in 1919, also thought of schooling as the backbone of the nation and the teachers' mission was, in its view, to prepare the "highest class of citizenship (Bruno-Jofr6, 1993, p. 351). The Federation saw a contradiction between the low status of the teaching profession and the increasing role expected from education in the political construction of Canada.

In the mid-twenties some restrictions against immigration of former "enemy aliens" were lifted for economic reasons, thus, opening doors to various ethnic groups: Ukrainians, Poles, Slovaks, Hungarians, German-Russians, and Mennonites (Thompson, 1991, pp. 9-11). The presence of "aliens" and the concern with social upheaval continued to have a place in the approach to the teaching of citizenship and the creation of a common polity that was promoted in public schools in the 1920s. The Western School Journal, published in Winnipeg, Manitoba, in its editorials and articles devoted attention to issues of moral character, citizenship, nation building, and patriotism. The Journal reached schools in all three prairie provinces. Initially an independent publication, by 1916 it was subsidized by the Manitoba Department of Education and contained a bulletin of the Department and also of the Manitoba Trustees Association; and after 1919 there was news from the Teachers' Federation. It also included a bulletin from the Manitoba Educational Association. 8
In the 1920s, the Journal by and large emphasized service, "character" in general, work habits, Christian values, obedience to the law, defence of national institutions and a willingness to serve the state as the main traits of a good citizen (Supremacy of character, 1918, p.41 l; The teaching of civics, p. 365; Conference on character, 1919, p. 293; Echoes of the conference, 1919, pp. 332-333; The national conference, 1926, pp. 781-790). The inculcation of the "right habits" of neatness, accuracy, thoroughness, faithfulness was often seen as a necessary condition for learning (Stevenson, 1920, pp. 194-197). These values and habits governing the soul (dispositions, sensitivities, enhancing of sympathetic feelings) were not only aimed at immigrants but they had a strong class character that can be found in school texts and programs not only in Canada but in all European countries. In Manitoba, for example, in The Programme of Studies for Elementary Schools (1927) issued by the Department of Education in Manitoba there is an italicized Note in the Grade I section under Manners and Morals that includes the following: "Teachers should not fail to inculcate in the minds of all children in the school (a) Love and Fear; (b) Reverence for the name of God; (c) Keeping of His Commandments" (p.5).

History books for young children were upholders of the rightness and goodness of leaders while opponents were portrayed as misguided or wicked. The Britannia History Readers for Grades IV and V, published in 1909 and reprinted many times, for example, said: "In Lower Canada the leader of the rebellion was Louis Papineau, a man high in office in his own province. He did much mischief among the French by his fiery speeches in Parliament. After several riots he, with a few followers, escaped to the United States" (cited in Shack, 1979, March 28). Textbooks excluded what was not a cause for the celebration of nation building, had a masculine tone, and were very British in general (Shack, 1979, March 28; Osborne, 1999, September 22). The role of education in developing a democratic polity went hand in hand with the overall notion of the Empire. In a 1927 editorial, The Western School Journal defined patriotism as loyalty to "the ideal for which the Empire stands in what may be called qualified or ordered freedom for every one within the Empire" (p. 234). Loyalty to the King-Emperor was also expressed in respect for the flag that symbolized the ideal, the system, and the person of the king, whose picture was a feature of every classroom. The editorial explained:

If patriotism is taught from this point of view, as a revelation of an Imperial ideal which represents democracy at its highest, children will be immune form "disloyal and revolutionary propaganda," since no revolution could give the people any better principle on which to build their national and personal life. (p. 234)

This approach was not only associated with teaching history, but with special ceremonies such as the celebration of Empire Day, of Queen Victoria's birthday, and of Armistice Day. It was most marked in the content of the Readers of the elementary school and of the Literature - so-called English programmes of the secondary schools. It seems clear, as Osborne (1994, p.5) pointed out, given the nature of Canada's history, that pride in Canada was relatively outward looking. Canada looked to Britain and to the tradition of western civilization. After the War, the place of Canada with reference to the British Empire was also influenced by the notion of international citizenship since the Empire was seen as a good model compatible with the League of Nations (1920) (Harvey, 1928, pp. 99-100). The role of education in securing a democratic society appeared side by side with the overall notion of the Empire and often in relation to the danger posed by the Bolshevic revolution. (Gordon Scott, 1920, p. 231)

Patriotism, the highest commitment to the common good, was also linked to the idea of nation building and the realization that Canada was indeed a nation or at least was well on the way to becoming one.' After 1931, and the enactment of the Statute of Westminster, the idea of self-governing countries that were independent but united by a common allegiance to the crown also had its place in the discourse on citizenship and education.

Character formation was a central component of the discourse on citizenship. Some writings, in particular in the Journal, suggest that character formation emerged from strict mandates and the teaching of habits and manners. The Boy Scouts and the Cadet Corps, for example, were seen as auxiliary agencies to the school in the development of a moral purpose. Other writings reflect an active participatory approach. Character formation was also part of the process of nation building through the assimilation of "aliens" and class reproduction (Citizenship, 1921, p. 619; The national conference, 1926, pp. 781-790; The nation builder, 1929, p. 327). The emphasis on service (voluntarism) rather than active political participation gave citizenship a depoliticised slant. Indeed, citizenship education was seen as a tool to counteract radicalism, especially in the early 1920's.
The Western School Journal contained over the years articles on citizenship, Canadianization, patriotism, and character formation written by educational leaders, editorials, policies, and statements from various organizations including government. To an important extent the many articles on citizenship and training for citizenship (even the definition of citizenship) reproduced and reinforced a separation of women from public life. The emphasis on military service, public service, paying taxes, reflected the gender oriented notion of citizenship even as women gained political rights. While education was seen as fundamental to developing a common polity, the Journal included an article arguing that the feminization of secondary education would lead to "deterioration in the moral tone of the male principals' virility" and "loss of power to deal successfully with men" (Hall, 1929, pp. 147-148). There was a gendered understanding of the role of teachers and women teachers were accepted at the elementary level but not necessarily at the secondary level. This understanding had to do with character formation and citizenship education.

The principles of progressive education (child centered education, relationship between education and experience, the school and the community, democracy and education) reached a number of Canadian provinces in the late 1920's and early 1930's. These principles influenced the notion of citizenship and character education held by educational leaders and were reflected in programs of studies but seldom influenced school practice (Patterson, 1986). The article/report on education in Canada written by Professor Fred Clarke (McGill University) in 1935 indicated the prevalence of grade structure and examination control in secondary education, and the peculiarity of rural areas where local control and interests were widespread. Clarke recognized but did not question the "entrenched conservatism which prevails in many parts of Canada in matters of educational usage, particularly where the ideal of the 'average' or the exercise of local rights is concerned" (cited in Wood, 1989, p. 23). In Manitoba, curricular changes in 1927-1930 reflected progressive influences, especially at the elementary levels. There was an emphasis on the development of the life of the child, on participation, on relating the school to community, on cooperation (Practical education, 1927, p. 396; The school preparing for life, 1928, pp. 43-44; Examinations, 1929, p. 327; Dickie, 1938, pp. 8, 16). However, these changes were also related to politically relevant pressure coming from rural constituencies which had long been complaining that schools taught a bookish education with little practical value. The Western School Journal and its successor in 1938, The Manitoba School Journal made clear through articles and editorials that teachers were expected to develop in students an understanding of democratic principles and strong loyalty to them (Donnelly, 1939, p. 10; Deliberate citizenship, 1938, p. 3; Moore, 1939, p. 6; Stevenson, 1939, p. 11). The Manitoba Teacher, published by the Manitoba Teachers' Federation, expounded a similar discourse. For example, an article published in 1930 read:

Education is more than preparation for life, it is part of life itself... True democracy, in its very essence, is government of the people, by the people; there can be no lasting education of the people which is not equally by the people. Educational fascism, paternalistic training limited to the earlier years of life, must be displaced by Educational Democracy, continuous from youth to age... Socially, the citizen is, at the same time, both the governor and the governed; educationally, he must be both the teacher and the learner. (Hearn, 1930)

There was a movement toward a redefinition of citizenship formation and the generation of a polity in light of international changes affecting Canada's identity as a nation and ideological and intellectual developments affecting education. The notion of citizenship based on a "generation of informed, thinking, and socially disposed citizens" (Moore, 1939) mainly remained within the framework of a language of political rights. The argument as expounded in articles and editorials of The Western School Journal or of the Manitoba Teacher (Manitoba Teachers' Federation) did not pursue a critical understanding of democracy within a concrete social and economic context. The argument showed an interest in Canada's place as a North-American nation and developed along with it a justification of colonialism within the British Empire and the suppression of the Aboriginal peoples, and also failed to deal with women's rights. It reflected anxiety over the rise of fascism and Stalinism and as the decade progressed it made evident the tensions of the time as a new world war was looming. Was Canada a British or a North American nation? What should Canada do? When war broke out in 1939 it was explained as a struggle for democracy. It brought into the discourse the elements of unity, patriotism, and service through war efforts by children. The Manitoba Education Department Act of 1937 prescribed a revised set of patriotic exercises which became part of the public school program in 1941 to have consistency in the message and to enforce it. In 1942, the Advisory Board recommended that citizenship be included as part of every school subject and...
other school activities. Empire Day was organized around the war theme during the War. The program for Empire Day 1941 talked about the unity of the English-speaking world; it read, "it is no exaggeration to say that the future of the whole world and the hopes of a broadening civilization founded upon Christian ethics depend upon relations between the British Empire, or Commonwealth of Nations, and the United States of America" (Manitoba Department of Education, 1941).

Perhaps the most obvious case in Manitoba has been that of the public schools located in Franco-Manitoban communities where citizenship formation had an oppositional dimension because it involved resistance, negotiation, memories of oppression on an individual and collective basis (Bruno-Jofre, 1998-1999). The actions took the form of a collective challenge to the Department of Education in response to the aftermath of the School Question and specifically the Education Act of 1916 which eliminated the bilingual system, made English the official language of instruction in public schools, and relegated religious instruction to hours before or after school. It was also an integral part of the process of elaboration of the identity of what Martel (1998) calls the French-Canadian nation (Quebec, and communities outside Quebec). However, each French Canadian or Acadian community outside Quebec created provincial bodies to promote its own particular interest. In Manitoba, L’Association de l’Education des Canadiens-Francais with headquarters in St. Boniface was founded in 1916 to protect the interest of French Catholics in Manitoba. In practice the Association had as much control over the education of Franco-Manitobans attending public schools as the Department of Education (Taillefer, 1987, pp. 263-264). The collective memory provided a sense of identity based on religion, ethnicity, and community history, an identity that was somehow articulated with the sense of identity expounded through the official curricula. (Bruno-Jofre, 1998-1999, p. 35)

In some settings minority children went, however, through the process of Canadianization with a sense of pain and oppression (not being able to experience alternative identifications), especially in places where the discourse of Anglo conformity was supported by a British environment. Other minority children became easily assimilated with no qualms on their part, in particular those whose ethnicity facilitated the process of assimilation in a discriminatory environment (Bruno-Jofre, 1998-1999, p. 32).

The point here is that citizenship and identity formation have a relational character." They develop through an intersubjective process in which it is difficult to separate the public and the private, the personal and the political. This acknowledgement is fundamental in the discussion of the creation of a polity and the influence of the hidden curriculum in identity formation. The intersubjective dimension helps to explain the endurance of forms of proto-multiculturalism which
did not seem to have a cosmopolitan ingredient. Even in cases of extreme oppression, such as the cultural genocide of the First Nations through residential schooling and religious conversion, the core of resistance was kept alive by communities of memory.

Re-formulating the Principles of a Common Polity: 1945-1971

The Post-war, Changes in Immigration, and the Movement toward Political Accommodation

Immediately after World War II Canada was faced with a refugee crisis. There was strong pressure on Canada by international organizations to do something for or about the large numbers of people displaced by the upheavals produced by the war and its after effects. There was also a tension between the humanitarian discourse on immigration and the practice of selection, which was mainly based on Canada’s perceived economic needs and the skills of the aspiring immigrants. Between 1946 and 1952, 160,000 displaced persons entered Canada. This number was in sharp contrast with the record of the 1930’s. After 1952 immigration recruitment focused on specific European countries such as The Netherlands, Germany, Italy, Greece, and Portugal. As the cold war progressed, the Immigration Branch and External Affairs worked together to prevent the immigration of suspected Communists (Avery, 1995, pp. 144-168).

As a result of changing world conditions, it was obvious that Canada needed a new general immigration policy. Racial biases continued to influence immigration policies and therefore immigrants came mostly from Europe and the United States. Between 1951 and 1961 the numbers reached 1,543,000 (Minister of Industry, Trade and Commerce, 1977, p. 185). The federal Bill of Rights (1960) rejected personal limitations based on race, religion or sex. Over the next fifteen years every province would establish Human Rights Commissions and consolidate anti-discrimination legislation. Restrictive immigration policies were no longer looking acceptable. Moreover, Walker (1985, p. 18) indicates, a more open policy was also needed to attract skilled immigrants. Obviously previous efforts were not working. In 1962 new immigration regulations were issued. These regulations made individual skills the main criterion for admission and ended race or national origin as reasons for exclusion. In 1967, a point system was established; all those who accumulated sufficient points were admitted. When the barriers were removed a large number of qualified immigrants from Asia, Africa, and the Caribbean came to Canada. The impact was so impressive that by mid-1970’s, over 40 per cent of all immigrants came from the so-called “Third World” (Walker, 1985, p. 18). The number accentuated the visibility of the new immigrants. There was not only an increase in the number of visible minorities, including blacks, but also a shift in occupation and aspirations of the immigrants. Discrimination took new forms and found new excuses. The new reality was reflected in the life of the classroom even before it became a public issue.

The end of the war also brought a new international reality that would in the long run affect Canada’s view of itself. The war had led to a questioning of racist and ethnocentric ideas, and theories of cultural relativism began to emerge. The decolonizing, liberating movements of the 1960’s increased this tendency. The civil rights movement in the United States and the women’s movement, the latter both in the United States and Canada, had an impact on society and on education. In the 1960’s, the Quebec/Canada issue began to show the potential for a crisis of citizenship and even community when the language of education became a full fledged political issue and a breakup of Canada began to loom as a possibility. A movement toward political and cultural accommodation and change, a re-definition of the public good and of the basis for a common polity, began to take place. It was also a time when Canada moved towards becoming a full blown welfare state.

In response to the increasing assertion of the various ethnic groups and especially the French Canadians’ demands for linguistic equality, in 1963 Prime Minister Lester Pearson set up The Royal Commission on Bilingualism and Biculturalism. Its mandate was to:

Inquire into and report upon the existing state of bilingualism and biculturalism in Canada and to recommend what steps should be taken to develop the Canadian Confederation on the basis of an equal partnership between the two founding races, taking into account the contribution made by the other ethnic groups to the cultural enrichment of Canada. (Palmer, 1983, p. 36)

The notion of Canada as a bicultural nation was contested by ethnic groups which had been long established in the country. By 1961, 26% of the population...
was other than British or French origin and the notion of a bicultural country did not fit with the historical reality (Palmer, 1983, p. 36). These Canadians embodied a proto-multiculturalism that developed in spite of Anglo-conformity and claimed rights and recognition. In fact, Book IV of the Report deals with the cultural contribution of other groups. The wording, however, had overtones of marginality. When referring to educational policy, the question of language and culture is seen within the broader context of the question of bilingualism and biculturalism in Canada as a whole (Canada, 1970, pp. 137-169). In 1969 the federal Liberal government introduced a discussion document, known as the White Paper on Indian Policy, prepared without previous consultations with the Aboriginal peoples (Canada, 1969). It was preceded by the Hawthorn Report (Canada, 1966, 1967) that had documented the horrendous living conditions of status Indians and had suggested their status be recognized as "citizens plus" and also recommended that Indian Affairs advocate for them. The White Paper proposed ending federal responsibility for Aboriginals, their special status, and the system of reserves. Its aim was to integrate Aboriginals into "mainstream" society. The Paper brought a strong negative response from Aboriginal individuals and organizations and the government withdrew it. As a result of the Aboriginal peoples' reaction and subsequent negotiations, in 1972, the National Indian Brotherhood produced a seminal policy paper on education, "Indian Control of Indian Education," outlining the Aboriginal Peoples' philosophy of education and policies for change (National Indian Brotherhood, 1972). The White Paper has been described as a "marker event" in the relationship between Aboriginal societies and the Canadian government because the Paper was the immediate impetus behind the movement toward Aboriginal self-government generally and control of education specifically (Mallea & Young, 1997, p. 97). It became clear to politicians early in the seventies that the building of a common polity would have to acknowledge the unique citizenship status of the Aboriginal people. The national question had become a complex conundrum.

Schooling, Needs for Change, and the Crisis of Anglo-conformity

The Canadian Citizenship Act was adopted on January 1, 1947; it was an important step toward the development of autonomous Canadian citizenship. Although the process of Canada's self-definition began to take new shapes, Anglo-conformity continued to influence the social dimension of schooling. Moreover, some educational and community leaders of the time tried to resist the ideological re-accommodation that began to be seen as a necessary alternative to the status quo (Milan, 1980, chap. 1). Like the accession of her father, George VI, the coronation of Queen Elizabeth II in 1953 was a big event. The Manitoba School journal expounded as late as 1958 the old imperial rhetoric when describing the dynamics of the Commonwealth and the process of decolonization. One of the articles read:

There are still within the association a number of Dependencies and Colonies which have not yet attained the full status of the Member nations. It has been the avowed aim of the Imperial Government to prepare the peoples in these countries to assume the full responsibilities of independent nationhood. (Pratt, 1958, p. 8)

The articles devoted to colonies or former colonies concealed the effects of colonialism, the treatment of Aboriginal peoples, and the appropriation of their resources. The interpretation of events put forward by the Manitoba School journal in the middle fifties was deceptive (Citizenship day, 1955, p. 7; Citizenship day, 1957, p. 9; Joseph, 1959, p. 16; Kargboo, 1959, p. 18; Yung, 1959, p. 16; Milan, 1980, pp. 108-125). Nation building also remained a major theme. Osborne observed that "at least until the 1950's textbooks dwelled on those figures who were seen as nation-builders: missionaries, pioneers, the Conquest, Loyalists, the War of 1812, railway builders, the Fathers of Confederation, and after 1867 prime ministers" (Osborne, 1994, p. 5).

In the late forties and fifties, however, there were changes in the discourse on citizenship. A small but notable example was the changing of Empire Day to Citizenship Day in 1951. Moreover, the place of Canada in what began as the British Commonwealth and developed into the Commonwealth of nations provided a point of reference for Canada's identity in the international context. After 1945 the focus was on the United Nations where Canada was accepted as a recognized state on its own right. The collapse of the British Empire and the assertive presence of the United States as a leading world power had a tremendous influence on Canada's perception of its role in the world and of itself as a national society (See Morton, 1968; Cook, 1994). The rhetoric of citizenship began to develop more and more around the virtues of democracy, and of the ideal citizen within the framework of the cold war. The virtues of democracy were exalted in opposition to socialism and communism in a number of articles published in The Manitoba...
Democracy was understood there in an abstract way with no consideration of class, race, and gender. Citizens were portrayed as being free to think, speak and write as they chose, to practice their religion of choice, to be in short owners of their own destiny. Meanwhile, the Aboriginal people, many of whom were still forced into residential schools, did not share basic civil rights.

Although restrictions against married women in the teaching profession were lifted during or after the war and the gender differential in salaries began to disappear in the fifties, the ideal citizen continued to be construed along gender lines. The teacher was expected to educate the future generations for their expected roles. This was especially true in rural areas. An article published in *The Manitoba School Journal* in 1950 is illustrative.

If the lady teacher - to give place to the ladies - is personable, or has a flair of becoming dress (sic) or even a touch of the sophistication of the city, she may earn the instinctive hostility (sic) of the local belles and, if she makes the slightest human mistake in judgment or deportment, Heaven help her. (The teacher in the community, 1950, p. 18)

A male teacher from rural Manitoba in a predominantly British area described the fifties as years of conformity. He said, "Everybody was pretty much the same. If you weren't you were looked down upon. They didn't accept you if you dressed differently." Helen McKay, who started teaching in the early fifties in Southern Manitoba, recalled that to be a teacher was more restrictive for women. She said, "We were left with the feeling that there wasn't very much left to learn. It was put upon us that the boys would probably go on to university because they would probably be principals." It was also a time when minorities started to find new spaces as paranoid attitudes about uniformity started, by and large, to relax while some rural communities experienced demographic changes due to migration to urban areas.

A Christian (Protestant) world view was still dominant in the educational system in the 1950's. The 1951 Code of Ethics of the Manitoba Teachers' Society provides a good example. Clause 2 (d) reads, "In accordance with the law, to aid the home and the church to foster in my pupils reverence, respect, and a deep sense of their religious duty" (Bruns, 1951, pp. 7-8). In the fifties, Christmas concerts still played an important role in the life of elementary teachers to judge by oral testimonies and by *The Manitoba School Journal*. A male teacher from rural Manitoba recalled, "A teacher staked her reputation on the Christmas Concert she produced. Math or Science is fine, but if your concert if mediocre, it will be never forgotten" (Bruno-Jofre & Shack, 1993, p. 650). In Franco-Manitoban areas the Catholic Action had developed since 1934 a complex network involving the schools, the community, and the Church.

New texts revealed the characteristic of the curriculum of the time. The *Manual of Civics and Citizenship* (Manitoba Department of Education, 1956) used in Manitoba schools, published in 1956 but based on earlier practices, emphasized the pride of being Canadian, paid some attention to the Queen and the British heritage, related Christianity to democracy, equated good Canadian citizenship with a set of values such as loyalty, hard work and qualities such as enthusiasm. Religious exercises were considered activities to develop moral and spiritual values. The pictures in the *Manual* as in most textbooks made clear the dominant notion of a family, mainly a white middle class one, and the expected roles of women and men. The reference to the role of Canada in the world was stressed. There was no political analysis of the colonization and struggles for liberation of former colonies, or any reference to differences, or problems within Canada. There was, however, a move to introduce Canada on her own and to loosen the ties with the British heritage.

The fifties, however, were the years of the Royal Commissions on Education in a number of provinces and were the prelude to important changes in the sixties and seventies. Economic changes generated a new setting for education and also for culture. Many of the submissions to the Massey Commission that worked in the late forties and published its report in 1951, lamented lack of knowledge of things Canadian, students' low level of skills and the fact that students were learning two versions of history, one French and another British." The members of the Commission questioned the dependency of our teachers upon graduate schools in the United States and in particular Columbia University, the center of progressive education. The members urged Canadians to produce their own materials since uncritical reliance on American educational materials had made the system less Canadian. Hilda Neatby, the Saskatchewan historian, was one of the commissioners. A few years later, in 1953, she published *So Little for the Mind*, an indictment of the teaching of history and citizenship that was also an
indictment of progressive education (See Tomkins, 1977, p. 18).

In Manitoba, the Liberal government headed by Douglas Campbell from 1949 to an end in 1958. The new Conservative government of Duff Roblin (1958-1967) quickly "moved to secure a place for Manitoba in the postwar era of transnational capital" (Gonick, 1990, p. 28). It was a time of increasing mechanization of farms, rapid urbanization, and consequent opportunities outside rural areas. Premier Duff Roblin had to deal with an educational system that needed structural changes (Gonick, 1990, p. 27). The administrative structure had remained essentially unchanged with 1651 school districts and 1410 one-room schools controlled by 5500 school trustees. Meanwhile the school population had increased to 169,482 students (Milan, 1980, p. 62). Campbell's government had created the Manitoba Royal Commission on Education (Mcfarlane Commission) in 1957 to review and make recommendations regarding education in the province. Out of the recommendations and under the new Conservative government, Manitoba finally proceeded with the consolidation of schools through the establishment of larger school divisions, the professional enhancement of teaching, and substantial changes in curricula. The entire apparatus of small local rural schools districts disappeared between 1959 and 1967 (See Levin, 1993).

The discourse of citizenship education in the 1960s contained overlapping old and new elements. It stressed consensus while glossing over the realities of class, gender, racial and ethnic discrimination, the complex Quebec issue, and other regional issues. Schools to a degree had a life of their own nourished by new realities outside school. The 1960’s brought forward nation-wide discussion about the nature of Confederation, Canadian fears of Americanization (economically, culturally, and politically), bilingualism, multiculturalism, human rights, and the constitution. The break of a common identity for all French Canadians and the understanding that Quebec was the "basic polity" of French Canada created a new political scenario (Martel Martel, 1998). The question of the rights of Francophones outside Quebec came to the fore in Manitoba, and Aboriginal issues also began to take on a new political dimension at the national level. In the midst of a metamorphosis that was also affecting the educational field, through the introduction of new programs of study in mathematics, science, social studies and so on, various groups began to question a notion of citizenship that still relied on "Us" and "Them."

The most critical analysis of what was happening in the classroom regarding citizenship education was the widely publicized A. B. Hodgetts (1968), What Culture? What Heritage? A Study of Civic Education in Canada. This study, based primarily on classroom observations, condemned what it described as a monolithic outdated approach to the teaching of civics, history, and social studies, subjects where civic education supposedly took place. The study offered a devastating critique of Canadian history as taught in the schools with an overemphasis on constitutional and political developments and disregard for social and political problems of the time. Hodgetts pointed out the tremendous differences in the way French and English history were taught in Quebec and in English Canada. These differences did not help to generate an understanding of Canada as a whole. The study also stressed the need to understand the unique problems Canada had in developing its identity. It identified as problems the presence of two distinctly different linguistic communities, the powerful influence of the United States, the growth of internal regionalism, and the presence of ethnic pluralism. These conditions were considered by Hodgetts to be both challenges and opportunities "because free societies thrive on the dynamic tensions arising from their diversity" (p. 11). Civic education had been too concerned with consensus. In his view, civic education should consider areas of agreement but also should face "inevitable differences of opinion that have always been and will continue to be an essential part of free societies" (p. 11). Conflict resolution and tolerance were highlighted. Hodgetts’ study did not consider divisions based on power, wealth, and social class although these were also reflected in the educational system and in the understanding of citizenship. The specific injustices perpetuated against the Aboriginal Peoples and the treatment of women in the curricula were not addressed. The study urged a recognition of pluralism, diversity, and the multiracial nature of society as basic premises from which to design and deliver citizenship education. The study put forward the idea of pursuing national understanding rather than national unity.

Social and political leaders of the time realized that it was necessary to formulate new principles that could help to develop a sense of being Canadian. It would mean dealing with cultural diversity, with the Quebec issue, with the impact of American influence, and with the severance of the British connection. In some provinces the political influence of various communities called for official recognition of their needs. The various ethnic communities struggled through waves of preservation and assimilation and developed a Canadian identity that
challenged anglo-conformity. In its 1970 throne speech, the New Democratic government of Manitoba announced its intention to hold a Congress (Manitoba Mosaic Congress) to provide "a forum where the different cultural groups in the province may express their views on measures needed to nourish and sustain the linguistic and cultural heritage" (Manitoba Legislative Assembly, 1970, March 12, p.5). Changes taking place in Canada were in tune with ideological and intellectual developments in the western world as well as in the so-called third world. Moreover, the rapid globalization led by multinational corporations and the early signs of a post-industrial economic setting made it imperative to reconstruct the understanding of common polity and citizenship.

Multiculturalism was conceived as the practical articulating principle that offered an avenue to deal with issues of identity, allegiances, and with the place of Canada in the world. The principle was established as a policy in 1971 by Trudeau's assertion that Canada is a multicultural country within a bilingual context and that the federal government would take steps to give public recognition to ethnic diversity through the introduction of a policy of multiculturalism (See Whitaker, 1992, chap. 5). Trudeau's multiculturalism was rooted in a liberal ideal of equalitarianism that encouraged cultural retention within the framework of individual choice and the existence of the welfare state. Multiculturalism became the core of the new educational discourse of citizenship that made diversity a key element of Canadian identity. The Aboriginal peoples, however, whose voices emerged strongly in the 1960's and even more so in the 1970's, saw themselves as apart from the new multicultural concept. Nor could multiculturalism within a bilingual context meet the expectations of Quebec nationalists. There is no doubt that Canada has been and is a country of "many allegiances" (Morton, 1993, p. 54).

Meanwhile the impact of the women's movement had become important enough to call attention to the need for educational change and to question the treatment of girls and women in the educational system. In 1970, the Royal Commission on the Status of Women produced a report that questioned gender socialization, stereotyping: it made clear that equality meant more than access to schooling: it meant equal treatment in the curriculum. A study sponsored by the Commission "concluded that women's creative and intellectual potential had been either underplayed or ignored in the education of children from their earliest years." Human rights issues emerged across the country. By the early 1970's, a universal notion of citizenship without regard for diversity was no longer defensible.

Conclusion

The state, through schooling, tried to implement curricula and practices based on Anglo-conformity as the central principle articulating the notion of citizenship formation. It was seen by the state as central to public good. Anglo-conformity would facilitate social mobility, integration, and social harmony. The discourse on citizenship education reflected the development of the liberal state and the growth of corporate industrial capitalism. The official discourse in Manitoba had both conservative and progressive components and it often reflected a preoccupation with Canada's place in North America. The British Empire was the referent although the political language of the 1920s reflected the notion of international citizenship and the Empire was seen as a good model compatible with the League of Nations (1920). International peace and cooperation were important themes.

In the early 1920s, in the aftermath of intensive political oppositional practices and discourses, the official discourse was characterized by voluntaristic, a political components. Nation building remained a central theme for decades. The presence of "aliens" was a powerful point of reference and appropriate social behaviours were often equated with Canadianization. By the late 1920's and early thirties, progressive educational theories, mostly John Dewey's ideas, permeated the discourse of education and citizenship not only in Manitoba but in provinces across English speaking Canada. However, the progressive language and its emphasis on democracy remained trapped within a framework of political rights with few socio-economic references. The preoccupation with Canada's nationhood developed within the framework of the British empire, a justification of colonialism, the exclusion of the First Nations from public life, and persistence of assimilationist views. The inconsistency was sustained by an universalizing ethic that made those who did not accept it inadequate citizens. Although the tenets of Anglo-conformity were often reproduced by teachers who continued established patterns of doing things, in particular in areas with a dominant British population, resistance and even accommodation of conflicting interests, values, political standpoints took place in many schools and districts. Teachers played a role mediating the official curriculum. Given the transactional and relational
character of citizenship formation and identity quite often people develop their sense of being Canadians on their own terms in a contested process (Bruno-Jofre, 1998-1999). On one side, the intersubjective nature of identity formation makes difficult to force a separation of life spheres. On the other side, as Ken Osborne (1998, p. 115) wisely wrote in relation to the teaching of history and national unity, "the teacher’s task is to help students understand the kind of country they live in, not to preach national unanimity." Many teachers took that task seriously.

The end of the war brought changes that were the product of the conjunction of various historical short term and long time processes at national and international levels. Schooling played a role, mostly through non-official practices, in the generation of a form of proto-multiculturalism that would take new life in the early 1960s. School life had and still has its own contours. The development of multiculturalism and bilingualism as key elements in the definition of Canadian identity and the public good is considered in this paper in the context of socio-economic and political developments. In fact, the understanding of citizenship formation and polity cannot be separated from the understanding of the democratic ideal. A change in the understanding of citizenship formation, and hence of what makes a polity have taken place along with changes affecting Canadian policies at various levels including the development of the welfare state. The cold war also set parameters for the understanding of citizenship and democracy. Multiculturalism provided a means at a point when the notion of citizenship glossing over differences had become not only historically irrelevant but socially and politically questioned and largely unacceptable. The limits of multiculturalism quickly became apparent when it could not meet Quebec aspirations and when the First Nations and the Aboriginal peoples asserted their unique status. Multicultural education would bring with it a liberal conceptual baggage and interwove with the unique history of Canadian provinces.

Notes

The author would like to thank Ken Osborne, for his comments on an earlier draft of this paper. Special thanks to Sybil Shack for sharing her first hand historical knowledge and critically reading this paper. This paper is a revised and modified version of Rosa Bruno-Jofre (1996). Schooling and the Struggles to Develop a Common Polity, 1919-1971. In R. Bruno-Jofre, & L. Grieger (Ed.), Papers on Contemporary Issues in Education Policy and Administration in Canada: A Foundations Perspective (pp. 71-108). Monograph in Education XXIII, Winnipeg, MB: The University of Manitoba.

In the case of Manitoba, The Grain Grower’s Guide, the farmers’ magazine, contained a lot of discussion of politics, citizenship and education. An important source is Laycock (1990).

The author is currently working in collaboration with Dick Henley on a paper entitled At the Cross-Roads of Difference: THE ROLE OF THE SCHOOL IN BUILDING A CANADIAN POLITY in the context of Globalization. The focus is on the public good.

This is the language used in publications of the time such as The Western School Journal.

In 1920 there were 459 strikes across Canada (Kealey, 1984, p. 17).

The Western School Journal was subsidized by the Manitoba Department of Education making sure that each district in the province received a copy. Dr. William McIntyre, principal of the Normal School in Winnipeg, known for his reformist bent, was the editor until his retirement in 1934. The Western School Journal was published until 1938 when the Manitoba Department of Education discontinued the grant and started The Manitoba School Journal which was published monthly until 1963.

An interesting example is the high school textbook written by G. J. Reeve (1926) who taught in Winnipeg. In his introduction he stated his hope that the book would instill a spirit of patriotism, love of country, pride in its
past, and a belief in its future greatness.

8. *The Western School Journal* contained editorials that reflected the influence and acknowledged the influence of Dr. Dewey. See for example *The Golden Mean*, 1929.

9. *The Manitoba School Journal* published in 1939 some articles on the cultural resources of Manitoba featuring various ethnic groups. See Fournier (1939); The cultural resources of Manitoba. Introduction (1939); The cultural resources of Manitoba. The Ukrainians (1939).


11. "The emerging view is 'relational' in the sense that it locates identities in connections among individuals and groups rather than in the minds of particular persons or of whole populations" (Tilly, 1995, p. 5).

12. Interview with Donald Wood by Rosa Bruno-Jofre, Elm Creek, MB, April 25, 1990.

13. Interview with Helen McKay by Rosa Bruno-Jofre, Elm Creek, MB, January 20, 1990.

14. The Royal Commission on Education in Ontario (Ontario's Hope Commission) that published its report in 1950; the Royal Commission on Public School Finance in Nova Scotia that published its report in 1954; the Royal Commission on Agriculture and Rural Life that published its report in 1956; the Royal Commission on Education in Manitoba, known as the Mcfarlane Commission, that published its report in 1959; the Royal Commission on Education in Alberta, known as the Cameron Commission, that published its report in 1959; the Royal Commission on Education, Province of British Columbia, known as the Chant Commission that published its report in 1960.

15. The Royal Commission on the Arts, Letters and Sciences, known as the Massey Commission published its report in 1951.

16. Ken Osborne commented that Hodgetts wrote as a "red Tory" from Ontario. For example, he saw regionalism as a threat to Canada but many people in Manitoba or in the west thought of regionalism as perfectly legitimate policy. In their view what Hodgetts saw as "national" interest was really a form of Ontario regionalism (Ken Osborne, personal communication, July 1996). For a summary see Alan Sears (1994).
References

Address of the Minister of Education. (1918, May). *The Western School Journal*, 13, 185.


Tomkins, G. Canadian education and the developmental of a national consciousness: Historical and contemporary perspectives. In A. Chaiton, & N. MacDonald (Eds.), Canadian schools and Canadian identities. Toronto, ON: Gage Educational Publishing Ltd.
Yung, C. (1959, April). This is Hong Kong. The Manitoba School Journal, 20(8), 16-17.

Abstract

The creative potentials of ethnic and racial differences are revealed by a comparison with another group marginal in society, artists. When a marginal group resists and expresses its resistance, it changes the social order, but builds on the human capacity to interpret experience. Social thought, as much as school practices, separates and polarizes groups such as delinquents, volunteers, and artists from academic students, professionals and responsible executives.

Introduction

And yet, despite the broad interpretative framework laid out by its curators, the institutional politics which led to the organization of Myth...